# Exhibit E





#### Seth A. Bergstein 415.515.6224 seth@pastconsultants.com

September 27, 2022

Stephen Soske 1451 Ondulado Road Pebble Beach, CA 93953

Re: Focused Phase Two Historic Assessment for 1451 Ondulado Rd., Pebble Beach, CA

APN. 008-441-033-000

Dear Mr. Soske:

This report evaluates the proposed alterations to the property located at 1451 Ondulado Road, in Pebble Beach, California. PAST Consultants, LLC (PAST) attended a site visit to the subject property on September 2, 2022 to inspect and photograph the areas of exterior repairs to the house on the subject property.

On October 28, 2021, PAST prepared a limited Phase One Historic Assessment letter report concluding that the subject house, designed by architect Clarence Tantau, is likely historic for its association with the Spanish Colonial Revival style dictated by the Del Monte Properties Company during the 1920s. In addition, the subject property illustrates the theme of "Samuel Morse and the Del Monte Properties Company (1919 - 1945)," as described in the *Pebble Beach Historic Context Statement*. Please refer to this Phase One Historic Assessment letter report for the property description and summary of historic significance.

The following letter evaluates the proposed repairs to the subject property for conformance with the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation*. Design drawings by Cassandra August of August Design and Build, dated September 23, 2022 were the drawings reviewed for this Focused Phase Two Historic Assessment. All areas of repair are numbered and photographed on the drawings.

#### **Proposed Scope of Work**

The proposed Scope of Work addresses window, stucco and balcony repairs to the existing house. It should be noted that no additional square footage to the existing house is proposed. Proposed alterations seek to primarily address window/stucco decay and to address waterproofing issues. The proposed scope of work to the building exterior is:

- For all balconies, repair deteriorated tile-deck paving in-kind and raise balcony rails to current Building Code height of 42 inches. See drawings for locations.
- Replace decayed wood windows with wood windows that match existing.
- Repair decayed stucco on building exterior at various locations. Stucco repairs to match existing stucco.
- Remove large area of decayed stucco at rear (south) elevation to correct waterproofing issues. Stucco repairs to match existing stucco.
- Repair interior plaster where water infiltration occurred.
- Replace existing copper gutters with new copper gutters where previously installed.
- Convert non-historic, two-car garage door back to original two-door configuration, separated by a column.

## **Typical Repair Photographs**

Nearly all of the proposed repairs are on the rear (south) elevation of the building. Photographs of typical repairs appear below (**Figures 1 - 4**). Please refer to drawings for exact repair locations.





**Figures 1 and 2.** Left image details the rear (south) elevation, where windows will be replaced in-kind (arrows). Right image shows the rear (south) elevation. The large area of plaster repair was due to poor waterproofing, allowing water to enter behind the wall. Stucco will be reapplied in-kind to match the original stucco. The wide picture window (arrow) can be replaced because it is a non-historic addition to the building.







**Figures 3 and 4.** Left image details the west elevation showing typical stucco decay at window corners and at balcony, due to waterproofing issues. Wood balcony supports and balcony paving will be repaired or replaced in-kind and balcony rails raised to 42 inches to accommodate current code requirements. Right image details the west elevation garage, showing the present non-historic, single garage door. This deteriorated door will be removed and the opening returned to its original two-door configuration.

## The Secretary of the Interior's Standards

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties (the Standards) provides the framework for evaluating the impacts of additions and alterations to historic buildings. The Standards describe four treatment approaches: preservation, rehabilitation, restoration and reconstruction. The Standards require that the treatment approach be determined first, as a different set of standards apply to each approach. For the proposed project, the treatment approach is rehabilitation. The Standards describe rehabilitation as:

In *Rehabilitation*, historic building materials and character-defining features are protected and maintained as they are in the treatment Preservation; however, an assumption is made prior to work that existing historic fabric has become damaged or deteriorated over time and, as a result, more repair and replacement will be required. Thus, latitude is given in the *Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitation* to replace extensively deteriorated, damaged, or missing features using either traditional or substitute materials. Of the four treatments, only Rehabilitation includes an opportunity to make possible an efficient contemporary use through alterations and additions.<sup>1</sup>

The ten *Standards* for rehabilitation are:

1. A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces, and spatial relationships.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties (accessed via http://www.nps.gov/hps/standguide/).



- 2. The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.
- 3. Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken.
- 4. Changes to a property that have acquired historic significance in their own right will be retained and preserved.
- 5. Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.
- 6. Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.
- 7. Chemical or physical treatments, if appropriate, will be undertaken using the gentlest means possible. Treatments that cause damage to historic materials will not be used.
- 8. Archeological resources will be protected and preserved in place. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures will be undertaken.
- 9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.
- 10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

#### **Evaluation of Proposed Alterations**

For the proposed alterations to the subject property, the following lists the ten *Standards* for rehabilitation, with an evaluation given below each standard.

1. A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces, and spatial relationships.

The proposed alterations impact the existing building minimally, allowing it to continue its historic residential use and satisfying this Standard.

2. The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.

With the exceptions of decay due to poor maintenance and waterproofing, the proposed repairs do not remove any distinctive materials, nor do they alter any existing features, spaces or spatial relationships, as none of the proposed repairs add any square footage to the existing house. This Standard is satisfied.



3. Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken.

The proposed alterations are necessary repairs and do not add conjectural features or elements from other historic properties that would confuse the remaining character-defining features of the subject property.

4. Changes to a property that have acquired historic significance in their own right will be retained and preserved.

This Standard does not apply, as no changes have acquired historic significance.

5. Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.

Distinctive materials and historic character-defining features, such as original wood windows and exterior stucco, are being retained and repaired in keeping with this Standard. Replacement of windows that are severely deteriorated will match the existing windows regarding type, material and configuration of panes.

6. Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.

As required by this Standard, replacement of deteriorated historic stucco will be repaired in-kind, regarding appearance, texture and finish. Existing wood windows to be replaced at various locations (see the subject drawings) will be matched in-kind regarding window type, material and configuration of panes, as shown on the location photographs indicted on the drawings.

Repairs by elevation are summarized below. For locations of all repairs, please refer to the design drawings by August Design and Build, dated September 23, 2022.

#### Front and Primary (North) Elevation

- Repair stucco in-kind where north kitchen walls meet the concrete patio. Replace deteriorated kitchen entry door in-kind.
- Repair upper-floor, family room balcony deck paving in-kind. Raise balcony height to code-required 42 inches. Repair stucco around balcony in-kind.

#### **East Elevation**

Replace upper-floor parlor window in-kind regarding window type, material and number of panes.

#### **West Elevation**

• Repair/replace deteriorated stucco in-kind around windows at various locations.



- Repair balcony corbels and deck paving in-kind. Raise balcony height to code-required 42 inches. Repair stucco around balcony in-kind.
- Remove non-historic, circa-1950s two-car garage door and return garage opening to its original two-bay composition. Repair stucco around garage openings in-kind.

#### South (Rear) Elevation

- Replace kitchen and upper-floor windows at various locations in-kind with regard to material and number of panes.
- Repair dining room balcony deck paving in-kind. Raise balcony height to code-required 42 inches. Repair stucco around balcony in-kind.
- Repair wood deterioration of upper floor, courtyard balcony.
- Repair large area of deteriorated stucco in-kind. Repair upper-floor balcony deck paving in-kind. Raise balcony height to code-required 42 inches. Repair stucco around balcony in-kind.

All of the proposed repairs meet this Standard as the proposed window replacements, stucco repairs and wood repairs will match the existing historic materials.

7. Chemical or physical treatments, if appropriate, will be undertaken using the gentlest means possible. Treatments that cause damage to historic materials will not be used.

Physical treatments to the historic wood details and stucco will be undertaken using the gentlest means possible for a given substrate. Stucco repairs will be undertaken that remove the smallest amount of original substrate as possible, with replacement matching the historic stucco in texture and method of application.

8. Archeological resources will be protected and preserved in place. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures will be undertaken.

This Standard does not apply, as archaeological features are not identified at the site.

- 9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment. This Standard does not apply, as new additions are not proposed in the current scope of work, with the exception of returning the west elevation's garage door to a paired configuration. This proposed alteration is in keeping with the Standards, as it is returning a historical feature to the original building.
- 10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

This Standard does not apply, as no additional square footage is proposed.



#### Conclusion

In conclusion, the proposed exterior repairs to 1451 Ondulado Rd., Pebble Beach, California, meet the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation*. The proposed changes are needed repairs that do not impact the building's existing character-defining features nor do they remove any historic integrity from the building. Because the proposed alterations to the building meet the *Standards*, the alterations are considered as mitigated to a level of less than a significant impact on the historic resource and do not constitute a substantial adverse change to the historic resource, thus conforming to the requirements of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA).

Please contact me if you have any questions about this evaluation.

Sincerely,

Seth A. Bergstein, Principal

Seth Bergstein

Cc: Monterey County Planning Department; Cassandra August, August Design and Build



# This page intentionally left blank