

Attachment F

This page intentionally left blank.

RESOLUTION

*Before the Historic Resources Review Board in and for
the County of Monterey, State of California*

Resolution No.: 22-002 (**PLN190140 -
MID-VALLEY SHOPPING CENTER**)
Resolution of the Monterey County
Historic Resources Review Board (HRRB)
to:

- 1) Find that adoption of a recommendation to the Board of Supervisors regarding the eligibility for listing of the Mid Valley Shopping Center on the Monterey County Register of Historic Resources is not a project pursuant to Section 15378 of the CEQA Guidelines;
- 2) Recommend the Board of Supervisors find that the Mid-Valley Shopping Center qualifies for listing on the Monterey County Register of Historic Resources under criteria A.5 for its design by Olof Dahlstrand; and
- 3) Recommend that any future alterations at the shopping center be designed to comply with the Secretary of the Interior Standards for the Rehabilitation of Historic Properties.

RECITALS.

WHEREAS, this matter was heard by the Historic Resources Review Board (HRRB) on February 3, 2022, pursuant to authority provided in Chapter 2.56 of the Monterey County Code. On February 3, 2022, the Historic Resources Review Board (HRRB) considered a request for a Design Approval to allow modifications to the Mid Valley Shopping Center in Carmel Valley. At that hearing, the HRRB was asked to consider: 1) a Draft Environmental Impact Report (DEIR) and comments received on the DEIR, 2) a request for a substantial financial hardship determination, 3) eligibility for listing as an historic resource, and 4) A recommendation on the Design Approval. At the hearing, the HRRB heard public comment and voted unanimously to continue the hearing to April 7, 2022. Since that meeting, the applicant has requested that the eligibility for listing be considered pursuant to Chapter 18.25 of the Monterey County Code prior to review and consideration of the Design Approval. Staff has published a new notice for the April 7, 2022 HRRB hearing that includes only on the consideration of a recommendation to the Board of Supervisors on the eligibility for listing of the property as an Historic Resource. Consideration of the Design Approval and any request for a hardship determination will occur separately from the eligibility determination.; and

WHEREAS, there is a disagreement among historians regarding the eligibility for listing of the Mid Valley Shopping Center on the local, state and national registers of historic resources.

WHEREAS, Dr. Anthony Kirk was commissioned by the applicant (Russ Stanley) to prepare an historic assessment of the Shopping Center. Dr. Kirk submitted a letter dated September 18, 2019, finding that the Mid Valley Shopping center does not appear eligible for listing on the National, State, or Local registers; and

WHEREAS, the Carmel Valley Association (CVA) separately hired Page & Turnbull to conduct an assessment of the Mid Valley Shopping Center. Page & Turnbull provided a "Preliminary Opinion of Historic Significance" dated October 29, 2019. Page & Turnbull's preliminary opinion was that the Mid Valley Shopping Center appears to possess sufficient significance and integrity to be eligible for listing in the California Register under Criterion 3, for its architectural style and association with architect Olof Dahlstrand. Page & Turnbull later provided a Phase 1 Historic Assessment and Primary Records document using the Department of Parks and Recreation (DPR) forms; and

WHEREAS, Dr. Kirk provided a written rebuttal to the Page & Turnbull Preliminary Opinion dated November 4, 2019, in which he disagreed with the Page & Turnbull conclusion and provides additional details to support his earlier conclusion that the shopping center does not qualify for listing. Additionally, the applicant commissioned Dr. Laura Jones to provide another historic assessment of the property. Dr. Jones found no substantial evidence supporting a determination that the shopping center is eligible for listing as an historic resource and further found that even if it were considered eligible for listing, it lacks integrity and does not convey its original design (agreeing with and support the conclusions of Dr. Kirk); and

WHEREAS, due to competing expert opinions on the historic significance of the Mid-Valley Shopping Center, the County initiated preparation of an Environmental Impact Report (EIR). A Draft EIR was prepared and circulated for public comment from November 24, 2021, through January 10, 2022 (SCH#2020090480); and

WHEREAS, Diana Painter with Painter preservation conducted an historic assessment of the Mid Valley Shopping Center under contract with the County's EIR consultant. Painter concluded in her letter dated December 21, 2020, that the Mid Valley Shopping Center is significant for its design and association with Olof Dahlstrand and it retains integrity; and

WHEREAS, during the public comment period on the Draft EIR, comments were received from Alli Wood, Ed Stellingsma, Pricilla Walton on behalf of the Carmel Valley Association, and Anthony Lombardo on behalf of the applicant. These comments are attached to the Staff report prepared for the HRRB hearing on February 3, 2022 as Attachment C; and

WHEREAS, comments submitted on the Draft EIR by Anthony Lombardo on behalf of the applicant contain attachments that include additional responses from Dr. Anthony Kirk dated January 3, 2020, and another historic evaluation from Barbara Lamprecht from Modern Resources dated April 2021. In her report, Lamprecht evaluates the previous reports and analysis and concludes that the Mid-Valley Shopping Center is not eligible for listing as an historic resource; and

WHEREAS, the HRRB has reviewed and considered the Draft EIR inclusive of the historic assessments, other appendices, and all of the comments received during the comment period prior to forwarding this recommendation; and

WHEREAS, the recommendation of the HRRB on the eligibility of the property for listing on the Monterey County Register of Historic Properties is not a commitment to a project. The HRRB is acting in a recommending capacity only and is not considering any current proposal for physical changes to the property or environment. Therefore, the recommendation is not a project under CEQA; and

WHEREAS, the Mid Valley Shopping Center was design by Olof Dahlstrand. Dahlstrand. Olof Dahlstrand was born in Wisconsin. He earned his degree in architecture from Cornell University in 1939 and moved to the San Francisco Bay area in 1948 where he worked as an associate for Fred and Lois Langhorst. He took over the practice when the Langhorsts moved to Europe in 1950 and later worked for Skidmore, Owings & Merrill before establishing his own practice in the Monterey Bay area in the early 1960s. Dahlstrand’s work was inspired by Frank Lloyd Wright. Some of his notable projects include the Carmel Plaza Shopping Center, the Wells Fargo Building in Carmel, a few single-family residences in the “usonian” architectural style located in the Bay Area, renderings produced in collaboration with John Carl Warnecke, and the UC Santa Cruz Faculty Housing; and

WHEREAS, Olof Dahlstrands work reflects a mastery of the mid century modern design style originally inspired by the work of Frank Lloyd Wright with his own unique interpretations. His work also reflects the influence of his widely acknowledged skills as a renderer; and

WHEREAS, the HRRB has considered all of the evidence and testimony and finds as follows:

FINDINGS:

- Finding 1** - The Mid-Valley Shopping Center is eligible for listing on the Monterey County Register of Historic Resources under criteria A.5 (18.25.070.A.5) due to its design by Olof Dahlstrand, a figure of recognized greatness in the field of architecture and architectural renderings.
- Finding 2** - The Mid Valley Shopping Center retains an ability to convey the integrity of its design by Olof Dahlstrand with the forms and design concept still intact.
- Finding 3** - As an historic resources for Monterey County, future alternations to the shopping center should be evaluated for consistency with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties and the criteria contained in Section 18.25.170 of the Monterey County Code.

EVIDENCE:

- Evidence:
- 1. The Draft Environmental Impact Report Prepared for the Mid-Valley Shopping Center (SCH#2020090408) including appendices.
 - 2. Comments received on the Draft Environmental Impact Report.
 - 3. The General Plan Historic Preservation Goals and Policies
 - 4. The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties

5. Chapter 18.25 of the Monterey County Code
6. National Register Bulletin 15
7. California Public Resources Code Sections 5020.1(j) (State's definition of "Historical resource) and 5024.1 California Historic Register criteria.
8. UC Berkely Environmental Design Archives.
9. *Olof Dahlstrand: The Usonians, The Magnificent Seven of the East Bay*" by Bill & Bea Welty
10. Lectures on Olof Dahlstrand provided by Pierluigi Serraino

DECISION:

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED THAT, it is the decision of the Monterey County Historic Resources Review Board to:

- 1) Find that adoption of a recommendation to the Board of Supervisors regarding the eligibility for listing of the Mid Valley Shopping Center on the Monterey County Register of Historic Resources is not a project pursuant to Section 15378 of the CEQA Guidelines;
- 2) Recommend the Board of Supervisors find that the Mid-Valley Shopping Center qualifies for listing on the Monterey County Register of Historic Resources under criteria A.5 for its design by Olof Dahlstrand; and
- 3) Recommend that any future alterations at the shopping center be designed to comply with the Secretary of the Interior Standards for the Rehabilitation of Historic Properties.

PASSED AND ADOPTED this 7th day of April 2022, upon motion of Judy MacClelland, seconded by Kellie Morgantini, by the following vote:

AYES: Judy MacClelland, John Scourkes, Salvador Munoz, Sheila Lee Prader, Belinda Taluban, Kellie Morgantini

NOES: Michael Bilich

ABSENT: None

ABSTAIN: None

DocuSigned by:

Philip Angelo

10955450DE57403...

Attest

Phil Angelo, Secretary