



County of Monterey Planning Commission

Board of Supervisors
Chambers
168 W. Alisal St., 1st Floor
Salinas, CA 93901

Agenda Item No. 5
Legistar File Number: PC 23-001

January 11, 2023

Introduced: 12/21/2022

Current Status: Agenda Ready

Version: 1

Matter Type: Planning Item

PLN220174 - ROMAN CATHOLIC BISHOP OF MTY

Public hearing to consider allowing alterations at the Mission San Antonio de Padua, including demolition of a caretaker unit and restoration of the foundation of the "Majordomo" residence. The caretaker unit will be demolished in order to expose, excavate and treat the foundation of Majordomo residence that underlies the existing caretaker residence.

Project Location: 1 Mission Rd, Jolon, 93928

Proposed CEQA action: Find the project categorically exempt pursuant to Sections 15301 and 15331 of the CEQA Guidelines

RECOMMENDATIONS

It is recommended that the Planning Commission adopt a resolution:

- 1) Find that the project qualifies for Class 1 and Class 31 Categorical Exemptions Pursuant to CEQA Guidelines Sections 15301 and 15331 and that none of the exceptions in Section 15300.2 apply; and
- 2) Approve a Use Permit to allow alterations at the Mission San Antonio de Padua, including demolition of a caretaker unit and restoration of the foundation of the "Majordomo" residence.

The attached draft resolution includes findings and evidence for consideration (**Exhibit A**). Staff recommends approval subject to 9 conditions of approval.

PROJECT INFORMATION

Agent: Brett Brenkwitz

Property Owner: Roman Catholic Bishop of Mty

APN: 201-021-002-000

Parcel Size: 33.19 Acres

Zoning: PQP-HR

Plan Area: South County Area Plan

Flagged and Staked: N/A

SUMMARY

The project consists of demolishing a non-historic caretaker unit at the Mission San Antonio de Pauda, and revealing and treating the foundations of the historical "Majordomo" residence, which lie partially underneath the caretaker unit. The project was referred to the Monterey County Historic Resources Review Board who unanimously recommended approval.

DISCUSSION

The Mission San Antonio de Pauda is a historical California mission constructed in the early 1800's and re-constructed primarily between 1948 and 1952. The Mission is listed on the National, State, and Monterey County historical registers, and has a Historic Resources "HR" overlay zoning district. A detached caretaker unit constructed in 1935 was built over the foundations of the mission's historic (and no longer extant) "Majordomo" residence. The Majordomo's were the economic managers or administrators of the Missions. The unit was constructed during the Great Depression to oversee restoration work on the mission, and was later used to house the mission's parochial administrator. The caretaker unit is non-contributing to the historical mission complex.

Caretaker Unit

The project proposes to demolish an existing detached caretaker unit constructed in 1935 southwest of the mission's south wing. The unit was originally constructed for a contractor to oversee restoration work on the other mission buildings and was later used as an office for the mission priests and to house the mission's parochial administrator.

A historical resource assessment was prepared January 2010 by Architectural Resources Group (ARG) for the entire mission (LIB130010). ARG's report indicates that while the unit was built within the period of the significance for the mission between 1810 and 1952, it does not follow its form, and designates it as a non-contributing feature. Such features are described as "*... elements or features that have been remodeled, altered or added after the period of significance (see next section), and where additional alteration would not have a negative effect on the original integrity of the building. In some cases, removal of the noncontributing features has a positive effect on the building's overall integrity.*"

An additional phase II historical assessment specifically focused on the proposed project was prepared by Kent L. Seavey dated June 10, 2022 (**LIB220249 / Exhibit C**). It describes the caretaker unit as a one-story adobe-framed building with a T shaped plan and low pitched red tile roof known as "The Casita". This report concurs that the 1935 unit is non-contributing, and concludes that it should be deemed a non historic feature. The also describes the current state of the unit as deteriorated: the unreinforced cement foundation is cracked throughout, the floor boards have been riven by pests and dry rot, and mold is present throughout the ceiling and walls. As the caretaker unit lacks both historical significance and integrity, it's removal would not adversely affect the historic, archaeological, architectural, or engineering significance of the mission.

"Majordomo" Historic Foundations

Underneath the 1935 caretaker unit are the foundations of the mission's "Majordmo" residence. The role of the Majordomo (or Mayordomo) as an economic administrator within the mission system was established as early as the 1770's. Each mission appointed a Majordomo, generally a soldier from the mission guards. They became the accounting manager, oversaw the agricultural and crafting operations, directed work, and reported to the missionary regarding temporal affairs.

After the demolition of the existing caretakers unit, the project proposes to excavate and partially treat the underlying foundation of the Majordomo structure:

- The overlying earth on top of the foundations would be excavated.
- They would then be repaired with a similar material as needed, with the top of the foundation sloped so that water sheds away.
- The foundations would then be capped with a lime plaster and several layers of lime wash.
- A six square foot rustic metal and rustic wood frame sign interpretive sign would be installed.

This treatment approach would be similar to the foundations of other accessory structures at the mission. It has both a preservation and educational function. The lime wash acts as a sacrificial layer that protects the foundations from the elements and vandalism, and their visibility would allow visitors to better understand they layout and function of mission spaces. The project historian reviewed this approach (**Exhibit D**) and concluded it was consistent with National Parks Service Preservation Brief #5 on Adobe Buildings and the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties.

The excavation would take place in an area the County has mapped as having a high sensitivity to archaeological resources and is approximately 70 feet northeast of the mission graveyard. Therefore, an archaeological report was prepared for the project by Robert L. Hoover, Ph.D., and David N. Hoover, M.A. (LIB220248). Archaeological reports are confidential in order to protect potential archaeological resources, however, the report recommends removal of the 1935 caretaker unit, and recommends excavation work be monitored by qualified archaeological and Salinian tribal cultural monitors. Staff recommends this monitoring be incorporated into the project as conditions of approval. Therefore, as conditioned, revealing these foundations would not adversely affect the historic, archaeological, architectural, or engineering significance of the mission.

CEQA

The project is categorically exempt from environmental review pursuant to Section 15301 “Existing Facilities” and Section 15331 “Historical Resource Restoration/Rehabilitation” of the CEQA Guidelines. These exemptions respectively apply to demolition and removal of small structures and rehabilitation and preservation of historic structures consistent with the Secretary of the Interior Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties.

None of the exceptions under CEQA Guidelines Section 15300.2 apply to the project:

- The project consists of demolishing a non-contributing structure at a historical site and preserving an archaeological/historical resource (the foundations of the Majordomo residence), and would therefore not contribute to a potentially significant cumulative impact;
- There are no unusual circumstances that would create a reasonable possibility the project would have a significant effect;
- The project would not adversely affect any historical resources as: the structure proposed for removal is non-contributing; the project was referred to the County’s Historic Resources Review Board (HRRB) who recommended approval as proposed; the proposed revealing of the foundations of the “Majordomo” residence are consistent with the Secretary fo the Interior Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties under the Preservation treatment

approach; and the project has been conditioned to require archaeological and tribal cultural monitors during grading and earthwork to ensure no archaeological or tribal cultural resources are impacted.

OTHER AGENCY INVOLVEMENT

The following agencies have reviewed the project, have comments, and/or have recommended conditions:

HCD-Engineering Services
Environmental Health Bureau
HCD-Environmental Services

HISTORIC RESOURCES REVIEW BOARD REVIEW

Alterations to historical sites require referral by the Historic Resources Review Board (HRRB), pursuant to Monterey County Code (MCC) Section 18.25.170. Alteration is defined by MCC Section 18.25.030 to encompass demolition of structures, placement of exterior objects such as signs, and change or modification of a site, including grading or vegetation removal.

As the project includes each of these components, it was referred to the HRRB, who at a duly noticed public meeting on November 3, 2022, adopted a resolution recommending approval of the project 7-0. The resolution further recommended that the project be conditioned to required archaeological and tribal cultural resource monitors during grading and excavation. These recommended conditions have been incorporated as Conditions Nos. 7 and 8.

Prepared by: Phil Angelo, Associate Planner, x5731

Reviewed and Approved by: Craig Spencer, Chief of Planning

The following attachments are on file with HCD:

Exhibit A - Draft Resolution including:

- Recommended Conditions of Approval
- Site Plans, Floor Plans, & Elevations

Exhibit B - Historic Resources Review Board Resolution No. 22-008

Exhibit C - Historic Report (LIB220249)

Exhibit D - Letter Describing Foundation Treatment Approach

Exhibit E - Vicinity Map

cc: Front Counter Copy; HCD-Environmental Services; HCD-Engineering Services; Environmental Health Bureau; Phil Angelo, Planner; Anna Qunga, ACIP, Principal Planner; Craig Spencer, Chief of Planning; Brett Brenkwitz, Agent; Diocese Of Monterey Parish & School Operating Corp., Applicant; The Open Monterey Project; LandWatch (Executive Director); Planning File PLN220174