



Monterey County Zoning Administrator

Board of Supervisors
Chambers
168 W. Alisal St., 1st Floor
Salinas, CA 93901

Agenda Item No. 3
Legistar File Number: ZA 22-041

August 25, 2022

Introduced: 8/18/2022

Current Status: Agenda Ready

Version: 1

Matter Type: Zoning Administrator

PLN200274 - WALKER

Public hearing to consider construction of 4,760 sf two-story single family dwelling with 106 sf covered entry, 105 sf balcony, 1,005 sf first floor terrace, 988 sf garage with 356 sf guesthouse above, development within 100 feet of ESHA and removal of 9 Monterey Pines.

Project Location: 1634 Sonado Rd, Pebble Beach, Del Monte Forest Land Use Plan

Proposed CEQA Action: Categorical Exemption pursuant to Section 15303 of the CEQA Guidelines.

RECOMMENDATION:

It is recommended that the Zoning Administrator:

1. Find the project involves construction of a single-family dwelling and accessory structures, which qualifies as Class 3 Categorical Exemptions pursuant to Sections 15303(a) and (e) of the CEQA guidelines and there are no exceptions pursuant to Section 15300.2 of the CEQA guidelines; and
2. Approve a Combined Development Permit consisting of:
 - a) Coastal Administrative Permit & Design Approval to allow construction of a 4,758 square foot two-story single family dwelling with a 106 square foot covered entry, a 105 square foot balcony, a 1,005 square foot first floor terrace & a 988 square foot attached garage;
 - b) Coastal Development Permit & Design Approval to allow construction of a 356 square foot guesthouse above the garage with a 50 square foot balcony;
 - c) Coastal Administrative Permit to allow development within 100 feet of ESHA; and
 - d) Coastal Development Permit to allow removal of nine Monterey Pine trees.

A draft resolution, including findings and evidence, is attached for consideration (Exhibit B).

Staff recommends approval subject to sixteen conditions.

PROJECT INFORMATION:

Project Owner: Joy and Robert Walker

APNs: 008-202-014-000

Zoning: Low Density Residential, 1.5 acres per unit, with a Design Control overlay in the Coastal Zone or "LDR/1.5-D (CZ)"

Parcel Size: 68,636 square feet

Flagged and Staked: Yes

SUMMARY:

The subject parcel is located in a residential neighborhood and is situated approximately 0.55 miles northeast of Stillwater Cove and 0.3 mile northeast of the 17 Mile Drive. The staking and flagging is not visible from these locations. Residences surround the subject property on all but one side. (Vicinity Map is shown as **Exhibit D.**) The applicant proposes to construct a 4,758 square foot two-story single family dwelling with a 106 square foot covered entry, a 105 square foot balcony, a 1,005 square foot first floor terrace, and a 988 square foot attached garage with a 356 square foot guesthouse above the garage with a 49 square foot balcony. A trellis wall will connect the main residence and the garage/guesthouse. The design also includes a set of 14-foot-wide wrought iron gates and 663 linear feet of 6-foot-tall wood fence and 479 linear feet of wire fence. Approximately 3,360 square feet of ground will be graded for a driveway and a motorcourt. The improvements will require removal of nine Monterey Pine trees, sixty-three Hooker's manzanitas, and fifty small-leaved lomatium (rare plants). The trellis wall will connect the proposed accessory structure to the existing single-family dwelling. Based on staff analysis, the proposed project, as conditioned, is consistent with all rules and regulations pertaining to zoning uses and any other applicable provisions of the 1982 Monterey County General Plan, Del Monte Forest Land Use Plan (DMF LUP), Monterey County Coastal Implementation Plan (Part 5) and Zoning Ordinance (Title 20).

DISCUSSION:

Development Standards

The subject property is zoned for low density residential use, which allows development of a single family dwelling and structures accessory to any principal use, subject to the granting of a Coastal Administrative Permit in each case. The development standards for the Low Density Residential or "LDR" are identified in Title 20, Section 20.14.060. The project meets all required setbacks and height restrictions. The allowed maximum site coverage and floor area ratio (FAR) are 15% and 17.5%, respectively. The subject property is 68,636 square feet (sf), which allows FAR of sf and 12,011 sf, respectively. Both are met by the proposed project. Due to the project location in the Carmel Area of Special Biological Significance of the Pescadero Watershed, site structural and impervious surface coverage is limited to 9,000 sf per DMF LUP Policy 77. The project will have a total impervious site coverage of 9,000 sf and an additional 1,005 sf of pervious pavers in the driveway. The project meets the Pescadero Watershed limitation on impervious surfaces. The Plans are presented as Exhibit B.

Design Review

The Design Control zoning overlay on the parcel requires a Design Approval for the proposed new dwelling, garage and guesthouse, and fence. The proposed accessory structure and fence will match the architectural style and colors and materials of the main residence, which is Italianate/Mediterranean. The colors and materials are proposed to be beige colored stucco body and warm red "Teja Bianco Blend" classic tapered mission tile roof, dark copper gutters, dark bronze windows and front and garage doors. The driveway pavers are proposed to be cream, tan and brown. The proposed terrace tiles are limestone. The design also includes a set of 14-foot-wide wrought iron gates and 663 linear feet of 6-foot-tall wood fence and 479 linear feet of wire fence. Colors and Materials are presented in Exhibit B.

Although the subject property has the potential to be within the viewshed from Point Lobos pursuant to Figure 3 of the DMF LUP, Visual Resources, it was determined not to impact any public views in a site investigation by the planner. Pine trees will also continue to surround the property and shield the development from any public views. The project, as designed, sited and conditioned, assures protection of the public viewshed, is consistent with neighborhood character, and assures visual integrity. As proposed, the project would not result in adverse visual impacts, and the project is consistent with the applicable scenic resource policies of the DMF LUP.

Development on an area occupied by sensitive plant species

As illustrated on the site plan, most of the area proposed for development is occupied by sensitive, but not listed, plant species. A biological report prepared by Pat Regan on December 30, 2021 (LIB220044) evaluated the health and conservation for the Hookers manzanita (*Arctostaphylos hookeri ssp hookeri*, California Rare Plant Rank 1B.1) and small-leaved lomatium (*Lomatium parvifolium*, Rare plant rank 4.2) on the parcel. In an Appendix to the biological report, Regan proposed a compensatory planting plan which would both transplant the individuals to the greatest extent possible and require planting of new individuals at a ratio of 1:1.5 in a comparable area of the parcel. The area would then be put into a conservation and scenic easement. These reports are presented as Exhibit E. These actions adhere to the requirements of DMF LUP Resource Management Policies 8 and 12, and the Monterey County Coastal Implementation Plan (Part 5) section 20.147.040 and reflect the spirit of the DMF LUP resource management policies, in that they

“must also be understood in terms of Pebble Beach Company’s Concept Plan described in Chapter 3 [of the DMF LUP]. Pebble Beach Company is the owner of the vast majority of the undeveloped land in Del Monte Forest and the Concept Plan was developed to provide certainty as to the ultimate disposition of that land under the LUP. The Concept Plan includes provisions for the Company to dedicate and preserve most of its undeveloped land, and for it to develop and redevelop a limited number of other areas, some of which include certain natural resources. The Concept Plan allows for certain resource impacts to ESHA, wetlands, dunes, streams, and riparian corridors in these limited areas notwithstanding other LUP policies protecting such resources in recognition of the significant permanent open space protection that would correspondingly be applied to the overwhelming majority of the Pebble Beach Company’s significant undeveloped lands.”
(DMF LUP Chapter 2 Introduction, pg. 7)

The DMF Coastal Implementation Plan (Part 5) section 20.147.040.A. guidance on protection of ESHA notes that “stands of native Monterey pine forest less than 20 acres that provide specific documented ecosystem functions, such as the provision of habitat for rare species (e.g., Yadon’s piperia or Hooker’s Manzanita) or rare communities (e.g., central maritime chaparral), or that are very close to or connected to large areas of forest may also be considered ESHA because of their especially valuable ecosystem functions.” The subject parcel abuts a Monterey Pine forest in the drainage on the south that is greater than 20 acres but this site is surrounded by residential dwellings on the northeast and southwest, and a road to the north. Therefore, this parcel’s stand is not especially valuable toward ecosystem function, as the Biological Report attends, although it is closely connected to contiguous Monterey Pine forest on one side.

On the property, there is an isolated area, approximately 4,000 square feet in size, containing maritime chaparral habitat. Within the chaparral habitat are the Hooker’s Manzanita and lomatium plants (rare

plants). The project will impact the chaparral community including the sensitive plants. Due to slopes, access, and lot size, impacts to 63 Hooker's Manzanita and approximately 50 small-leaved lomatium cannot be avoided in this case. In compliance with the Del Monte Forest Land Use Plan policies, the biologist suggests transplanting and replanting the manzanita and lomatium plants in an appropriate area of the property that will ensure long-term maintenance of the habitat on the property. A compensatory planting plan proposes to transplant the Hooker's Manzanitas to a suitable area on the subject parcel and to cause additional planting of them in the same area to sum to a ratio of 1:1.5. The plan proposes an attempt to transplant the small-leaved lomatium and additional planting of container stock in the same area to sum to a ratio of 1:1. Control of non-native invasive plants and enhancement of the compensatory planting area are also prescribed. The success criteria for the plan are proposed to be 75% survival of all container stock plantings and 50% survival of transplanted Manzanita and small-leaved lomatium plants in the fall of the third year of monitoring. A condition has been applied to the project requiring the replacement of Hooker's Manzanita and small-leaved lomatium on these ratios and following the plan. Another condition has been applied requiring the dedication of a conservation and scenic easement over the area containing the relocated plants.

Tree removal

An arborist report and forest management plan prepared by Frank Ono on October 13, 2020 (LIB210210) evaluated the health, structure, and preservation suitability for each tree within or adjacent to the proposed development. Nine living protected Monterey Pine trees were found to be impacted by the development. Ono recommended two dead Monterey Pines also be removed. A replacement planting plan as well as protection of trees near grading and construction are required as conditions of approval. The arborist report is presented as Exhibit F. An early draft of the plans would have required removal of two more Monterey Pine trees. The driveway was redesigned to avoid them.

CEQA:

California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Guidelines Section 15303 categorically exempts the first single family dwelling and accessory structures on a residential parcel. The project meets this exemption. No evidence of significant adverse environmental effects were identified during staff review of the development application. A small area of sensitive plants which are classified in the DMF LUP as ESHA and fewer than ten Monterey Pines will be impacted and the onsite remediation proposed in accordance with the Del Monte Forest Coastal Implementation Plan compensates for the minor impact sufficiently and effectively. Given the size, location, and nature of the chaparral community on this property, this site is not considered to be a particularly sensitive environment that would preclude the application of a categorical exemption (Section 15300.2 of the CEQA Guidelines).

OTHER AGENCY INVOLVEMENT:

Environmental Health Bureau

Pebble Beach Community Services District - Fire Protection District

LUAC:

The project was referred to the Del Monte Forest Land Use Advisory Committee (LUAC) for review. The LUAC, at a duly-noticed public meeting on March 3, 2022, voted 7 - 0, with one absent member, to support the project as proposed. A letter to the LUAC expressed concern with the development's siting on the front corner of the parcel. The architect explained before the LUAC that

the purpose for the siting was to keep the buildings off the slopes found on the rest of the parcel. The minutes are presented as Exhibit C.

Prepared by: Mary Israel, Senior Planner, x5183

Reviewed by: Craig Spencer, HCD Chief of Planning

Approved by: Craig Spencer, HCD Chief of Planning

The following attachments are on file with HCD:

Exhibit A - Project Data Sheet

Exhibit B - Draft Resolution, including:

- Conditions of Approval
- Site Plan, Floor Plans, Elevations, Fuel Management Plan
- Colors and Materials

Exhibit C - Del Monte Forest LUAC Minutes (March 3, 2022)

Exhibit D - Vicinity Map

Exhibit E - Biological Report and Compensatory Planting Plan (LIB220044)

Exhibit F - Arborist Report and Forest Management Plan (LIB210210)

cc: Front Counter Copy; Pebble Beach Community Services District (Fire Protection District); HCD-Environmental Services; HCD-Engineering Services; Environmental Health Bureau; Mary Israel, Project Planner; Craig Spencer, Chief of Planning; Joy and Robert Walker, Property Owners; Bill Mefford, Agent; Linda Sinsar, Interested Party; The Open Monterey Project (Molly Erickson); LandWatch; Project File PLN200274