



County of Monterey Planning Commission

Item No.4

Agenda Item No. 4

Board of Supervisors
Chambers
168 W. Alisal St., 1st Floor
Salinas, CA 93901

Legistar File Number: PC 22-085

October 12, 2022

Introduced: 9/30/2022

Current Status: Agenda Ready

Version: 1

Matter Type: Planning Item

PLN210324 - CURRAN

Public hearing to consider the construction of a 2,948 square foot single family dwelling with a 321 square foot porch, a 681 square foot garage, a 640 square foot outdoor dining area, a pool, and removal of three Coast Live Oak trees.

Project Location: 9 Wild Boar Run, Carmel - Santa Lucia Preserve (Assessor's Parcel Number 239-102-010-000), Carmel Valley Master Plan

Proposed CEQA action: Consider an addendum together with the the Potero Subdivision Environmental Impact Report (SCH #: 2002051095)

RECOMMENDATIONS:

It is recommended that the Planning Commission adopt a resolution to:

- 1) Certify that an addendum has been considered together with the Potrero Subdivision (State Clearing House No. 2002051095) pursuant to CEQA Guidelines Section 15164; and
- 2) Approve a Combined Development Permit consisting of:
 - a. An Administrative Permit and Design Approval to allow the construction of a 2,948 square foot single story family dwelling with a 321 square foot porch, a 681 square foot detached garage, a 640 square foot outdoor dining area/pool terrace and associated site improvements; and
 - b. A Use Permit to allow the removal of (3) protected Coast live oak trees.

The attached draft resolution includes findings and evidence for consideration (**Exhibit A**). Staff recommends approval subject to 10 conditions of approval.

PROJECT INFORMATION:

Agent: Doug Shaffer - McHenry Shaffer Architecture

Property Owner: Pat & Janet Curran

APN: 239-102-010-000

Parcel Size: 13.3 acres, inclusive of 2.4 acres for Homeland size

Zoning: RG/10-D-S-RAZ (Rural Grazing, 10 acres per unit -Design Control, Site and Residential Allocation Zoning District Overlays)

Plan Area: Carmel Valley Master Plan

Flagged and Staked: Yes

SUMMARY:

Located approximately 4.2 miles east of Highway 1, and 2.1 miles south of Carmel Valley Road, the project site is part of the Santa Lucia Preserve Subdivision (Lot E7), Phase E, the Potrero Subdivision. Phase E of the Santa Lucia Preserve is in a densely forested rural area of Carmel Valley

containing 29 lots ranging in size from 14-67 acres. Each parcel contains dedicated homeland boundaries (building envelopes) ranging in size from 2 to 4 acres. This is an undeveloped lot that is 13.3 acres in size with the homeland boundary being 2.4 acres. The remaining acreage outside of the homeland boundaries oak woodlands.

Doug Shaffer (agent) on behalf of Pat and Janet Curran propose to construct a one story single family dwelling, a screened porch, a detached garage, an outdoor dining area/ pool terrace, and associated site improvements within the homeland boundary of Lot E7 of the Potrero subdivision. The majority of the proposed building footprint is located in previously disturbed and impacted natural woodland clearings. The development does not appear to be situated on slopes greater than 30% grade and the design of the home is consistent with development patterns in the Santa Lucia Preserve. Construction of the home, accessory structures, septic system, related grading and site improvements involves removal of three (3) trees. The Portero Subdivision EIR assumed a certain number of trees would be removed for development within each specific homeland boundary. No tree removal was assigned to lot E7 in the EIR. As such, a Use Permit is required for the removal of three additional trees and an addendum to the previously certified EIR is needed to reflect the change in the number of trees removed for development of Lot E7. The total number of trees anticipated for removal within the Portero Subdivision will be exceeded as a result of this project.

DISCUSSION:

Tree Assessment:

Removal of trees is subject to regulations contained in Section 21.64.260 of the Monterey County Zoning Ordinance, Title 21 which requires making a finding that the tree removal is the minimum required under the circumstances of the case and that the removal will not involve a risk of adverse environmental impacts. For this project, a report was prepared by Rob Thompson, dated January 2022. Three Coast live oak trees ranging from 12 inches to 16 inches in diameter are proposed for removal to accommodate construction of the proposed single family dwelling and associated site improvements. None of these trees to be removed meet "landmark" definition (24 inches or more in diameter when measured two feet above the ground, or trees which are visually significant, historically significant, or exemplary of their species).

In this case, the home is designed to take advantage of the flattest area of the lot and to preserve the largest number of trees within the homeland boundary. The location of the home is near the front of the homeland boundary which translates to the least amount of grading and overall disturbance to the property. The proposed structures and driveway are designed around several landmark oak trees and away from larger clusters of oaks on the property. Three trees (12, 13, and 16 inches in diameter) are proposed for removal near the proposed garage and emergency vehicle turnaround area.

Thompson reviewed the proposal and concluded that the tree removal will not create a significant impacts to the surrounding oak woodland. Tree protection measures are suggested to protect a number of trees near the proposed construction. These protective measures have been incorporated as a condition of approval (Condition #4). Also recommended by the forester (Thompson), a condition of approval requiring replanting of 9 oak trees has been included in this permit. This amount represents a 3:1 replacement ratio for non-landmark trees as recommended by the arborist and to compensate for possible failure of some new trees to achieve the 90% success rate (Condition No. 6).

Staff has reviewed the forester recommendations which include limig of trees, it will be implemented part of the project (See Exhibit E).

Design Review:

The site is zoned Rural Grazing, 10 acres per unit, with Design Control, Site Plan Review, and Residential Allocation Zoning overlays (RG/10-D-S-RAZ). The Santa Lucia Preserve has been designed with homeland boundaries (building envelopes) dedicated for development. The proposed structures will be located within the homeland boundary.

Maximum allowed structure height is 35 feet for main structures and 35 feet for accessory structures. The proposed bedroom wing and main home is 16 feet and 7 inches in height from average natural grade, consistent with the height limit for main structures; the garage is 14 feet and 4 inches in height from average natural grade; and the outdoor dining area/ pool house is 16 feet 10 inches in height from average natural grade, consistent with the height limit for accessory structures. The allowed site coverage maximum in the Rural Grazing (RG) district is 5%. The property is 13.3 acres or 579,348 square feet, which would allow a max site coverage of approximately 28,967 square foot. The proposed single-family dwelling (2,948 sq. ft.), a (321 sq. ft.) screened porch, a (681 sq. ft.) detached garage, and a (640 sq. ft.) outdoor dining area/ pool terrace that would result in total site coverage of .0079%. Therefore, as proposed, the project meets all required development standards.

Staff has determined that the proposed residence is compatible with the surrounding neighborhood character in terms of size, color and location. The architecture design is simple and blends in well with the natural environment consistent with other homes in the Santa Lucia Preserve, and the proposed structures are not visible from any public viewing area. Enhancing the architecture style, the structures incorporate earth tone colors and materials that consist of limestone retaining walls, adobe brick building exterior walls, clay tile roofing, painted olive green wood posts and beams, as well introducing standing seam metal roofing over some areas of the main dwelling. As required on the exterior lighting plan, all proposed site lighting is downlit, shielded, and unobtrusive.

This project will be served by the Santa Lucia Preserve Community Services District (CSD) for potable domestic water and an on-site septic system will provide sewage disposal capacity. The project does not involve development on slopes in excess of 30%. The grading will consist of approximately 400 cubic yards of cut and 400 cubic yards of fill.

CEQA:

An addendum to the previously certified EIR has been prepared to reflect the removal of three trees on Lot E7 of the subdivision. This change does not alter the conclusions within the SEIR and does not trigger substantial revisions to the previously certified SEIR. There have been no substantial changes in the project, no changes in circumstance, and no new information which would require major revisions to the previous SEIR. The SEIR considered the potential for residential development within the homeland boundaries for each of the 29 lots created. The subject project includes residential development within the homeland boundary on one of those lots. The increase in three additional trees does not result in new or substantially more severe impacts. Tree removal counts are still within the total number of trees analyzed in the SEIR (280).

OTHER AGENCY INVOLVEMENT:

The following agencies have reviewed the project, have comments, and/or have recommended conditions:

HCD-Engineering Services
Environmental Health Bureau
HCD-Environmental Services
Monterey County Fire Protection District

Prepared by: Marlene Garcia, Assistant Planner, x5114
Reviewed and Approved by: Anna Quenga, AICP, Principal Planner

The following attachments are on file with HCD:

- Exhibit A - Draft Resolution including:
- Conditions of Approval
 - Site Plans, Floor Plans & Elevations
- Exhibit B - Addendum to EIR
Exhibit C - Vicinity Map
Exhibit D - Arborist Report
Exhibit E - Tree Replacement Plan
Exhibit F - Lot Specific Fuel Management Plan For Lot E7 (Forest Management Plan)
Exhibit G - Santa Lucia DRB Letter Approval of Design
Exhibit H - Santa Lucia Preserve updated Tree Removal Matrix

cc: Front Counter Copy; Monterey County Fire Protection District; HCD-Environmental Services; HCD-Engineering Services; Environmental Health Bureau; Marlene Garcia, Assistant Planner; Anna Quenga, AICP, Principal Planner; Pat & Janet Curran, Property Owners; Joel Panzer, Agent; The Open Monterey Project; LandWatch (Executive Director); Planning File PLN210324