

Attachment H

This page intentionally left blank.

**Before the Historic Resources Review Board in and for the
County of Monterey, State of California**

Bixby Rock LLC (PLN210228)

Resolution No. 22-005

Resolution by the Monterey County Historic Resources Review Board (HRRB) recommending the Monterey County Board of Supervisors approve of a Combined Development Permit (PLN210228) for the demolition of an existing 4,952 square foot single family dwelling and construction a replacement 5,235 square foot single family dwelling and associated site improvements. The property is located at 39140 Highway 1 (Assessor's Parcel Number 418-121-050-000 and 418-121-051-000), Big Sur Coast Land Use Plan, Coastal Zone.

WHEREAS, this matter was heard by the Historic Resources Review Board (HRRB) of the County of Monterey on June 2, 2022, pursuant to the regulations for the Preservation of Historic Resources contained in Monterey County Code Chapter 18.25.

WHEREAS, the property is located at 39140 Highway 1, Carmel Highlands (Assessor's Parcel Number 418-121-050-000 and 418-121-051-000), Big Sur Coast Land Use Plan, Coastal Zone.

WHEREAS, Aengus L. Jeffers (agent) filed with the County of Monterey, an application for a Combined Development Permit consisting of: 1) Coastal Administrative Permit to allow demolition of a 4,952 square foot single family dwelling and construction of a 5,235 square foot single family dwelling and associated site improvements; 3) Coastal Development Permit to allow development within the Critical Viewshed; 4) Coastal Development Permit to allow development within 100 feet of Environmentally Sensitive Habitat Areas; and 5) a Conservation and Scenic Easement amendment.

WHEREAS, the property is developed with an approximately 4,952 square foot single-family home, designed by Gregory Ain in the Mid-Century Modern architectural style and constructed in 1959. The site also contains a guesthouse completed in 1967 and designed by local architect Will Shaw, and engineering remnants of the hoisting apparatus constructed on Bixby Point by the Monterey Lime Company in the early 1900s.

WHEREAS, although the 1967 guesthouse retains historical integrity and significance, the 1959 residence would not be considered historically significant or contributing to the historical character of the site, due to the alterations completed in the 1980's that impacted the integrity of the historic design of the main residence. The guesthouse, engineering remnants and hoisting apparatus are proposed to remain unaltered.

WHEREAS, Seth A. Bergstein prepared a Phase I Historic Assessment assessing the property's eligibility for local listing on the Monterey County Register of Historic Resources, California

Register of Historic Resources, and National Register of Historic Places. This report, dated February 15, 2021, is available in HCD-Planning library file LIB220112. The evaluation found that the main home on the property does not qualify for listing as a historic resource because substantial changes have been made that impacted the integrity of the original design. County staff independently reviewed this report and concurs with its conclusions.

WHEREAS, the residence no longer retains integrity or conveys significance. Original character defining features of the residence have been adversely altered with additions and modifications made in the 1980s. Alterations included a master bedroom addition, garage conversion, changes to fenestration, replacement of siding, and mass of the structure. These changes have affected the workmanship, mass and design of the house which have impacted the feeling of association to a point where the building no longer qualifies as an historic resource.

WHEREAS, the project was referred to the Big Sur Land Use Advisory Committee (LUAC) on April 26, 2022. At the April 26, 2022 meeting, the LUAC members voted four to zero to recommend approval of the project with changes including confirmation that windows and roof mounted solar panels are non-reflective and the west elevation of the residence will not block ocean views, and the addition of native vegetation to screen the western elevation.

WHEREAS, the project planner conducted a site visit on April 21, 2022 to review the project site and proposed development for consistency with the applicable policies and regulations.

WHEREAS, at the conclusion of the hearing, the matter was submitted to the HRRB for a recommendation. Having considered all the written and documentary information submitted, oral testimony, and other evidence presented before the HRRB, the HRRB rendered its decision to adopt findings and evidence to recommend approval of the Combined Development Permit, subject to the following findings:

Finding: The HRRB concurs with the project specific Phase I Historic Assessment regarding “integrity” and the proposed project is not eligible for listing on the Monterey County Register of Historic Resources.

Evidence:

1. Regulations for the Preservation of Historic Resources as contained in Monterey County Code Chapter 18.25
2. National Register Bulletin 15: How to Apply the National Register Criteria for Evaluation
3. Phase I Historic Assessment (LIB220112) prepared by Seth A. Bergstein, Pacific Grove, CA, February 15, 2022.
4. Oral testimony and HRRB discussion during the public hearing and the administrative record.
5. The application, plans, and supporting materials submitted by the project applicant to Monterey County HCD-Planning for the proposed development found in project file PLN210228

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED THAT, it is the decision of the County of Monterey Historic Resources Review Board to:

1. Find that the main residence on the property does not retain integrity;
2. That the project will not adversely affect the remaining historic guesthouse and remnants of the Monterey Lime Company infrastructure; and
3. Recommend approval to the Board of Supervisors of the Bixby Rock LLC Combined Development Permit as presented.

PASSED AND ADOPTED this **2nd day of June, 2022**, upon motion of Kellie Morgantini, seconded by Judy MacClelland, by the following vote:

AYES: Judy MacClelland, John Scourkes, Salvador Munoz, Sheila Lee Prader, Belinda Taluban, Kellie Morgantini

NOES: None

ABSENT: Michael Bilich

ABSTAIN: None

DocuSigned by:
Philip Angelo
1695450DE57483...

Attest

Philip Angelo, HRRB Secretary

June 2, 2022

This page intentionally left blank