

# Attachment A

This page intentionally left blank.

## **DRAFT RESOLUTION**

### **Before the Historic Resources Review Board in and for the County of Monterey, State of California**

Resolution No. 23-XXX

#### **PLN230203 - COUNTY OF MONTEREY (PORTER-VALLEJO MANSION)**

Resolution by the Monterey County Historic  
Resources Review Board (HRRB) recommending  
that the Planning Commission:

- 1) Find that repair and rehabilitation of the historic property qualifies for a Class 31 categorical exemptions pursuant to CEQA Guidelines section 15331; and
- 2) Approve of a Use Permit to allow alterations to a historic resource (Porter Vallejo Mansion), including repair and replacement of roofing, siding, and windows; repair and relocation of mechanical equipment including exterior screening to hide equipment; replacing the front porch decking; repairs to front railing; mothballing of a detached water tower; and removal of a trellis, fencing and play equipment.

**WHEREAS**, this matter was heard by the Historic Resources Review Board (HRRB) of the County of Monterey on October 5, 2023, on November 2, 2023, and on December 7, 2023, pursuant to Title 21 Section 21.54.050.A and Title 18 Section 18.25.170 of the Monterey County Code.

**WHEREAS**, the property is located at 29 Bishop Street, Royal Oaks (Assessor's Parcel Number 117-323-013-000), North County Area Plan, and the Porter Vallejo Mansion has been listed on the Monterey County Register of Historic Resources and on the National Register of Historical Places.

**WHEREAS**, County of Monterey Public Works, Facilities and Parks (PWFP) filed with the County of Monterey an application for a Use Permit to allow alterations to a historic resource (Porter Vallejo Mansion), including repair and replacement of roofing, siding, and windows; repair and relocation of mechanical equipment including exterior screening to hide equipment; replacement of front porch decking; repairs to front railing; mothballing of a detached water tower; and removal of a trellis, fencing and play equipment.

**WHEREAS**, The Porter Vallejo Mansion was listed on the National Register of Historic Places on January 4, 1990. The mansion is significant under NRHP Criterion B for its association with

John Porter, who was a major force in the development of the Pajaro Valley; and under NRHP Criterion C for its remodeled design by Architect William Weeks, who transformed the home into a Queen Anne style while retaining its original Gothic Revival features. A detached water tower is also on the site and is a contributing structure to the site's significance.

**WHEREAS**, a historical narrative was prepared on August 28, 2023, by RIM Architects (LET\_Larsen\_PLN230203\_082823) further describes the mansion's significance. It was owned by John Porter, a prominent business and community leader for the Pajaro Community. John Porter had the one and a half story home moved from the Vallejo property to its current location at 29 Bishop Street and hired Architect William Weeks to convert the Gothic Revival home into a 23-room three-story Queen Anne style mansion while also maintaining the home's original Gothic Revival features. The mansion is also a significant historical example of architect William Week's early work.

**WHEREAS**, the project proposes to remove the existing mechanical equipment and ductwork from the basement and installation of new low profile equipment throughout the building interior to allow the equipment to be permanently located 1'-0" above the level of the base flood per FEMA Code of Federal Regulations, Section 44 CFR 59.1. Relocating utilities above established flood risk levels is recommended by the Secretary of the Interior's (SOI) Guideline on Flood Adaption for Rehabilitating Historic buildings. The proposed equipment will have one single exterior penetration per unit, totaling seven penetrations. The location of the units have been placed to maintain the integrity of the building's seismic upgrades and minimize the visual impact on the exterior; none are located on the primary façade. Previous versions of the project plans proposed three exterior heat pumps that will be located on concrete pads around the perimeter of the building. This has been revised to two pumps on a single pad behind the south elevation of the building within a lattice screening enclosure.

**WHEREAS**, there is evidence of water intrusion at the exterior envelope. Proposed work includes removing and replacing the roofing, removing existing ship lap siding, waterproofing the building envelope and installing flashing around the windows, and re-installing/replacing the siding. The existing 1874 siding on the north elevation scored to give the appearance of masonry is in good condition and will be cleaned/remain in place. Windows will be repaired if possible. If the windows are too damaged, the applicant is proposing to rebuild the wood double-hung windows custom milled to match the exiting windows. There are a total of 78 windows on the building, 68 of which are in fair to good condition and can be cleaned and repaired where needed. 10 windows are in poor condition and will need to be replaced. Previous iterations of the proposed project plans including replacing portions of the west and entire south façade with a thermally modified wood, while the remaining facades would have their siding removed and re-installed. This has been changed so that only the south face of a non-contributing 1924 addition would have its siding removed and replaced with a thermally modified wood product. The remaining ship lap siding will be catalogued, numbered, stored in a dry place, cleaned, repainted, and re-installed, with the exception of individual members that are damaged beyond repair. Siding removed from the 1924 addition would be salvaged and used to replace these damaged members. The thermally treated wood is proposed due to its durability and can be custom milled to match the profile of the existing shiplap siding. Trim will be cleaned and repaired; any trim damaged beyond repair will be replaced in kind. The exterior will be repainted to match the existing colors.

**WHEREAS**, the non-original front porch decking is deteriorated, and the project would replace it with a thermally modified wood product that matches the existing decking's patterns and dimensions. A non-historic lattice below the deck would also be replaced, and the front railing will be cleaned using the gentlest means possible and re-painted.

**WHEREAS**, due to its current deterioration, the applicants are proposing mothballing the water tower until a new use for it can be identified. Proposed mothballing will be consistent with National Park Service Preservation Brief 31, the work will include structurally stabilizing the building, repairing and coating the siding, installing new corner trims to secure the siding, and cleaning up the exterior. New flashing and a metal cap will be installed to cover an existing opening on the roof where the (now removed) water tower tank was located. The building will be secured from break-ins and vandalism. Recommended Condition of Approval No. 2 would require the applicant to provide a report detailing how they complied with the mothballing plan.

**WHEREAS**, additional site improvements will include removing the children's play equipment, chain link fence, and wood trellis and replacing them with a hardscape/landscaped community space and installation of a three-foot-tall white picket fence.

**WHEREAS**, a Phase II Historic Assessment was prepared on November 20, 2023, by Meg Clovis (LIB230334) evaluating the project for consistency with the Secretary of Interior's (SOI) Standards for Rehabilitation. The report includes discussion of the Guidelines for Flood Adaptation for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, and the appropriate National Parks Service Preservation Briefs. Based on the assessment, the project will be consistent with the SOI's Standards for Rehabilitation with the recommendations included in the report, which are incorporated as Condition No. 1 – 3.

**WHEREAS**, CEQA Guidelines section 15331 categorically exempts projects limited to the maintenance, repair, stabilization, rehabilitation, restoration, preservation, conservation, or reconstruction of historical resources in a manner consistent with the Secretary of the Interior Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties. The project consists of the repair and rehabilitation of a historic property, consistent with the intent of this exemption, and none of the exceptions from CEQA guidelines section 15300.2 apply in this case.

**THEREFORE, BE IT RSOLVED**, that having considered all the written and documentary information submitted, oral testimony, and other evidence presented before the HRRB, the HRRB recommended approval of the Use Permit to allow alterations to a historic resource (Porter Vallejo Mansion), including repair and replacement of roofing, siding, and windows; repair and relocation of mechanical equipment including exterior screening to hide equipment; replacement of front porch decking; repairs to front railing; mothballing of a detached water tower; and removal of a trellis, fencing and play equipment, subject to the following findings and recommended conditions:

Finding: The recommendation for repair and rehabilitation of the historic property qualifies for a Class 31 categorical exemptions pursuant to CEQA Guidelines section 15331

Finding: In accordance with Title 21 section 21.54.060.E., the proposed alterations, as conditioned, do not significantly and adversely affect the historic, archaeological, architectural, or engineering integrity of the resource.

Evidence:

1. Regulations for Historic Resources Zoning Districts or “HR” Districts as contained in the Monterey County Code Chapter 21.54.
2. Regulations for the Preservation of Historic Resources as contained in Monterey County Code Chapter 18.25.
3. The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation
4. The Secretary of the Interior’s Guidelines on Flood Adaption for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings
5. National Parks Service Preservation Bulletins Preservation Briefs 6, 9, 16, 31, 39, and 45
6. The Porter Vallejo Manor National Register of Historic Places Nomination Form (LIB230273)
7. Phase II Historical report (LIB230334) prepared by Meg Clovis, Salinas, CA, November 20, 2023
8. HRRB Narrative Report (LET\_LARSEN\_PLN230203\_082823) prepared by RIM Architects (RIM), San Francisco, CA, August, 2023.
9. The application, plans, and supporting materials submitted by the project applicant to Monterey County HCD-Planning for the proposed development found in project file PLN230203.
10. The staff report, oral testimony, and HRRB discussion during the public hearing and the administrative record.

Condition 1: **Exterior Siding Repair/Replacement Process:** Ship lap siding removal and re-installation/replacement shall be conducted in accordance with Secretary of Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation #6, the National Parks Service Preservation Brief 16, and the recommendations of the phase II historical report, HCD-Planning file No. LIB230334:

- With the exception of the south elevation of the 1924 addition shown in the phase II report, ship lap siding being removed on all elevations will be catalogued, numbered, stored in a dry place, cleaned, repainted, and re-installed.
- Individual members that are damaged beyond repair shall be replaced with siding salvaged from the south elevation of the 1924 addition.
- Replacement siding on the south elevation of the 1924 addition shall match the historic material in all its visual and physical properties to preserve the historic character of the building and minimize the impact on its integrity.

Prior to issuance of building permits, the Owner/Applicant/Architect shall include a note on the plan set indicating the substitute material being used for the exterior siding in accordance with National Parks Service Preservation Brief 16.

During construction, siding being removed shall be numbered, catalogued, and stored in a dry place.

After installation of the water proofing/flashings, siding shall be re-installed/replaced as indicated in the phase II historical report (LIB230334). Any remaining salvaged boards shall be catalogued and saved in case they're needed in the future.

Condition 2: **Mothballing Water Tower Plan:** The water tower "mothballing" work shall be done in accordance with the National Park Service Preservation Brief 31.

Prior to issuance of building permits, the Owner/Applicant/Architect shall provide a plan detailing the mothball work and how it meets the mothballing standards for review and approval by HCD-Planning.

Prior to final building permit inspection, the Owner/Applicant shall provide evidence to HCD-Planning detailing how they complied with the mothballing plan.

Condition 3: **Additional Report Recommendations:** In accordance with Title 21 section 21.54.080.F, the project plans shall incorporate the recommendations of the phase II historical report (LIB230334), including:

- A ventilation channel shall be included behind the exterior siding to help avoid peeling and blistering paint per National Parks Service Preservation Brief 39.
- Preservation and replacement materials for decorative elements and wood porches shall be undertaken in accordance with National Parks Service Preservation Brief 45.
- Substitute decking materials shall be undertaken in accordance with National Parks Service Preservation Brief 16.
- Cleaning shall be done with the "Gentlest Means Possible" as defined by National Parks Service Preservation Brief 6.
- Windows shall be repaired in accordance with National Parks Service Preservation Brief 9.

Prior to issuance of building permits, the Owner/Applicant/Architect shall place a note on the plans with the text of this condition and implementing actions.

Prior to issuance of building permits, the Owner/Applicant/Architect shall include a ventilation channel behind the exterior siding in accordance with National Parks Service Preservation Brief 39.

Prior to issuance of building permits, the Owner/Applicant/Architect shall include a note on the plan set indicating the substitute material being used for the exterior decking in accordance with National Parks Service Preservation Brief 16.

Prior to issuance of building permits, the Owner/Applicant/Architect shall include a note on the plan set indicating that cleaning shall be done using the "Gentlest Means Possible" and including the definition of Gentlest Means Possible from National Parks Service Preservation Brief 6.

Passed and adopted on this **7<sup>th</sup> day of December 2023**, upon motion of \_\_\_\_\_, seconded by \_\_\_\_\_, by the following vote:

AYES:

NOES:

ABSENT:

ABSTAIN:

\_\_\_\_\_  
Attest

Philip Angelo, HRRB Secretary

December 7<sup>th</sup>, 2023