

Exhibit C

This page intentionally left blank.

MINUTES
Carmel Highlands Land Use Advisory Committee
Monday, September 16, 2024

1. Meeting called to order by Donna Kostigen at 4:05 pm

2. Roll Call

Members Present:

John Borelli, Clyde Freedman, Donna Kostigen, Dan Keig, Norm Leve (5)

Members Absent:

Chip Moreland, Doug Paul (2)

3. Approval of Minutes:

A. September 3, 2024 minutes

Motion: Clyde Freedman (LUAC Member's Name)

Second: Norm Leve (LUAC Member's Name)

Ayes: John Borelli, Clyde Freedman, Donna Kostigen, Dan Keig, Norm Leve (5)

Noes: _____

Absent: Chip Moreland, Doug Paul (2)

Abstain: _____

4. **Public Comments:** The Committee will receive public comment on non-agenda items that are within the purview of the Committee at this time. The length of individual presentations may be limited by the Chair.

N/A

5. Scheduled Item(s)

6. Other Items:

A) Preliminary Courtesy Presentations by Applicants Regarding Potential Projects

N/A

B) Announcements

N/A

7. Meeting Adjourned: 5:55 pm

Minutes taken by: Donna Kostigen

Action by Land Use Advisory Committee Project Referral Sheet

Monterey County Housing & Community Development
1441 Schilling Place 2nd Floor
Salinas CA 93901
(831) 755-5025

Advisory Committee: Carmel Highlands

1. **Project Name:** ERSKINE KIRKE ANDREW TR
 File Number: PLN230311
 Project Location: 157 HWY 1, CARMEL, CA 93923
Assessor's Parcel Number(s): 241-171-001-000
 Project Planner: Marlene Garcia
 Area Plan: Carmel Land Use Plan
Project Description: An application for a Combined Development Permit consisting of: 1) Coastal Administrative Permit and Design Approval to allow a 1,680 square foot as-built concrete scenic deck with composite decking and concrete wall, steps and stone veneer CMU walls; 2) Coastal Development Permit to allow development within 50 feet of a coastal bluff edge; 3) Coastal Development Permit to allow development within ESHA; 4) Coastal Development Permit to allow development on slopes greater than 30%; and 5) Coastal Administrative Permit to allow for development within 750 feet of known archaeological resources. Colors and materials to consist of Carmel Stone (white & tan).

Was the Owner/Applicant/Representative present at meeting? YES X NO

(Please include the names of those present)

Luis Osorio, Kirk Erskin, Tim Erskin, Mellisa Taylor

Was a County Staff/Representative present at meeting? Zoe Zepp (Name)

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Name	Site Neighbor?		Issues / Concerns (suggested changes)
	YES	NO	
NA			

LUAC AREAS OF CONCERN

Concerns / Issues (e.g. site layout, neighborhood compatibility; visual impact, etc)	Policy/Ordinance Reference (If Known)	Suggested Changes - to address concerns (e.g. relocate; reduce height; move road access, etc)
N/A		

ADDITIONAL LUAC COMMENTS

The applicants Land Use Planner presented the project and described the storm caused land slide on the property which necessitated the retention system. The Land Use Planner continued to describe the methods used to ensure stable construction of the retention system. The retention system of the coastal bluff has withstood 25 years of drainage and maintained the coastal bluffs during that period. Materials used were consistent with neighbors and LUAC members agreed that this project was necessary to protect and restore coastal bluffs. A member of the public voiced approval.

RECOMMENDATION:

Motion by: Clyde Freedman (LUAC Member's Name)

Second by: Dan Keig (LUAC Member's Name)

- Support Project as proposed
- Support Project with changes
- Continue the Item

Reason for Continuance: _____

Continue to what date: _____

Ayes: John Borelli, Clyde Freedman, Donna Kostigan, Dan Keig, Norm Leve (5)

Noes: _____

Absent: Chip Moreland, Doug Paul (2)

Abstain: _____

Action by Land Use Advisory Committee Project Referral Sheet

Monterey County Housing & Community Development
1441 Schilling Place 2nd Floor
Salinas CA 93901
(831) 755-5025

Advisory Committee: Carmel Highlands

2. **Project Name:** FAY LAURA J
 File Number: PLN230226
 Project Location: 24723 GUADALUPE ST, CARMEL, CA 93923
Assessor’s Parcel Number(s): 009-141-022-000
 Project Planner: Christina Vu
 Area Plan: Carmel Land Use Plan
Project Description: An application for the demolition of an existing 1,958 square foot two-story single family residence and a 330 square foot detached non-habitable accessory structure; and construction of an approximately 2,904 square foot two-story residence inclusive of an attached underground two-car garage and storage room, an approximately 179 square foot attached guesthouse, and associated site improvements. Grading consisting of approximately 507 cu. yds. of cut.

Was the Owner/Applicant/Representative present at meeting? YES X NO

(Please include the names of those present)

Tom Sloan (Architect), Ernest Culp (Contractor), Laura Fay. Ann Daugherty (neighbor)

Was a County Staff/Representative present at meeting? Christina Vu & Zoe Zepp (Name)

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Name	Site Neighbor?		Issues / Concerns (suggested changes)
	YES	NO	

Ms. Daugherty voiced concerns about the height of the proposed building. She understood that the height was within the county regulations.	X		
Ms. Daugherty voiced concerns about a 50 yr old foundational oak tree whose roots crossed property lines and may be compromised during construction of a retention wall. A request to move the retaining wall, extending root growth, was requested.	X		The applicant dug a trench to expose potential roots and hired an arborist to assess the ongoing longevity of the tree should it be impacted by proposed construction. Both neighbors agreed on the importance of the trees viability. The applicant produced an arborists report indicating that there were three tree roots which would be impacted by proposed construction but would not adversely impact the longevity of the tree. .

LUAC AREAS OF CONCERN

Concerns / Issues (e.g. site layout, neighborhood compatibility; visual impact, etc.)	Policy/Ordinance Reference (If Known)	Suggested Changes - to address concerns (e.g. relocate; reduce height; move road access, etc.)
Roof mass – side views are a massive steel roof		Not addressed
Neighbor side yard landscaping & screening		Not addressed
Drainage concerns		The backyard deck covers the entire backyard property. This section of the property is at the bottom of a steep grade. Drainage needs to be carefully planned and executed.
Obstructed driveway view from proposed driveway walls		Architect demonstrated that this would not be a problem since the wall was very low starting from the street in about 15 feet. The view up and down the street would not be impeded.
Excavation for the guest house and backyard wall could impact a mature oak tree.		This is somewhat covered by the arborist report but extra care needs to be taken since there will be extensive excavation to accommodate the guest house and the wall.

ADDITIONAL LUAC COMMENTS

Neighbor and applicant both voiced the importance of existing trees and the desire to maintain their longevity. LUAC encourages neighbors to acknowledge each other’s concerns and accommodate compromise.

RECOMMENDATION:

Motion by: Dan Keig (LUAC Member's Name)

Second by: Norm Leve (LUAC Member's Name)

X Support Project as proposed

Support Project with changes

Continue the Item

Reason for Continuance: _____

Continue to what date: _____

Ayes: Donna Kostigen, Dan Keig, Norm Leve (3)

Noes: John Borelli, Clyde Freedman (2)

Absent: Chip Moreland, Doug Paul (2)

Abstain: _____