



Monterey County Planning Commission

168 West Alisal Street,
1st Floor
Salinas, CA 93901
831.755.5066

Agenda Item No. 1

Legistar File Number: PC 17-039

June 14, 2017

Introduced: 6/1/2017

Version: 1

Current Status: Agenda Ready

Matter Type: Planning Item

PLN170064 - SMYTHE

Public hearing to consider the construction of a single family dwelling, garage, guesthouse and removal of 26 Oak trees. The property is located at 8 Goodrich Trail, Carmel (Assessor's Parcel Number 239-102-021-000), Carmel Valley Master Plan.

Project Location: 8 Goodrich Trail, Carmel, Carmel Valley Master Plan.

Proposed CEQA action: Consider an Addendum to the Potrero Subdivision Supplemental Environmental Impact Report

RECOMMENDATION:

It is recommended that the Planning Commission adopt a resolution to:

- a. Consider an Addendum to the Potrero Subdivision Supplemental Environmental Impact Report (SEIR)
- b. Adopt a resolution to approve a Combined Development Permit consisting of:
 1. An Administrative Permit and Design Approval to allow the construction of a 4,975square foot two-story single family dwelling with a 1,067 square foot attached garage and a detached 545 square foot guesthouse with an attached shed and handicap access, 1035 cubic yards of associated grading; and
 2. A Use Permit to allow the removal of 26 protected Oak trees.

The attached draft resolution includes findings and evidence for consideration (**Exhibit A**).

Staff recommends approval subject to 20 conditions of approval.

PROJECT INFORMATION:

Agent: Drew Davis

Property Owner: Judy and Scot Smythe

APN: 239-102-021-000

Parcel Size: 34.2 acres

Zoning: RG/10-D-S-RAZ (Rural Grazing, 10 acres per unit -Design Control and Site District Overlay)

Plan Area: Carmel Valley Master Plan

Flagged and Staked: Yes

SUMMARY:

The Smythe parcel is located within the Potrero subdivision, also known as Phase E of the Santa Lucia Preserve. Like all lots in the Preserve, the Smythe property has a designated building envelope that identifies the best location for development to occur. The remainder of the lot is permanently dedicated in a conservation easement

The Smythe project consists of development within the homeland boundary consisting of a two-story single family dwelling, attached garage, detached guesthouse with attached shed and

handicap access. Staff conducted a site visit on February 9, 2017. The project area was staked and flagged and staff determined that the proposed structures were appropriately sited on a relatively flat area within the homeland boundary. The proposed structures will be well screened by existing oak trees. The structures are not visible from any public road and are designed to blend with the natural environment. The proposed design is consistent with surrounding residential development and with the design guidelines of the Santa Lucia Preserve. Development in the Santa Lucia Preserve is subject to approval by the Preserve's Design Review Board. Applicants must receive approval for their projects prior to applying for a permit from the County. The project was approved by the Preserve's Design Review Board and the Carmel Valley Advisory Committee recommended approval. Tree removal is the primary concern with this project; however, the 26 trees proposed for removal represent a reduction in tree removal from a previously approved project, the tree removal is less than 25% of the trees growing within the homeland boundary, and overall tree removal for residential development within the Potrero subdivision is within the 280 approved by the Use Permit.

Environmental impacts for the entire Santa Lucia Preserve were analyzed in Environmental Impact Report SCH #94083019. Subsequently, impacts specific to the Potrero subdivision were analyzed in a Supplemental Environmental Impact Report (SCH #2002051095). The SEIR found that impacts would remain insignificant with the implementation of the proposed Mitigation Measures. Applicable mitigation measures have been incorporated into the Smythe project and the conditions of approval. An addendum has been prepared to address tree removal.

A detailed discussion of Tree Removal is provided in Exhibit B.

OTHER AGENCY INVOLVEMENT:

The following agencies have reviewed the project, have comments, and/or have recommended conditions:

- Environmental Health Bureau
- RMA-Public Works
- RMA-Environmental Services
- Water Resources Agency
- Monterey County Regional Protection District
- Carmel Valley Land Use Advisory Committee

The proposed project was reviewed by the (Carmel Valley Land Use Advisory Committee on April 17, 2017. The LUAC recommended approval of the project by a vote of 7 to 0 (Exhibit C). The LUAC committee members had questions about the tree replacement ratio and the subdivision cap for the guesthouse, but their questions were answered during the meeting and they recommended the project as proposed.

Prepared by: Cheryl Ku, Associate Planner, x6049, Planner
Reviewed by: Jacqueline Onciano, RMA Chief of Planning
Approved by: Carl Holm, AICP, RMA Director

The following attachments are on file with the RMA:
[List attachments included with this item, if applicable]

Example:

Attachments:

Exhibit A - Project Data Sheet

Exhibit B - Discussion

Exhibit C - Draft Resolution including:

- Conditions of approval
- Site Plans

Exhibit D - Carmel Valley LUAC Minutes

Exhibit E - Vicinity Map

Exhibit F - Addendum to the Potrero Subdivision SEIR

Exhibit G - Potrero Tree Status Update May 2017

Exhibit H - Potrero Subdivision Supplemental Environmental Impact Report

Exhibit I - Tree Resource Assessment (LIB170145)

cc: Front Counter Copy; Planning Commission, Brandon Swanson, RMA Services Manager; Drew Davis, Agent; Judith and Scot Smythe, Applicant/Owner; The Open Monterey Project (Molly Erickson); Land Watch (Michael DeLapa, Executive Director); John H. Farrow; Janet Brennan; Project File PLN170064