



Zoning Administrator

Legistar File Number: ZA 24-039

September 26, 2024

Introduced: 9/19/2024

Current Status: Agenda Ready

Version: 2

Matter Type: Zoning Administrator

PLN220274 - REEVES SAMUEL T & ELIZABETH W

Public hearing to consider construction of a 12 square foot addition to the first-floor of an existing 7,536 square foot single family dwelling and the conversion of a permitted Caretaker Unit into the main dwelling living space within 100 feet of Environmentally Sensitive Habitat Area.

Project Location: 1176 Signal Hill Road, Pebble Beach

Proposed CEQA action: Find the project Categorically Exempt pursuant to Section 15301 of the CEQA Guidelines, and there are no exceptions pursuant to Section 15300.2.

RECOMMENDATIONS

It is recommended that the Zoning Administrator adopt a resolution to:

- a. Find that the minor alteration and addition to an existing single family dwelling qualifies for a Class 1 Categorical Exemption pursuant to CEQA Guidelines Section 15301 and there are no exceptions pursuant to Section 15300.2; and
- b. Approve a Combined Development Permit consisting of:
 1. Design Approval to allow construction of a 12 square foot addition to the first-floor of an existing 7,536 square foot single family dwelling and internal remodel of 1,022 square feet of first-floor Caretaker Unit into a bedroom wing of the single family dwelling; and
 2. Coastal Development Permit to allow development within 100 feet of Environmentally Sensitive Habitat Area (ESHA).

The attached draft resolution includes findings and evidence for consideration (**Exhibit A**). Staff recommends approval subject to 7 conditions of approval.

PROJECT INFORMATION

Agent: Izu Ojukwu

Property Owner: Elizabeth and Samuel Reeves

APN: 008-261-010-000

Parcel Size: 2.2-acre (94,308 square feet)

Zoning: Low Density Residential with 1.5 acres per unit with a Design Control overlay in the Coastal Zone or “LDR/1.5-D(CZ)”, Open Space Recreational zoning with a Design Control overlay or “OR-D(CZ)”, Resources Conservation with a Design Control overlay or “RC-D(CZ)”, and “Under Review”

Plan Area: Del Monte Forest Land Use Plan

Flagged and Staked: Yes

SUMMARY

The subject property is a 2.2-acre lot located at 1176 Signal Hill Road within the unincorporated community of Pebble Beach, approximately 900 feet east of the Pacific Ocean and 3 miles west of Highway 1. The applicant is pursuing a Combined Development Permit consisting of a Design Approval to allow construction of a 12 square foot addition to the first-floor of an existing 7,536 square foot single family dwelling and internal remodel of 1,022 square feet of first-floor permitted Caretaker Unit to create a bedroom wing for the main dwelling, and Coastal Development Permit to allow development within 100 feet of Environmentally Sensitive Habitat Area (**Exhibit A, Attachment 2**).

The parcel is predominately zoned Low Density Residential with 1.5 acres per unit with a Design Control overlay in the Coastal Zone or “LDR/1.5-D(CZ)” which allows a single family dwelling and an accessory dwelling unit (formerly Caretake Unit) per legal lot of record, subject to the granting of the appropriate Coastal Administrative Permits. The single family dwelling and accessory structures are existing and permitted and the proposed development is limited to the remodel and minor addition to these structures. Therefore, the project is an allowed land use for this site. The parcel is bounded by a golf course which is zoned Open Space Recreational zoning with a Design Control overlay or “OR-D(CZ)” to the south and southwest, as well as Resources Conservation with a Design Control overlay or “RC-D(CZ)” to the east and zoning “Under Review” to the north over identified Coastal Dune habitat. The project as proposed would not impact the adjacent Dune complex or existing Dune habitat on site.

In 1998, the existing guest bedroom wing was permitted to be converted to a Caretaker Unit (Zoning Administrator Resolution No. PLN970377). Caretaker Units are currently considered Accessory Dwelling Units (ADUs) in accordance with a revision to Monterey County Code. Based on staff analysis, the proposed project is consistent with all rules and regulations pertaining to zoning uses and any other applicable provisions of the 1982 Monterey County General Plan, Del Monte Forest Land Use Plan, Del Monte Forest Coastal Implementation Plan, Part 5.

DISCUSSION

Development Standards

The development standards for the LDR zoning district are identified in Title 20 Section 20.14.060. Required setbacks for main dwelling units are 30 feet (front), 20 feet (rear), and 20 feet (sides). The maximum allowed height is 30 feet. Required setbacks for habitable accessory structures are 50 feet (front) with 6 feet side and rear setbacks and the maximum height limit allowed is 15 feet, unless it is attached to the main structure (see Title 20 Section 20.62.030.D). As proposed, the two-story converted bedroom wing would be attached to the main residence and maintain the existing compliant 30 foot (front), 20 foot (sides), and exceed the rear setbacks. The existing height will remain 19 feet 7 inches. Conversion of the Caretaker Unit includes removal of the kitchen and return the unit to a conventional first-floor wing of the main residence. Therefore, the applicant has complied with the development standards listed in Title 20.

Pursuant to Title 20 Section 20.14.060.E, the maximum building site coverage is 15 percent. The

property is 2.2 acres or approximately 94,308 square feet, which allows site coverage of 14,146 square feet. The proposed project results in site coverage of 6,437 square feet which equals 6.8 percent. The maximum allowed floor area ratio (FAR) is 17.5 percent or 16,504 square feet for parcels within the Del Monte Forest. The project proposes a FAR of 6,576 square feet or 6.9 percent which is below the maximum allowed. Therefore, as proposed, the project meets the required coverage limitations.

Design Review

The project site is located on Signal Hill which overlooks the Pacific Ocean along 17 Mile Drive. Development in this area must be compatible and subordinate to the protection of scenic and visual resources which is regulated by the Del Monte Forest Land Use Plan (DMF LUP). Proposed exterior colors and materials will remain unchanged which match the existing brown wood shingled siding of the single family dwelling. The exterior finishes described above blend with the surrounding environment, are consistent with the surrounding eclectic residential neighborhood character, and other dwellings in the neighborhood. Furthermore, the proposed development is consistent with the residential aesthetics of the Signal Hill area (**Exhibit A, Attachment 2**).

The site is located on the inland (eastern) side of 17 Mile Drive when driving southbound along the Pacific Ocean and will not have the potential to impact visual access to the coastline or a public viewshed. The proposed project is situated on a parcel tucked back on a hillside overlooking the Spyglass Hill Golf Course. The existing structure is naturally screened from 17 Mile Drive by mature Monterey cypress trees along the western property line. The project does not propose new fences or additional accessory structures that could obscure public views from Fanshell Beach, Bird Rock or Cypress Point Rock. Staff conducted a public viewshed determination of the development from 17 Mile Drive and found that staking and flagging of the addition were not visible. Staff concluded that there would be no impact on a public viewshed. As proposed, the project assures protection of the public viewshed, is consistent with neighborhood character, and assures visual integrity.

Health and Safety

Necessary public utilities are available and have existed onsite. Water is provided to the parcel by the California American Water Company (Cal Am) and sewage disposal is provided by the Carmel Wastewater District (CAWD) via the Pebble Beach Community Services District. On January 28, 1998, the existing guest bedroom wing was converted to a Caretaker Unit which included a kitchen facility (Zoning Administrator Resolution No. PLN970377). As discussed above, the conversion would remove the existing kitchen facility, therefore, reducing the water fixture count for the property.

Environmentally Sensitive Habitat Area (ESHA)

The site is located in an area of a remnant Coastal Dune complex which is considered ESHA according to the DMF LUP. In accordance with the applicable policies of the DMF LUP and the Monterey County Zoning Ordinance (Title 20), a Coastal Development Permit is required. The project includes a minor addition with interior alterations to a caretaker wing attached to an existing single family dwelling. The 12 square foot addition to the proposed bedroom wing would occur on the existing hardscape located along the eastern side of the structure. As proposed, the addition would not further encroach on, disturb, or remove the adjacent Dune scrub habitat. In accordance with DMF LUP Policies 12, 14, and 16, a biological report was required for the project. A Biological Assessment (**Exhibit A**) performed by Pat Regan was submitted as part of the project application (November 2, 2022, HCD-Planning Library File No. LIB230004). The biologist visited the property in October of 2022 to assess the potential impacts of an earlier version of the project scope, proposed

as a complete demolition and rebuild of the attached Caretaker Unit. However, the project was redesigned in December of 2023 to include interior remodeling and a 12 square foot addition within a previously developed area of the subject property. Several rare and endangered plant and animal species are known to occur in Coastal Dune habitat. Although the project biologist stated in the report that October is not the best time of the year for a biological survey, no further studies were recommended due to the minor nature and location of the proposed addition entirely on an existing hardscaped area. Therefore, even though the project is within 100 feet of ESHA, no impacts on Coastal Dune habitat are anticipated during construction.

Environmental Review

California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Guidelines Section 15301 categorically exempts minor alterations and additions to existing single family dwellings. As proposed, the interior remodel and 12 square foot addition would occur within a previously disturbed area. The addition would not impact the Coastal Dune habitat on site. None of the exceptions under CEQA Guidelines Section 15300.2 apply to this project. The project does not involve a designated historical resource, a hazardous waste site, and there are no unusual circumstances that would result in a significant effect. Impacts within the 17 Mile Drive viewshed are avoided or minimized by design including maintaining the location, height, and mass of the existing structure. No significant archaeological resources have been found, there are no historic resources that would be impacted, and no significant effects on biological resources are anticipated during construction. (**Exhibit A, Attachment 1**). As such, staff recommends the Zoning Administrator find the project categorically exempt.

OTHER AGENCY INVOLVEMENT

The following agencies have reviewed the project, have comments, and/or have recommended conditions:

- HCD-Engineering Services
- Environmental Health Bureau
- HCD-Environmental Services
- Pebble Beach Community Services District
- California Coastal Commission

LAND USE ADVISORY COMMITTEE (LUAC)

The proposed project was reviewed by the Del Monte Forest LUAC on March 21, 2024. Concerns regarding the circular staircase as the only access to the upstairs guest wing were raised. The applicant responded to the concern by stating the stairs are existing and planned to remain as part of this project. The LUAC reviewed the project and recommended for approval as proposed by a vote of 8-0 with no members absent. See **Exhibit B**.

Prepared by: Kayla Nelson, Associate Planner, x6408
Reviewed by: Mary Israel, Supervising Planner
Approved by: Anna Ginette Quenga, AICP, Principal Planner

The following attachments are on file with HCD:

Attachments

Exhibit A - Draft Resolution including:

- Attachment 1 - Recommended Conditions of Approval
- Attachment 2 - Site Plans, Floor Plans, Elevations, Colors and Materials

Exhibit B - Del Monte Forest LUAC Minutes dated March 21, 2024

Exhibit C - Vicinity Map

cc: Front Counter Copy; California Coastal Commission; Pebble Beach Community Services District; HCD-Environmental Services; HCD-Engineering Services; Environmental Health Bureau; Kayla Nelson, Planner; Mary Israel, Supervising Planner; Izu Ojukwu, Agent; Elizabeth and Samuel Reeves, Property Owners; Dale Ellis, Interested Party; The Open Monterey Project; LandWatch (Executive Director); Lozeau Drury LLP; Planning File PLN220274