

Mid-Valley Shopping Center

BOARD OF SUPERVISORS

JUNE 14, 2022



Before the Board:

- Certify an EIR prepared for the Mid-Valley Shopping Center; and
- Determine if the Mid-Valley Shopping center is an historic resource:
 - Qualifies for listing on the Local Register

Not Before the Board:

- The Design Approval application to allow exterior modifications to the Mid-Valley Shopping Center



Background

Painting without a Design Approval

- Directed to stop work and make an application
- Application Submitted

Carmel Valley Land Use Advisory Committee (LUAC) Review

- July 15, 2019 – Continued with Recommendation to, among other things:
 - Refer to Historic Review Board

September 18, 2019 - Applicant Submits Historic Report Prepared by Dr. Anthony Kirk

- Does not Qualify as an historic resource

October 29, 2018 – Carmel Valley Association (CVA) Submits Historic Report Prepared by Page & Turnbull

- Does Qualify as an historic resource

Competing Historian Opinions

Differing opinions from Historians

- Dr. Anthony Kirk – **Not Historic**
- Stacy Kozakavich (Page & Turnbull) – **Historic**
- Dr. Laura Jones (Heritage Resources Consulting) – **Not Historic**
- Dr. Diana Painter (Painter Preservation) – **Historic**

Draft Environmental Impact Report (DEIR) prepared

- Comments received during public comment period
 - Carmel Valley Association
 - Neighbors along Center Street
 - Anthony Lombardo on behalf of applicant
- Final EIR - response to comments

Points of Disagreement

Is the Mid Valley Shopping center an “Historic Resource”?

- Kozakavich and Painter
 - Qualifies for listing as work of a Master
 - Retains integrity
- Kirk, Jones, and Lamprecht
 - Does not qualify – Dahlstrand is not an architect of generally recognized greatness
 - Past Modifications to the Shopping Center have impacted integrity

EIR required to treat the property as an historic resource under CEQA

- Independent historian under contract with County’s EIR consultant – Painter
 - Found property qualifies as an historic resource in local context
- Design Approval (not part of today’s action) would adversely impact

Board of Supervisors is the Authority to determine a building/property historic at the local level

Dahlstrand

Born in Wisconsin

Degree in architecture from Cornell University in 1939

Moved to the San Francisco Bay area in 1948

- worked as an associate for Fred and Lois Langhorst.
- Took over the practice when the Langhorsts moved to Europe in 1950

Later worked for Skidmore, Owings & Merrill before establishing his own practice in the Monterey Bay area in the early 1960s.

Inspired by Frank Lloyd Wright

Known for rendering skills

Worked with John Carl Warnecke on JFK Memorial and Del Monte Shopping Center

Designed the original Carmel Plaza

Designed the Wells Fargo Bank in Carmel

Work is recorded in the Environmental Design Archives at UC Berkely

Historic Resource - Definitions

CEQA Guidelines- Definition of “Historic resource” (paraphrased)

(2) A resource included in a local register of historical resources or identified as significant in an historical resource survey.

- Public agencies must treat any such resource as significant unless the preponderance of evidence demonstrates that it is not historically significant.

(3) Any building, structure, site, place, ...which a lead agency determines to be historically significant

- Provided the lead agency's determination is supported by substantial evidence in light of the whole record.

(4) The fact that a resource is not listed in or determined to be eligible for listing in a local register of historical resources or identified in an historical resources survey does not preclude a lead agency from determining that the resource may be an historical resource.

MCC Section 18.25.030 – Definition of "Historic resource"

- Any structure, object, fence, site, or portion of a site which has a significant historic, archaeological, architectural, engineering or cultural value, real property or improvement thereon such as a structure, archaeological excavation, or object that is unique or significant because of its location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, or aesthetic feeling and is designated as such by the Board of Supervisors pursuant to the provisions of this Chapter.

Criteria for Listing on Local Register (MCC Chapter 18.25)

A. Historical and Cultural Significance.

1. Particularly representative of a distinct historical period, type, style, region, or way of life.
2. Is, or contains, a type of building or buildings which was once common but is now rare.
3. Was connected with someone renowned.
4. Is connected with a business or use which was once common but is now rare.
5. Represents the work of a master builder, engineer, designer, artist, or.
6. Is the site of an important historic event or is associated with events that have made a meaningful contribution to the nation, State, or community.
7. Has a high potential of yielding information of archaeological interest.

B. Historic, Architectural, and Engineering Significance.

1. Exemplifies a particular architectural style or way of life important to the County.
2. Exemplifies the best remaining architectural type of a community.
3. The construction materials or engineering methods used in the resource or district proposed for designation embody elements of outstanding attention to architectural or engineering design, detail, material or craftsmanship.

C. Community and Geographic Setting.

1. Materially benefits the historic character of the community.
2. The unique location or singular physical characteristic represents an established and familiar visual feature of the community, area, or county.
3. Geographically definable area, urban or rural possessing a significant concentration or continuity of site, buildings, structures, or objects unified by past events, or aesthetically by plan or physical development.
4. The preservation of a resource or resources is essential to the integrity of a district.

Integrity

National Register Criteria – 7 aspects

- Location
 - Design
 - Setting
 - Materials
 - Workmanship
 - Feeling
 - Association
- In order to be considered an historic resource, a building/structure will retain all or most of the 7 aspects of integrity (Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties)

Historic Resources Review Board (HRRB)

February 3, 2022 – Continued

- Time to review information and return with Final EIR

April 7, 2022

- Recommended the Board find the Mid-Valley Shopping Center eligible for listing on the Monterey County Register of Historic Resources

What does a Historic Designation mean

Subject to Historic Preservation Standards

- CEQA
 - A project with an effect that may cause a substantial adverse change in the significance of an historical resource is a project that may have a significant effect on the environment (CEQA Guidelines 15064.5 (b))
 - Generally, a project that follows the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties shall be considered as mitigated to a level of less than significant
- Secretary of the Interior Standards (SOI)
 - Rehabilitation" is defined as "the process of returning a property to a state of utility, through repair or alteration, which makes possible an efficient contemporary use while preserving those portions and features of the property which are significant to its historic, architectural, and cultural values."
- County Code
 - Modifications reviewed the Historic Resources Review Board for consistency the County's Historic Preservation criteria (Chapter 18.25) and SOI standards
 - Qualify for property tax relief under the Mills Act Program (Chapter 18.27)

Staff Recommendation

Adopt two Resolutions to:

1. Certify the EIR prepared for the Mid-Valley Shopping Center Design
 - Can certify no matter the determination on historic significance
 - Do not need overriding considerations at this time (No Action on the Design Approval)
2. Declare the Mid Valley Shopping Center an historic resource that qualifies for listing on the Monterey County register of Historic Resources.

Alternative to staff recommendation:

Adopt Resolution to Certify EIR and Direct staff to prepare a resolution declaring that the Mid-Valley Shopping Center does not qualify for listing.