

Attachment B

This page intentionally left blank.

**Before the Historic Resources Review Board in and
for the County of Monterey, State of California**

Resolution No.: 21-005

PLN210296 – RANCHO EL ROBLEDO

Monterey County Historic Resources Review Board (HRRB) Resolution to recommend that:

- a) The Board of Supervisors add Rancho El Robledo to the Monterey County Register of Historic Resources;
- b) The Planning Director find once listed, “Rancho El Robledo” is eligible for an Historic Property Contract; and
- c) The Board of Supervisors approve a Mills Act Contract for Rancho El Robledo.

The property is located at 8 Rancho El Robledo Road, Carmel Valley (Assessor’s Parcel Number 197-151-011-000).

WHEREAS, the property owners, Jeffery Webster and Kimberly Clemenson, applied for a Mills Act Contract (PLN210296) to obtain a preferential property tax assessment in exchange for restrictions on the property to help preserve, restore and/or maintain the historic building located at 8 Rancho El Robledo Road, Carmel Valley. In order to qualify for a Mills Act contract, the property must be listed on the local, state, or federal register of historic places and the property owners consent to listing of the home a 8 Rancho El Robledo Road on the Monterey County Register of Historic Resources; and

WHEREAS, this matter was heard by the Historic Resources Review Board (HRRB) on November 4, 2021, pursuant to the regulations contained in Chapters 18.25 and (Historic Preservation) and 18.28 of the Monterey County Code (The Mills Act Program for Monterey County); and

WHEREAS, the residential home located at 8 Rancho El Robledo, Carmel Valley, is found to be eligible for listing on the Monterey County Register of Historic Resources under Criterion A5 and B1 as an excellent example of a California Ranch style home built by Hugh Comstock in 1939; and

WHEREAS, Once listed, Rancho El Robledo will qualify as an Historic Property for the purposes of Chapter 18.28 (The Mills Act Program), however, the subject property is a residential property with a fair market value of over \$6,000,000 which exceeds the \$3,000,000 cap for properties eligible for a Mills Act Contract according to Sections 18.28.080(4) and 18.28.040.C of the Monterey County Code. In order to approve the Mills Act Contract, the property must meet the exceptions to the fair market value cap contained in Section 18.28.080.B; and

WHEREAS, the applicant has submitted written justification for the exception that describes that describes the significance of this property being an exceptional example, and perhaps one of the best remaining examples of the work of Hugh

Comstock, that the type of materials and construction require special attention to detail in repair and maintenance because much of the materials are no longer widely available making the structure at risk without the Mills Act contract, and the applicant is willing to provide public access to the site. The work program submitted with the Mills Act application reflects ongoing maintenance and repair costs that total over \$150,000 over a ten-year period making for appropriate use of the projected property tax reductions anticipated under the Mills Act Program; and

WHEREAS, Section 18.28.040.B of the Monterey County Code allows granting of an exception to the \$3,000,000 value cap if the following criteria are met:

1. The site, building, object, or structure is a particularly important resource such as the last or only example of its kind, and it represents an exceptional example of an architectural style, the work of a master, or is associated with the lives of significant persons or events important to history; and
2. The historical property contract will result in the preservation of a site, building, object, or structure whose significance as a historical resource would otherwise be at immediate risk of substantial adverse change. A substantial adverse change in the significance of the historical resource means the physical demolition, destruction, relocation, or alteration of the resource or its immediate surroundings such that the significance of the resource would be materially impaired; and
3. The exception is warranted due to one or more of the following additional factors:
 - a. The resource is highly visible to the public;
 - b. The difference between the current property tax obligation for the property and the estimated property tax obligation under the Mills Act is within the same range as the expected estimated lost property taxes from historic property contracts for properties meeting the valuation limit;
 - c. The work program proposes to provide for critical improvements immediately necessary to preserve the resource, and it provides for the best and most efficient use of the expected property tax savings; or
 - d. Approval of the contract would generate heritage tourism, affordable housing, or similar public benefits; and

WHEREAS, with regard to the first exception criteria, 8 Rancho El Robledo is an exceptional example of the California Ranch Style adobe architecture that reflects the work of master builder Hugh Comstock; and

WHEREAS, with regard to the second exception criteria, the house has been recently rehabilitated and is well maintained. Lack of readily available construction materials including the adobe walls and locally sourced redwood beams represent a risk of deterioration of the structure overtime if not carefully maintained; and

WHEREAS, with regard to the third criteria, the property owner has agreed, as a term of the Mills Act Contract, to make the home available for heritage tourism which could increase public access to the site; and

WHEREA, The home is currently assessed property tax (under Proposition 13 value) based on a just over \$3 million value which equates to approximately \$36,000 in annual property tax revenue. Under the Mills Act restricted value, the property tax

would be reduced by around \$25,000 annually; and

WHEREAS, after reviewing the application, the HRRB has determined that the property qualifies for an exception to the \$3,000,000 value limit as described above and is therefore eligible for a Mills Act Contract.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED THAT, it is the decision of the Monterey County Historic Resources Review Board to recommend:

- a) The Board of Supervisors add Rancho El Robledo to the Monterey County Register of Historic Resources;
- b) The Planning Director find that once listed, "Rancho El Robledo" is eligible for an Historic Property Contract; and
- c) The Board of Supervisors approve a Mills Act Contract for Rancho El Robledo.

PASSED AND ADOPTED this **4th day of November 2021**, upon motion of Belinda Taluban, seconded by Salvador Munoz, by the following vote to recommend approval of the Resolution to the Board of Supervisors:

AYES: Judy McClelland, John Scourkes, Sheila Lee Prader, Salvador Munoz, Belinda Taluban, Michael Bilich

NOES: None

ABSENT: Kellie Morgantini

ABSTAIN: None

DocuSigned by:
Philip Angelo
21F22588DE514CB

Attest
Philip Angelo
HRRB Secretary