

MID VALLEY SHOPPING CENTER

MONTEREY COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS

JUNE 14, 2022

THE ONLY ISSUE BEFORE THE BOARD

- Is the Mid Valley Shopping Center a significant historic resource ***based on the preponderance of substantial evidence in the record.*** CEQA Guideline Section 15064 (a) (5)
- No alterations to the Center are proposed at this time. The pending design approval will be withdrawn as soon as the Board acts on the historical designation.
- Should alterations be proposed in the future a design approval will be required to be approved by the Planning Commission and be found to be consistent with Carmel Valley Master Plan policy CV-1.1 which requires that to preserve the rural character of Carmel Valley, “development shall follow a rural architectural theme with design review.”

PREPONDERANCE OF EVIDENCE STANDARD FOR DETERMINING IF THE MID VALLEY CENTER IS HISTORICALLY SIGNIFICANT

- A resource that is listed or included in a local register of historical resources or **is identified as significant in an historical resource survey is presumed to be historically significant.**
- ***Unless the preponderance of evidence demonstrates that it is not historically or culturally significant.*** CEQA Guidelines Section 15064.5 (a)(2)
- The preponderance of the evidence means *the evidence on one side outweighs the evidence on the other side ...* (*Glage v. Hawes Firearms Co.* (1990) 22640 Cal.App.3d 314, 325)
- The Board must weigh conflicting evidence to determine which position contains a preponderance of substantial evidence.

WHAT DEFINES A SIGNIFICANT RESOURCE IN THE MONTEREY COUNTY CODE

- Work of a Master Architect (e.g., an architect “whose talent influenced a particular architectural style or way of life.”) MCC 18.25.070 (A) (5)
- The resource or district proposed for designation is particularly representative of a distinct historical period, type, style, region, or way of life. MCC 18.25.070 (A) (1)
- The resource must have retained its design and construction integrity (“Integrity” means soundness or completeness MCC 18.25.030) such that it can convey its original design intent.



OLOF DAHLSTRAND WAS NOT A MASTER ARCHITECT

-
- Five different qualified historians have extensively reviewed Olof Dahlstrand's body of work. Neither Dr. Anthony Kirk, Dr. Laura Jones, Dr. Barbara Lamprecht or Ms. Kozakavich [Page and Turnbull, consultant to CVA] refer to Olof Dahlstrand as a "master architect". Only Diane Painter who also refers to Olof Dahlstrand as "Locally Prominent" concludes he was a "master". Local prominence does not equate to being a master architect.
 - Dr. Laura Jones, Stanford University: The finding that the Mid Valley Shopping Center is eligible for listing on the California Register as the "work of a master" is not supported by evidence that Olof Dahlstrand is a "figure of generally recognized greatness".
 - Dr. Barbara Lamprecht: "Mr. Dahlstrand is not a "figure of generally recognized greatness in a field." His work was not published widely at the state or national levels, it did not have an impact on the architecture profession, and it did not influence its wider direction. The Center was not a formative or pivotal design in his career nor has it had an important impact on the Carmel community."
 - Dr. Anthony Kirk: Other sources make it evident that Olof Dahlstrand was not considered a master architect. He was never named a Fellow of the American Institute of Architects, an honor accorded designers "who have made outstanding contributions to the profession through design excellence, contributions in the field of architectural education, or to the advancement of the profession." He is not among the 8,400 architects listed in the Pacific Coast Architecture Database, which includes designers in California, Oregon, and Washington. No examples of his work are included in the National Register of Historic Places, nor is he mentioned in *Architectural Record*.

DAHLSTRAND DID NOT INFLUENCE AN ARCHITECTURAL STYLE (QUOTES FROM PAINTER DPR)

- Painter, 12/21/2020, Page 4: “Olof Dahlstrand was an architect who worked for important architectural firms practicing modern design (Langhorst and Langhorst Associates and Skidmore, Owings & Merrill) for ten years before starting his own firm in Carmel-by-the-Sea, where he practiced for 25 years. *The influence of Frank Lloyd Wright on his work is unmistakable...*”
- DPR, Page 59: “John Carl Warnecke, who was designing the Del Monte Shopping Center about the same time as Dahlstrand was designing the Mid Valley Shopping Center. *Warnecke utilized large “hovering” roofs, had a penchant for combining concrete, redwood, and industrial materials in imaginative ways, and a concern with pedestrian scale. These same qualities are seen in the Mid Valley Shopping Center.*”
- DPR, Page 64: “*The Langhorsts [for whom Dahlstrand worked] were highly respected modernists. Fred Langhorst had previously worked for William W. Wurster. Wurster had a national reputation as one of the Bay Area’s most innovative and talented architects* and was a key proponent of the Second Bay Area Tradition. The Langhorsts were *committed to Wright’s legacy* Usonian houses as well.”

DAHLSTRAND INFLUENCED BY OTHERS (PAINTER DPR)

- DPR, Page 67: “Several influences can be seen in Olof Dahlstrand’s architectural design. They include the work of the architectural legend Frank Lloyd Wright ... Fred and Lois Langhorst, who were highly respected modernists in the Bay Area. Fred Langhorst had been a Taliesin Fellow in Spring Green, Wisconsin. The influences of Frank Lloyd Wright’s Usonian houses can be seen in the Langhorst’s residential design work in the Bay Area, as well as Dahlstrand’s own Usonians.”
- DPR, Page 69: “Another influence from Wright that can be seen in Dahlstrand’s work is his belief in the importance of using natural materials ... This influence can be easily seen in Langhorst and Langhorst’s work, particularly in the design of their own house. And it is embedded in Dahlstrand’s residential work...”
- DPR, Page 77: “Dahlstrand is mentioned in Carmel’s first Historic Context Statement within the context of the Organic style of architecture, which was developed and promoted by Frank Lloyd Wright and his followers, and was one of the modern styles popular in Carmel in the late 1940s and 1950s, to the present. The authors mention specifically that Dahlstrand – along with other Carmel architects - was influenced by Frank Lloyd Wright at this time.”

PEIRLUIGI SERRAINO

- Peirluigi Serraino, a noted architectural historian very familiar with Dahlstrand's work lectured a Hidden Valley Seminar and:
 - Did not refer to Dahlstrand as a master architect
 - Spoke at length about the professional who had influenced Dahlstrand but little on whom Dahlstrand influenced
 - Touched on the MVC but did not refer to it as a significant historic resource.
- In a recent email “Dahlstrand met FLW [Frank Lloyd Wright] and saw Taliesin. His work with the Langhorst was exhibited at the SF Museum of Art. He spent 8 years at Skidmore Owings & Merrill (SOM) during that firm's golden years. Indeed, he was highly principled. He had a specific way of believing what was right and wrong *in essence embracing Wright, although tempered with the SOM design language.*”

MVC'S ARCHITECTURE IS NOT HISTORICALLY SIGNIFICANT

- Dr. Laura Jones: “Even if a new argument were assembled to support such a finding [significance], the complex lacks integrity and cannot convey its original design intent. It is my professional opinion that the Mid Valley Shopping Center would not be eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic Places nor the California Register of Historical Resources. It also does not appear eligible for the Monterey County Local Official Register of Historic Resources, if nominated. I concur with Kirk’s evaluation in this regard.”
- Dr. Barbara Lamprecht: “The Center [MVC] does not “embody the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction.” It blends a number of styles from various sources and time periods. Its construction, combining concrete, heavy timbers, exposed aggregate, and wood shake roof is common in commercial work.”
- Dr. Anthony Kirk: “The Carmel Valley Shopping Center is not a “Wrightian-inspired design.” Wright was a master architect, possibly the most important and celebrated of all American architects. He designed a single shopping center over the course of his lifetime, the Anderton Court Shops, a small three-story complex that is on the National Register of Historic Places. In my opinion the Carmel Valley Shopping Center is not eligible for the National Register of Historic Places, the California Register of Historical Resources, or the Monterey County Local Register of Historical Resources.”

PACIFIC COAST ARCHITECTURE DATABASE

- At the time the Kirk, Lamprecht and Jones reports were done Dahlstrand was not listed in the Pacific Coast Architecture Database. He was added to the list in February 2022, after Diane Painter contacted the PCAD and asked that he be added.
- PCAD regarding Dahlstrand
 - Biographical
 - In the Section “Buildings and Other Works” PCAD states “None Found”
 - No mention of Mid Valley Shopping Center

BERKELEY ENVIRONMENTAL DESIGN ARCHIVES

- Dahlstrand contacted Berkeley asking if they would accept his documents.
- Dahlstrand's list of documents
 - Referred to Mid Valley Center drawings as “preliminary.”
 - Lists two projects in Monterey for Standard Oil. Nothing listed for MVC.
- In his letter to “Dahlstrand enthusiasts” Dahlstrand wrote:
 - “when I was a small child and first exposed to this way (Frank Lloyd Wright) of building I felt the affect of architecture, so my later understanding of what is at the root of this effect was greatly reinforced.”
 - The real hero here is the idea behind the buildings, the origins of which lie in the thoughts Wright respected ...my job was simply to put this into reality ...”

Mid Valley



Walnut Creek - 1965



MID VALLEY CENTER AND DEL MONTE CENTER



SUMMARY

The preponderance of evidence, from experts, show:

- Olof Dahlstrand was not a “master architect.”
- The Mid Valley Center is not historically significant for its architecture.
- The Mid Valley Center has lost whatever architectural integrity it may have had.

REQUEST

- We respectfully request that the Board of Supervisors adopt a **resolution of intention** to:
 - Certify the FEIR as being adequate for the Board to make their decision on the historic significance of the MVC;
 - Find there is a preponderance of substantial evidence in the record to conclude that MVC is not historically significant either for its architecture or being the work of a local master architect; and,
 - Find that MVC is not historically significant.