

Attachment C

This page intentionally left blank.

Attachment C: Detailed Discussion

Design/Visual Impacts

The property includes a Design Control (D) overlay, which provides for the regulation of the location, size, configuration, materials, and colors of structures in areas where design review is appropriate to ensure protection of the public viewshed, neighborhood character, and to assure the visual integrity of certain developments without imposing undue restrictions on private property. The structure will be 764 square feet, which is smaller than the majority of surrounding homes in the neighborhood. Colors and materials have been selected to blend with the natural environment and include brown concrete masonry unit (CMU) walls with a steel roll-up door and a terracotta roof. The structure meets height and setback requirements for a main structure in the Low Density Residential area. The maximum allowable height per zoning is 30 feet. The structure will be 18.5 feet at its tallest point. Required setbacks per zoning are front: 30 feet, side: 10 feet, rear: 20 feet. The setbacks will be: front: 316 side: 53feet and 160 feet, rear: 350 feet. The structure is at a lower elevation than Carmel Valley Road and will not be visible from any public road or viewing area.

Traffic Impacts

The EIR analyzed the temporary increase in traffic that could result during construction of the pump station. Construction is estimated to take six months. Construction worker traffic could contribute up to 14 round trips a day of passenger vehicles and an estimated six large truck round-trips per day. These increases are within the daily fluctuations of traffic volumes for Carmel Valley Road and the affected segment of Highway 1, and will not be noticeable to the average motorist. Construction of the project will require temporary closure of one lane of Carmel Valley Road in order to connect to the water main. This closure will be brief, likely only a few days. A traffic control and safety assurance plan is required as Mitigation Measure 4.9-1. In addition, a Construction Management Plan is required as a County condition of approval to identify measures to reduce impacts on traffic and on neighboring properties.

While traffic impacts as a result of the pump station are expected to be less than significant with mitigation, the EIR found that cumulative construction impacts of all MPWSP components, combined with potentially overlapping schedules of other construction projects identified in the EIR, could result in significant and unavoidable short-term traffic impacts. The CPUC and the County have adopted a statement of overriding considerations due to specific social, technological, economic, or other benefits of the proposed project.

After construction, the pump station will be an un-staffed facility and will not generate daily trips, thus the facility will not contribute to increased traffic on Carmel Valley Road.

Noise

The pump station will be located approximately 50 feet from the closest residences. All equipment will be enclosed. The EIR estimates the increase in ambient noise at the closest residences to be 1.1 dBA Leq, which is less than significant. Noise from this source would be occasional operation for testing, which will generate less noise than a diesel automobile and is not expected to result in any substantial increase over daytime noise levels.

Construction noise is not anticipated to exceed the noise standards of Monterey County Code Section 10.60.030 (Operation of noise-producing devices restricted), which prohibits noise levels

exceeding eighty-five (85) dBA measured fifty (50) feet therefrom. The EIR includes mitigation measures to minimize construction related noise. Mitigation Measure 4.12-A requires advance notice to residents in the vicinity and procedures for addressing construction related complaints, including a designated construction disturbance coordinator. Mitigation measure 4.12-B requires sound control devices for construction equipment with internal combustion engines. Construction is expected to take approximately eight months.

Biological

The project site consists of non-native grassland with coast live oak woodland fringe south of Carmel Valley Road. The site is bordered by residential development and the Carmel Valley River. Monterey County GIS identifies the site as potentially containing sensitive habitat including: Carmel Valley bush-mallow, Monterey pine, California red-legged frog, and steelhead. Biological surveys conducted for the EIR (Section 4.6) found that special status species that could potentially be impacted during construction include: California red-legged frog, Monterey pine, Coast Range newt, red-tailed hawk, white-tailed kite, American peregrine falcon, American kestrel, loggerhead shrike, pallid bar, western red bat, Monterey dusky-footed woodrat, and Monterey shrew. The potential presence of these species, or of suitable habitat for these species, is due to the proximity to the Carmel River and the presence of trees where birds or bats could nest. Implementation of mitigation measures identified in the EIR will reduce impacts to a less than significant level. Mitigation measures include:

- Designating a lead biologist to oversee and ensure implementation of special-status species protective measures
- Requiring worker training to ensure that workers are aware of the special-status species and the measures necessary to avoid, minimize, or mitigate impacts,
- General measures such as installation of exclusion fencing, trash abatement program to ensure special-status species predators are not attracted to the site
- Limiting construction to non-nesting season when feasible or requiring a no-disturbance buffer around active nests
- Habitat Mitigation and Monitoring Plan to describe all restoration and compensatory requirements
- Avoidance and minimization measures for the California Tiger Salamander and Red-legged Frog, including pre-construction surveys, relocation procedures, exclusion fencing, and monitoring of vegetation removal and grading
- Measures to avoid impacts to wetlands
- Compliance with tree removal requirements if applicable (no tree removal is proposed)
- Requiring low-intensity exterior lighting

Archaeological/Tribal Cultural

The project site is designated as a high archeological sensitivity zone by Monterey County GIS. Per Monterey County Code Section 21.66.050, a Phase 1 inventory report (LIB190035) was prepared. No records of archaeological resources were identified in the project vicinity. Two recorded archeological sites are between 0.5 and 0.8 miles away. No cultural resources were identified within the project footprint. Midden soil with shell was observed outside of the project footprint, on the terraced slopes at the northern extent of the property bordering APN 015-252-

006-000. Because midden soil was not observed at the top of the slope or on the adjacent property and because the layer of shell midden is underlain by non-native culturally sterile, silt soils used to construct the slopes, the shell midden is presumed to have been imported as fill from offsite and placed on the slopes as armament. There is not expected to be any significant impact to archaeological resources. However, due to the presence of the shell midden and the high archaeological sensitivity of the site, the archaeologist recommended monitoring by a qualified, professional archaeologist during project related ground disturbance. This requirement has been added as a Condition of Approval (Condition 5) in accordance with Title 21.66.050(D)(2)(a), which calls for incorporating conditions recommended by the archeologist even if no unique archaeological resources were found.

In compliance with state and federal requirements for tribal consultation, the lead agency (CPUC) contacted the Native American Heritage Commission (NAHC) and requested a search of the Sacred Lands File. The search identified no results, and the NAHC provided contact information for the appropriate tribes. On June 24, 2016 letters were sent to members of the Esselen Tribe of Monterey County, Costanoan Rumsen Carmel Tribe, Ohlone/Costanoan Esselen Nation, Amah Mutsun Tribal Band, and Indian Canyon Mutsun Band. During follow up phone calls on March 16, 2017, the Tribal Council Woman of the Ohlone/Costanoan Esselen Nation requested that letters and maps be resent. No further communication was received from tribal members. Mitigation measures 4.15-2b and 4.15-4 identify procedures for work to stop and consultation to occur with the appropriate native American representative and the Native American Heritage Commission if resources or remains are discovered during construction activities.

Floodway/Floodplain

The subject parcel borders the Carmel River, and the proposed development will be partially within the FEMA special flood hazard area. The structure will be elevated and flood proofed a minimum of one foot above base flood elevation. A Condition of Approval (Condition 8) has been added to require final improvement plans demonstrating full compliance with Monterey County Code Chapter 16.16, Regulations for Floodplains in Monterey County.

Air Quality

The EIR determined that the MPWSP would cumulatively have significant and unavoidable impacts to air quality due to the large amount of construction for all project components combined. Mitigation measures were adopted to address air quality impacts of all projects, including the Carmel Valley Pump Station. Measures include use of either: equipment with the highest emissions standards or alternatively powered equipment when possible, idling restrictions, fugitive dust control plans, and possible off-site mitigation. The project is consistent with Open Space Policies OS-10.9 of the Monterey County 2010 General Plan, which requires future development to implement applicable Monterey Bay Unified Air Pollution Control District control measures. These Mitigation Measures are being carried forward through Condition of Approval No. 19. The EIR found the overall MPWSP potentially inconsistent with Policy OS-10.6 which states that the Monterey Bay Unified Air Pollution Control District's air pollution control strategies, air quality monitoring, and enforcement activities shall be supported, because construction activities in unincorporated Monterey County would generate emissions in the air basin that could conflict with implementation of the applicable air quality plan. For the Carmel Valley Pump Station, Air Quality impacts are due to earth moving activities and

construction equipment. No additional Air Quality impacts not analyzed in the EIR can be expected to occur and no further review is needed.