ATTACHMENT A DISCUSSION

The proposed project is located at 4041 Sunset Lane in Pebble Beach (Assessor's Parcel Number 008-111-017-000). The site currently has telecommunications facilities, including two 80-foot high lattice towers, owned by the County and commercial wireless telecommunications providers. Cal-Am also owns a telecommunications facility on the property that provides service for its operations. The site, as well as some of the adjacent parcels (Assessor's Parcel Numbers 008-111-014-000 and 008-111-015-000 and 008-111-016-000), is part of facilities owned and operated by the California American Water Company (Cal-Am) in conjunction with the Pebble Beach Community Services District for water storage and related operations. An 800,000 gallon potable water storage tank is located on Parcel Nos. 008-111-015-000 and 008-111-016-000 directly adjacent to the project site; and a new 800,000 gallon tank is projected for construction on Parcel Nos. 008-111-014-000 and 008-111-015-000 (Figure 1). The latter project included the removal of 74 Monterey pine trees varying in size and was approved with an adopted Mitigated Negative Declaration by the Planning Commission on December 14, 2011 (Planning Department File No. PLN100608). An additional wireless telecommunications facility including an approximately 60-foot high tower is located on Parcel No. 008-112-009-000 directly across the street to the west (Figure 2). The project site plan and elevations are illustrated in Figure Nos. 3 and 4 below.







The project site is located in an area surrounded mostly by single family residential development within an "urban type" setting mixed with undeveloped Monterey Pine Forest habitat to the west. The area is near Highway 68 (Holman Highway) and near the border of the incorporated City of Monterey. The Del Monte Forest Land Use Plan (LUP) identifies Huckleberry Hill, as one of the eight planning areas within the Del Monte Forest (Figure 6e, LUP). The LUP further identifies the area surrounding the medium density residential areas of Huckleberry Hill to be preserved for its habitat and scenic value. The vegetation on the site consists mostly of Monterey pines and two species of non-native acacia trees. The existing Monterey pines are tall with spare vegetation at their tops. There is one dead pine and one pine in poor condition within the proposed tower

location. The project site is surrounded by residential uses and the water tank sites. The immediately surrounding residential areas also contain Monterey pines.

The subject project is the construction of a new public safety wireless telecommunications facility which requires a Combined Development Permit consisting of: 1) a Coastal Development Permit to allow the development of a public safety, non-commercial wireless telecommunications facility including a 100-foot monopole with ten (10) Omni-directional antennas, two 4-foot diameter microwave dishes and three panel antennas; a 276 square foot (11.5 x 24.0) equipment shelter; two GPS antennas mounted to the roof of the shelter; demolition of an abandoned 50,000 gallon water tank and grading (less than 100 cubic yards cut and fill); a Coastal Development Permit to allow ridgeline development; and 3) Design Approval. The project evolved through the public review process, from the applicant's original application -which consisted of a 150-foot high monopole and related telecommunications equipment, antennas, etc., the elimination of two existing telecommunications towers and the consolidation of all existing antennas on to the new monopole-to the current proposal of a 100-foot high monopole and ancillary antennae and equipment and retention of the existing towers. The applicant also considered an additional alternative consisting of a 120-foot high monopole. The original and revised projects were reviewed by the Del Monte Forest Land Use Advisory Committee at two separate meetings; the LUAC recommended denial of the project. The project plans are depicted as Figure Nos. 3 and 4 below. A visual simulation of the proposed 100-foot high monopole is depicted in Figure 5.

Environmental Review

The Monterey County Planning Department prepared an Initial Study pursuant to CEQA which separately described and analyzed the potential environmental impacts from the development of four wireless telecommunications facilities proposed under Application File Nos. PLN100501, PLN100502, PLN100515 and PLN100516. The Initial Study represents the independent judgment of the staff from the County. The Initial Study concluded that development of the projects would not result in individual or cumulative potentially significant impacts, including potentially significant visual and aesthetic impacts, that would require the preparation of an Environmental Impact Report. Accordingly, a proposed Mitigated Negative Declaration was circulated for public review, including to the State Clearinghouse, between August 21, 2012 and September 21, 2012. The Planning Commission adopted the Mitigated Negative Declaration (Resolution No. 12-039) on September 26, 2012. (Attachment E).

<u>Appeal</u>

Jameson Halpern, Esquire, timely filed a Notice of Appeal on October 8, 2012, appealing the Planning Commission's approval of the Combined Development Permit for the Huckleberry Hill/Cal-Am site (File No. PLN100516) and the Planning Commission's adoption of the Mitigated Negative Declaration as it pertains to the Combined Development Permit for the Huckleberry Hill/Cal-Am site. Generally, the appeal contends that the hearing before the Planning Commission was not fair, that the findings of the Commission are not supported by the evidence, that the Commission's decision was contrary to law, and that substantial evidence exists that the project "will have a significant effect on the environment as to visual, aesthetics and land use plans and policies," necessitating and EIR.

Staff has considered the issues raised in the appeal relative to the environmental analysis of the Huckleberry Hill site (File PLN100516). Pursuant to Section 21080 (d) of the Public resources Code and Section 15064 (f) (1) of the CEQA Guidelines, if there is a fair argument supported by a substantial evidence that a project may have a significant effect on the environment, the lead agency shall prepare an EIR, even though other substantial evidence has been presented that the

project will not have a significant effect. Without having determined whether the Combined Development Permit for the Huckleberry Hill site will have a significant effect on the environment, staff believes that preparation of an EIR is appropriate in this particular case to analyze the potential environmental impacts of the project.

Recommendation

Staff recommends that the Board of Supervisors 1) grant the appeal insofar as the Board is directing preparation of an EIR and deny the rest of the appeal; 2) vacate the adoption of the Mitigated Negative Declaration as applicable to the Combined Development Permit for the Huckleberry Hill site (PLN 100516) and vacate the approval of the Combined Development Permit for the Huckleberry Hill site (PC Resolution No.12-042); and 3) direct staff to prepare an Environmental Impact Report on the proposed Combined Development Permit for the Huckleberry Hill site.



Figure 4 – Elevations



Figure 5 - Existing Towers and Proposed 100-Foot High Monopole as viewed from Sunset Lane (A Private Street)

