



Historic Resources Review Board

Legistar File Number: 26-086

February 05, 2026

Introduced: 1/27/2026

Current Status: Agenda Ready

Version: 1

Matter Type: General Agenda Item

DA250339 - 456 PROPERTIES LLC

Public hearing to consider recommending that the Chief of Planning approve a Design Approval to allow the exterior and interior modifications to historic Casa de la Estrella, a single-family residence constructed in the 1920s, including removal of an existing window to be replaced with a larger window, construction of a new covered walkway, and other exterior site improvements. Materials and colors to match existing residence, stucco (cream color), concrete tiles, kursaal raven porcelain tile (coffee, cream, and dark brown), window (dark brown).

Project Location: 3322 17 Mile Drive, Pebble Beach (Assessor's Parcel Number 008-423-025-000), Del Monte Forest Land Use Plan, Coastal Zone.

RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends that the County of Monterey Historic Resources Review Board (HRRB) adopt a resolution recommending that the Chief of Planning:

- 1) Find the Project categorically exempt from CEQA pursuant to CEQA Guidelines section 15331; and
- 2) Approve a Design Approval to allow the exterior and interior modifications to historic Casa de la Estrella, a single-family residence constructed in the 1920s, including removal of an existing window to be replaced with a larger window, construction of a new covered walkway, and other exterior site improvements. Materials and colors to match existing residence, stucco (cream color), concrete tiles, kursaal raven porcelain tile (coffee, cream, and dark brown), window (dark brown).

SUMMARY:

On November 19, 2025, the applicant submitted a Design Approval for minor exterior and interior modifications to an existing historic single-family home known as the historic Casa de la Estrella, which was built in the 1920s. An Historic Resource Evaluation (HRE), Local Assessment, and Secretary of Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties (**Exhibit C**) was prepared by Evans & De Shazo, Inc.(EDS), on December 11, 2024. The Principal Architectural Historian Stacey De Shazo, M.A., completed an architectural survey of the 1920 house, ca. 1930 garage, and associated landscape within the Property. The discussion documents why the structure is historic and the results of the survey.

The proposed scope of work includes a 698 square foot interior remodel, proposed 94 square foot roof over the existing walkway, proposed 1,733 square foot exterior hardscape improvements, and replacement of existing windows and doors with wood.

DISCUSSION:

The Report describes the 1920 house as being associated with the Spanish Revival architectural style. The one-story building is constructed on the side of a hill on a raised foundation, which allows a basement unit that is accessed from the exterior. The house consists of a composite form that gives the appearance of several phases of construction, with a central, side-facing gable form that has an L-shaped flat roof section attached to the east elevation and an irregular, flat roof form attached to the west elevation. The two north elevations of the flat roof sections are connected by a stucco wall, creating an enclosed courtyard. The house is finished with a textured stucco. Due to the composite form of the house, the central, side-facing gable section of the house has a moderately sloped roof with Spanish red-clay tiles, which is continued at three shed-roofs - one over the projecting bay window of the east elevation, which is adjacent to a membrane finished, sloped section that is cut into the flat roof for water shedding, and two on the porches of the south elevation. The remainder of the house has a flat roof with a raised stucco parapet with varying heights, which gives the appearance of multiple phases of construction.

The ca. 1930 detached garage is associated with Spanish Revival architecture, with a saltbox form. The garage has a basement unit with a concrete slab on a grade foundation; the first story has a concrete slab that is supported by the wall of the basement and has a concrete apron that extends to the driveway. The building is finished with textured stucco. The moderately sloped roof is clad with Spanish red clay tiles, with wide eave overhangs that have exposed rafters. Within the gables of the building, there are three Spanish red-clay tile vents.

The landscape associated with the Property consists of a driveway that extends around a long island that has a tall hedge, which shields the primary façade from view from the public-right-of-way. Between the driveway and the house, there is a path of stone pavers surrounded by a variety of shrubs and plants. This path leads to the front door, which provides access to an interior courtyard that has a brick patio, a fountain, a central gas fireplace, and Moorish loggia with springing arches and decorative tile. Between the 1920 house and the ca. 1930 garage is a stucco wing wall with an arched doorway and arched wood gate. The gate opens to a set of concrete steps that leads to a brick walkway to the house and a small exterior courtyard with a low stucco wall. Detailed figures are located in the Historic report.

This HRE completed by EDS recommends that the 1920 house meets CRHR Criterion 3 for association with both Spanish Revival architecture and the architecture firm Davis & Davis, and retains integrity and, therefore, appears eligible for listing on the CRHR. To assess the Project's potential impacts on the historical resource, EDS completed a Standards review to ensure the Project meets the Standards. The EDS team worked with the Project's design team at Affinity Residential Design (previously Blackwell Design Consultants) reviewing the final drawings dated October 15, 2025. The 1920 house within the Property was found eligible under CRHR Criterion 3; therefore, an integrity analysis was completed.

Historic Character: The 1920 house is characterized by Spanish Colonial Revival design, which was altered in ca. 1930 with additions consisting of expanding the dining room at the south towards the west, with a covered porch, the kitchen was extended east with the low sloped roof and the bay window, and the room at the northeast corner of the building was extended east. Further additions to

the house include the two sconces on either side of the entrance, the gate connecting the 1920 house and the ca. 1930 garage, and the picture window at the basement level.

Proposed Changes: The Project proposes to return certain aspects of the façade, including the removal of the sconces on the front façade, added in ca. 1930, and not part of the original 1920 design by Davis & Davis, which returns the house to its original 1920 appearance. Per the plan, the Project includes replacing three of the windows within the ca. 1930 bay addition on the west elevation; as these windows were not original to 1920 house, this proposal does not impact character defining features of the historic house. The Project also includes the removal of the eightlight wood door set within a decorative, recessed doorway with chamfered edges that opens to a Juliet balcony on the south elevation and replacing it with a large, rectangular wood window. The proposed project requires the removal of the decorative doorway with chamfered edges and scrolling, the Juliet balcony, and the wood door. The replacement window consists of the installation of a rectangular wood window, which will be set within a large rectangular opening that will replicate the chamfered edge and scrolling on the existing window. Although the proposed project removes historic materials and features that contribute to the character of the property, the door is replaced with a window that compliments the character of the Property, without giving a false sense of history, as the window will not appear original. While the proposed project includes the removal of the characteristic door, the project returns the north elevation (primary façade) to its original 1920 appearance and alters only one original section of the house. In addition, the matching door and Juliet balcony on the east wall will remain but will no longer be functional.

Assessment: The proposed Project does not alter the association of the property to the architectural style of Spanish Colonial Revival; the proposed replacement window meets the Standards, as it does not impact the historic character of the Property, as it is a style commonly found within Spanish Colonial Revival, it will be wood, and it will not present a false sense of history.

In accordance with CEQA regulations and guidelines, EDS completed an HRE of the Property at 3322 17 Mile Drive, Pebble Beach, containing the 1920 house, ca. 1930 garage, and associated landscape to determine if any of the built environment resources within the Property are eligible for listing on the CRHR. The HRE was completed following CEQA regulations (PRC § 21000) and the Guidelines for Implementing CEQA (14 CCR § 15000 et seq.). In addition, EDS completed a local assessment, following the County of Monterey Municipal Code, Chapter 18.25, Preservation of Historic Resources, subsection, 18.25.070 - Review Criteria, as well as a Standards review, following the NPS Standards for Rehabilitation. The HRE determined that the 1920 house within the Property is eligible for listing on the CRHR under Criterion 3 for association with Spanish Colonial Revival Architecture and association with the architectural firm of Davis & Davis, with a period of significance of 1920, and retains all seven aspects of integrity. In addition, the local assessment recommends that the 1920 house appears eligible for local listing for association with Criteria 1 and 5 of A. Historical and Cultural Significance; Criteria 1 and 3 of B. Historical, Architectural, and Engineering Significance; and Criterion 1 of C. Community and Geographic Setting. Based on the HRE findings, EDS completed a Standards review to determine if the proposed Project would significantly impact the integrity of the 1920 house. As part of the Standards review, EDS worked directly with Affinity Residential Design [Blackwell Design Consultants], ensuring the Project meets the Standards for

Rehabilitation.

Based on the current drawings by Affinity Residential Design dated October 15, 2025, EDS has determined that overall, the Project meets the Standards for Rehabilitation. Furthermore, the Property may be eligible for the Mills Act (Ordinance Number 5238, adopted on April 8, 2014, by Monterey County as seen in Chapter 18.28 - Mills Act Program).

CEQA

The proposed project qualifies for a class 31 categorical exemption pursuant to section 15331 of the CEQA Guidelines. This exemption applies to projects that are for the "**maintenance, repair, stabilization, rehabilitation, restoration, preservation, conservation or reconstruction of historical resources**" in a manner consistent with the Secretary of Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties" ("the Standards") are exempt from CEQA. None of the exceptions to categorical exemptions in section 15300.2 apply to the project. The project would not have a cumulative impact on the environment, there are no unusual circumstances regarding this project that will cause a significant impact on the environment, the project is not visible from any scenic highways, the project is not located on a hazardous waste site and the proposed project will not cause an substantial adverse change to any historical resources.

Prepared by: Elizabeth Gonzales, Permit Center Manager

Approved by: Jordan Evans-Pollockow, HRRB Secretary

The following attachments are on file with Housing and Community Development:

- Exhibit A - Draft Resolution
- Exhibit B - Project Plans, Colors and Materials
- Exhibit C - Phase II Historic Resource Evaluation, Local Assessment, and Secretary of Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties, prepared by Evans & De Shazo, Inc. with DPR

Cc: Baily Sullivan, Brody Group, Sausalito CA