Introduced: 8/28/2025 **Current Status:** Agenda Ready

Version: 1 **Matter Type:** General Agenda Item

DA250201 - LEVETT DENNIS A & JEANNE COX TRS

Public hearing to consider recommending that the Chief of Planning approve a Design Approval to allow the replacement of existing wood shingle roofing materials with Class A fire resistant fiberglass based shingles on an existing 3,200 square foot dairy barn. Color to consist of weathered wood (brownish).

Project Location: 6540 Carmel Valley Road, (Assessor's Parcel Number 015-201-012-000), Carmel Valley Master Plan.

RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends that the County of Monterey Historic Resources Review Board (HRRB) adopt a resolution recommending that the Chief of Planning:

1) Find the Project categorically exempt from CEQA pursuant to CEQA Guidelines section 15331;

2) Approve a Design Approval to allow the replacement of existing wood shingle roofing materials with Class A fire resistant fiberglass based shingles on an existing 3,200 square foot dairy barn. Color to consist of weathered wood (brownish).

DISCUSSION:

In July 2025, applicant, Dennis Levett, applied for a Design Approval to replace existing roof materials of a 3,200 square foot historic dairy barn, known as the Hatton Dairy Barn. Due to fire concerns because the barn is located in a high fire hazard area, the applicant is requesting to replace the wood shingles with asphalt shingles. Prior to installing the shingles, new plywood and an additional layer of a fire-rated membrane will be installed for further fire protection. The current wood shingle roof was installed in 2011 and has reached the end of its life span. When the barn was originally constructed c. 1890, an elongated wood shingle roof was installed. When the barn was restored in 2011, the shingles were replicated. The project also includes the installation of interior storm windows. To prevent water intrusion through the stall windows, new storm windows will only be visible if the sliding wood shutters are open.

The Hatton Dairy Barn was listed in Monterey County's Local Official Register of Historic Resources by Monterey County's Board of Supervisors in June 2009. The DPR 523 form (**Exhibit D**) prepared by Kent Seavey describes the barn as eligible for listing under the California Register of Historic Resources at the local level for its association with the pioneering California Dairyman William Hatton.

The history of William Hatton and his barn on the Upper Hatton Ranch in Carmel Valley is excerpted from this report, "William Hatton was the owner-operator of the Del Monte Dairy, one of the most

extensive dairying interests in Monterey County in the late 19th century, controlling as many as 4000 acres at one time. Hatton's dairy milked as many as 600 high quality Holstein and Durham cows daily. In 1883 Hatton became superintendent of the PIC ranching operations in Carmel Valley, moving to Los Laureles Ranch. Hatton purchased 1000 acres of mid-valley property (Upper Ranch) with Sinclair Ollason in the 1880s, where the subject dairy barn is located, later buying out the Ollason interest. By 1888 Hatton had been hired by Dominga Doni de Atherton, to manage her dairy on the Rancho Canada de la Segunda, which he later purchased in 1892. Mr. Hatton was considered in his time to be one of the foremost progressive dairymen in California. His introduction of Durham cattle, early use of mechanical milk separators and other evolving technologies, and his testing laboratory for better project quality and safety were some of the earliest dairying innovations in the state."

A Phase II Historic Assessment (**Exhibit C**) for the Hatton Dairy Barn was prepared by Historical Consultant, Meg Clovis on July 10, 2025, and describes the barn as follows: "The Hatton Dairy Barn is a 40 by 80 foot wood framed dairy barn, rectangular in plan, that rests on a concrete foundation. The exterior walls are clad with wide vertical flush Douglas fir siding. The medium pitched front gabled roof has wide overhanging eaves with exposed rafter tails. There are two gabled, louvred wood ventilators on the roof ridge. The roof is covered with elongated wood shingles. Double doors are located on the gable ends of the barn. The opening at the east doors is flanked by rail mounted sliding doors on the side aisles. The north and south elevations have a series of stall window openings with sliding wood shutters that match the exterior siding. The barn is immediately south of Carmel Valley Road and is in a rural neighborhood of older farm buildings and open space. The barn was rehabilitated in 2011. The wood siding on the west, east, and north elevations was replaced with Douglas fir siding that matched the original. The south elevation is original wood that was patched from pieces of wood taken from the other elevations. A new roof was installed using custom-made, 36 inch wood shakes that replicate the original."

The barn's character defining features are its:

- Rectilinear plan and one-story massing.
- Gabled roof with louvered windows.
- Door openings on the west and east elevations.
- Stall windows with sliding wood shutters.
- Wood siding on the south elevation.

The compliance of the proposed work on the Hatton Dairy Barn was reviewed with respect to the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation Standards in the Phase II Historic Assessment. The proposed work meets Standards One, Two, Three, Five and Nine. Standards Four, Seven, Eight, and Ten are not applicable. The report states that upon HRRB approval of the replacement roof materials, the proposed work will meet Standard Six. The project meets the applicable Secretary of the Interior's Standard's for Rehabilitation; therefore, the proposed project will not impact the historic integrity of the Hatton Dairy Barn.

CEQA

The proposed project qualifies for a class 31 exemption pursuant to section 15331 of the CEQA Guidelines with no exceptions to section 15300.2. This exemption applies to projects that are for the "**maintenance, repair, stabilization, rehabilitation, restoration, preservation, conservation or**

reconstruction of historical resources" in a manner consistent with the Secretary of Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties" ("the Standards") are exempt from CEQA. Additionally, the project will not have a cumulative impact on the environment, there are no unusual circumstances regarding this project that will cause a significant impact to the environment, the project is not visible from any scenic highways, the project is not located on a hazardous waste site and the proposed project will not cause a substantial change to any historical resources.

Prepared by: Margarita Ochoa, Permit Technician II
Reviewed by: Elizabeth Gonzales, Permit Center Manager
Approved by: Phil Angelo, Senior Planner

The following attachments are on file with Housing and Community Development:
Exhibit A - Draft Resolution
Exhibit B - Site Plan and Colors and Materials
Exhibit C - Phase II Historic Assessment for the Hatton Dairy Barn prepared by Historical Consultant, Meg Clovis, dated July 10, 2025.
Exhibit D - Phase I Historic Report prepared by Kent L. Seavey

cc: Charles Mandurrago (Agent); Dennis Levett (Applicant); Project File DA250201