Exhibit B



EXHIBIT B DISCUSSION

Setting and Description of Project:

The property is a vacant trapezoidal parcel of approximately 2.5 acres located at 15630 Plaza Serena. The site is an undeveloped but disturbed site (has an existing long driveway) and for the most part it is heavily forested with tree spacing ranging between 5 and 15 feet apart except where development is proposed. The parcel is surrounded with other residential parcels of a similar size. Several parcels have homes with accessory structures, including barns.

Total lot coverage proposed is 4,084 square feet (approximately 3.75% lot coverage). Associated grading for the residence will consist of 334 cubic yards of cut and 128 cubic yards of fill. The remaining 206 cubic yards of excess fill will be used to fill the area of the proposed recreation structure. Two septic systems, one for the residence and one for the recreation structure are proposed.

As stated in the cover report, the project requires the following entitlements:

- 1) A Coastal Administrative Permit to allow the construction of an approximately 3,000 square foot one-story single family residence with attached garage and an approximately 1,050 square foot detached recreation room;
- 2) A Coastal Development Permit to allow the removal of five (5) Coast live oak trees and the "after-the-fact" removal of one (1) Landmark Coast live oak tree, for a total of six (6) Coast live oaks; and
- 3) A Coastal Development Permit for development within 100 feet of Environmentally Sensitive Habitat Areas (ESHA- central maritime chaparral plant community, Pajaro Manzanita, Hooker's Manzanita, Monterey ceanothus).

Project Issues:

Potential issues affecting biological and tribal cultural resources were found to occur with the implementation of this project:

Environmentally Sensitive Habitat Areas (ESHA)- Biological surveys confirmed the presence of the following environmentally sensitive habitats within 100 feet of proposed development: central maritime chaparral plant community consisting of Pajaro manzanita, Hooker's manzanita and Monterey ceanothus. The biological survey update dated September 15, 2017, attaches a map with approximate locations of these plants. **Exhibit F**. Pajaro manzanita and Hooker's manzanita are both present in places close to the existing driveway. The impacts to these plants would result from widening of the driveway to meet current fire standards. The biologist offers mitigation measures that would reduce the impacts to a less than significant level.

In addition to the sensitive plant species located near the existing driveway, the biologist confirmed the presence of a large area of maritime chaparral on the property, containing Pajaro

manzanita, Hooker's manzanita and Monterey ceanothus located north of the proposed home site. No removal of these plants is anticipated although some trimming may be necessary on those plants that are closer to the proposed development for fire clearance. In order to reduce construction impacts to a less than significant level, the following mitigation measure has been divided into a "driveway widening" and an "overall project," each with separate mitigation actions. See Exhibit C, Recommended Conditions of Approval, Condition Nos. 21-28):

Mitigation Measure 1: In order to reduce construction impacts to less than significant levels to sensitive species (central maritime chaparral plant community, Pajaro manzanita, Hooker's manzanita and Monterey ceanothus); and in order to allow for wildlife corridor passage and the eradication of invasive exotic plants, the following shall occur (project impacts separated by "driveway widening" and "overall project"):

<u>Driveway Widening:</u> The proposed driveway widening may have potential impacts to sensitive plant species, including Pajaro manzanita (*Arctostaphylos pajaroensis*) and Hooker's manzanita (*Arctostaphylos hookeri* ssp.*hookeri*), which are both present in places close to the existing driveway's edges.

- The widening of the driveway will require the removal of the sensitive plants, these would be transplanted to an area within the property designated by the qualified biologist. The transplanted Pajaro or Hooker's manzanitas will also be supplemented with one additional plant of local origin (2:1 mitigation). See the attached map of sensitive plant species locations at the end of the Biological survey update dated September 15, 2017.
- All sensitive plants that could potentially be impacted by driveway construction will be surrounded by orange construction fencing prior to the start of construction.

Overall Project: In order to maximally protect and preserve all Pajaro manzanitas, Hooker's manzanitas on or near the areas to be developed, to allow for wildlife corridor passage and the eradication of invasive exotic plants, the following measures shall occur:

- All Pajaro manzanitas and Hooker's manzanitas in areas that could be impacted by development will be marked by orange construction fencing prior to the start of construction. If it is determined that any Pajaro manzanitas or Hooker's manzanitas will have to be removed, these will be replaced with two of local origin (2:1 mitigation). Any transplanted Pajaro manzanitas will also be supplemented with one additional one.
- Conservation easements or scenic easements shall be dedicated to preserve sensitive habitat areas on the property, which include the ridge top and north slope areas of central maritime chaparral north of the proposed home site and the area north of the proposed driveway just west of the home site. (See the attached map of sensitive plant species locations at the end of the Biological survey update dated September 15, 2017).

- A preconstruction survey for the presence of sensitive wildlife that could potentially be impacted by construction activities shall be conducted ten days prior to the start of the work. If construction or tree trimming begins between April 1 and August 31, the survey shall also include breeding birds.
- Storage and staging areas for construction shall be on already cleared land and shall not be on or close to areas of natural habitat.
- Perimeter fencing, if present, shall be of a type to allow wildlife to cross. Wire fencing shall have a clearance of eighteen inches between the ground and the first wire and can be any height. Board fencing shall have at least two panels on a side, or every ten feet, with at least fifteen inches between boards.
- Curbs at the edges of driveways, parking areas, or driveways, will be low and have rounded contours, to allow amphibians, reptiles, invertebrates and other small animals to cross them easily.
- All landscaping and restoration plantings on the property shall be composed primarily of native plants of local origin. Other native plants and drought tolerant, fire resistant plants with similar requirements to our native vegetation may also be planted immediately around the home. All other restoration plantings shall be plants native to the area, preferably of local origin. A native plant seed mix from stock of local origin shall be used to restore impacted native understory and ground cover as well as for erosion control. Many suitable plants for drought-tolerant landscaping in our local area are listed on pamphlets and websites available from the Monterey County Resource Management Agency, the Monterey Peninsula Water Management District and other agencies as well as native plant nurseries.
- Invasive exotic plants will, as much as possible, shall be removed from the property. The invasive exotics observed to be on the Barwick Property on my survey are: Hottentot Fig (Carpobrotus edulis), French Broom (Genista monspessulana) and Pampas Grass (Cortaderia jubata).

Tree Removal: The development includes the removal of six (6) oak trees including one (1) previously removed landmark oak tree (landmark oak tree is an oak tree of 24 inches or more in diameter)¹; as well as the removal of eight (8) non-landmark eucalyptus. The following is a

¹ Forest Resources Development Standards contained in Section 20.144.050 of the *Monterey County Coastal Implementation Plan, Part 2, Regulations for Development in the North County Land Use Plan Area*, identifies Coast live oaks, 6 inches or more in diameter as protected trees. Coast live oaks of 24 inches or more in diameter are not only protected, but are considered "landmark" trees with specific findings for their removal.

table showing tree identification number in the Tree Resource Assessment report, size in diameter, structure, health, removal, and location (under comments):

ID#	Diameter	Species	Structure	Health	Remove	Comments
325	6	Oak	Fair	Fair	Х	Leach Field
326	10	Oak	Fair	Fair	Х	Leach Field
327	10	Oak	Fair	Fair	Х	Leach Field
328	6	Oak	Fair	Fair	Х	Building footprint
329	9	Oak	Fair	Fair	Х	Building footprint
158	20,7	Eucalyptus	Poor	Fair	Х	Building footprint
159	11,11,4,4,4	Eucalyptus	Poor	Fair	Х	Building footprint
160	7,5	Eucalyptus	Poor	Fair	Х	Building footprint
161	15,10	Eucalyptus	Poor	Poor	Х	Building footprint
162	13	Eucalyptus	Fair	Fair	Х	Building footprint
163	17	Eucalyptus	Fair	Fair	Х	Building footprint
164	10	Eucalyptus	Fair	Fair	Х	Building footprint
165	8,6,6,4	Eucalyptus	Poor	Fair	Х	Building footprint

The arborist observed one stump where a 24" diameter Oak tree (#333) was removed without a permit, which has been added to the tree removal count. The tree stump is located within the proposed building foot print. The Tree Resource Assessment concludes that judging by its stump measurement, the tree should be classified as a landmark oak. Evidence suggests that the tree was not visually significant, did not have historical value or it was not more than 1000 years old. The removal of the tree would have been required with this site plan due to the configuration of the lot, which has a scenic easement that makes designing a house difficult on this property. The arborist concludes that the proposed number of trees to be removed is the minimum possible given the site constraints of the property and the proposed tree removal will not significantly affect air movement or noise levels. Trees to be removed are on edges of existing stands of trees and will not disrupt forest continuity or have a negative effect to prevailing sun/wind exposure to trees. The arborist provides recommendations that would reduce impacts to a less than significant levels. These recommendations include, preconstruction meeting and training session with construction staff to educate them on tree protection measures, replanting requirements which include, eight (8), five-gallon or larger Coast Live Oaks trees in locations near or adjacent to the removed trees and monitoring of these trees for three years. All recommendations in the Tree Resource Assessment report have been incorporated as conditions of approval of the project.

Tribal Cultural Resources- The site is in a low archaeological area, nevertheless, during the tribal consultation meeting in accordance with AB52 requirements, the Tribal Chairwoman of the Esselen Nation required on-site monitoring be a requirement of the project by a tribal monitor. The Tribal Chairwoman expressed concerns with the proposed project since the project involves removal of five Coast live oaks and the stump removal of a 24-inch in diameter Coast live oak, previously cut. She expressed that Coast live oaks were considered important and

frequented by her people for food and burials. Also, she had concerns with the excavation depth of the proposed septic and septic leach field areas. Therefore, the Tribal Chairwoman recommended that a tribal monitor be onsite during the removal of the proposed Coast live oaks and during the excavation of the septic and septic leach field areas. In order reduce potential impacts to archaeological resources such as artifacts, human remains, and/or a sacred site, a mitigation measure requiring an OCEN tribal monitor to observe the removal of the Coast live oaks and the excavation activities for the proposed septic and septic leach field areas has been incorporated.

Environmental Review

An Initial Study/Draft Mitigated Negative Declaration (IS/MND) was prepared in accordance with CEQA and circulated for public review from October 17, 2017 to November 15, 2017. Issues that were analyzed in the MND were Biological Resources, Cultural Resources, Greenhouse Gas Emissions, Tribal Cultural Resources and Mandatory Findings of Significance. Potential impacts to Biological Resources and Tribal Cultural Resources were identified. Mitigation measures proposed are designed to mitigate for the impacts to ESHA and to manage the discovery of cultural resources during construction. The impacts are mitigated to a less-than-significant level through the implementation of these mitigation measures. Staff did not receive any comment letter(s) during the public review period.

Recommendation

The proposed project has been designed to meet the policies of the North County Land Use Plan and site development standards of the Low Density Residential Zoning District. The proposed project has been designed to be subordinate to the site. The initial study addresses and analyzes potential impacts from the proposed development and where necessary, mitigates the impacts to less than significant. Therefore, staff recommends adoption of the Mitigated Negative Declaration and approval of the Combined Development Permit.

This page intentionally left blank