

Exhibit D

This page intentionally left blank.

KENT L. SEAVEY
310 LIGHTHOUSE AVENUE
PACIFIC GROVE, CALIFORNIA 93950
(831) 375-8739

February 26, 2018

Mr. Gary Wimmer
21888 Blue Oaks Place
Los Altos Hills, CA 94022

Dear Mr. Wimmer:

Thank you for the opportunity to prepare a Phase I Historic Review for your residential property located at 2361 Bay View Ave. (APN# 009-422-006), on Carmel Point in Carmel, as required by the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) and the County of Monterey. The property is not historically significant.

According to Monterey County Assessor's records the subject property was constructed in 1938. Additions and alterations were made between 1970, with a guest house remodel (no permit # available). In 1989 a full second floor was added to the original one-story house (MCBP# 42526), with further alterations to the attached garage under (MCBP# 42527) that same year. Further alterations to the main residence occurred in 1995 (MCBP# 38816). The original owner was Mrs. Helen Rosenkrans, a widow, who first appears in a 1940 Monterey and San Benito Telephone Directory, and is listed in the Polk Business Directory for Carmel in 1941. No architect or builder has been identified.

The original residence was one-story and wood-framed, in the Pueblo Revival Style, reflected in the form of the altered guest house to the rear of the property. In 1989 the house was transformed into a French Mansard roofed cottage by the addition of a full second floor. As noted above, further alterations were made in 1995.

As noted above, the guest house to the rear (north) of the fully altered main residence, while maintaining some of the original form of its Pueblo Revival style, has also been sufficiently altered by the complete change of its original fenestration to modern vinyl-clad windows, in a variety of shapes and sizes, many with snap in multi-paned plastic muntins, and the addition of a modern enclosed entry porch. This work was done in 1970 according to the Monterey County Assessor's records.

The subject property is sited on the north side of Bay View Ave., slightly below grade, and screened by a wood fence from the roadway, in an informal landscape setting of grassed lawn, dotted with flowers, and mature shrubbery. The residence is located in a wooded residential neighborhood with homes of varying ages, sizes and styles.

The California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA), PRC Sec. 21084.1 requires all properties fifty years of age or older to be reviewed for potential historic significance. Criteria for that significance is addressed in PRC Sec. 5024.1 (a). It asks, did any event important to the region, state or nation occur on the property. Did anyone important to the region, state or nation occupy the property during the productive period of their lives. Does the building represent an important architectural type, period or method of construction, or is it a good example of the work of a noted architect or master builder. The criteria also asks if the property is likely to yield information significant to the understanding of the area's history.

Eligibility for historic listing of buildings, structures, objects, sites and districts, i.e., rests on the twin factors of historic significance and integrity to be considered for listing in the National Register of Historic Places, the California Register of Historical Resources, and the Monterey County Historic Resource Inventory. Loss of integrity, if sufficiently great, will overwhelm the historic significance a resource may possess and render it ineligible for historic listing. Likewise, a resource can have complete integrity, but if it lacks significance, it must also be considered ineligible.

Integrity is measured by the application of seven aspects, defined by the National Register Criteria for Evaluation. They include: Location, the place where the historic property was constructed, or an historic event occurred; Design, the combination of elements that create the form, plan, space, structure, and style of a building;

Setting, the physical environment of the historic property; Materials, the physical elements that were combined during a particular period of time and in a particular pattern or configuration to form a historic property; Workmanship, the physical evidence of the crafts of a particular culture or people during any given period in history; Feeling & Association are subjective elements that assess a resources ability to evoke a sense of time and place.

The subject property is not included in the California Office of Historic Preservation-maintained "Historic Data File for Monterey County" (updated September, 2017). It is not listed in the California Register, or the National Register of Historic Places, nor is it listed in the Monterey County Historic Resources Inventory.

The subject property retains its original location and setting. However, The principal residence is a modern interpretation of a classic French building style designed and constructed in 1989 (MCBP# 42527). It bears no relationship with the traditional residential building styles associated with Carmel's architectural heritage. Changes to the Pueblo Revival Style rear guest house have sufficiently compromised its original c. 1938 design, materials and workmanship to preclude its consideration for historic listing. The subject property does not evoke a sense of time and place or of feeling and association with the early development of Carmel Point. No architect or builder has been identified with the original residence.

No event of significance to the nation, state or region, nor any significant individuals during the productive period of their lives, have been identified with the existing property.

Lacking both physical integrity and historic significance, the subject property does not meet the necessary criterion for listing in the California Register of Historical Resources. Nor does it meet the criterion established by the County of Monterey to qualify for inclusion in the Monterey County Register of Historic Places, and therefore cannot be considered as historic resources as defined by CEQA.

Respectfully Submitted,

A handwritten signature in dark ink, appearing to read "Karl S. Scovay". The signature is written in a cursive, flowing style with a long horizontal stroke at the end.

2361 Bay View Avenue-Carmel



Photo #1. Looking NE at the SW facing facade, note 1989 Mansard roofed second story, Kent Seavey, February, 2018.



Photo #2. Looking NE at the guest house, note 1970 new entry, & vinyl window replacement of original wood windows, Kent Seavey, Feb. 2018.