

Exhibit D

This page intentionally left blank.

P A S T
CONSULTANTS LLC

Seth A. Bergstein
415.515.6224
seth@pastconsultants.com

June 13, 2018

Kelly Tucker
24713 Upper Trail
Carmel, CA 93923

Re: Phase One Historic Assessment for 24713 Upper Trail, Carmel, CA
APN. 009-071-008-000

Dear Mr. Tucker:

This letter states the findings of historic significance, based on our research and conditions assessment of the property located at 24713 Upper Trail, Carmel, California. PAST Consultants, LLC (PAST) attended a site visit to the subject property on May 31, 2018 to photograph the property and assess its existing condition. Research in local repositories was conducted during June 2018 to determine the property's potential historic significance.

24713 Upper Trail contains a single-story house (1948) constructed in the California Ranch style and a flat-roofed garage constructed below the house (**Figure 1**). The house has gable roofs with exposed rafters; wood fixed and wood casement windows; a single Carmel-stone chimney and Carmel-stone site walls (**Figures 2 - 4**).



Figures 1 and 2. Left image shows the house located above the flat-roofed garage. Right image details the west elevation's gable end, which is finished with clapboard siding above stucco walls.

P.O. Box 721
Pacific Grove, CA 93950
www.pastconsultants.com

The south elevation features a Carmel-stone chimney and replaced front door (**Figure 3**). The rear (north) elevation is a plain stucco composition with a rear service entrance to a concrete patio (**Figure 4**).



Figures 3 and 4. Left image shows the south elevation with replaced entry door. Right image shows the rear (north) elevation, looking southwest.

24713 Upper Trail is not historically significant under National (NR) or State of California (CR) register criteria. Monterey County Assessor's records indicate that the house was constructed in 1948 for James O. and Alma G. Handley (*Monterey County Assessor Records*), who occupied the house throughout the historic analysis period, 1948 - 1968. James O. Handley worked for Carmel Building Supply at the corner of 4th Avenue and Junipero Street (*Polk's Monterey, Pacific Grove, Carmel City Directories: 1948 - 1968*) and did not make any significant contributions to national, California or Monterey County history. Because the house is not associated with significant events or a significant person, the house is not historic according to NR Criteria A and B (CR Criteria 1 and 2). The Carmel Ranch-style house is not a particularly distinctive or representative example of a construction method or the California Ranch style (NR Criterion C/CR Criterion 3).

The property is not significant according to Monterey County Register criteria A. The California Ranch-style house on the property is not particularly representative of a distinct historical period, type, style, region or way of life (Criterion A1). The building style is not rare in Monterey County (Criterion A2). The property is not connected with someone renowned (Criterion A3). The property's residence does not represent the work of a master builder, engineer, designer, artist, or architect whose talent influenced a particular architectural style or way of life (Criterion A5). The property is not the site of an important historic event nor is it associated with events that have made a meaningful contribution to the nation, State, or community (Criterion A6).

The property is not significant according to Monterey County Register criteria B. The California Ranch-style house does not exemplify a particular architectural style or way of life important to the County (Criterion B1). It does not exemplify the best remaining architectural type of the community (Criterion B2). The construction materials or engineering methods do not embody elements of outstanding attention to architectural or engineering design, detail, material or craftsmanship (Criterion B3).

The property is not significant according to Monterey County Register criteria C. The property does not materially benefit the historic character of the community (Criterion C1). The location and physical characteristics of the property do not represent an established and familiar visual feature of the community, area, or county (Criterion C2). Lastly, the preservation of the property is not essential to the integrity of a district (Criterion C4), as no district is present.

In conclusion, because the house on the subject property has no historical associations and is not a distinctive example of the California Ranch style, the property at 24713 Upper Trail is not historic.

Please contact me if you have any questions about this evaluation.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "Seth Bergstein".

Seth A. Bergstein, Principal
cc.: Monterey County Planning Department; Jeff Crockett, Designer

This page intentionally left blank.