Attachment A

This page intentionally left blank.

ATTACHMENT A – Detailed Discussion

The discussion sections below provide additional detail to topics covered in the Staff Report.

Detailed Project Description

The combined desalination facilities will be constructed on the upper terrace (about 25 acres) of a 45.5 acre parcel, on a portion zoned Permanent Grazing, on Charlie Benson Rd, off of Del Monte Boulevard, north of the City of Marina, near the Marina Landfill. Construction will involve a total of 15 acres of impervious surfaces. Grading of 51,000cy of cut and 40,000cy of fill will be balanced on-site.

Water is proposed to be pulled from slant wells located at the CEMEX site in the City of Marina and conveyed to the desalination plant where the water will be treated. From the desalination plant, desalinated water will be conveyed to multiple locations, including: the Castroville Seawater Intrusion Project (CSIP) distribution system and the Castroville Community Services District (CCSD), the Ryan Ranch, Bishop, and Hidden Hills water systems, the forest lake tanks for service to Monterey, Seaside, and Pacific Grove, and to six Seaside Groundwater Basin Aquifer Storage and Recovery (ASR) wells for storage.

The project site is bordered on the west and north by agricultural lands and the Salinas River, and to the south by more agricultural lands. To the northwest lies the Dole processing facility and to the southeast lies Monterey Regional Environmental Park. South of the Monterey Regional Environmental Park is the several hundred acre Monterey Regional Water Pollution Control Agency's (Monterey One Water) Regional Wastewater Treatment Plant and drying beds.

The portion of the subject parcel where the desalination facility would be located is zoned Permanent Grazing (PG) with Design Control (D) and Site Plan (S) overlays. Water system facilities including wells and storage tanks serving 15 or more service connections are an allowed use with a Use Permit in the Permanent Grazing land use category (Title 21, Section 21.34.050.O).

Additional components associated with the desalination plant are located within the unincorporated areas of Monterey County, but do not require County discretionary entitlements. These include:

- Source Water Pipeline: The 42-inch-diameter Source Water Pipeline would convey the brackish intake slant well water from each wellhead located inland of the dunes within the CEMEX Plant property in the City of Marina to the MPWSP Desalination Plant.

- Brine Discharge Pipeline: The 36-inch-diameter Brine Discharge Pipeline would convey decanted brine effluent from the desalination process to a proposed Brine Mixing Box at the existing Monterey One Water wastewater treatment plant before being conveyed to the headworks of the existing Monterey One Water outfall pipeline.

- New Desalinated Water Pipeline: The 36-inch-diameter New Desalinated Water Pipeline would extend northwest from the Desalination Plant and convey desalinated water to the new transmission main beginning in the City of Marina and to be conveyed further south to proposed ASR wells. The New Desalinated Water Pipeline will also supply desalinated water to the Castroville Pipeline (described below) within unincorporated Monterey County.

- Castroville Pipeline: The 12 inch-diameter Castroville Pipeline will convey desalinated water from the New Desalinated Water Pipeline to the Castroville Seawater Intrusion Project (CSIP) distribution system and the Castroville Community Services District (CCSD) Well #3 at Del Monte Avenue and Merritt Street.

- Pipeline to CSIP Pond (aka Salinas Valley Return Pipeline): The 12-inch-diameter Salinas Valley Return Pipeline would convey desalinated water from the MPWSP Desalination Plant to the CSIP pond for subsequent delivery to agricultural users in the Salinas Valley.

Additional Information - Issues/Potential Impacts

Design/Visual Impacts

The property includes a Design Control "D" zoning overlay, which is intended to provide regulation of the location, size, configuration, materials, and colors in areas of the County where design review is appropriate to assure the visual integrity of certain developments without imposing undue restrictions on private property. The proposed desalination plant site is bordered by other industrial facilities, including the Monterey Regional Environmental Park, and the Monterey Regional Water Pollution Control Agency's (Monterey One Water) Regional Wastewater Treatment Plant and drying beds. Structures are proposed to be constructed of metal, and colors will be varying shades of green to complement the agricultural/industrial surroundings. Due to topographic features and vegetative screening, the proposed facilities will not be visible from public viewing areas, and the industrial nature of the desalination plant is similar to the landfill and wastewater treatment facilities in the vicinity.

Archaeology

No prehistoric archaeological resources were identified in the project area during the 2010-2016 survey effort. One historic-era resource, a railroad grade, was previously identified in the project area in 1998; however, there were no remains of this resource present on-site during the 2010 survey effort. The reports concluded that the site does not contain archaeological resources, so no additional review is necessary. Mitigation Measures 4.15-2b and 4.15-4 require work to stop and proper notification and procedures to occur in the event that resources or human remains are inadvertently discovered.

In compliance with state and federal requirements for tribal consultation, the lead agency (CPUC) contacted the Native American Heritage Commission (NAHC) and requested a search

of the Sacred Lands File. The search identified no results, and the NAHC provided contact information for the appropriate tribes. On June 24, 2016 letters were sent to members of the Esselen Tribe of Monterey County, Costanoan Rumsen Carmel Tribe, Ohlone/Costanoan Esselen Nation, Amah Mutsun Tribal Band, and Indian Canyon Mutsun Band. During follow up phone calls on March 16, 2017, the Tribal Council Woman of the Ohlone/Costanoan Esselen Nation requested that letters and maps be resent. MBNMS also spoke with the Chairperson of the Amah Mutsun Tribal Band who was interested in project components north of the Salinas River. No further communication was received from tribal members. Mitigation measures 4.15-2b and 4.15-4 identify procedures for work to stop and consultation to occur with the appropriate Native American representative and the Native American Heritage Commission if resources or remains are discovered during construction activities.

Traffic

While the increased traffic would be noticeable by drivers on the lower-volume segments of Reservation Road, the traffic volumes would continue to be within the carrying capacity of this two-lane road (about 10,000 to 15,000 vehicles per day). Therefore, the impact for this project would be less than significant.

Long-term increases on regional and local roadways during project operations and maintenance are expected to be less than significant. The greatest long-term increase in vehicle trips would occur on Charlie Benson Road, which is a private road. Based on existing traffic conditions and the industrial nature of surrounding land uses, the projected increase in daily trips from worker commutes is well within the roadway carrying capacity of the two-lane road and would not adversely affect traffic conditions. Other trips from commutes and deliveries would be dispersed onto different roads farther removed from Charlie Benson Road. Long term operations and maintenance of the desalination plant would result in minimal additional trips and will not adversely affect traffic condition on the overall existing circulation system over the long term.

Biological

Construction of the facilities could potentially significantly impact the species listed in the staff report, but Mitigation Measures listed in the EIR and adopted by the Mitigation Monitoring and Reporting Program will reduce all impacts to a less than significant level. Mitigation measures include:

- Designating a lead biologist to oversee and ensure implementation of special-status species protective measures;
- Requiring worker training to ensure that workers are aware of the special-status species and the measures necessary to avoid, minimize, or mitigate impacts;
- General measures such as installation of exclusion fencing, and a trash abatement program to ensure special-status species predators are not attracted to the site;
- Limiting construction to non-nesting season when feasible or requiring a no-disturbance buffer around active nests;

- Avoidance and minimization measures for American Badger;
- Habitat Mitigation and Monitoring Plan to describe all restoration and compensatory requirements;
- Avoidance and minimization measures for the California Tiger Salamander and Red-legged Frog, including pre-construction surveys, relocation procedures, exclusion fencing, and monitoring of vegetation removal and grading;
- Control measures for spread of invasive plants; and
- Requiring low-intensity exterior lighting.

Noise

Mitigation Measure 4.12-1b (General Noise Controls for Construction Equipment and Activities) has been included which requires staging areas and stationary noise sources to be located as far from nearby receptors as possible. Additional mitigation measures required by the Mitigation Monitoring and Reporting Plan include designation of a Neighborhood Notice and Construction Disturbance Coordinator, general noise controls for construction equipment and activities, offsite accommodations in the event of substantially affected nighttime receptors, vibration reduction measures, and stationary-source noise controls. Construction is not proposed to occur during nighttime hours, and thus nighttime noise impacts are not a concern for this portion of the project.

CalAm would install a 750-kW (1,000 hp) emergency diesel-powered generator adjacent to the administration building at the MPWSP Desalination Plant site. The generator would be operated weekly for 20 to 30 minutes during the daytime to test and maintain the engine which would result in a predicted noise level from generator operation of approximately 47.8 dBA Lmax at the nearest residence (2,200 feet away). The RO system would also require a series of specialty pumps, but these would be located within the treatment building and are not expected to generate substantial noise.

Additional CEQA Info

The County is a Responsible Agency under CEQA because the County is the permitting agency for the desalination and Carmel Valley pump station components of the project which are located in the unincorporated area of the County and require land use entitlements per County zoning. CEQA requires that a Responsible Agency consider the EIR certified by the Lead Agency and impose all feasible mitigation measures and feasible alternatives within its powers for the part of the project over which County has permitting authority. As a responsible agency, the County must make CEQA findings for the significant unavoidable and potentially significant impacts identified by the EIR and adopt a statement of overriding considerations for significant unavoidable impacts. All identified potential impacts for the desalination project will be mitigated to a level of less than significant with the exception of Cumulative Traffic and

Transportation and Cumulative Air Quality impacts from combined construction activities, which was determined to be Significant and Unavoidable. The draft resolution includes a statement of overriding considerations.

CEQA requires public agencies to adopt a program for monitoring or reporting on the measures it has imposed to mitigate or avoid significant environmental effects. A public agency may delegate reporting or monitoring responsibilities to another public agency which accepts the delegation; however, until mitigation measures have been completed the lead agency remains responsible for ensuring that implementation of the mitigation measures occurs in accordance with the program. CEQA Guidelines section 15097(e) states that lead and responsible agencies should coordinate their mitigation monitoring or reporting programs where possible. In this case, the CPUC, the lead agency, is responsible to ensure all measures are implemented according to the adopted MMRP. As a responsible agency, the County will adopt its own MMRP, which requires verification that mitigation measures which apply to the desalination plant have been implemented in accordance with the CPUC-adopted MMRP.

This page intentionally left blank