

Exhibit E

This page intentionally left blank.

P A S T
CONSULTANTS LLC

Seth A. Bergstein
415.515.6224
seth@pastconsultants.com

December 11, 2019

Craig Suhl
P.O. Box 117697
Burlingame, CA 94011

Re: Phase One Historic Assessment for 6235 Brookdale Dr., Carmel, CA
APN. 015-192-006-000

Dear Mr. Suhl:

This letter states the findings of historic significance, based on our research and conditions assessment of the property located at 6235 Brookdale Drive, Carmel, California. PAST Consultants, LLC (PAST) attended a site visit to the subject property on December 9, 2019 to photograph the property and assess its existing condition. Research in local repositories was conducted during December 2019 to determine the property's potential historic significance.

6235 Brookdale Dr. contains a highly modified house (circa-1959) constructed in the California Ranch style. The house has an irregular plan with gable roofs, Post-Adobe wall construction, a single chimney, front veranda and replaced windows (**Figures 1 and 2**).



Figures 1 and 2. Left image shows the front elevation taken from the driveway. The large gable-roofed mass with board-and-batten wall construction was constructed in front of and connected to the house in 1993. Right image shows the remaining post-adobe portion of the front elevation, with replaced front door and replaced windows.

A records search at the Monterey County Assessor's office reveals that the house has received two substantial alterations. The following lists the available building permits:

- Permit #3143, 1959. Construct single-family residence with full-width front veranda and detached garage.
- Permit #47800, 1993. Convert south half of garage to living space, install windows on garage and connect garage with the main house via a breezeway on the rear elevation.
- Permit #47805, 1993. Construct 990-sf, gable-roofed front addition by removing the west section of the original veranda and connecting the addition to the house's front elevation.

The 1993 alterations modified substantially the design, materials and spatial relationships of the original, Post-Adobe house. In addition, the modifications impacted the original garage on the west elevation (**Figures 3 and 4**). These modifications have removed substantially the historic integrity of design, materials, feeling and association from the original house.



Figures 3 and 4. Left image shows the original four-car garage, with half of the structure converted to living space with windows added in 1993. Right image details the rear elevation, showing substantial fenestration modifications and connection of the garage to the house via a breezeway (arrow).

Summary Property History

The house was constructed for Kenneth E. and Marjorie J. Copsey, Jr. Kenneth E. Copsey, Jr. was President of the Palace Drug Company, located at 401 Alvarado Street in Monterey. The Copsey family occupied the subject property from 1960 – 1967. Aside from presiding over a successful drug store, Kenneth E. and Marjorie J. Copsey did not contribute significantly to national, California or Monterey County history (*Polk's Monterey, Pacific Grove City Directories: 1959 – 1967*).

Evaluation of Historic Significance

6235 Brookdale Dr. is not historically significant under National (NR) or State of California (CR) register criteria because the alterations have removed most of the original house's historic integrity. Both the National Register and the California Register criteria emphasize that a house must possess

both historic significance and historic integrity. Without sufficient historic integrity, a building cannot communicate its historic significance.

In addition to this loss of historic integrity, the subject property is not associated with any events significant to national, California or Monterey County history. The subject property was developed at a time of increasing housing demand in the Carmel area following the population expansion and housing shortages after World War II. However, the demand for increased housing is not a significant event, as it would apply to numerous regions in the United States and California that experienced substantial postwar population growth. Because the house is not associated with significant events, the house is not historic according to NR Criterion A (CR Criterion 1).

Research did not reveal any significant contributions by the house's residents to national, California or Monterey County history. The house is not significant according to National Register Criterion B (CR Criterion 2). As stated above, the subject house has been highly altered with the 1993 additions and fenestration modifications and is no longer a distinctive or representative type, period or method of Post-Adobe construction, as better local and unaltered examples of the style remain extant in Carmel and Monterey County. The house is not significant under NR Criterion C (CR Criterion 3).

The property is not significant according to Monterey County Register criteria A. The property is not particularly representative of a distinct historical period, type, style, region or way of life that is important to the County (Criterion A1). The California Ranch-style house with Post-Adobe wall construction is distinctive to Monterey County; however, this example is too highly altered from its original design, making it not eligible under this Criterion (Criterion A2). The property is not connected with someone renowned (Criterion A3). The property does not represent the work of a master builder, engineer, designer, artist, or architect whose talent influenced a particular architectural style or way of life (Criterion A5). The property is not the site of an important historic event nor is it associated with events that have made a meaningful contribution to the nation, State, or community (Criterion A6).

The property is not significant according to Monterey County Register criteria B. The modified California Ranch-style house on the property does not exemplify a particular architectural style or way of life important to the County (Criterion B1). The property does not exemplify the best remaining architectural type of the community (Criterion B2). The construction materials or engineering methods do not embody elements of outstanding attention to architectural or engineering design, detail, material or craftsmanship (Criterion B3).

The property is not significant according to Monterey County Register criteria C. The property does not materially benefit the historic character of the community (Criterion C1). The location and physical characteristics of the property do not represent an established and familiar visual feature of the community, area, or county (Criterion C2). Lastly, the preservation of the property is not essential to the integrity of a district (Criterion C4), as no district is present.

In conclusion, because the property has no historic associations and has suffered from a substantial loss of historic integrity, the property at 6235 Brookdale Drive is not historic.

Please contact me if you have any questions about this evaluation.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Seth Bergstein". The signature is written in a cursive, slightly slanted style.

Seth A. Bergstein
Principal

Cc: Monterey County Planning Department