



Legislation Details (With Board Report)

File #: ZA 17-037 **Name:** PLN170341 - Wulf
Type: Other Board Matters **Status:** Agenda Ready
File created: 6/26/2017 **In control:** Board of Supervisors and Monterey County Water Resources Agency Board of Directors
On agenda: 6/29/2017 **Final action:**
Title: PLN170341 - WULF
Public hearing to consider entitlements to add about 900 total square feet to an existing single story family dwelling including an approximately 400 square foot second story addition, where development would occur within 750-feet of a known archaeological resource.
Project Location: 2744 Pradera Road, Carmel Meadows, Carmel Land Use Plan
Proposed CEQA action: Categorically Exempt per Section 15303 (a) and 15303 (e) of the CEQA Guidelines

Sponsors:

Indexes:

Code sections:

Attachments: 1. Staff Report, 2. Exhibit A - Project Data Sheet, 3. Exhibit B - Discussion, 4. Exhibit C - LUAC Minutes (5-15-17, 6-5-17), 5. Exhibit D - Draft Resolution, 6. Exhibit E - Vicinity Map, 7. Exhibit F - Phase One Historic Assessment (LIB170083), 8. Exhibit G - Comment Letters

Date	Ver.	Action By	Action	Result
6/29/2017	1	County of Monterey Zoning Administrator		

PLN170341 - WULF

Public hearing to consider entitlements to add about 900 total square feet to an existing single story family dwelling including an approximately 400 square foot second story addition, where development would occur within 750-feet of a known archaeological resource.

Project Location: 2744 Pradera Road, Carmel Meadows, Carmel Land Use Plan

Proposed CEQA action: Categorically Exempt per Section 15303 (a) and 15303 (e) of the CEQA Guidelines

RECOMMENDATION:

It is recommended that the Zoning Administrator adopt a resolution to:

- a. Find the project Categorical Exempt per Section 15303 (a), and 15303 (e) of the CEQA Guidelines; and
- b. Approve a Coastal Administrative Permit and Design Approval to allow additions to an existing single family dwelling, including 277-square feet on the first floor, a new 429-square foot second story with a 190-square foot deck; and
- c. Approve a Coastal Development Permit to allow development within 750-feet of a known archaeological resource.

The attached draft resolution includes findings and evidence for consideration (**Exhibit D**). Staff recommends approval subject to 9 conditions of approval.

PROJECT INFORMATION:

Agent: N/A

Property Owners: John and Karen Wulf

APN: 243-034-010-000

Parcel Size: 0.23 acres

Zoning: MDR/2-D (18) (CZ)

Plan Area: Carmel LUP

Flagged and Staked: Yes

SUMMARY:

The project site is located at 2744 Pradera Road in Carmel by-the-sea, on the west side of Highway 1 (aka Carmel Meadows). This project came on for an administrative hearing, to be approved by the Chief of Planning on June 7, 2017. Due to public controversy, this matter is being referred to the Zoning Administrator for consideration. Also, the project was referred to the Carmel Highlands Land Use Advisory Committee (LUAC) on May 15, 2017.

Issues were raised regarding bulk and mass of the proposed architectural design. Specifically, there is an issue of privacy as it relates to the second story deck. The LUAC continued the matter to allow the applicant an opportunity to address the issues raised and incorporate the recommendations of the Committee. The LUAC recommendation was to blend the second story addition with the first story and break up the boxy architectural design of the proposed additions.

To address privacy concerns, the applicant reduced the second story deck by 134 square feet and added a 30-inch solid privacy wall on the south side of the deck to obstruct the line of sight into the adjacent neighbor's backyard. The project returned to the Carmel Highlands LUAC on June 5, 2017 with the recommended modifications incorporated. Members of the public, including the closest neighbor raised similar concerns as the prior meeting about the re-design of the house. After review of the revised project plans, the LUAC recommended denial of the project by a vote of 3-0.

Design Review:

Carmel Meadows neighborhood is characterized by single-family homes, with single and second story homes lining its streets. Lots in this area are generally about 10,000 square feet. Residences with second stories exist with different architectural variations and add design interest to the overall aesthetic in this area. The neighbor immediately to the west of the subject property, has a second story extension with an enclosed atrium, a master bedroom, and various skylights. Nearing the end of the Pradera Road block, a home with a partial second floor is positioned prominently on the street. Right next to this home, the County has approved the construction of a 1,082 square-foot second floor addition and deck. These are just a few examples of existing second story additions on Pradera Road.

The project is located in the Medium Density Residential zoning designation setbacks and there is a special 18-foot height restriction. This proposal would modify an existing California Ranch style single family residence with uncovered decking in the backyard. Modifications include a new 429-square foot second story with a 190-square foot attached deck with colors and materials to match the existing structure; San Francisco Fog (gray) for the body, Feather White for the trim, and Country Gray (dark gray) for the roof shingles. To support the additional mass, Mr. Wulf's project also proposes to increase the first-floor square footage by 277-square feet.

Staff finds that the proposed project meets all of the development standards (height, set backs, etc) for this area. A roof deck, with the configuration of lots/homes in this area does afford some ability to see into neighboring yards/homes. This would be similar to a second story addition since it would exceed the fence/wall height. Staff has determined that there is no other location for a roof deck that would eliminate this issue (if not with this neighbor, another neighbor). The applicant added reasonable screening with a privacy wall. After thorough design review, staff feels that the proposed project is compatible with the neighborhood character and design.

DISCUSSION:

Detailed discussion is provided in **Exhibit B**.

CEQA

New construction or conversion of one single family residence and the addition of accessory structures is categorically exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) pursuant to Section 15303(a) and 15303(e) of the guidelines. This project includes remodels to one single family dwelling, and the addition of a deck. The project is located within 750 feet of a known archaeological resource. A report provided concludes that the proposed project would not impact any resources. Staff finds that there is adequate evidence to support finding that there are no unique circumstances for potential impact in this case (CEQA Guidelines, Section 15300).

OTHER AGENCY INVOLVEMENT:

The following agencies have reviewed the project, have comments, and/or have recommended conditions:

- RMA-Public Works
- RMA-Environmental Services
- Water Resources Agency
- Carmel Highlands Fire Protection District
- Carmel Highlands Land Use Advisory Committee

The proposed project was reviewed by the Carmel Highlands LUAC on May 15, 2017 and again on June 5, 2017. In the first Carmel Highlands LUAC meeting, a recommendation to continue the project was made to give the applicant an opportunity to incorporate design suggestions (**Exhibit C**). Specifically, the Committee expressed concerns relative to the massing of the second-floor addition and its roofline. In the subsequent meeting, the applicant returned with a re-design of the project, but did not receive the LUAC's approval of the revised project. The LUAC recommended denial of the project by a vote of 3-0 with one Committee member abstaining.

Prepared by: Maira Blanco, Assistant Planner, x5052
Reviewed by: Brandon Swanson, RMA Services Manager
Jacqueline Onciano, RMA Chief of Planning
Approved by: Carl P. Holm, AICP, RMA Director

The following attachments are on file with the RMA:

Attachments:

- Exhibit A - Project Data Sheet
- Exhibit B - Discussion
- Exhibit C - LUAC Minutes (5/15/17, 6/5/17)
- Exhibit D - Draft Resolution including:
 - Conditions of approval
 - Colors and Materials
 - Site Plans
- Exhibit E - Vicinity Map
- Exhibit F - Phase One Historic Assessment (LIB170083)
- Exhibit G - Comment Letters
 - Emails from Maya Pechak, April 21, 2017 and April 24, 2017

- Email from Maya Pechak, June 5, 2017
- Letter from Carmel Meadows Association (Andrew Popadiuk), June 5, 2017
- Email from Maya Pechak, June 6, 2017
- Letter from Maya Pechak, June 6, 2017
- Letter from Maya Pechak, June 22, 2017

cc: Front Counter Copy; Zoning Administrator; Brandon Swanson, RMA Services Manager; Maira Blanco, Project Planner; John R. and Karen A. Wulf; The Open Monterey Project (Molly Erickson); LandWatch (Executive Director); John H. Farrow; Janet Brennan; Project File PLN170341.