



County of Monterey

Board of Supervisors
Chambers
168 W. Alisal St., 1st Floor
Salinas, CA 93901

Legislation Details (With Board Report)

File #:	15-0346	Name:	Old Jail Feasibility Study
Type:	General Agenda Item	Status:	Agenda Ready
File created:	4/7/2015	In control:	Capital Improvement Committee
On agenda:	5/11/2015	Final action:	
Title:	a. Receive an update on the Final Report-Adaptive Reuse Feasibility Study for the Old County Jail located at 142 West Alisal Street, Salinas CA, Project 8850, Request For Proposal 10438, completed by Page & Turnbull, Inc.; b. Support acceptance of the Final Report-Adaptive Reuse Feasibility Study for the Old County Jail; and the inclusion of alternative schemes 7 and 8 as potential reuse schemes for the site; and c. Provide direction to staff on selection of one preferred scheme for the adaptive reuse of the Old County Jail site.		
Sponsors:	Public Works / RMA		
Indexes:			
Code sections:			
Attachments:	1. Jan 21, 2015 CIC Minutes, 2. Historic Facade Projects, 3. March 11, 2015 HRB letter, 4. Feb 5, 2015 HRRB Meeting Minutes, 5. Board of Supervisors Resolution 05-019, 6. Final Report-Adaptive Resue Feasibility Study.pdf		

Date	Ver.	Action By	Action	Result
5/11/2015	1	Capital Improvement Committee		
a. Receive an update on the Final Report-Adaptive Reuse Feasibility Study for the Old County Jail located at 142 West Alisal Street, Salinas CA, Project 8850, Request For Proposal 10438, completed by Page & Turnbull, Inc.;				
b. Support acceptance of the Final Report-Adaptive Reuse Feasibility Study for the Old County Jail; and the inclusion of alternative schemes 7 and 8 as potential reuse schemes for the site; and				
c. Provide direction to staff on selection of one preferred scheme for the adaptive reuse of the Old County Jail site.				

RECOMMENDATION:

It is recommended the Capital Improvement Committee:

- Receive an update on the Final Report-Adaptive Reuse Feasibility Study for the Old County Jail located at 142 West Alisal Street, Salinas CA, Project 8850, Request For Proposal 10438, completed by Page & Turnbull, Inc.;
- Support acceptance of the Final Report-Adaptive Reuse Feasibility Study for the Old County Jail; and the inclusion of alternative schemes 7 and 8 as potential reuse schemes for the site; and
- Provide direction to staff on selection of one preferred scheme for the adaptive reuse of the Old County Jail site.

SUMMARY/DISCUSSION:

On January 21, 2015, the Capital Improvement Committee (CIC) received a presentation on the Old County Jail, located at 142 West Alisal Street, Salinas CA, and the Final Report-Adaptive Reuse Feasibility Study (Final Report) completed by the consulting firm of Page & Turnbull, Inc. The Final Report incorporated existing studies, input from public entities and private citizens, an engineering analysis, and County evaluation of its present and future space needs. Based on this information, the following six (6) schemes with cost

estimates were developed:

- Scheme 1 - Remove Building and convert lot to parking or landscaped area (\$3,062,008)
- Scheme 2 - Save Alisal facade and add new building (\$29,060,240)
- Scheme 3 - Retain Administration Wing and add new building (\$19,878,806)
- Scheme 4 - Rehabilitate original construction; add new construction for infill (\$18,587,634)
- Scheme 5 - Full rehabilitation of entire building (\$13,532,983)
- Scheme 6 - Mothball of building (\$2,092,969)

In considering these alternatives, the CIC raised concerns about possible restrictions to removing the Old Jail that resulted from a previous attempt and a subsequent court order. In addition, the CIC requested that staff contact the State to obtain their perspective on project requirements/parameters.

The CIC did favor an alternative; however, it was not one of the six presented. The CIC favored removing the building with the exception of the façade. The façade would be saved and could act as a gateway to an outdoor plaza.

The purpose of this report is to detail additional information gathered in response to the direction from the CIC and determine if this information impacts the selected alternative. On March 12, 2014, RMA-PW and Page & Turnbull met with the State of California Office of Historic Preservation (OHP). OHP's stated position is that it would become involved only after an Environmental Impact Report (EIR) on the County's project was prepared and circulated, and it would not provide further comment until such time.

With respect to a possible restriction on the removal of the building due to an earlier court order, the following chronology is provided:

- | | |
|------------------|--|
| July 30, 2002 | County Board of Supervisors adopted a mitigated negative declaration for removing Old Jail. |
| August 30, 2002 | Historic Preservation Associates placed Old Jail on National Register of Historic Places and, subsequently, filed suit to stop removal of the building. |
| August 31, 2004 | Court of Appeals prevented building removal without proper consideration of its historic and architectural features through CEQA process. |
| February 5, 2005 | Board of Supervisors Resolution 05-019 set aside its decision to remove building based on adopted mitigated negative declaration and resolved to prepare an EIR prior to further consideration of removing the building. |

Therefore, removal of the building is an option; however, an EIR will need to be prepared. In fact, any significant alteration of the existing building will likely require an EIR given its historic and architectural heritage. This would include removal of all but the façade.

The Final Report was presented to the City of Salinas Historic Resources Board (HRB) and the County of Monterey Historic Resources Review Board (HRRB) on February 2, and February 5, 2015, respectively. Their comments/motions were as follows:

In a letter to the County dated March 11, 2015, HRB: *"recommends that the County accept the Final Report for its historical evaluation of this important National Register property, but notes that the Report does not provide "preferred" alternatives in keeping with the Secretary of the Interior standards. The Board is opposed to the complete demolition of the building. Instead, the Board recommends that the County follow the Secretary of Interior's Standards for adaptive use of the building which may include partial demolition."*

HRRB approved the motion recommending to the Board of Supervisors for the rehabilitation of the Old Monterey County Jail, based on the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historical Properties, taking into consideration the jail's architectural significance, its association with Cesar Chavez and its significance within the context of Salinas Government buildings.

Based on direction provided previously by the CIC, State, HRB, HRRB, and other stakeholders, two additional schemes have been developed for consideration:

Scheme 7 - Alisal Façade Preservation with commemorative Park (\$8,000,000)

Scheme 8 - 1930 Restoration (\$25,000,000)

Scheme 7 would be in line with the CIC's direction to remove the building, but save the façade. In analyzing this scheme, it is important to understand that the façade would need to be structurally supported, if it could be separated from the rest of the building without being damaged. Pictures of similar structures are provided in the attached Historic Façade Projects to illustrate what this would look like. The County Historian has indicated that OHP would likely not consider this type of project consistent with rehabilitation standards. The project cost estimate of this scheme is \$8 Million. Scheme 8 would rehabilitate the original 1930s construction elements with an external architectural restoration. All post-1930 construction would be removed, which would include areas occupied, at least in part, by Cesar Chavez. This scheme would address concerns about the loss of the architectural significance of the structure and yield 20,000 square feet and cost an estimated \$25 Million.

Given the information provided above, staff is seeking direction on the preferred scheme. For any scheme contained in the Final Report, which was previously transmitted, it should be anticipated that an EIR will be required with the possible exception of full rehabilitation (Scheme 5) or mothballing (Scheme 6). In addition, full rehabilitation would yield space limited by the existing conditions of the original facility resulting in low ceiling heights. Full rehabilitation would net small floor plates unsuitable for large business tenancy with discontinuous, compartmentalized units of space that would not foster modern office dynamic functionality of collaborative work environments. Full rehabilitation would further result in dark office space with less natural daylight and views not expected in contemporary business space. These negative attributes of full rehabilitation would result in a high-cost product with low user satisfaction in the overall product.

OTHER AGENCY INVOLVEMENT:

County of Monterey HRRB and City of Salinas HRB participated in public workshops, including a joint special meeting of the Boards on March 20, 2014. Staff provided status reports to HRRB at their regular meetings on May 1, and October 2, 2014. The Final Report was presented to HRB on February 2, 2015; and HRRB on February 5, 2015, respectively. The Final Report will be presented to the Budget Committee in May 2015.

FINANCING:

There is no financial impact to the General Fund as a result of supporting acceptance of the Final Report. Currently, no funds are allocated or available to move forward with any proposed scheme.

Prepared by: Dave Pratt, Project Manager II, (831)796-6091

Approved by:

Robert K. Murdoch, P.E., Director of Public Works

Approved by:

Carl P. Holm, AICP, Acting RMA Director

Attachments: January 21, 2015 CIC Minutes; Historic Façade Projects; March 11, 2015 HRB letter; February 5, 2015 HRRB Meeting Minutes; Board of Supervisors' Resolution 05-019; Final Report - Adaptive Resue Feasibility Study (on file with CCIC)

cc: City of Salinas Historic Resources Board
County of Monterey Historic Resources Review Board