PLN150669 - NASE WERNER JR. TRUST
Public hearing to consider the construction of a single-family residence which will require the removal of a maximum of 46 Monterey pines and the removal and off-site transplantation of approximately 437 individual Yadon's piperia (ESHA).
Project Location: 1412 Lisbon Lane, Pebble Beach, Del Monte Forest
Proposed CEQA Action: Adopt a Mitigated Negative Declaration
RECOMMENDATION:
It is recommended that the Planning Commission adopt a resolution to:
a. Adopt a Mitigated Negative Declaration;
b. Approve a Combined Development Permit consisting of:
   1) Coastal Administrative and Design Approval for the construction of a 5,385 square foot one-story single family dwelling with an attached garage, covered porch, and a detached 216 square foot gazebo;
   2) Coastal Development Permit for the removal of 46 Monterey pine trees;
   3) Coastal Development Permit for development within 100 feet of Environmental Sensitive Habitat (ESHA -Yadon's Piperia and Monterey Pine forest); and
c. Adopt a Mitigation Monitoring and Reporting Plan

The attached draft resolution includes findings and evidence for consideration **(Exhibit C)**. Staff recommends approval subject to 19 of conditions of approval and 10 mitigation measures subject to a mitigation monitoring and reporting plan.

PROJECT INFORMATION:
Owner: Werner Nase Jr. Trust
APN: 008-232-003-000
Parcel Size: .998 acres (43,456 square feet)
Zoning: LDR/1.5-D (CZ) [Low Density Residential, 1.5 acres per unit, with Design Control Overlay (Coastal Zone)]
Plan Area: Del Monte Forest Area Land Use Plan
Flagged and Staked: Yes

SUMMARY:
The project site is located at 1412 Lisbon Lane in Pebble Beach. See **Exhibit G- Vicinity Map**. It is a vacant rectangular parcel of approximately 1 acre, surrounded by large residences on similarly sized parcels. The zoning for the property is Low Density Residential, 1.5 acres per unit in a Design Control Overlay Zoning District. The site is relatively flat and covered primarily of upper canopy Monterey pine with some scattered understory Coast live oak and shrubs (willow, acacia and huckleberry) and with a large population of Piperia yadonii (Yadon's piperia), identified during spring biological surveys.
In January of 2016, the property owner, Mr. Werner Nase made an application to RMA-Planning to allow the construction of a one-story single family residence (4 bedroom, 4.5 baths) with an attached three car garage, covered porch, detached square foot gazebo and an entry gate with wall. The square footages for these are as follows:

- Residence, 4,078 square feet
- Attached Garage, 889 square feet
- Attached Covered Porch, 418 square feet
- Detached Gazebo, 216 square feet

See **Exhibit C-Plans and Photos**.

Analysis: The project requires the following entitlements: A Combined Development Permit consisting of: 1) a Coastal Administrative Permit and Design Approval for the construction of a 5,385 square foot one-story single family dwelling with an attached garage, covered porch, and a detached 216 square foot gazebo; 2) a Coastal Development Permit for the removal of 46 Monterey pine trees; and 3) a Coastal Development Permit for development within 100 feet of Environmental Sensitive Habitat (ESHA- Yadon's Piperia and Monterey pine woodland). The analysis conducted was based on these entitlements against pertinent State and Federal laws and Monterey County Code. Below is a summary of the design and biological analysis.
Design Review - The site is located in a Design Control Overlay Zoning District, which regulates the location, size, configuration, materials, and colors of structures to assure protection of public viewshed, neighborhood character, and visual integrity of certain developments without imposing undue restrictions on private property. The proposed residence is not located on a site that is mapped as visually sensitive or a visual resource; nor located on or near a scenic vista. The proposal is under the allowable lot coverage and floor area ratio limitations of the zoning district. Nevertheless, staff has analyzed the project's siting, bulk and mass, proposed site improvements such as tree removal and proposed landscaping, evaluating impacts to the neighborhood. The proposed residence is an asymmetrical one-story Mediterranean Modern Farmhouse-style home with portico entrance, composition roof, cement plaster, wood trim and stone veneer. Being that the home is proposed as single-story and not a two-story home, this alone reduces the sense of bulk and mass. More contributing factors to a reduced bulk and mass is the U-shaped elevation proposal with varied roof forms and moderate roof pitches; the siting of the home is proposed approximately 45 feet from the edge of Lisbon Lane and 45 feet from the west side yard property line; with a much larger east side yard setback of 80 feet. This siting in addition to the proposed native planting landscaping, ensures separation between adjoining parcels and creates screening, buffers and privacy. The proposed native plant landscaping along the perimeter of the proposed parcel and along the proposed residence and driveway, which includes a restoration site on the east portion of the Nase property, contributes to the re-forestation of Del Monte Forest.

Colors proposed are grey roof, beige body, brown trim and beige stone façade. The style, colors and materials are in keeping with the homes in this area of Pebble Beach. The proposed residence and site improvements are consistent with the Architectural Standards and Residential Guidelines for Del Monte Forest and proposed plans have been approved by the Del Monte Forest Architectural Review Board as well as receiving a recommendation of approval by the Del Monte Forest Land Use Advisory Committee. See **Exhibit H**.

Environmentally Sensitive Habitat Area (ESHA)-
Tree Removal: The project includes the removal of Monterey pines. Prior to the applicant's submittal of current development plans, the applicant worked with staff to reduce the tree removal by ten trees. This resulted in the proposed removal of 46 Monterey pines. A Tree Resource Assessment Management Plan (see **Exhibit F**) prepared for the project identifies the project site as having an overstock of Monterey pines; 200 trees on the parcel of under one acre. The arborist report states that tree removal is unavoidable since the trees are scattered throughout the property. The 46 Monterey pines to be removed are within the proposed house footprint and the trees are in the following health conditions: six (6) dead; fifteen (15) poor and twenty-five (25) fair. Additionally, the arborist is recommending that seven (7) Monterey pines, not within the construction footprint,

but near the construction and grading activities, be monitored.

Staff concurs with the arborist's finding. For residential development to occur on this site, tree removal is unavoidable. Furthermore, the area chosen for the development footprint is the least impactful to the forest because the development is concentrated on the west side of the property, allowing for a proposed enhancement/restoration area of approximately 21,600 square feet on the eastern portion of the Nase property (see Yadon's piperia and Monterey pine woodland section below). Mitigation measures have been incorporated to address the tree removal impacts. These include a 1: 1 replacement ratio of forty-six (46) Monterey pines at five-gallon each, to be located on site and requiring monitoring to ensure successful growth. In addition, monitoring of the seven (7) Monterey pines located near the construction activities. See Condition 24.

Yadon's Piperia and Monterey pine woodland: Seasonal biological surveys confirmed that two sensitive species occurred on the Nase property. They are Monterey pine (Pinus Radiata) woodland and Piperia yadonii (Yadon's piperia). A component of the project is to remove approximately 437 individual Yadon's piperia from the Nase property and relocate them to a receiver site in Del Monte Forest where in the opinion of the project's biologist in consultation with the United States Fish and Wildlife Service (USFWS), members of the Del Monte Forest Conservancy, the Del Monte Forest Open Space Advisory Committee and the Pebble Beach Company is the best mitigation. The receiver site was part of the Pebble Beach buildout project, allowing for conservation sites throughout Del Monte Forest.

The Yadon's piperia extends from the front of the Nase property, on the Pebble Beach right-of- way frontage directly adjacent to Lisbon Lane. This area contains most of the Piperia. It continues to the very back of the development footprint, where approximately 59 Piperia plants exist (area of the proposed residence). Other alternatives were analyzed; these included: 1) Trying to avoid impacting the Piperia population by redesign of the proposed development footprint (driveway and house footprint); and 2) Large percentage of avoidance (by project's design) and partial mitigation off-site. Both alternative options failed because the long term indirect impacts of development and surrounding neighborhood would likely cause the decline of the Piperia population, especially if the Piperia remained in the Pebble Beach right-of-way. Proceeding with the proposed development plans and transplanting all of the known Piperia to the chosen receiver site, located in "Area H" of the Pebble Beach Company conservation sites, is the best mitigation possible. The translocation of the Piperia can therefore be monitored for success, seedling recruitment and population size for five (5) years following transplanting. According the biologist, five years should be sufficient to demonstrate survival of the transplants.

The transplantation must occur between October 15 to March 15 when the Yadon's piperia tubers are dormant. A Mitigation and Monitoring Plan (MMP) has been prepared for the site by Regan Biological and Horticultural Consulting, LLC (RBHC) to offset the impacts to Monterey pine woodland and Yadon's piperia resulting from the construction activities. See **Exhibit E**. The MMP offers the following mitigation measures (not an inclusive list):

- In order to mitigate for the impacts to an area of approximately 10,800 square feet of Monterey pine woodland the applicant shall restore a 19,000 square foot area on the east portion of the Nase property using the dominant native species present on project site.

- A 1: 1 replacement ratio of forty-six (46), five-gallon Monterey pine trees to be located on site (mentioned previously). There is adequate space on site for the replanting and survival of the trees.

- Transplanting the approximate 437 individual Yadon's piperia from the Nase property to a Del Monte Forest receiver site, with monitoring for five years. Success criteria has been developed and this is found in the MMP, which has been added as part of the mitigation measures.

Staff prepared and circulated an Initial Study (see **Exhibit D**) that included the recommendations contained in the MMP. The Initial Study concluded that the project has a less than significant impact, with mitigation incorporated, to biological and cultural resources. The recommended mitigations for cultural resources were the outcome of staff's consultation with the most likely descendant (MLD) of the Ohlone/Costanoan-Esselen Nation. Although the archaeological report prepared for the project resulted in negative findings, the MLD expressed concerns with the proposed project since areas located close to bodies of water were frequented by their people. Therefore, the MLD recommended that a tribal monitor be onsite during any earth disturbing activities, which includes the transplantation of the Yadon's piperia from the site. This has been incorporated as mitigation measures requiring that an archaeologist and an MLD be present to monitor any earth disturbance to reduce potential impacts to archaeological resources.

DISCUSSION:
Detailed discussion is provided in **Exhibit B**.

OTHER AGENCY INVOLVEMENT:
The following agencies have reviewed the project, have comments, and/or have recommended conditions:
Environmental Health Bureau
RMA-Public Works
RMA-Environmental Services
Water Resources Agency
Pebble Beach Community Services District
Del Monte Forest Land Use Advisory Committee
Del Monte Forest Architectural Review Board

The proposed project was reviewed by the Del Monte Forest Land Use Advisory Committee (LUAC) on February 4, 2016, at which meeting the item was continued to February 18, 2016, pending revisions made by the applicant. On February 18, 2016, the LUAC recommended approval of the project by a vote of 4-0 (2 absent) (**Exhibit H**) and expressed no concerns for the project.

FINANCING:
Funding for staff time associated with this project is included in the FY17-18 Adopted Budget for RMA-Planning.

Prepared by: Nadia Amador, Associate Planner, Extension 5114
Reviewed by: Brandon Swanson, RMA Services Manager
Approved by: Carl P. Holm, AICP, RMA Director

The following attachments are on file with the RMA:
Exhibit A - Project Data Sheet
Exhibit B - Discussion
Exhibit C - Draft Resolution including:
- Recommended Conditions of Approval
- Plans and Photos

Exhibit D - Mitigated Negative Declaration (Draft Initial Study)
Exhibit E - Mitigation and Monitoring Plan for 1412 Lisbon Lane, Pebble Beach, CA, December 2016, Revised February 8, 2017
Exhibit F - Tree Resource Assessment Management Plan, dated December 29, 2015
Exhibit G - Vicinity Map
Exhibit H - Del Monte Forest Land Use Advisory Committee (LUAC) Minutes

cc: Front Counter Copy; Planning Commission; California Coastal Commission; Pebble Beach CSD; RMA-Public Works; RMA- Environmental Services; Environmental Health Bureau; Water Resources Agency; Pebble Beach Co., Cheryl Burrell; Del Monte Forest Conservancy, Suha Kilic, President; Jacqueline R. Onciano, Chief of Planning; Brandon Swanson, RMA Services Manager; Nadia Werner Nase, Applicant/Owner; Patrick Regan, Project's Biologist; US Fish & Wildlife Service Dept. of Interior, Ventura Office, Attn Christopher Diehl; California Department of Fish & Wildlife, Marine Region, Attn: Steven Rienecke; The Open Monterey Project (Molly Erickson); LandWatch; Project File PLN150669.