



County of Monterey

Board of Supervisors
Chambers
168 W. Alisal St., 1st Floor
Salinas, CA 93901

Board Report

File #: ZA 18-017, **Version:** 1

PLN170237 - RHODES

Public hearing to consider 2,335 square feet of additions to a 1,433 square foot single family residence for a total of 3,768 square feet and the removal of six Monterey Pine trees, including one 33 inch landmark tree, three others of which are considered a hazard.

Project Location: 4175 Sunset Lane, Pebble Beach, Del Monte Forest Land Use Plan.

CEQA Action: Categorically Exempt per CEQA Sections 15303 (a) and 15304

RECOMMENDATION:

It is recommended that the Zoning Administrator adopt a resolution to:

- a. Find that the project is a remodel and addition to an existing single family residence in a residential zone which qualifies as a Class 3 Categorical Exemption per Section 15303 (a) of the CEQA Guidelines; and tree removal which does not involve the removal of healthy, mature, or scenic trees, which qualifies as a Class 4 Categorical Exemption per Section 15304. and does not meet any exceptions under Section 15300.2;
- b. Approve a Combined Development Permit consisting of:
 - 1) Coastal Administrative Permit and Design Approval to allow the remodel of a one-story 1,433 square foot single family residence for a total of 3,768 square feet to include:
 - a. 1,082 square foot addition on the main level;
 - b. 264 square foot addition on the upper level; and
 - c. 989 square foot attached garage on the basement level
 - 2) Coastal Development Permit for the removal of six Monterey Pine trees (ranging between 15" and 33" in diameter), three of which are considered a hazard.

The attached draft resolution includes findings and evidence for consideration (**Exhibit B**).

Staff recommends approval subject to 16 conditions of approval.

PROJECT INFORMATION:

Agent: Duke Kelso Construction

Property Owner: Daniel Rhodes and Katherine Spitz

APN: 008-072-013-000

Parcel Size: 13,600 square feet

Zoning: "MDR/4-D (CZ)" Medium Density Residential 4 units per acre-Design Control in the Coastal Zone

Plan Area: Del Monte Forest Land Use Plan

Flagged and Staked: Yes

SUMMARY/DISCUSSION:

Setting:

The project site is located northwest of 4175 Sunset Lane, approximately .06 miles south of its intersection with Crest Road in the Del Monte Forest of Pebble Beach. The topography of the 13,600 square foot site

encompasses an area containing a slight northern slope on a southeastern facing hillside above Pescadero Canyon. The majority of the site is covered with modest landscaping, hardscaping and a variety of trees.

Project overview:

Currently, a single family residence is located centrally on the site with a driveway from the existing carport providing access to the street on the southeastern property line. As proposed, a new garage with a second story addition is to be located on the residence's southern side, with a new driveway tying in to the existing home to the northeast. Several additions are to be placed to the west and north on the residence's northwest corner, expanding the square footage and providing for proposed interior remodels.

Historic Resource:

The subject property is significant, under California Register criteria 2, for its association with internationally recognized architect Charles W. Moore and criteria 3, for architecture as an excellent example of Japanese influenced design, and as one of Moore's first residential projects. The existing single family home consists of a one-story, wood framed residence of Japanese influenced design. Constructed in 1954, the exterior wall-cladding is a combination of vertical wood siding along the north facing façade, with wide, horizontal ship-lap wood siding and extensive glazing along the rear (south) elevation as well as a large open wood deck. The roof system is a low-pitched gable-on-hip type, called Irimoya in Japanese. The roof has wide, overhanging eaves and is covered in composition shingles. There was a 1974 bedroom/bathroom addition projecting south off the main building block, with vertical flush-board siding, that was added toward the west, off the deck along this elevation that did not take away from the Historic Resource. The new additions are located in non-character defining elevations. The proposed work on the subject property will be executed consistent with the Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation, with the least possible loss of historic material so that the remaining character-defining features of the resource will not be obscured, damaged or destroyed. On October 5, 2017, the Historic Resources Review Board found that the proposed work was consistent with Section 18.25 of Monterey County Code. Therefore, as proposed, the additions will not cause a significant adverse effect on the environment.

Design Review:

The Project is located within a Design Control District, pursuant to Chapter 20.44, Design Control Zoning Districts. This zoning requires design review of structures to assure protection of the public viewshed, neighborhood character, and to assure visual integrity. Due to the Historic nature of the existing residence and the desire of the applicants to maintain the integrity of the structure, all additions are sited in a way that will not take away from the Historic feel of the existing structure. The end result will maintain the Historic ambiance of the Charles Moore design. Colors and materials will match the existing similar wood materials, with the same brown colors that will not obscure, damage or destroy the Historic Resource.

Development Standards

Pursuant to Section 20.70.120 (MCC), on property located between the sea and the first public road paralleling the sea (Pebble Beach) improvements that would result in an increase of 10% or more of internal floor area of an existing structure, requires a Coastal Administrative Permit. The proposed project includes additions that are over 10% of the existing floor area. Under the Medium Density Residential Zoning District, allowable lot coverage is 35%; proposed is 19.2%. There is also an allowable floor area ratio, which is 35%; the project proposes 21%. All other site development standards (i.e., setbacks, height) within the MDR zoning district have been met. The project is located on the edge of the Del Monte Forest Watershed Boundary, within an unnamed watershed. Pursuant to 20.147.030, A.b., "Impervious surface coverage for residential development shall be limited to a maximum of 9,000 square feet. Maximum coverage for the proposed project is 4,676 square feet, which is well under the maximum allowed.

Tree Removal.

The project also requires a Coastal Development Permit pursuant to 20.147.050.A of the Del Monte Forest Coastal Implementation Plan, because the proposal includes tree removal of six Monterey Pine trees, which are protected (ranging between "15 and 33" in diameter). The Arborist wrote two reports to analyze the trees separately. One report states, three of the trees (15", 30" and 31") are considered hazardous trees that are unstable and in danger of falling. The second report identifies the other three trees (18", 19", and 33" in diameter) as in fair condition and necessary for the proposed development. The 33" tree is considered to be a landmark tree; pursuant to Section 20.147.050 the Del Monte Forest CIP, a Coastal Development Permit is required for its removal. A Condition of Approval shall require replacement of the three healthy trees (3:1 ratio). The Del Monte Forest Land Use Plan (DMF LUP) states when reviewing requests for tree removal, land clearing, and other development, preservation of scenic resources shall be a primary objective, such as along Highway 68, 17 Mile Drive, and publicly accessible shoreline areas. The Del Monte Forest also views Cypress trees and Oaks trees as visually, and historically significant specimens. Native trees that are not considered ESHA and are not a part of a forest area considered ESHA may be removed for development (20.147.050.C.3 CIP). This parcel is not located within any of these areas, and removal is the minimum necessary for the proposed development. Proposed improvements considered preserving trees to the greatest extent feasible, maintaining the viewshed, and general aesthetic quality of the area, while allowing the maintenance of an historic structure for the Preservation of Historic Resources.

CEQA:

The project is exempt from further environmental review under the provisions of Sections 15303(a) and 15304 of the California Environmental Quality Act. Under the provisions of Section 15303(a), one-single family residence or a second dwelling unit in a residential zone is exempt. The remodel and additions will result in only one single family dwelling. Under the provisions of Section 15304, minor public or private alterations in the condition of land, water and/or vegetation which do not involve in the removal of healthy, mature, scenic trees are exempt. It was confirmed by an arborist that three of the six these trees were hazardous trees that needed immediate removal, and that the other three were the minimum necessary for the development. The DMF LUP policies confirm. They are not considered mature and they are not scenic trees.

OTHER AGENCY INVOLVEMENT:

The following agencies have reviewed the project and have no recommended conditions:

- ✓ RMA-Planning
- ✓ RMA-Environmental Services
- ✓ RMA Public Works
- ✓ Environmental Health Bureau
- ✓ Water Resources Agency
- ✓ Pebble Beach Community Services District

On September 21, 2017, the Del Monte Forest Land Use Advisory Committee unanimously recommended approval of the project, as presented (6-0 vote).

Prepared by: Elizabeth Gonzales, Associate Planner x5102

Reviewed by: Brandon Swanson, RMA Planning Manager

Approved by: John M. Dugan, AICP, RMA Deputy of Director of Land Use and Community Development

The following attachments are on file with the RMA:

Exhibit A	Project Data Sheet
Exhibit B	Draft Resolution including:
B1	Recommended Conditions of Approval
B2	Site Plan, Floor Plan, and Elevations
Exhibit C	Vicinity Map

cc: Front Counter Copy; Zoning Administrator; Pebble Beach Community Services District; RMA-Public Works Department; RMA-Environmental Services; Environmental Health Bureau; Water Resources Agency; California Coastal Commission; Jacqueline R. Onciano, Chief of RMA-Planning; Brandon Swanson, RMA Services Manager; Elizabeth Gonzales, Project Planner; Daniel Rhodes and Katherine Spitz, Owners; Duke Kelso Construction, Applicant; The Open Monterey Project; LandWatch; Planning File PLN170237.