



County of Monterey

Board of Supervisors
Chambers
168 W. Alisal St., 1st Floor
Salinas, CA 93901

Board Report

File #: ZA 18-044, **Version:** 1

PLN170413 - TRAINA WILLIAM & TRAINA RAQUEL C TRS

Public hearing to consider an addition to an existing 2,518 square foot single family dwelling and 476 square foot garage in the public viewshed.

Project Location: 170 Mal Paso Road, Carmel, Carmel Area Land Use Plan

Proposed CEQA Action: Categorically exempt per Section 15301(e)(1) of the CEQA Guidelines

RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends the Zoning Administrator adopt a Resolution to:

- 1) Find the project is an addition to an existing structure that will not result in an increase of more than 2,500 square feet which qualifies as a Class 1 Categorical Exemption pursuant to Section 15301(e)(1) of the CEQA Guidelines; and there are no exceptions pursuant to Section 15300.2 of the CEQA Guidelines; and
- 2) Approve a Combined Development Permit consisting of:
 - a) Coastal Administrative Permit and Design Approval to allow the partial demolition, and addition of 641 square feet to an existing 2,518 square foot single family dwelling and addition of 85 square feet to an existing 476 square foot garage, and 135 cubic yards of associated grading; and
 - b) Coastal Administrative Permit to allow development within 750 feet of a known archaeological resource.

The attached resolution includes findings and evidence for consideration (**Exhibit C**). Staff recommends that the Zoning Administrator adopt the resolution approving PLN170413 subject to 15 conditions of approval.

PROJECT INFORMATION:

Agent: Edan Asturi, c/o Conrad|Asturi Architects

Property Owner: TRAINA WILLIAM & TRAINA RAQUEL C TRS

APN: 243-292-002-000

Parcel Size: 0.8 acre

Zoning: "LDR/1-D(CZ)" (Low Density Residential with maximum gross density of 1 acres per unit with a Design Control Overlay in the Coastal Zone)

Plan Area: Carmel Area Land Use Plan

Flagged and Staked: yes

SUMMARY

The subject parcel is located atop a small knoll in Carmel about 400 feet above sea level east of Highway 1, approximately 750 feet north of Mal Paso Creek, and with the Pacific Ocean about one-fifth of a mile to the west. The existing home is visible from state Highway 1; however, the structure is consistent with the neighborhood character of other homes in the vicinity that sit upon surrounding knolls. Proposed colors and materials are designed as subordinate to the environment, improving upon the existing lighter color that makes the structure visually prominent. Access to the site is on a 20-foot wide road easement that is a 400 foot long paved driveway from Mal Paso Road. The existing residence has been built on the northernmost third of the site where a flat bench accommodates development while avoiding encroachment on the steep slopes comprising the lower two thirds of the parcel. The addition is proposed to expand the existing 2,518 square foot home by 641 square feet and the existing 476 square foot garage by 85 square feet, resulting in a 3,159 square foot

dwelling and 561 square foot garage. The height is proposed to be five feet above the existing height.

DISCUSSION:

Project Proposal

The applicant has requested a permit to allow the partial demolition and remodel of the existing 2,518 square foot residence and 476 square foot garage, along with the addition of 641 square feet to the single family dwelling and of 85 square feet to the attached garage. The scope of the addition would include the following:

- Expansion of the home to 3,159 square feet;
- Expansion of the garage to 561 square feet;
- 182 square foot steel trellis with retractable canvas cover;
- 95 cubic yards of cut and 35 cubic yards of fill with 60 cubic yards off-haul.

The subject application is for a Combined Development Permit. Therefore, the Zoning Administrator (ZA) is the appropriate authority to hear an application for a Combined Development permit pursuant to 20.82.030.A.

Site Constraints

The location of the existing residence is the only feasible site for the home due to the steep slopes on the rest of the parcel that would present additional issues for development. Aside from causing erosion issues, development on the steep slopes would create increased visibility of the residence from Highway 1. The southwest profile is the elevation visible from Highway 1 and is where the 85 square feet of addition to the garage is proposed. This addition is proposed southward toward the edge of the relatively flat bench area that accommodates development on the parcel. This area of expansion to the garage is also where two non-native ornamental Hollywood juniper trees are proposed for removal to accommodate the development. The Geotechnical and Geological Assessment prepared by Soil Surveys, Inc. (File No. LIB170390) provides specific recommendations for construction of the addition to which project Condition Nos. 9 & 15 require adherence prior to final approvals and inspections. Addition to the main house occurs at the north side of the structure which is not visible from Highway 1 and extends northward toward the edge of relatively flat bench area that accommodates development on the parcel.

Key Lot

The subject parcel abuts Coast Ridge Drive at the southern property boundary and is adjacent to residential lots along all other boundaries. The entrance to the residence is from Mal Paso Road along the 400 foot long paved driveway. The “front” of a parcel is commonly identified as the side from which the driveway enters the property. However, the “front” of the subject parcel is on Coast Ridge Drive property boundary while the opposite side of the property is the “rear.” Therefore, the project qualifies for the setback exceptions set forth in Section 20.62.040.J of Title 20. Staff confirmed project plans conform to the setback requirements for a key lot with 30-foot minimum front and 20-foot minimum side and rear setbacks.

Archaeological Report

The subject parcel is within 750 feet of a known archaeological resource and is High status for archaeological sensitivity. Addition to the single family dwelling includes some ground disturbance outside the existing building footprint. In order to ensure the project would be consistent with the Carmel Area LUP Chapter 2.8 for the maintenance and protection of archaeological resources, an Archaeological Assessment was required pursuant to Policy 2.8.3.2 of the Carmel LUP. The assessment prepared by Susan Morley (File No. LIB170388) for the proposed development concludes there is no evidence of historical resources. Therefore, no cultural resources would be affected by implementation of proposed addition.

Fire Hazard

The subject parcel is a State Responsibility Area ranked very high risk for fire hazard. Carmel Area Coastal Implementation Plan (CIP) Policy requires a deed restriction be recorded that states fire hazards exist on the parcel and development may be subject to certain restrictions, and processed in accordance with Section 20.64.280.B of Title 20. Therefore, Condition no.17 requires a deed restriction is recorded that states the following: "The parcel is located in a high fire hazard area and development may be subject to certain restrictions as per section(s) of the Coastal Implementation Plan and per the standards for development of residential property."

Visibility

While this application to remodel the structure increases the floor area of the single family dwelling, construction of the expansion, except for the 85 square foot garage addition, is planned to occur out of visual access from any public viewing area. In accordance with Carmel Area CIP Policy 20.146.030.C.1.c, the project is subject to requirements for structures in the public viewshed to minimize visibility and blend into the surrounding area. These requirements include conditions for height verification, unobtrusive exterior lighting and maintenance of site landscaping. Implementation of these conditions (Nos. 4, 10, & 20) will ensure the development integrates with and is subordinate to the surrounding scenic resources. Staff finds the proposed design best meets the Carmel Area LUP policies for protecting the aesthetic character of the area.

Design Review:

The addition would minimize visibility by the use of understated colors and materials that reflect less light than the current colors and materials (Exhibit F). Staff confirmed with the staking and flagging the proposed project keeps with the character of the surrounding area developed with existing residences atop knolls and along hillsides of varied architectural styles from California ranch style to Spanish revival. The proposed design will be a modern Prairie School design with hipped roofs, broad eaves, and bands of windows in horizontal spans that blends into the tree-laden hills. The current height of the residence is about 21 feet and the proposed height is increasing to 26 feet. Although this increases the mass of the structure, existing off-white colors will be replaced by muted warm grays that will integrate with the earthtones of the surrounding area. The 85 square foot garage addition in the public viewshed would blend inconspicuously with the surroundings due to the warm gray color. In order to ensure bulk and mass of the structure are consistent with approved plans, Condition No. 4 requires verification of the building height in conformance with the height approved in the permit.

Development Standards for MDR/2(18)

Front Setback: 30 feet (minimum)
Side Setback: 20 feet (minimum)
Rear Setback: 20 feet (minimum)
Maximum Height: 30 feet
Building Site Coverage: 15% maximum

Proposal Meets Requirements as follows:

100 feet
20 feet 20 feet
20 feet
26 feet
9.5%

Staff finds the project, as proposed and conditioned, is appropriate in location, size, configuration, materials, and colors to assure protection of the public viewshed, neighborhood character, and visual integrity in accordance with Section 20.44.010 of Title 20.

CEQA:

Pursuant to §15301(e)(1) of CEQA Guidelines, the project is exempt from environmental review because the addition to existing structures does not exceed 2,500 square feet.

OTHER AGENCY INVOLVEMENT:

The following agencies have reviewed the project, have comments, and/or have recommended conditions:

Bureau of Environmental Health
RMA-Public Works
Water Resources Agency
RMA-Environmental Services
Carmel Highlands Land Use Advisory Committee

LUAC:

The Carmel Area Land Use Advisory Committee reviewed the project on 4 December 2017 and recommended approval of the project with a 4-0 vote with the following provisions:

- 1) *Apply a condition to the project that erosion control measures are implemented to control runoff.*
 - Condition No. 7 encourages no land clearing or grading occur on the subject parcel between October 15 and April 15 as measure for erosion control.
 - Condition No. 8 requires submittal of an Erosion Control Plan to be implemented during demolition, construction, and rebuild.
 - Condition No. 9 requires submittal of a Grading Plan that is implemented in conformance with the Geotechnical and Geological Investigation prepared by Soil Surveys Group Inc. (Exhibit E-1).
 - Condition No. 11 requires submittal of a Drainage Plan for managing impervious surface stormwater runoff dispersed at multiple points, on the least steep available slopes, away from and below any septic leach fields, and that incorporates recommendations from the Geotechnical and Geological Investigation prepared by Soil Surveys Group Inc. (Exhibit E-1).
- 2) *Septic field concerns are addressed.*
 - The previous plan had the addition of a bedroom which increased septic capacity requirements. The project proposal no longer includes a bedroom addition. The addition is now a playroom. Therefore, EHB finds the existing septic system is adequate for implementation of the remodel.
- 3) *Outdoor lighting issues be sensitive to impact from Scenic Highway 1.*
 - Condition No. 10 requires submittal of an Exterior Lighting Plan that specifies fixtures that are unobtrusive, down-lit, harmonious with the local area, and constructed or located so that only the intended area is illuminated and off-site glare is fully controlled. Exterior lighting shall have recessed lighting elements. Exterior light sources that would be directly visible, when viewed from a common public viewing area, are prohibited.
 - Condition No. 21 requires implementation of non-glare glass manufactured with non-reflective shading treatment in order to control visibility of the interior lighting from the exterior.

Prepared by: Jaime Scott Guthrie, AICP Candidate, Associate Planner, ext. 6414

Reviewed by: Brandon Swanson, Planning Services Manager

Approved by: John M. Dugan, FAICP, Deputy Director of RMA Land Use and Development Services

The following attachments are on file with the RMA:

Exhibit A	Project Data Sheet
Exhibit B	Draft Resolution, including: B-1 Plans; and B-2 Draft Conditions of Approval
Exhibit C	Vicinity Map
Exhibit D	Carmel Highlands Land Use Advisory Committee (LUAC) Minutes from meeting 4

Exhibit E December 2017
 Reports:
 E-1 Geotechnical and Geological Investigation, Soil Surveys Inc., 31 October 2017
 (LIB170390)
 E-2 Tree Resource Assessment, Frank Ono, 3 August 2017 (LIB170389)
Exhibit F Colors and Materials

cc: Front Counter Copy; Jacqueline R. Onciano, Chief of RMA-Planning; Edan Asturi c/o Conrad|Asturi
Studio Architects, Agent; The Open Monterey Project (Molly Erickson); LandWatch (Executive Director);
Project File PLN170413.