



County of Monterey

Board of Supervisors
Chambers
168 W. Alisal St., 1st Floor
Salinas, CA 93901

Board Report

File #: PC 18-124, **Version:** 1

PLN180039 - THOMAS

Public hearing to consider the construction of a two-story single family dwelling with basement (Approx. 6,605 sq. ft.) and detached 2-car garage/office (Approx. 875 sq. ft.), and removal of 5 trees (4 oaks and 1 madrone).

Project Location: 28 Potrero Trail, Carmel - Santa Lucia Preserve (Assessor's Parcel Number 239-111-009-000), Greater Monterey Peninsula Area Plan.

Proposed CEQA action: Addendum to the Santa Lucia Preserve Environmental Impact Report.

RECOMMENDATION:

It is recommended that the Planning Commission adopt a resolution to:

- 1) Consider an Addendum to the Santa Lucia Environmental Impact Report (EIR #94-005/Resolution #96-059) pursuant to CEQA Guidelines Section 15164; and
- 2) Approve a Combined Development Permit consisting of:
 - a) Administrative Permit and Design Approval to allow the construction of an approximately 3,995 square foot single family dwelling with 2,610 square foot basement, and an approximately 875 square foot 2-car detached garage with office; and
 - b) Use Permit to allow the removal of five protected trees (4 Oaks and 1 Madrone).

The attached draft resolution includes findings and evidence for consideration (**Exhibit C**). Staff recommends approval subject to 19 conditions of approval.

PROJECT INFORMATION:

Agent: Tom Meaney

Property Owner: Christopher & Kellie Thomas

APN: 239-111-009-000

Parcel Size: 29.56 acres

Zoning: RC/40-D-S (Resource Conservation, 40 acres per unit -Design Control and Site District Overlay)

Plan Area: Greater Monterey Peninsula Area Plan

Flagged and Staked: Yes

SUMMARY:

Located approximately 5 miles east of Scenic Highway 1, and 2.4 miles off Carmel Valley Road, the project site is part of the Santa Lucia Preserve Subdivision (Phases A-C/Rancho San Carlos) which is comprised of 254 lots. This parcel is located on lot 195, Phase C of the Santa Lucia Preserves which is in a densely forested rural area of Carmel Valley. Each individual parcel contains dedicated homeland boundaries (building envelopes), the remaining acreage outside of the homeland boundaries is dedicated with open space easements. The subject project consists of development fully within the homeland boundary consisting of a two-story (above ground) single family dwelling and basement, detached garage/office, and removal of 5 trees (4 Oaks and 1 Madrone) ranging from 9"-14" in diameter.

DISCUSSION:

Tree Assessment:

The subject application requests the removal of five protected trees (4 Oaks and 1 Madrone). The trees are growing within the area proposed for the garage and auto court. The Forest Management Plan prepared for the

Environmental Impact Report (EIR) in 1994 for Phase C estimated zero tree removal for this site. Due to the dense forest conditions, development without tree removal is not feasible. In fact, the removal of the smaller oaks proposed ensure protection of a 26" diameter landmark oak and avoids development on slopes in excess of 30%. Approval for excess tree removal amount shall be based on regulations pursuant to Section 21.64.260 of the Monterey County Zoning Ordinance, Title 21 and shall also comply with Condition No. 24 in PC94067. The proposed tree removal will not involve a risk of significant adverse environmental impacts such as soil erosion, water quality degradation, ecological impacts upon existing biological or ecological systems, noise pollution, and movement or significant reduction of available wildlife habitat.

Analysis of impacts from tree removal in this subdivision was informed by a Forest Management Plan prepared by Ralph Osterling Consultants Inc. in February 18, 1994 (**Exhibit F**). The Osterling report determined that impacts to tree resources would remain less than significant within the homeland boundary. The tree permit for the Santa Lucia Preserve (Phases A-C) allowed removal of 1,480 trees in total. The removal of these 5 trees will bring the total number of trees removed or anticipated to be removed to 626. Therefore, the removal of these 5 trees is still under the total allotment allowed for these Phases A-C.

A report dated March 2018 (**Exhibit D**) was submitted by Maureen Hamb, Certified Arborist. Maureen observed 49 trees growing within the homeland boundary of this lot. Two of which are madrones (ranging from 6"-10" diameter) and the remaining forty-seven are coast live oaks (ranging from 5"-34" diameter). In addition to the 49 trees inventoried within the homeland boundary, the lot itself is forested with at least 200 additional trees outside the development area. She further noted the homeland boundary is mixed with individual specimen trees along with larger dense groves of both mature and immature native trees and small groupings of coast live oak. Hamb concluded the proposed tree removal will not affect the health of the surrounding oaks or any other trees on the site.

Based on substantial evidence, the trees proposed for removal are the minimum required under the circumstance of the case and will not involve a risk of adverse environmental impacts. Therefore, the proposed tree removal is consistent with the regulations contained in Section 21.64.260 (Preservation of Oak and Other Protected Trees) of the Monterey County Zoning Ordinance, no oak, madrone or redwood tree six inches or more in diameter two feet above ground level shall be removed in the Greater Monterey Peninsula Area Plan without approval of the permit(s) required in Subsection 21.64.260D.

Tree Protection/Replacement:

Pursuant to, all non-landmark oak trees removed as a result of the project shall be replaced at a three-to-one (3:1) ratio and landmark trees at a five-to-one (5:1) ratio. The minimum replacement size shall be 5 gallons. In this case, a 3:1 ratio would be required for replacement totaling 15 trees since the proposed tree removal are non-landmark trees. Furthermore, instead of the 5-gallon replacement suggested, staff concurs with the arborist assessment to replace it with fifteen (15) Coast Live Oaks totaling eight (8) fifteen gallons and seven (7) 5 gallons (**Exhibit E**). These oaks would be planted throughout the homeland boundary. The various sized oaks containers will acclimate and add diversity to the woodland system as it currently exists. The reforestation program shall also include a monitoring element that guarantees a success period of not less than 5 years after planting and a success ratio threshold of no less than 90%. A condition of project approval, (Condition No. 6) requiring the replacement/replanting of all removed trees has been applied to the project.

In addition, a condition of project approval (Condition No. 4) has been applied for surrounding trees located

close to the construction site. These surrounding trees shall be protected from construction equipment by fencing off the canopy driplines and/or critical root zones with protective materials.

The addition of the 15 oak trees would be a contribution to the woodland environment and will enhance the natural resources and wildlife in the Santa Lucia Preserve subdivision. No madrones have been recommended for replacement. Per the arborist, Maureen Hamb, native madrone are difficult to propagate and usually have a 90% loss rate. There are cultivars (Arbutus Marina) but, it is a landscape type species that does not have the quality of the natives. Coast live oak is the dominant species on the site and would have a greater success rate and are easier to propagate. Therefore, the replacement of the coast live oaks is more suitable given the condition of this site. If approved, the project will not prevent the Santa Lucia Preserve from continuing to provide large contiguous expanses of open space throughout the subdivision and between development envelopes to allow for wildlife movement through the site. In addition, the Design Review Board of the Santa Lucia Preserve supported the removal of the trees proposed (**Exhibit I**).

No Mitigation Monitoring and Reporting program (MMRP) was implemented for this Phase A-C, only condition of approval. Therefore, conditions described above for tree replacement and monitoring (Conditions No. 6) were carried over pursuant to Resolution No. 96-060, Condition No. 24 in Use Permit PC94067.

Environmental Review:

Environmental impacts for the entire Santa Lucia Preserve were analyzed in the Environmental Impact Report (EIR) Resolution No. #94-005. The subject parcel was identified in the original EIR (Jones & Stoke, 1995) done for the subdivision. The EIR for the Santa Lucia Preserve addressed anticipated removal of trees within the homeland boundary for each individual lot. As part of the EIR, removal of 1,480 trees was approved for the subdivision (Phase A-C) and determined to be less than significant. To date, 621 trees have been approved for removal. If approved, the estimated 5 trees proposed for removal on Lot 195 would constitute less than 0.3% of the total trees approved for removal within homeland boundaries in the subdivision. The approval of the 5 trees proposed to be removed from this lot would account for an updated total of 626 trees, which would represent approximately 42% of the overall approved count for the subdivision. As a whole, even though 133 of 254 lots have been built out, the Santa Lucia Preserve Subdivision (Phase A-C/Rancho San Carlos) is well under the tree removal approved and analyzed by the EIR and will remain under the approved tree removal limits if remaining lots stay within the allowed tree removal. Though the tree removal amount proposed (5) exceeds what was approved for this lot (0), it is consistent with what was analyzed in the Santa Lucia Preserve EIR. The applicable conditions of approval from the original EIR have been incorporated into the proposed Thomas project. An Addendum to the EIR is also included as part of this project (**Exhibit G**).

Upon review of the submitted information and site visit, staff finds the removal of the 5 trees proposed will not have a significant impact to the environment. In fact, the replacement of 15 oaks would further meet the goals and objectives of the Santa Lucia Preserve. The replacement trees would create a positive impact to the environment by contributing to the natural environment established in the Santa Lucia Preserves.

Design Review:

The development standards for the RC zoning district are identified in MCC Section 21.36.060. Required setbacks in the RC district for main dwelling units are 30 feet (front), 20 feet (rear), and 20 feet (sides). However, the Santa Lucia Preserves have been designed with homeland boundaries (building envelopes) dedicated for development. The proposed structures are proposed within the homeland boundary.

Maximum allowed structure height is 30 feet. The proposed height for the single-family dwelling is 26'11". The allowed site coverage maximum in the Resource Conservation (RC) district is 25%. The property is 29.56

acres or 1,287,634 square feet, which would allow a max site coverage of approximately 321,908 square feet. The proposed single-family dwelling (3,996 sq. ft.), office/garage (872 sq. ft.) and basement (2,607 sq. ft.) would result in total site coverage of 7,475 square feet or approximately 2.3%. Therefore, as proposed, the project meets all required development standards.

Staff has determined that the proposed residence is compatible with the surrounding neighborhood character in terms of size, color, location and mass. The open, multi-level classic ranch architectural incorporates natural mixed materials with a twist of a modern design. Colors and materials are comprised of dark brown shiplap and earthy tone stone siding, non-reflective charcoal metal seam roofing, and metal clad windows and doors. The proposed structure is consistent with the surrounding residential development. The proposed landscaping incorporates native vegetation that will blend seamlessly with the surrounding open natural environment of the Santa Lucia Preserve. Additionally, the design was reviewed and approved by the Santa Lucia Preserve Design Review Board (**Exhibit H**).

The project will be served by the Santa Lucia Mutual Water system for potable water and an on-site septic system will provide sewage disposal

OTHER AGENCY INVOLVEMENT:

The following agencies have reviewed the project, have comments, and/or have recommended conditions:

Environmental Health Bureau
RMA-Public Works
RMA-Environmental Services
Water Resources Agency
Monterey County Regional Fire Protection Department

Prepared by: Son Pham-Gallardo, Associate Planner, x5226

Reviewed by: Brandon Swanson, RMA Planning Services Manager

Approved by: John M Dugan, AICP, RMA Deputy Director of Land Use and Community Development

The following attachments are on file with the RMA:

Exhibit A - Project Data Sheet

Exhibit B - Draft Resolution including:

- B1 - Conditions of Approval
- B2 - Site Plan, Elevations & Floor Plans

Exhibit C - Vicinity Map

Exhibit D - Arborist Report (LIB180190)

Exhibit E - Arborist Tree Replacement Recommendation

Exhibit F - Forest Management Plan for Rancho San Carlos

Exhibit G - Addendum to the EIR

Exhibit H - Santa Lucia DRB Letter Approval of Design

Exhibit I - Santa Lucia DRB Letter Approval of Tree Removal

cc: Front Counter Copy; Planning Commission; Son Pham-Gallardo, Associate Planner, Brandon Swanson, RMA Services Manager; Tom Meaney, Agent; Christopher and Kellie Thomas Applicant/Owner; The Open Monterey Project (Molly Erickson); LandWatch (Executive Director); John H. Farrow; Janet Brennan; Project File PLN180039