



County of Monterey

Board of Supervisors
Chambers
168 W. Alisal St., 1st Floor
Salinas, CA 93901

Board Report

File #: PC 19-073, **Version:** 1

PLN190098 - WALNUT COVE LLC

Public hearing to consider construction of a 4,355 square foot two-story single family dwelling inclusive of an attached two-car garage on slopes in excess of 30%, within 100 feet of environmentally sensitive habitat (Pescadero Canyon) and the removal of one (1) Monterey Pine tree.

Project Location: 24424 San Juan Road, Carmel, Carmel Land Use Plan, Coastal Zone

Proposed CEQA action: Categorically Exempt per Section 15303 (a) of the CEQA Guidelines

RECOMMENDATION:

It is recommended that the Planning Commission adopt a resolution to:

1. Find that the project involves the construction of a new single family dwelling on an existing legal lot of record, which qualifies as a Class 3 Categorical Exemption pursuant to Section 15303 (a) of the CEQA Guidelines, and there are no exceptions pursuant to Section 15300.2; and
2. Approve a Combined Development Permit consisting of a:
 - a. Coastal Administrative Permit and Design Approval to allow for the construction of a 4,355 square foot two-story single family dwelling inclusive of attached two-car garage;
 - b. Coastal Development Permit to allow the removal of one (1) Monterey Pine tree;
 - c. Coastal Development Permit to allow development within approximately 25 feet of an environmentally sensitive habitat area; and
 - d. Coastal Development Permit to allow approximately 600 square feet of development on slopes in excess of 30%.

The attached draft resolution includes findings and evidence for consideration (**Exhibit C**). Staff recommends approval of the project subject to 14 conditions of approval.

PROJECT INFORMATION:

Agent: Chad Brown

Owner: Fred & Silvia Miranda (Walnut Cove LLC)

APN: 009-013-012-000

Zoning: MDR/2-D (CZ)

Parcel Size: 9,965 square feet (0.229 acres)

Plan Area: Carmel Land Use Plan

Flagged and Staked: Yes

SUMMARY:

The subject property is located approximately one-half mile west of Highway 1, north of the intersection of San Juan Road and Pescadero Road in the Carmel Woods neighborhood, that backs up into the Pescadero Canyon. Zoning for the subject property allows a maximum gross density of 2 units per acre, within an established residential neighborhood. The subject property contains a 2,775 square foot one-story single family dwelling, driveway, concrete walkways and a storage shed. The existing dwelling with associated improvements are located in such a way that it straddles the lot line between this parcel (24424 San Juan Road, Assessor's Parcel Number 009-013-012-000) and the adjacent parcel (24418 San Juan Road, Assessor's Parcel Number 009-013-011-000). A permit to allow the demolition of the existing dwelling has been approved under separate permit (Monterey County Planning File No. PLN180240). The subject project (PLN190098) is for construction of a

new single family dwelling at 24424 San Juan Road. A separate permit has been submitted for construction of a dwelling at 24418 San Juan Road (PLN190097). This report focuses only on the proposed dwelling at 24424 San Juan Road, Carmel.

Staff evaluated the project for consistency with the 1982 General Plan (General Plan), Carmel Area Land Use Plan (CAR LUP), Carmel Coastal Implementation Plan, Part 4 (CAR CIP) and the Monterey County Coastal Zoning Ordinance (Title 20). As designed, the proposed single family home requires approvals (each a separate permit) to develop approximately 600 square feet on slopes in excess of 30%, to allow development within 25 feet of ESHA (threshold is 100 feet) and to remove one Monterey pine tree (native tree). Concerns were raised during review of the project relative to impacts from developing the proposed residence (ESHA, trees, slopes). Staff considered the comments received and determined that the required findings can be made in this case, as described in the detailed discussion (**Exhibit B**) and attached draft resolution (**Exhibit C**).

DISCUSSION:

Concerns were raised during review of the project including:

1. The construction of the single family dwelling impacting slopes in excess of 30%;
2. The potential for the project to result in impacts to a seasonal creek easement (Pescadero Canyon);
3. The development impacting additional trees;
4. Whether the proposed design and colors of the single family dwelling and retaining walls are consistent with the neighborhood character; and
5. The construction related impacts that would result from the development of the single family dwelling.

Staff has considered the comments received on the project and has not identified inconsistencies with the applicable policies and regulations that govern development at the site. Each of the concerns are addressed below and in more detail in the attached discussion.

Slopes: The site is constrained by slopes in excess of the 30% within the front and middle of the property. The development has been sited toward the front of the lot in an area that is in conformance with development standards for the MDR zoning district. Topography at the site begins to drop around the middle of the parcel and flattens towards the Pescadero Canyon. If the development was sited towards the rear of the parcel, it would then require a larger amount of grading to construct the driveway through the property to connect to the garage. Due to the topography and narrow shape of the parcel, there are no alternative feasible options for the development to be entirely on slopes less than 30%.

Seasonal Creek: Pescadero Canyon is considered an environmentally sensitive habitat area (ESHA) and the subject property is located on the ridge above the canyon. There is no work proposed within the Canyon but due to the narrow shape of the parcel, any development on the lot would be within 100 feet of ESHA. With appropriate erosion control and stormwater runoff requirements implemented, the project will avoid impacts on the adjacent canyon and its habitat.

Trees: Tree removal will occur within the proposed motorcourt area. The motorcourt has been constructed to allow adequate space for egress and ingress into the garage. The remaining trees on the property would be conditioned to be protected during construction related activities.

Neighborhood Character: The proposed home is large when compared to surrounding residential development however, it has been designed to meet the maximum site development standards for the zone including setbacks, height, lot coverage, and floor area ratio which are all intended to regulate bulk and mass of

structures. Much of the mass of the home is located in the rear of the of the structure and the front elevation (viewed from San Juan Road and Pescadero Road) will be of a mass and character consistent with other two-story structures in the surrounding neighborhood. The proposed colors and materials are subordinate to the surrounding environment and blends with the neighborhood character.

Construction: The construction related impacts are temporary and would be minimized through a construction management plan that is required as a part of the construction permit. Hours of operation will be limited to Monday through Friday, 8:00 AM to 4:30 PM. Construction staging and parking areas will be identified to minimize construction related impacts within the neighborhood.

See **Exhibit B** for detailed discussion.

CALIFORNIA ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY ACT (CEQA):

The project is categorically exempt from environmental review pursuant to Section 15303 (a) of the CEQA Guidelines. This exemption applies to the construction of single family dwellings within a residential neighborhood. The proposed project is to construct an approximately 4,355 square foot two-story single family dwelling inclusive of an attached two-car garage. None of the exceptions under CEQA Guidelines Section 15300.2 apply to this project. The project is not located on a hazardous waste site or historic resource, near a scenic highway, is not likely to effect cultural resources and will not have a significant effect on the environment. Therefore, the project is categorically exempt.

LAND USE ADVISORY COMMITTEE (LUAC):

Based on the Land Use Advisory Committee (LUAC) procedure guidelines adopted by the Monterey County Board of Supervisors, the project was referred to the Carmel Unincorporated/Highlands LUAC for review on July 1, 2019 and July 15, 2019 (**Exhibit E**). At the July 1, 2019, the Committee continued the application until the applicant removed a fallen tree from a neighboring property, provided color samples for the proposed home, lowered the overall roof plate height and re-staked the proposed development. The application went before the Committee again on July 15, 2019. In between meetings, the applicant submitted revised plans, to reduce the height from 30 feet to 26 feet and re-staked the proposed development. At the July 15, 2019 meeting, the Committee reviewed the color samples and recommended another continuance to recommend the applicant reduce the plate heights even lower. The applicant reviewed the request and recommendations from staff, and reduced the height to 24 feet, which are reflected within the attached draft resolution (**Exhibit C**). Staff reviewed the proposed development carefully and considered the other two-story homes within the neighborhood and although the home is large in size within the context of the neighborhood, revisions incorporated between the July 1 and July 15 LUAC hearing are appropriate the minimize the mass to the extent that the home will not negatively impact the character of the neighborhood.

OTHER AGENCY INVOLVEMENT:

The following agencies have reviewed the project:

- Environmental Health Bureau
- Cypress Fire Protection District
- RMA-Environmental Services
- RMA-Public Works

Prepared by: Jacquelyn M. Nickerson, Assistant Planner, Ext. 5240

Reviewed by: Craig Spencer, RMA Planning Services Manager

Approved by: John M. Dugan, FAICP RMA Deputy Director of Land Use and

Development Services

The following attachments are on file with the RMA:

Exhibit A - Project Data Sheet

Exhibit B - Discussion

Exhibit C - Draft Resolution, including:

- Conditions of approval
- Site plans
- Colors and materials

Exhibit D - Vicinity Map

Exhibit E - Carmel LUAC Minutes

Exhibit F - Tree Assessment LIB190167

Exhibit G - Biological Report LIB190216

Exhibit H - Correspondence

cc: Front Counter Copy; Planning Commission; California Coastal Commission; Carmel Unincorporated/Highlands Land Use Advisory Committee; Brandon Swanson, Interim Chief of Planning; Craig Spencer, Interim RMA Planning Manager; Chad Brown, Agent; Walnut Cove LLC, Owner; Tom O'brien and Natalie Nielsen, Interested Party; Pat Roberts, Interested Party; Elliot Byrd, Interested Party; Robin Robinson, Interested Party; The Open Monterey Project (Molly Erickson); LandWatch (Executive Director); Project File PLN190098