



County of Monterey

Board of Supervisors
Chambers
168 W. Alisal St., 1st Floor
Salinas, CA 93901

Board Report

File #: ZA 20-018, **Version:** 1

PLN190180 - MATTHEWS

Public hearing to consider the demolition of an existing 3,673 square foot two-story single-family dwelling, and construction of an 8,233 square foot two-story single-family dwelling with a 1,070 square foot attached garage; removal of 3 trees (Coast Live oak); and development on slope exceeding 30 percent and within 750 feet of known archaeological resources.

Project Location: 1484 Bonifacio Road, Pebble Beach, Del Monte Forest Land Use Plan, Coastal Zone

Proposed CEQA action: Categorically Exempt per Section 15302 of the CEQA Guidelines

RECOMMENDATION:

It is recommended that the Monterey County Zoning Administrator adopt a resolution to:

1. Find that the project involves the demolition of an existing single-family dwelling and construction of a new single-family dwelling, which qualifies for a Class 2 Categorical Exemption pursuant to Section 15302 of the CEQA Guidelines, and there are no exceptions pursuant to Section 15300.2; and
2. Approve a Combined Development Permit consisting of a:
 - a. Coastal Administrative Permit and Design Approval to allow the demolition of a 3,673 square foot two-story single family dwelling, inclusive of a 450 square foot attached garage, and construction of a 8,233 square foot two-story single family dwelling with a 1,070 square foot attached three-car garage;
 - b. Coastal Development Permit to allow development on slopes exceeding 30 percent;
 - c. Coastal Development Permit to allow removal of three (3) trees (Coast Live oak); and
 - d. Coastal Administrative Permit to allow development within 750 feet of known archaeological resources.

The attached draft resolution includes findings and evidence for consideration (**Exhibit A**). Staff recommends approval subject to twelve (12) conditions of approval.

PROJECT INFORMATION:

Owner: Patrick H. Matthews Trust

Agent: Eric Miller Architects, Inc. (Carla Hashimoto)

APN: 008-341-009-000

Zoning: Low Density Residential, 1.5 acres per unit, with a Design Control Overlay [LDR/1.5-D (CZ)]

Parcel Size: 1.65 acres (71,710 square feet)

Plan Area: Del Monte Forest Land Use Plan

Flagged and Staked: Yes

SUMMARY:

The steeply-sloped property is located on Bonifacio Road within an established residential neighborhood in Pebble Beach, approximately 450 feet southeast of the intersection of Bonifacio Road and Cortez Road, and over 1,000 feet northeast of 17-Mile Drive. The proposed project involves the demolition of an existing two-story single family dwelling, and construction of a larger single-family dwelling. The project also involves approximately 1,000 square feet of development on slopes exceeding 30 percent, removal of 3 native trees (Coast Live oak), and development within 750 feet of known archaeological resources. The new structures are

proposed to have a style of development that is consistent with the surrounding residential development which includes large custom homes. As designed and conditioned, there are no major project issues and there would be no impacts to the public viewshed.

DISCUSSION:

Land Use

The property is zoned for low density residential use, which allows development of single-family dwellings and non-habitable accessory structures as allowed uses pursuant to MCC Sections 20.14.040.A and F. The Design Control zoning overlay requires the granting of a Design Approval for the proposed development. Based on staff review of the planning application materials, the property complies with all rules and regulations pertaining to zoning uses and other applicable provisions of the 1982 Monterey County General Plan, Del Monte Forest Land Use Plan, and applicable sections of the Monterey County Coastal zoning ordinance (Title 20). As proposed, the structures conform to all required setbacks. As proposed, the single-family dwelling would be 30 feet above average natural grade, so staff recommends Condition No. 9 (Height Verification) to ensure the structure remains within the maximum allowed structure height of 30 feet. The property is approximately 1.65 acres (71,710 square feet), which would allow structural site coverage of 10,757 square feet and floor area of 12,549 square feet. As proposed, the project would result in building coverage of 5,417 square feet (7.55 percent) and floor area of 9,303 square feet (12.97 percent). The project also includes approximately 3,541 square feet of impervious surfaces (terrace, pool, stairs, etc.), for a total of 8,958 square feet of site structural and impervious surface coverage.

Pescadero Watershed

Policy 77 of the Del Monte Forest Land Use Plan limits development of parcels within the applicable watersheds to a maximum site coverage of 9,000 square feet, including both structural and impervious surface coverages. The intent of this policy is to reduce runoff into the waters of the Pacific Ocean surrounding the Del Monte Forest, specifically the Carmel Bay Area of Special Biological Significance (ASBS). As proposed, the project would result in site coverage, including impervious surfaces, of 8,958 square feet, which is below the maximum allowed of 9,000 square feet. Therefore, the project is consistent with DMF LUP Policy 77 regarding development within the Pescadero Watershed.

Public Viewshed and Design Review

The property is located in an area where the Local Coastal Program may require visual public access (Figure 3, Visual Resources, Del Monte Forest Land Use Plan). Based on review of the application materials, as well as a site visit on September 19, 2019, the development proposal would not interfere with visual access along 17-Mile Drive and minimizes development within the public viewshed. Due to distance (over 1,000 feet), topography, and easterly location, the property is not visible from 17-Mile Drive. Existing trees also add to screening of potential visual impacts from 17-Mile Drive. Additionally, due to its location east of 17-Mile Drive, the proposed development will not block public views toward the ocean.

Although the size and mass of the proposed residence would increase, the residence would still appear as a one-story, downslope structure from the access road. The other three sides are not currently visible, and would not be visible, due to topography and vegetation. Additionally, the design incorporates the slope, windows, and decks to minimize the bulk and mass of the new structure. The proposed dwelling is sited in approximately the same location as the existing residence, and all areas of footprint expansion are into areas previously disturbed by retaining walls, terraces, landscaping, and other miscellaneous site improvements. As proposed and conditioned, the single-family dwelling would conform to all required development standards for this zoning district, is located in a residential neighborhood, and the surrounding lots have been developed with similarly-

sized residential development. Staff finds that the proposed development will not adversely impact the public viewshed or scenic character in the project vicinity, and that the design and siting of the proposed development will not increase the visual impacts over the existing baseline.

The project site is also located within the Point Lobos viewshed and may be visible from public vantage points. However, as proposed, the project would not adversely affect public views based on the proposed design, existing setting, and distance from Point Lobos (approximately 3.51 miles or 18,540 feet). The proposed residence would be screened by existing landscaping and trees, and would consist of materials and colors that blend well with the surrounding natural environment and neighborhood character. The primary exterior colors and materials proposed for the residence and attached garage include the following: natural wood, and cream stone and stucco veneer walls; copper framed exterior doors and windows; glass railing; and copper metal roofing. The design of the proposed residence incorporates elements of the modern-contemporary architectural style. The dwellings within this vicinity have a variety of architectural styles and the proposed exterior colors and finishes blend with the surrounding environment, are consistent with the surrounding residential neighborhood character, and are consistent with other dwellings in the neighborhood. As proposed, the project assures protection of the public viewshed, is consistent with neighborhood character, and assures visual integrity.

Archaeological or Cultural Resources

The project site is in an area identified in County records as having a moderate archaeological sensitivity, and the area of proposed development has been disturbed by previous structural and hardscape development, as well as extensive landscaping. Per DMF CIP Section 20.147.080.B, an archaeological report (Monterey County RMA-Planning Library No. LIB190154) was prepared for the site and submitted to the County. The report concluded that there is no surface evidence of potentially significant archaeological resources, and that potential impacts to archaeological resources are not anticipated from the proposed project. The report also identified that the nearest recorded prehistoric site is approximately 250 feet away from the subject property. The archaeologist did not recommend any mitigation measures, and the siting and design of the project would not have any potential impacts to known archaeological resources. Therefore, there is no evidence that any cultural resources would be disturbed, and the potential for inadvertent impacts to cultural resources is limited and will be controlled by application of the County's standard project condition (Condition No. 3) which requires the contractor to stop work if previously unidentified resources are discovered during construction.

Tree Removal

The project includes application for the removal of three (3) Coast Live oak trees. A Tree Assessment (LIB190155; Frank Ono) prepared for the site identifies the condition of the three (3) oak trees proposed for removal as either fair or poor. Also, the Tree Assessment identifies the 27-inch tree proposed for removal as hazardous due to evidence of internal decay. Additionally, the 3 native trees proposed for removal were planted as part of the site landscaping and will be replanted per the recommendation of the arborist (Condition No. 10) and LUP Policy 35 which directs the replacement of native trees on the site in accordance with the recommendations of the arborist, except where it is demonstrated that replacement of trees would result in an overcrowded, unhealthy environment. The project has been sited and designed to minimize tree removal, and no other protected trees would be removed due to the proposed development. Per the Tree Assessment prepared for the project, the tree removal has been limited to that required for the overall health and long-term maintenance of the forest resources on the property.

Development on Slope Exceeding 30 Percent

The project includes approximately 1,000 square feet of development on slopes exceeding 30 percent primarily

to allow adjustments to the access driveway and turnaround area for emergency response vehicles to meet current fire code requirements. The steep descending slope from Bonifacio Road to Riata Road significantly limits available building area without encroaching into slope exceeding 30 percent, and movement of the main dwelling downslope to accommodate the larger driveway and turnaround area would not impact undisturbed area. The small areas of main dwelling development on slopes would occur in areas previously disturbed by structural development, retaining walls, terraces, landscaping, and other miscellaneous site improvements. The Soil Engineering Investigation (LIB190226; LandSet Engineers, Inc.) prepared for the project identifies that the site is suitable for the proposed development. The existing main residence was built on slopes exceeding 30 percent, and there is no alternative building site on the subject property that better meets applicable goals, policies and objectives.

CEQA:

The project is categorically exempt from environmental review pursuant to Section 15302 of the CEQA Guidelines. This exemption applies to the replacement or reconstruction of existing structures where the new structure(s) will be located on the same site as the structure(s) replaced and will have substantially the same purpose and capacity as the structure(s) replaced. As designed, the proposed single-family dwelling uses existing hardscape and landscaped areas to accommodate the square footage increase to the dwelling unit. The demolition of a two-story single-family dwelling, and construction of a two-story single-family dwelling on a residentially-zoned parcel within a developed neighborhood, is consistent with this exemption. None of the exceptions under CEQA Guidelines Section 15300.2 apply to this project.

LUAC:

County staff referred the project to the Del Monte Forest Land Use Advisory Committee (LUAC) for review. The LUAC reviewed the project at a duly-noticed public meeting on September 5, 2019, at which all persons had the opportunity to be heard, and voted 4 - 0 to support the project as proposed. No members of the public commented on the project, and the LUAC raised no concerns regarding the project.

Prepared by: Joseph Sidor, Associate Planner, Ext. 5262
Reviewed by: Brandon Swanson, RMA Planning Services Manager
Approved by: John M. Dugan, FAICP, RMA Deputy Director of Land Use and
Development Services

The following attachments are on file with the RMA:

Exhibit A - Draft Resolution, including:

- Recommended Conditions of Approval
- Site Plan, Floor Plans, Elevations, Colors and Materials

Exhibit B - Vicinity Map

Exhibit C - Del Monte Forest LUAC Minutes

cc: Front Counter Copy; Zoning Administrator; Pebble Beach Community Services District (Fire Protection District); RMA-Public Works; RMA-Environmental Services; Environmental Health Bureau; Brandon Swanson, RMA Planning Services Manager, Craig Spencer, RMA Planning Services Manager; Eric Miller Architects, Inc. (Carla Hashimoto), Agent; Patrick H. Matthews Trust, Owner; The Open Monterey Project (Molly Erickson); LandWatch (Executive Director); Project File PLN190180