



Board Report

File #: ZA 21-002, **Version:** 1

PLN200217 - DOBBINS

Public hearing to consider the demolition of an existing single-story single-family dwelling, and construction of an approximately 3,915 square foot two-story single-family dwelling with an attached 470 square foot two car garage.

Project Location: 3124 Hacienda Drive, Pebble Beach, Greater Monterey Peninsula Area Plan.

Proposed CEQA Action: Categorical Exemption pursuant to Section 15302 of the CEQA Guidelines.

RECOMMENDATION:

It is recommended that the Zoning Administrator:

- a) Find that the project, as a replacement single-family dwelling, qualifies as a Class 2 Categorical Exemption pursuant to Section 15302 of the CEQA Guidelines, and there are no exceptions pursuant to Section 15300.2; and
- b) Approve a Design Approval to:
 - a. Demolish an existing 1,648 single-story single-family dwelling with an attached 462 square foot garage; and
 - b. Construct an approximately 3,915 square foot two-story single-family dwelling with an attached 470 square foot garage and 234 square foot carport, and other improvements including a 786 square foot covered loggia, a 858 square foot second story terrace, a 730 square foot courtyard, a 5 foot high 163 linear foot stucco wall with iron gates, and associated grading of 50 cubic yards of cut.

A draft resolution, including findings and evidence, is attached for consideration (Exhibit B).

Staff recommends approval subject to six (6) conditions.

PROJECT INFORMATION:

Project Owner: Derek and Kris Dobbins

APNs: 007-341-017-000

Zoning: Medium Density Residential, 4 units per acre, with Building Site 6, Design Control, and Recreational Equipment Storage zoning overlays (MDR/4-B-6-D-RES); and Open Space, with Design Control, Site Plan Review, and Recreational Equipment Storage zoning overlays (O-D-S-RES).

Parcel Size: 0.288 acres (12,527 square feet)

Flagged and Staked: Yes

SUMMARY:

The subject parcel is located in a developed residential subdivision (MPCC Subdivision No. 2) and sits approximately 120 feet from the Dunes Golf Course and 1/3-mile East of 17-Mile Drive. The surrounding land uses include residences to the west, east, and south; and the Monterey Peninsula County Club Dunes Golf Course to the north. The Applicant proposes to demolish an existing 1,648 square foot single-story single-family dwelling with an attached 462 square foot garage and construct a replacement 3,914 square foot two-story single-family dwelling with a 470 square foot attached garage and a 234 square foot attached carport. The project also includes a 786 square foot covered loggia, a 858 square foot second story terrace with a fire pit and

built-in barbeque, a 730 square foot courtyard, and a 5 foot high 163 linear foot stucco wall with iron gates. Associated site grading would involve 50 cubic yards of cut.

Based on staff analysis, the proposed project is consistent with all rules and regulations pertaining to zoning uses and any other applicable provisions of the 2010 Monterey County General Plan, Greater Monterey Peninsula Area Plan, and zoning ordinance (Title 21).

DISCUSSION:

Development Standards

The subject property is zoned for medium density residential use, which allows development of single-family dwellings and non-habitable accessory structures as allowed uses pursuant to MCC Section 21.12.030.A. The development standards for the MDR zoning district are identified in MCC Section 21.12.060. Required setbacks in the MDR district for main dwelling units are typically 20 feet (front), 10 feet (rear), and 5 feet (sides). However, pursuant to MCC Section 21.12.070.D, parcels located within the Del Monte Forest (DMF) are additionally subject to side setbacks of 10 feet for the first story and 20 feet for the second story. These setback requirements were established in 1969 by a blanket variance (RMA-Planning File No. ZA00595) and subsequent ordinance to ensure residences developed on the relatively small parcels would not loom over adjacent properties. As proposed, the single-family dwelling with an attached garage would have setbacks of 20 feet (front), 10 feet (rear), and 10 feet (first story side setbacks). The second story would have side setbacks of 20 feet. Pursuant to MCC Section 21.12.070.D, the maximum main structure height is 27 feet. The proposed height for the single-family dwelling is 26 feet 10 inches. Staff recommends Condition No. 7, Height Verification, to ensure the structure does not exceed the maximum height allowed. Pursuant to MCC Section 21.12.070.D, the maximum allowed site coverage and floor area ratio in the DMF MDR/4 district are both 35 percent. The property is 0.288 acres or 12,527 square feet, which would allow site structural coverage and floor area of 4,384 square feet. The proposed single-family dwelling would result in site coverage of 3,333 square feet (26.6 percent) and floor area of 4,384 square feet (35 percent). The total floor area of the proposed development includes the main residence (main floor and upper floor) and the attached garage. The attached 234 square foot carport is not included in the calculation of the total floor area square footage as it is not a fully enclosed structure. Therefore, as proposed, the project meets all required development standards.

Design Review

The proposed two-story (above grade) single-family dwelling would replace an existing single-story residence, would be located on the same general footprint as the existing residence, and would have a comparatively similar layout to other residences in the vicinity. As proposed, the visible structure would increase by 2,274 square feet compared to the existing residence, but would remain comparable to the bulk and mass of other dwellings in the vicinity. Many of the residences in the surrounding neighborhood have developed to the full floor area ratio allowed. Of the 12 residences along Hacienda Road, eight (8) have either a full or partial second story and 6 of which are adjacent to the Dunes Golf Course and face 17-Mile Drive.

The Design Control zoning overlay requires the granting of a Design Approval for the proposed development. The proposed project is a modern Spanish style single family dwelling. The proposed exterior colors and materials are consistent with the residential setting. The primary colors and materials include Clay 2-piece roofing tiles, 'Cameo White' stucco exterior building and walls, bronze patina clad windows and doors, cedar trim and garage door, and tempered glass guardrail for second story terrace. The proposed exterior finishes would blend with the surrounding environment, are consistent with the surrounding residential neighborhood character, and other dwellings in the neighborhood.

The project site is not within an area of visual sensitivity, as designated on Figure 14 (Greater Monterey

Peninsula Scenic Highway Corridors and Visual Sensitivity Map) of the 2010 Monterey County General Plan. Although the project site is approximately 0.33 miles East of 17-Mile Drive and has an intervening golf course, the proposed project's second story is visible from 17-Mile Drive. The project does not block significant public views, nor does it significantly adversely impact public views and scenic character of 17-Mile Drive. The project is consistent with the surrounding development and land uses and would be minimally visible to the naked eye at a distance when looking East from 17-Mile Drive. Therefore, as proposed, the project would not result in adverse visual impacts, and the project is consistent with the applicable scenic resource policies of the 2010 General Plan and the Greater Monterey Peninsula Area Plan.

Historic Review

The existing residence was constructed in 1954 and has an altered 'California Modern' residential design style. Per the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA), PRC Sec.21084.1(a), all properties fifty years of age or older must be reviewed for potential historic significance. Additionally, based on the 2013 Pebble Beach Historic Context Statement, residential buildings constructed between 1946-1969, must demonstrate particularly strong artistic merit, the influence of a significant architect or builder, and should be excellent examples of types or styles such as the subject property to qualify for architectural significance.

The historic assessment prepared on October 15, 2020 by Kent Seavey (LIB# 200232), notes that the existing residence does not appear to qualify for architectural significance because of a loss of design integrity as a result of "unsympathetic window replacement over time," not demonstrating strong artistic merit, and not representing the work of a significant architect or builder. Due to the lack of physical integrity and historical significance, the subject property does not meet the criteria established by the County of Monterey to qualify for inclusion in the Monterey County Historic Resources Inventory, and therefore cannot be considered a historic resource as defined by CEQA.

CEQA:

California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Guidelines Section 15302 categorically exempts the replacement or reconstruction of existing structures where the new structure(s) will be located on the same site as the structure(s) replaced and will have substantially the same purpose and capacity as the structure(s) replaced. The project involves the demolition of a single-family dwelling, and construction of a single-family dwelling on a residentially-zoned parcel within a developed neighborhood. Therefore, the proposed development is consistent with the parameters of this Class 2 exemption. No evidence of significant adverse environmental effects were identified during staff review of the development application.

OTHER AGENCY INVOLVEMENT:

No other County agencies or departments reviewed this project.

LUAC:

The project was referred to the Del Monte Forest Land Use Advisory Committee (LUAC) for review. The LUAC, at a duly-noticed public meeting on October 15, 2020, voted 7 - 0, with one absent member, to support the project as proposed.

Prepared by: Fionna Jensen, Assistant Planner, x6407

Reviewed by: Brandon Swanson, HCD Planning Services Manager

Approved by: Carl P. Holm, AICP, HCD Director

The following attachments are on file with the Housing and Community Development:

Exhibit A - Project Data Sheet

Exhibit B - Draft Resolution, including:

- Conditions of Approval
- Site Plan, Floor Plans, and Elevations
- Color and Material Finishes

Exhibit C - Del Monte Forest LUAC Minutes

Exhibit D - Vicinity Map

Exhibit E - Historic Review

cc: Front Counter Copy; Pebble Beach Community Services District (Fire Protection District); Monterey County -Public Works Parks and Facilities; HCD-Environmental Services; Environmental Health Bureau; Fionna Jensen, Assistant Planner; Brandon Swanson, HCD Services Manager; Derek and Kris Dobbins, Property Owners; Amy Denney, Agent; The Open Monterey Project (Molly Erickson); LandWatch; Project File PLN200217