



## Historic Resources Review

Legistar File Number: 25-680

October 02, 2025

Introduced: 9/23/2025

Current Status: Agenda Ready

Version: 1

Matter Type: General Agenda Item

### **PLN250160 - URBAN ANNE G & NITZBERG WILLIAM J**

Public hearing to consider recommending that the Chief of Planning approve an Administrative Design Approval to allow a major remodel and a 1,122 square foot addition to an existing two-story single-family dwelling known as the historic Goulding house. Colors and materials to match the existing exterior (off-white stucco), Class A Brava synthetic shake roof (weathered), retrofit wood windows to match existing, new aluminum clad windows (brown color to match), copper gutters & downspouts, wood trim & siding color (Tanner's Brown).

**Project Location:** 3377 4th Avenue, Carmel (Assessor's Parcel Number 009-153-006-000), Carmel Land Use Plan, Coastal Zone.

### RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends that the County of Monterey Historic Resources Review Board (HRRB) adopt a resolution recommending that the Chief of Planning:

- 1) Find the Project categorically exempt from CEQA pursuant to CEQA Guidelines section 15331; and
- 2) Approve an Administrative Design Approval to allow a major remodel and a 1,122 square foot addition to an existing two-story single-family dwelling known as the historic Goulding house. Colors and materials to match the existing exterior (off-white stucco), Class A Brava synthetic shake roof (weathered), retrofit wood windows to match existing, new aluminum clad windows (brown color to match), copper gutters & downspouts, wood trim & siding color (Tanner's Brown).

### SUMMARY:

On August 26, 2025, the applicant submitted an Administrative Design Approval for a major remodel and additions to an existing historic single-family home known as the Goulding house, which was built in 1928. A Phase I historic report prepared by Meg Clovis December 2024 (**Exhibit C**) determined that the Goulding House is eligible for the listing on the California Register of Historical Resources at the local level of significance under California Register Criterion 3 and eligible for listing on the Monterey County Register of Historic Resources under Criteria A1, A5, and B1. Specifically, the house is eligible because it embodies the distinctive characteristics of the French Eclectic style of architecture, and it represents the work of locally significant architect Anthanase Nastovic. The Period of Significance for the house is 1928, the year of construction. The Goulding House takes its name from long-time owners Dr. Robert L. Goulding and his wife Alice who lived in the house for six decades.

The proposed includes a 2,900 square foot interior remodel; demolition of a portion previous 1940 and 1967 additions; and a 1,112 square foot addition on the rear (northern) side of the residence. First floor additions consist of a new sunroom at the northwest elevation and and pop out dining area on the northeast elevation, totaling 457 square feet. The second floor addition is 665 square feet, and includes two bedrooms, a bathroom, and a lounge. The second floor addition would connect to terraces on top of the first floor addition. The entire home would be re-roofed with a mixed size weathered synthetic shake, and gutters and downspouts would be added to the roof. Second floor windows will be replaced in-kind only where necessary due to deterioration of existing windows, and the vinyl window at the tower on the southern elevation will be replaced with a solid wood replica type. Exterior finishes consist of exterior stucco and horizontal wood siding. These would be compatible with but appropriately differentiated from the historical materials.

The alterations have been reviewed for and found consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties in a Phase II historic report prepared by Meg Clovis (**Exhibit C**), under the treatment approach of rehabilitation.

#### DISCUSSION:

The Goulding House was built in 1928 and is in the Hatton Fields subdivision which was developed by the Carmel Land Company. The developers did not build model homes but relied on contractors who invested their own money to build speculative houses. One such builder was Serbian architect Anthanese Nastovic (1876-1965) who built the subject property as well as five other homes in Hatton Fields (*Carmel Cymbal*, 2/9/1927). Nastovic was formerly a professor of architecture at the Art Academy at Petrograd. By 1926 Nastovic was partnered with the Carmel Development Company and started building residences in Hatton Fields and in the Peter's Gate area of Monterey. The Carmel Development Company promoted Nastovic as "an architect with the reputation of building distinctive homes" (*Carmel Pine Cone*, 4/8/1928) in the popular revival styles of architecture.

The wood-framed Goulding House has an asymmetrical plan composed of a one-story side gabled west wing and a two-story east wing with a front facing gable and tower. Two additions have been constructed on the rear of the house: a two-story 1940 addition and a one-story 1967 addition. The steeply sloped roof is covered with asphalt composition shingles. Exterior walls are stucco and horizontal wood siding fills the apex of each gable and clads the dormers. The house is an example of the towered subtype of the French Eclectic style (also known as the French Norman style) which became popular after World War I. Elements of the house that represent the French Eclectic style include the prominent tower with conical roof and narrow, vertically oriented windows; the flared eaves at the roof-wall junction; the hipped dormers (the 1940 addition has shed roof dormers); half-timbering in the front gable; and the mix of materials, in this case stucco and horizontal wood siding. Fenestration in the original and 1940 section of the house is wood casement multi-paned sash. An oriel window with three narrow, vertically oriented multi-paned windows is in the second story gable on the front elevation. Vertically oriented tripartite windows run across the front elevation's one-story wing. Brick steps with a wood railing lead to the raised front entry porch. The plank front door, which is flanked by sidelites, is overlaid with a "Z" pattern - one of architect Nastovic's signature features. His other signature feature is the Gothic arch which can be found inside the house and in the wing wall gate that connects the house and garage. A tapered stucco covered chimney is located on the north eave wall. The two previous additions do not fall within the period of significance

which is 1928.

Character-defining features of the Goulding House include:

- Original 1928 footprint, height and massing.
- Tower with conical roof.
- Gabled roof forms with flared eaves.
- Half-timbering detail.
- Wood casement windows including oriel window dating to 1928.
- Steep roof slope and hipped dormers.
- Stucco exterior walls with horizontal wood siding in gables and on hipped dormers.
- Panel front door with “Z” detail and sidelites.
- Wing wall, garage and arched garden gate.
- Tapered chimney.

The proposed alterations to the Goulding House have been reviewed with respect to the ten Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties under the treatment approach of rehabilitation. The ten standards for rehabilitation are detailed in the Historic Assessment prepared by Meg Clovis (**Exhibit C**), followed by a discussion regarding the property’s consistency or inconsistency with each Standard. The report concludes that the alterations would be consistent with the standards and would not adversely affect the integrity of the Goulding house. Staff have reviewed this report and concur with its conclusions.

#### CEQA

The proposed project qualifies for a class 31 categorical exemption pursuant to section 15331 of the CEQA Guidelines. This exemption applies to projects that are for the "**maintenance, repair, stabilization, rehabilitation, restoration, preservation, conservation or reconstruction of historical resources**" in a manner consistent with the Secretary of Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties" ("the Standards") are exempt from CEQA. None of the exceptions to categorical exemptions in section 15300.2 apply to the project. The project would not have a cumulative impact on the environment, there are no unusual circumstances regarding this project that will cause a significant impact to the environment, the project is not visible from any scenic highways, the project is not located on a hazardous waste site and the proposed project will not cause an substantial adverse change to any historical resources.

Prepared by: Erika Isidro-Valdovinos, Permit Tech II

Reviewed by: Elizabeth Gonzales, Permit Center Manager

Approved by: Phil Angelo, Senior Planner

The following attachments are on file with Housing and Community Development:

Exhibit A - Draft Resolution

Exhibit B - Project Plans, Colors and Materials

Exhibit C - Phase II Historic Assessment, including a Phase I DPR prepared by Meg Clovis (LIB250253)

Cc: Eric Wynkoop (Applicant); Project File PLN250160