



County of Monterey Planning Commission

Agenda Item No.1

Legistar File Number: PC 25-067

Item No.1

Board of Supervisors
Chambers
168 W. Alisal St., 1st Floor
Salinas, CA 93901

August 13, 2025

Introduced: 7/24/2025

Version: 1

Current Status: Agenda Ready

Matter Type: Planning Item

PLN240285 - PERKINS ROBERT T & MARA B TRS

Continued from July 9, 2025 - Public hearing to consider construction of a 5,580 square foot single family dwelling with an attached 678 square foot two-car garage, and associated site improvements including the removal of 13 Oak trees.

Project Location: 62 Marguerite, Carmel, Carmel Valley Master Plan

Proposed CEQA action: Find the project Categorically Exempt pursuant to CEQA Guidelines section 15303, and there are no exceptions pursuant to section 15300.2.

RECOMMENDATIONS

It is recommended that the Planning Commission adopt a resolution to:

1. Find that the project qualifies for a Class 3 Categorical Exemption pursuant to CEQA Guidelines section 15303, and none of the exceptions set forth in Section 15300.2 apply; and
2. Approving a Combined Development Permit consisting of:
 - a. Administrative Permit and Design Approval to allow the construction of a 5,580 square foot single-family dwelling with an attached 678 square foot garage, and associated site improvements; and
 - b. Use Permit to allow the removal of 13 Coast live oak trees.

The attached draft resolution includes findings and evidence for consideration (**Exhibit A**). Staff recommends approval subject to 14 conditions of approval.

PROJECT INFORMATION

Agent: Sonia Madrigal, Holdren Lietzke Architecture

Property Owners: Robert and Mara Perkins

APN: 169-421-020-000

Parcel Size: 13.05 acres (586,657 square feet)

Zoning: Rural Density Residential, 10 acres per unit, with Design Control, Site Plan Review, and Residential Allocation Zoning District overlays (RDR/10-D-S-RAZ), and Low Density Residential, 2.5 acres per unit, with Design Control, Site Plan Review, and Residential Allocation Zoning District overlays (LDR/2.5-D-S-RAZ).

Plan Area: Carmel Valley Master Plan

Flagged and Staked: Yes

Project Planner: Hya Honorato, Assistant Planner
Honoratoh@countyofmonterey.gov
(831) 755-5173

SUMMARY/DISCUSSION:

The project was continued from the July 9, 2025, Planning Commission hearing per the Applicant/Owner's request as they were unable to attend the hearing date. The hearing was continued to a date certain, August 13, 2025.

The project site is located south of Highway 68 within the Tehama Subdivision, Monterey County, California. The subject property is developed with a driveway and an existing single family dwelling (1,092 square feet of living space over a garage). The proposal involves the construction of a new 5,580 square foot single family dwelling with an attached 678 square foot garage, associated site improvements. The project also involves modifications to the existing auto court, landscaping, and the removal of 13 Coast live oak trees, including one landmark tree. The existing 1,092 square foot single family dwelling would be converted into a second-story accessory dwelling unit, with a lower-level 594 square foot studio and a lower-level 1,496 square foot 3-car garage. Re-classifying this structure's living space from a single-family dwelling to an Accessory Dwelling Unit does not require the granting of a discretionary permit. No exterior modifications are proposed to this structure, and therefore, the proposed Combined Development Permit does not contemplate the conversion of space. However, a condition of approval has been applied to ensure that conversion of this structure into an Accessory Dwelling Unit occurs concurrent with issuance of building permits for the proposed single-family dwelling. Water service and sewer service will continue to be provided by the Canada Woods Water Company.

Based on staff analysis, the proposed project is consistent with all rules and regulations pertaining to zoning uses and any other applicable provisions of the 2010 Monterey County General Plan, Carmel Valley Master Plan (CVMP), and Zoning Ordinance (Title 21).

Land Use & Development Standards

The subject parcel is dual zoned as Low Density Residential (LDR) and Rural Density Residential (RDR), however, the proposed development is located within LDR zoning. The project complies with the development standards of the Low Density Residential ("LDR") zoning district. The subject 13.05-acre property, Lot #49 of the Tehama Subdivision, contains one building envelope (Tract No. 1398 of the Tehama Phase I Final Map). The building envelope area is 2.62 acres. According to Title 21 section 21.16.060, structures must be located within the designated building envelope. As proposed, both the existing and proposed structures, including hardscape, are entirely within the building envelope area.

The LDR zoning district allows a maximum height of 30 feet for main structures. The proposed single-family dwelling would be 28 feet 8 inches tall, within the allowed limit. With implementation of the project, the total building site coverage would be approximately 1%, well below the 25% limit. With conversion of the existing structure into an Accessory Dwelling Unit and construction of a new single-family dwelling, the property will continue to comply with density standards (one unit per 2.5 acres in the LDR zoning district). However, it should be noted that conversion of the existing residential structure into an ADU is not required to comply with density requirements as the lot is approximately 13.05 acres and could support up to four dwelling units. In summary, the project meets all height, coverage, density, and setback requirements set forth in the development standards of the

LDR zoning district.

Design

The proposed exterior colors and materials are consistent with the area's rural setting and surrounding residences. As proposed, the colors and materials of proposed single-family dwelling include beige stucco finish with natural stone accents for exterior walls, Class-A standing-seam roof in dark bronze, bronze aluminum windows, stained wood trim, and beige stucco finish site walls.

Development within the subject subdivision includes large custom homes. The proposed project would have a comparatively similar layout, bulk, and mass to other residences in the vicinity. The proposed project will not be visible from Highway 68, Carmel Valley Road, or other common public viewing areas due to distance and topography.

Tree Removal

Tree removal within the inland portion of Monterey County is subject to the regulations contained in Title 21 section 21.64.260, which requires a Use Permit for the removal of more than three protected trees in a one-year period. To grant a Use Permit to allow tree removal, the appropriate authority must find that the tree removal is the minimum required under the circumstances of the case and that the removal will not involve a risk of adverse environmental impacts.

Development of the subject property must be contained within the 2.6-acre building envelope. The remainder of the property cannot be developed. The subject property's building envelope is heavily forested with mature trees. The building envelope has limited continuous areas not encumbered by protected trees; there is only one irregularly shaped area with a natural clearing. The proposed development is sited partially within this natural clearing. As part of this permit, the applicant submitted a Tree Assessment, prepared by Albert Weisfuss, dated July 22, 2024 (Monterey County Document No. LIB250036; **Exhibit C**). This Assessment determined that approximately 243 occupy the subject property. The prepared Tree Assessment determined that the implementation of the proposed project would involve the removal of 13 Coast live oak trees. The tree removal is required to accommodate the development, with some trees being structurally compromised or located within the construction zones of the proposed main residence. Eight trees are directly in the proposed structural footprint of the residence; these trees are in fair to good condition. One of these eight trees is a landmark Oak, with a trunk diameter of 28 inches. The remaining five trees are within the construction limits and the 0-5 foot non-combustible fuel management zone, and thus are proposed for removal. No tree removal is proposed to accommodate site improvements, such as hardscape or patio. The proposed structural development could be re-sited south into the natural clearing to potentially reduce tree removal; however, the applicant's desired orchard area and landscape/hardscape improvements would likely require tree removal. As sited, the proposed tree removal to accommodate the single-family dwelling is the minimum necessary. As conditioned, trees would be replaced at a one-to-one ratio. The project, as conditioned, also includes measures for tree protection during construction.

CEQA:

The project as a whole, as described in Finding No.1, Evidence "b", involves re-classifying an existing residential structure into an Accessory Dwelling Unit and construction of a new single-family dwelling and associated site improvements including tree removal. Under Title 21 section 21.64.030 and

Government Code section 65852.2, conversion of space into an ADU is being processed ministerially. CEQA Guidelines section 15268(d) declares that “[w]here a project involves an approval that contains elements of both a ministerial action and a discretionary action, the project will be deemed to be discretionary and will be subject to the requirements of CEQA.” In such cases, while the whole project becomes subject to CEQA, it is only those discretionary components of the project - those parts which the reviewing agency (here, the County) has authority to shape, influence, approve, or deny (CEQA Guidelines section 15040; Public Resources Code section 21004). Accordingly, while the Planning Commission’s discretionary authority is limited to consideration of the proposed residence and tree removal, the proposed residence, tree removal, and the conversion of space into an ADU are subject to CEQA.

California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Guidelines section 15303 categorically exempts the construction and location of limited numbers of new, small facilities or structures, including one single-family residence, and accessory structures within residential zoned areas in a residential zone. The proposed project involves the construction of a 5,580 square foot single family dwelling with an attached 678 square foot garage, associated site improvements. CEQA Guidelines section 15301 allows for the conversion of small structures involving negligible or no expansion of former use. Conversion of an existing 1,092 square foot single family dwelling into a 1,092 square foot ADU involves no change in use (residential dwelling unit). Therefore, the project is consistent with the categorical exemption requirements of CEQA Guidelines sections 15303 and 15301. There are no exceptions pursuant to Section 15300.2. No evidence of significant adverse environmental effects were identified during staff’s review of the development application.

LUAC:

On May 5, 2025, the Carmel Valley Land Use Advisory Committee reviewed the project at a duly noticed meeting and voted unanimously to support the project as proposed (**Exhibit B**). No comments or questions were raised by the public or LUAC members.

OTHER AGENCY INVOLVEMENT

The following County agencies have reviewed this project, have comments, and/or have recommended conditions:

HCD-Engineering Services
Environmental Health Bureau
HCD-Environmental Services
Monterey County Regional Fire Protection District

Prepared by: Hya Honorato, Assistant Planner, (831) 755-5173

Reviewed by: Fionna Jensen, Principal Planner

Approved by: Melanie Beretti, AICP, Chief of Planning

The following attachments are on file with the HCD:

Exhibit A - Draft Resolution including:

- Conditions of approval
- Site Plans, Floor Plans, Elevations, Colors and Materials

Exhibit B - Carmel Valley LUAC Minutes

Exhibit C - Arborist Report

Exhibit D - Vicinity Map

cc: Front Counter Copy; Monterey County Regional Fire Protection District; HCD-Environmental Services; HCD-Engineering Services; Environmental Health Bureau; Hya Honorato, Planner; Robert and Mara Perkins, Property Owners; Sonia Madrigal, Holdren Lietzke Architecture, Agent; The Open Monterey Project; LandWatch (Executive Director); Laborers International Union of North America (Lozeau Drury LLP); Christina McGinnis, Keep Big Sur Wild; Planning File PLN240285.