

Attachment C

This page intentionally left blank.

**Before the Historic Resources Review Board in and for the
County of Monterey, State of California**

**Resolution No. 23-006
PLN230067 – RIVERA STEVEN A & JUNE M
TRS**

Resolution by the Monterey County Historic Resources Review Board (HRRB) recommending that the Board of Supervisors that the Board of Supervisors:

- 1) Find that the listing of the property on the Monterey County Register of Historic Resources is not a project pursuant to Section 15378 of the CEQA Guidelines and the recommendation on the historic property (Mills Act) contract qualifies for a Class 31 categorical exemptions pursuant to CEQA Guidelines section 15331;
- 2) List the “Ferris Bagley House” on the Monterey County Register of Historic Resources; and
- 3) Approve a historic property (Mills Act) contract application for the property at 4161 Sunridge Road, Pebble Beach (Assessor’s Parcel Number 008-071-011-000 and 008-071-012-000).

[The property is located at 4161 Sunridge Road, Pebble Beach (Assessor’s Parcel Number 008-071-011-000 and 008-071-012-000), Del Monte Forest Land Use Plan, Coastal Zone.]

WHEREAS, this matter was heard by the Historic Resources Review Board (HRRB) of the County of Monterey on July 6, 2023, pursuant to the regulations for the Preservation of Historic Resources contained in Chapter 18.25 of the Monterey County Code and the Mills Act Program contained in Chapter 18.28 of the Monterey County Code.

WHEREAS, the property is located at 4161 Sunridge Road, Pebble Beach (Assessor’s Parcel Number 008-071-011-000 and 008-071-012-000), Del Monte Forest Land Use Plan, Coastal Zone.

WHEREAS, on February 7, 2023, the owners Steven and June Rivera submitted a request that their property be listed on the Monterey County Register of Historic Resources, and an application for a historic property (Mills Act) contract.

WHEREAS, the site is a property with a one-story, wood and glass-framed single-family home constructed between 1948 and 1949 in the “Second Bay Region Style” in a residential neighborhood in Pebble Beach.

WHEREAS, a phase I historic report was prepared by Kent L. Seavey (LIB140306) evaluating the historical significance of the home.

WHEREAS, the phase I report describes the home as significant under the California Register of Historic Resources Criterion 3, “*Embodies the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, region or method of construction or represents the work of a master or possesses high artistic values*”, in the area of architecture, as an excellent and early example of Post World War Two Second Bay Region design, found on the Monterey Peninsula, by noted modernist architect John E. Dinwiddie. Additionally, state Criteria 3 corresponds with Monterey County code section 18.25.070.B “*Historical, Architectural, and Engineering Significance,*” which includes resources that exemplify a particular architectural style important to the County.

WHEREAS, The Second Bay Region style is described in the historic report as a combination of the less is more philosophy of the International Style and “Soft Modernism”, which drew from vernacular architecture of ranches, barns, and low cost homes. Local cordwood siding, exposed interior roof structure, and low pitched roofs were mixed with international style influences like flat roofs, simple geometric forms, large expanses of glass, and particularly, open plans. This style is also mentioned in the Pebble Beach Historic Context Statement. The construction date places it within the post war theme of residential development in Pebble Beach between 1946 and 1969 according to the Pebble Beach Historic Context Statement. This period was the greatest period of sustained growth in the history of the Pebble Beach/Del Monte Forest area, and was mostly marked by the construction of single-family properties of a variety of styles, including the Second Bay Region Style. The Pebble Beach Historic Context Statement list the defining characteristics of this style as:

- No standardized appearance, but frequently simple or vernacular with a horizontal orientation;
- Emphasis on volume over ornamentation;
- Wood siding, including boards, board-and batten and shingles Flat, shed or canted roof forms;
- Overhanging eaves with exposed rafters;
- Emphasis on indoor-outdoor living spaces, including the use of large window openings; and
- Open-plan of flexible plan interior spaces.

WHEREAS, the home demonstrates many of these. It has a simple ornamentation with architectural relief provided by volumetric transitions. It’s primary exterior finish is a redwood siding. It has a large overhanging eave, and it has large window openings and fully glazed walls which emphasize indoor-outdoor living space.

WHEREAS, John Dinwiddie earned his degree in architecture from the University of Michigan, Ann Arbor in 1925. He worked briefly in New York before re-locating to San Francisco in 1927, where he worked until establishing his own practice in 1931. Several of his bay area designs

were published in professional magazines between 1941 and 1947, and Lewis Mumford introduced John E. Dinwiddie and Henry Hill at a 1949 exhibit on “Domestic Architecture of the San Francisco Bay Region” that saw the emergence of the name “Bay Region Style” at the San Francisco Museum of Modern Art.

WHEREAS, The phase I report describes the character defining features of the residence as:

- The rather cubist like footprint;
- Vertical, flush redwood board exterior wall cladding;
- A flat roof with a slight lift toward the south; and
- Fully glazed walls in the main living area that seem to lead outdoors and to take advantage of both the intimate and far views of nature afforded by the hill-top siting of the residence.

WHEREAS, according to the historic report alterations since construction consist of painting the house (which was originally a stained wood) an off-white; and minor additions constructed in 1972 on the plan east and plan west sides of the home, as shown in the building plans attached to the historical report (LIB140306). The report concludes that the residence retains integrity: most of its original features and finishes are in place, and it evokes a strong sense of time, place, and feeling.

WHEREAS, the Board of Supervisors would consider the listing as a pre-requisite for consideration of the Mills Act Contract Application; and should it be listed, the “Farris Bagley House” would qualify as a Historic Property for the purposes of Chapter 18.28 (The Mills Act Program).

WHEREAS, a residential appraisal was prepared by David E. Nolting (State Certification #AR023184) which appraised the fair market value of the property at \$2,850,000, less than the \$3,000,000 valuation limitation set forth in Monterey County Code 18.28.040.C.

WHEREAS, a re-habilitation and maintenance plan was submitted which describes how the tax savings will be used in the preservation of the home. The work plan provides for \$111,600 in rehabilitation activities over the next six years, and an additional \$8,300 in annual maintenance activities.

WHEREAS, The listing on the historic register is not a project under CEQA as defined by CEQA Guidelines section 15378. For the Mills Act contract, CEQA Guidelines section 15331 categorically exempts projects limited to the maintenance, repair, stabilization, rehabilitation, restoration, preservation, conservation, or reconstruction of historical resources in a manner consistent with the Secretary of the Interior Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties. The project consists of approving a historic property contract to allow the on-going maintenance and preservation of a historic home, consistent with the intent of this exemption, and none of the exceptions from CEQA guidelines section 15300.2 apply in this case:

- Class 31 exemptions are not qualified by their location;
- Approving a historic property contract would not contribute to a cumulative environmental effect;
- There are no unusual circumstances associated with the project that would create the

- reasonable possibility of a significant environmental effect;
- The project would not cause damage to scenic resources within view of a state scenic highway;
- The project is not on a hazardous waste site listed pursuant to Section 65962.5 of the Government Code; and
- The project would not cause a substantial adverse change to a historical resource.

WHEREAS, at the conclusion of the hearing, the matter was submitted to the HRRB for a recommendation. Having considered all the written and documentary information submitted, oral testimony, and other evidence presented before the HRRB, the HRRB rendered its decision to adopt findings and evidence to recommend that the property be listed on the Monterey County Register of Historic Resources and that a historic property (Mills Act) contract be approved for the property, subject to the following findings and condition:

Finding: The “Ferris Bagley House” is eligible for listing on the Monterey County Register of Historic Resources under California Register of Historic Resources Criterion 3, *“Embodies the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, region or method of construction or represents the work of a master or possesses high artistic values”*, in the area of architecture, as an excellent and early example of Post World War Two Second Bay Region design, found on the Monterey Peninsula, by noted modernist architect John E. Dinwiddie.

Finding: Should the Board add the home to the Monterey County Register of Historic Resources, the “Ferris Bagley House” at 4161 Sunridge Road, Pebble Beach (Assessor’s Parcel Number 008-071-011-000 and 008-071-012-000) shall be eligible for a Mills Act Contract.

Finding: The listing of the property on the Monterey County Register of Historic Resources is not a project pursuant to Section 15378 of the CEQA Guidelines and the recommendation on the historic property (Mills Act) contract qualifies for a Class 31 categorical exemptions pursuant to CEQA Guidelines section 15331

Evidence:

1. Application materials in the file PLN230067, including letter requesting the property be listed on the historic register, tax savings estimate, rehabilitation and maintenance plan, and property appraisal;
2. Procedures and Criteria for listing contained in Chapter 18.25 of the Monterey County Code;
3. The Mills Act Program contained in Chapter 18.28 of the Monterey County Code;
4. Phase I Historic Resources Assessment (LIB140306) prepared by Kent Seavey, Pacific Grove, CA, September 1, 2014;
5. The Pebble Beach Historic Context Statement; and
6. Oral testimony and HRRB discussion during the public hearing and the administrative record.

Condition: The rehabilitation and maintenance plan shall be revised to cover a 10-year duration.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED THAT, based on the above findings and evidence the Historic Resources Review Board does hereby recommend to the Board of Supervisors that the “Ferris Bagley House” be listed on the Monterey County Register of Historic Resources and that a historic property (Mills Act) contract be approved for the property.

Passed and adopted on this **6th day of July, 2023**, upon motion of Kellie Morgantini, seconded by Salvador Muñoz , by the following vote:

AYES: Judy MacClelland, John Scourkes, Salvador Muñoz, Belinda Taluban, Kellie Morgantini, Michael Bilich

NOES: None

ABSENT: Sheila Lee Prader

ABSTAIN: None

DocuSigned by:
Philip Angelo
16955456DE57483...

Attest

Philip Angelo, HRRB Secretary
July 6th, 2023

This page intentionally left blank