

Attachment A

This page intentionally left blank.

DRAFT RESOLUTION

Before the Historic Resources Review Board in and for the County of Monterey, State of California

Resolution No. 23-XXX

PLN230203 – COUNTY OF MONTEREY (PORTER-VALLEJO MANSION)

Resolution by the Monterey County Historic
Resources Review Board (HRRB) recommending
that the Planning Commission:

- 1) Find that repair and rehabilitation of the historic property qualifies for a Class 31 categorical exemptions pursuant to CEQA Guidelines section 15331; and
- 2) Approve of a Use Permit to allow alterations to a historic resource (Porter Vallejo Mansion), including repair and replacement of roofing, siding, and windows; repair and relocation of mechanical equipment including exterior screening to hide equipment; replacing the front porch decking; repairs to front railing to be replaced in kind; mothballing of a detached water tower; and removal of a trellis, fencing and play equipment.

WHEREAS, this matter was heard by the Historic Resources Review Board (HRRB) of the County of Monterey on October 5, 2023 and on November 2, 2023, pursuant to Title 21 Section 21.54.050.A and Title 18 Section 18.25.170 of the Monterey County Code.

WHEREAS, the property is located at 29 Bishop Street, Royal Oaks (Assessor's Parcel Number 117-323-013-000), North County Area Plan, and the Porter Vallejo Mansion has been listed on the Monterey County Register of Historic Resources and on the National Register of Historical Places.

WHEREAS, County of Monterey Public Works, Facilities and Parks (PWFP) filed with the County of Monterey an application for a Use Permit to allow alterations at the Porter Vallejo Mansion, consisting of: repair and replacement of roofing, siding, and windows; repair and relocations of mechanical equipment including exterior screening to hide equipment; replace front porch decking; repairs to front railing to be replaced in kind; mothballing of a detached water tower; and removal of a trellis, fencing and play equipment.

WHEREAS, The Porter Vallejo Mansion was nominated as a historic property with the United States Department of Interior, National Park Service, National Register of Historic Places on

December 4, 1989. The nomination was approved and entered into the National Registry on January 4, 1990.

WHEREAS, a historical narrative was prepared on August 28, 2023 by RIM Architects (LET_Larsen_PLN230203_082823) describing the mansion's significance based on the ownership by John Porter, a prominent business and community leader for the Pajaro Community. John Porter had the one and a half story home moved from the Vallejo property to its current location at 29 Bishop Street and hired Architect William Weeks to convert the Gothic Revival home into a 23-room three-story Queen Anne style mansion while also maintaining the home's original Gothic Revival features. The mansion is also a significant historical example of architect William Week's early work.

WHEREAS, proposed exterior work includes removing the existing mechanical equipment from the basement and installing new mechanical equipment throughout the building to be consistent with FEMA Code of Federal Regulations, Section 44 CCR 59.1. Three heat pumps will be located on concrete pads. Screening will be provided to hide the heat pumps and exterior mechanical vent penetrations.

WHEREAS, there is evidence of water intrusion at the exterior envelope. Proposed work includes removing all of the exterior siding and trim, repairing windows deemed as "Fair" and replacing the windows deemed as "Poor" in condition, install new flashing and waterproofing membranes at the window openings and exterior wall, and reinstalling the siding and trim. PWFPP provided an analysis to the HRRB for approval confirming that the primary public facing façades, north and east, will be 100% original salvaged siding, 75% will be salvaged siding at the west (secondary) façade, and an alternative thermally treated wood siding to be used at the remaining 25% as well as 100% of the south (secondary) façade. Damaged trim will be replaced in kind.

WHEREAS, the front porch decking and railing is damaged and needs to be repaired and/or replaced. The porch decking is damaged beyond repair, options for an alternative decking material was presented to the HRRB for approval. Damaged parts of the railing will either be repaired and reinstalled, or replaced in kind.

WHEREAS, the water tower needs to be structurally stabilized and the siding cleaned up and/or replaced if damaged. Flashing and a metal cap will cover the hole where the old water tank used to sit on top of the water tower. The building will be secured from future break-ins and vandalism.

WHEREAS, site improvements will include removing the deteriorated wood trellis, the play structure and the chain link fence as these are not significant historical aspects of the Queen Anne style. A three-foot tall white picket fence will be installed around the perimeter, a feature that is commonly seen with Queen Anne homes.

WHEREAS, all proposed building improvements and site improvements are designed and detailed in compliance with the United States Secretary of the Interior's standards for Rehabilitation.

WHEREAS, CEQA Guidelines section 15331 categorically exempts projects limited to the maintenance, repair, stabilization, rehabilitation, restoration, preservation, conservation, or reconstruction of historical resources in a manner consistent with the Secretary of the Interior Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties. The project consists of the repair and rehabilitation of a historic property, consistent with the intent of this exemption, and none of the exceptions from CEQA guidelines section 15300.2 apply in this case.

THEREFORE, BE IT RSOLVED, that having considered all the written and documentary information submitted, oral testimony, and other evidence presented before the HRRB, the HRRB recommended approval of the Use Permit allow alterations to a historic resource (Porter Vallejo Mansion), including repair and replacement of roofing, siding, and windows; repair and relocation of mechanical equipment including exterior screening to hide equipment; replace front porch decking; repairs to front railing to be replaced in kind; mothballing of a detached water tower; and removal of a trellis, fencing and play equipment, subject to the following findings and conditions:

Finding: The recommendation for repair and rehabilitation of the historic property qualifies for a Class 31 categorical exemptions pursuant to CEQA Guidelines section 15331

Finding: In accordance with Title 21 section 21.54.060.E., the proposed alterations, as conditioned, do not significantly and adversely affect the historic, archaeological, architectural, or engineering integrity of the resource.

Evidence:

1. Regulations for Historic Resources Zoning Districts or “HR” Districts as contained in the Monterey County Code Chapter 21.54.
2. Regulations for the Preservation of Historic Resources as contained in Monterey County Code Chapter 18.25.
3. The Porter Vallejo Manor National Register of Historic Places Nomination Form (LIB230273)
4. The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation & Guidelines on Flood Adaption for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings
5. National Parks Service Preservation Brief 31 on Mothballing Historic Structures
6. HRRB Narrative Report (LET_LARSEN_PLN230203_082823) prepared by RIM Architects (RIM), San Francisco, CA, August, 2023.
7. The application, plans, and supporting materials submitted by the project applicant to Monterey County HCD-Planning for the proposed development found in project file PLN230203.
8. Oral testimony and HRRB discussion during the public hearing and the administrative record.

Condition 1: Exterior Siding Repair/Replacement Process: For siding repair and replacement, to ensure that Secretary of Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation #6 is adhered to, deteriorated siding shall be repaired when possible. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of siding, the new siding shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing siding shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or

pictorial evidence. Re-installation of original siding material shall be prioritized at the public-facing facades first.

Replacement of missing siding shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence by the Owner/Applicant/Architect and provide a final report for review by HCD-Planning prior to final/occupancy.

Condition 2: Exterior Window Survey Submittal: To ensure the work meets Secretary of Interior's Standards of Rehabilitation #6, deteriorated historic windows shall be repaired where possible, rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a window, the new window shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing windows and window features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

Prior to final/occupancy, the Owner/Applicant/Architect shall provide a final report detailing the work completed and final quantity of windows replaced for review by HCD-Planning.

Condition 3: Mothballing Water Tower Report: The water tower "mothballing" work shall be done in accordance with the U.S. Department of Interior National Park Service Preservation Brief 31.

Prior to issuance of building permits, the Owner/Applicant/Architect shall provide a report detailing the mothball work and how it meets the mothballing standards for review and approval by HCD-Planning.

Passed and adopted on this **2th day of November, 2023**, upon motion of _____, seconded by _____, by the following vote:

AYES:

NOES:

ABSENT:

ABSTAIN:

Attest
Philip Angelo, HRRB Secretary
November 2nd, 2023