

Exhibit E

This page intentionally left blank.

Keith Higgins

Traffic Engineer

November 2, 2023

Robert and Tracy Winkleblack
PO Box 729
Monterey, CA 93942

Re: Winkleblack Vacation Rental Traffic Study, 9700 Venado Drive, Carmel Valley, Monterey County, CA

Dear Robert and Tracy,

As you requested, this is a traffic study for the Winkleblack single family vacation rental home, 9700 Venado Drive, Carmel Valley, Monterey County, CA (Project). The Project is a single-family home that is currently under construction that is proposed to be a short-term rental. This study is focused on the project's effects on trip generation and vehicle miles traveled (VMT).

Per the request of the Monterey County Housing and Community Development Department in a Project Referral Sheet dated 8/29/2023 included herein as **Attachment A**, the study includes the following tasks.

1. Project Trip Generation Estimate
2. Qualitative Operational Analysis/Discussion
3. Project Vehicle Miles Traveled (VMT) Discussion

1. Project Trip Generation Estimate

The Project is the use of a single-family home as a vacation rental when not occupied by the owner. Trip rates for the Project are cited from "Trip Generation Manual," Institute of Transportation Engineers (ITE Manual), 11th Edition, 2021.

The property is a typical single-family home. **Table 1** on the following page tabulates daily trip generation for weekdays, Saturdays, and Sundays for this use, which is categorized as "Single-Family Detached Housing" Land Use Category 210. This indicates that the existing single-family home is estimated to typically generate about 9 daily trips on weekdays and Saturdays and about 8 on Sundays. The ITE Manual peak hour trip generation rates include one trip (0 in, 1 out) during the AM peak hour and one trip (1 in, 0 out) during the PM peak hour.

The ITE Manual "Timeshare" land use (ITE Land Use Code 265) trip generation rates are also summarized on **Table 1**. The Project is expected to generate about 9 daily trips per day on weekdays, 7

on Saturdays and 6 on Sundays. The ITE Manual peak hour trip generation rates include none during the weekday AM peak hour and one trip (0 in, 1 out) during the PM peak hour.

Trip generation rates for the ITE Manual “Recreational Home” land use category (ITE Land Use Code 265) trip generation rates are also summarized on **Table 1**. Based on this rate, the Project is expected to generate about 4 daily trips on weekdays, 3 on Saturdays and 3 on Sundays. The ITE Manual peak hour trip generation rates include none during the weekday AM peak hour and one trip (0 in, 1 out) during the PM peak hour. Trip rates for this category are much lower than typical single-family homes and timeshares because the ITE database includes second homes that are only owner-occupied, are rented on a seasonal basis or are within resort complexes that capture trips that would otherwise be external to the resort complex. The ITE Manual states, “A recreational home is either (1) a second home used by its owner periodically for recreation or (2) rented on a seasonal basis. Some sites in the database are located within a resort that contains local services and complete recreational facilities. Timeshare land use 265 is a related land use.

Land Use Category	ITE Manual Land Use Code	Weekdays		Saturdays		Sundays	
		Trip Rate	Daily Trips	Trip Rate	Daily Trips	Trip Rate	Daily Trips
Single-Family Detached Housing	210	9.43	9	9.48	9	8.48	8
Timeshare	265	8.63	9	7.34	7	6.01	6
Recreational Home	260	3.55	4	3.34	3	2.96	3

Table 1 – Project Daily Trip Generation

Based on the above trip generation rates, the use of the home as a vacation rental has essentially the same or less impact than a typical single-family home. Vacation rentals generally have less morning peak hour trips because those trips are usually work and/or school-related commute trips. Vacation rentals are more likely to generate more trips later in the day.

The above trip generation comparison is based on averages. It is understood that differences occur between identical single-family homes depending on numerous factors including family size, income, type of employment and age. The trip rate will be affected by whether occupants are retired, have unusual work schedules and number of persons of driving age as well as number and frequency of visitors. Other factors include whether the residents utilize contracted help such as housekeeping, gardening, and other types of service vehicles. On the other hand, vacation rental trip rates vary by the number of occupants and vehicles.

The frequency of contracted help such as housekeeping, gardening, and other types of service vehicles as well as number and frequency of visitors affects the trip rate for individual vacation rentals as well as

single family homes. The number of visitors to either a residence or vacation rental will of course also affect its trip generation.

The vacation rental rate will also be affected by the percentage of time that it is occupied. According to Smith Travel Research, overall hotel occupancy in the Salinas-Monterey area was about 71.8% for 2000. It is therefore expected that the property would be vacant about 25% of the time during which there could be landscape maintenance and housekeeping trips. However, there is no inherent, qualitative difference between the amount of traffic generated by a single-family home or a single vacation rental.

The residence will already be able to be owner occupied. Given that there is no appreciable difference between the amount of traffic generated by an owner-occupied residence and a vacation rental, the proposed change to a vacation rental will not result in a noticeable difference in anticipated trip generation.

2. Qualitative Operational Analysis/Discussion

Because the usage of the new home will not result in a qualitative difference in trip generation, there will be no effect on off-site traffic operations from this project. The Project has already paid its traffic impact fees which represent its fair share contribution to regional cumulative road improvements.

3. Project Vehicle Miles Traveled (VMT) Evaluation

As mandated by California Senate Bill SB 743, effective July 1, 2020, vehicle-miles-travelled (VMT) replaced level of service in the evaluation of environmental impacts under CEQA (California Environmental Quality Act). Although a draft policy has been developed, Monterey County has not adopted a formal VMT policy which would include the methodology for performing this analysis. However, Monterey County's draft VMT policy and evaluation methodology are consistent with the "Technical Advisory on Evaluating Transportation Impacts in CEQA," State of California Governor's Office of Planning and Research, December 2018 (OPR Guidelines), which provides implementation guidance for SB 743 for evaluating development proposals.

The OPR Guidelines include criteria for determining if a development proposal will require further VMT analysis or if the proposal is below the significance threshold and exempt from additional analysis. The OPR Guidelines, page 12, states, "Many local agencies have developed screening thresholds to indicate when detailed analysis is needed. Absent substantial evidence indicating that a project would generate a potentially significant level of VMT, or inconsistency with a Sustainable Communities Strategy (SCS) or general plan, projects that generate or attract fewer than 110 trips per day generally may be assumed to cause a less-than-significant transportation impact."

The proposed Timeshare is estimated to generate about 9 vehicle trips per day which is about the same as its permitted use as a typical owner-occupied single-family home. The Project will not increase the amount of traffic generated by the site. The Project trip generation will therefore be far below the 110

Robert and Tracy Winkleblack
November 2, 2023

trips-per-day significance threshold. The Project will therefore have a less-than-significant VMT impact. No additional VMT analysis is required.

4. Conclusion

The following are the conclusions of this analysis.

- The project will generate essentially the same amount of traffic as the existing single-family home. It will not result in an adverse effect on safety, operations, or neighborhood traffic-related quality of life.
- The Project has already paid its traffic impact fees which represent its fair share of cumulative impact mitigation.
- The Project will have a less-than-significant vehicle-miles-traveled impact.

If you have any questions or need additional information, please do not hesitate to contact me at your convenience. Thank you for the opportunity to assist you with this project.

Respectfully submitted,

Keith Higgins

Keith B. Higgins, PE, TE

Attachment

5 HH57 < A9BH'5 - Project Referral Sheet

Monterey County HCD Planning
1441 Schilling Pl South 2nd Floor
Salinas, CA 93901
(831) 755-5025

TO: FIRE DEPARTMENT
HCD-ENGINEERING SERVICES
PARKS DEPARTMENT

HEALTH DEPARTMENT
HCD-ENVIRONMENTAL SERVICES
OTHER: _____

PLEASE SUBMIT YOUR COMMENTS FOR THIS APPLICATION BY: Monday, September 11, 2023

Project Title: WINKLEBLACK ROBERT & TRACY

File Number: PLN230133

File Type: CHIEF OF PLANNING

Planner: MOULTON

Location: 9700 VENADO DR CARMEL

Assessor's No: 169-021-009-000

Project Description:

Administrative Permit for the transient use of a residential property (single-family dwelling) for remuneration. The property is located at 9700 Venado Drive, Carmel (Assessor's Parcel Number 169-021-009-000), Carmel Valley Master Plan.

Status: COMPLETE/**INCOMPLETE** (highlight/circle one)

Recommended Conditions:

- Provide Project Trip Generation Estimate (Existing and Proposed). Provide project daily trip estimates assuming various other similar categories: Recreational homes, timeshares, etc.
- Provide a qualitative operational analysis/discussion, including any conclusions and recommendations to mitigate any potential traffic effects on the nearby roads and intersections
- Provide Vehicle Miles Traveled (VMT) analysis as required per CEQA requirements and Office of the Planning & Research (OPR). The VMT analysis report shall be prepared by a licensed traffic engineer with experience in VMT analysis and the Association of Monterey Bay Area Governments (AMBAG) model.

Signature: *Bora Alkaya*

Date: 08/29/2023

This page intentionally left blank