



County of Monterey Historic Resources Review Board

Item No. 1

Board of Supervisors
Chambers
168 W. Alisal St., 1st Floor
Salinas, CA 93901

Legistar File Number: 25-161

March 06, 2025

Introduced: 2/28/2025

Current Status: Agenda Ready

Version: 1

Matter Type: General Agenda Item

DA240266 - DOWLER RANDALL R AND STACEY G

Public hearing to consider recommending that the Chief of Planning approve a Design Approval to allow alterations to the Fan Shell house including all single pane plate glass glazing will be replaced with insulated glazing in aluminum frame units in existing openings; addition of new windows and access doors from the courtyard to the garage (convert portion of garage into office/gym with 1/2 bath); and a new green roof over the garage; replace trellis sections at the north and south ends of the structure; casement egress windows to be replaced with new aluminum frame units in existing openings; new built-in hot tub spa, planters and bench proposed within the existing courtyard. The courtyard was previously a swimming pool, recently permitted to be filled. Colors and materials to match existing masonry and concrete (tan slump stone block); unfinished incense cedar wood siding and trim, sand finish concrete patio, and new mullion pattern windows to match existing.

Project Location: 3137 17 Mile Dr Pebble Beach, (Assessor's Parcel Number 008-263-001-000)
Del Monte Forest Land Use Plan.

RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends that the County of Monterey Historic Resources Review Board (HRRB) adopt a resolution recommending that the Chief of Planning:

- 1) Find the project qualifies for a class 3 exception pursuant to section 15331 of the CEQA guidelines; and
- 2) Approve a Design Approval to allow Alterations to the Fan Shell house including all single pane plate glass glazing will be replaced with insulated glazing in aluminum frame units in existing openings; addition of new windows and access doors from the courtyard to the garage (new 1/2 bath in garage); overhang restructuring, and a new green roof over the garage; replace trellis sections at the north and south ends of the structure; casement egress windows to be replaced with new aluminum frame units in existing openings; new built-in hot tub spa, planters and bench proposed within the existing courtyard. The courtyard was previously a swimming pool, recently permitted to be filled. Colors and materials to match existing masonry and concrete (tan slump stone block); unfinished incense cedar wood siding and trim, sand finish concrete patio, and new mullion pattern windows to match existing.

DISCUSSION:

The applicants began obtaining permits to start interior repair work. Initial permits include Residential Reroof (23CP02852), Repair soffits/roof thickness (23CP02852-REV1), Replace 6 CMU exterior walls (23CP02893), Replace interior water lines and electrical service panel (24CP00572); Demo existing interior concrete slab (24CP00572-REV1), Demo existing pool and fill (24CP00572-REV2); Replace plumbing/electrical/radiant heating under concrete slab (24CP00572-REV3). Much of the work they received approval for (interior work or repairs) would generally not require a discretionary

approval or referral to the Historic Resources Review Board (HRRB).

A Phase I DPR was prepared by Anthony Kirk, Ph.D on January 26, 2022 (LIB240284). The Fan Shell house appears to be eligible for the California Register of Historical Resources under Criterion 3 as an unusually fine example of Organic architecture. The residence is designed by Mark Mills, a Carmel architect who worked out of his home for over a half century. According to this report its character defining features include its “plan, form, fenestration, features, and finishes, together with the setting, which inspired the design.” The residence is also mentioned in the *Pebble Beach Historic Content Statement* prepared in 2013, “it features a distinctive scalloped roofline similar to the roof of a shell” and “appears individually eligible for the California Register of Historical Resources.”

In his report for the project, historian Kent Seavey states, “This is the historic Fan Shell House by noted American architect Mark Mills that was constructed in 1972. Constructed of slump stone blocks, the house is segmental in design, taking the form of a scalloped seashell, in an arch shaped footprint, West to Northwest, just above the Pacific Ocean. The building’s style is Organic Modern. The structure has five bays, with massive glass windows formed with vertical steel members, piercing the roof and bolted in place. The radiating walls are set directly on the sand dunes.”

Seavey’s report continues, “It’s immediate proximity to the ocean, and weather in general for over fifty years has caused structural damage to the building envelope, including corrosion of the vertical metal supports of all types, which, by expansion, has created cracks in the supporting slump stone walls. The roof covering has also eroded over time allowing minor water intrusion.

A careful and exhaustive program of discovery regarding these issues, supported by initial permits from the County, under Code section Chapter 18.25.020 for maintenance and repair, not only have the specific issues at hand been identified, but some of the original craftsmen and contractors for the various materials have been engaged to resolve the problems, including access to original materials, such as the original slump stone bricks.

Based extensive research, the existing permitted work along with the proposed work has provided a reasonable course to assure the appropriate materials, methods of construction, and a construction group of people familiar with the residence, to affect an excellent result in the rehabilitation of this unique and important example of the design work of Mark Mills, which intends to meet the Secretary of the Interior Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties, under the Standards for Rehabilitation.”

CEQA

The proposed project qualifies for a class 3 exemption pursuant to section 15331 of the CEQA Guidelines with no exceptions to section 15300.2. This exemption applies to projects that are for the **"maintenance, repair, stabilization, rehabilitation, restoration, preservation, conservation or reconstruction of historical resources"** in a manner consistent with the Secretary of Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties ("the Standards") are exempt from CEQA. Additionally, the project will not have a cumulative impact on the environment, there are no unusual circumstances regarding this project that will cause a significant impact to the environment, the project is not visible from any scenic highways, the project is not located on a hazardous waste site and the

proposed project will not cause a substantial change to any historical resources.

Prepared by: Elizabeth Gonzales, Permit Center Manager

Reviewed and approved by: Phil Angelo, Senior Planner

The following attachments are on file with Housing and Community Development:

- Exhibit A - Draft Resolution
- Exhibit B - Project Plans, Colors and Materials and Renderings
- Exhibit C - Design Approval application with Site Photos
- Exhibit D - Seavey Historic Report_104124

cc: Gretchen Fletcher (Agent); Randall Dowler (owner); Project File DA240266