



# County of Monterey Planning Commission

## Item No.1

Board of Supervisors  
Chambers  
168 W. Alisal St., 1st Floor  
Salinas, CA 93901

### Agenda Item No.1

May 28, 2025

Legistar File Number: PC 25-048

Introduced: 5/16/2025

Current Status: Agenda Ready

Version: 1

Matter Type: Planning Item

#### PLN220251 - ARDUA 31 LLC

Continued from June 26, 2024 and August 14, 2024 - Public hearing to consider construction of a 5,412 square foot single-family dwelling with an attached 984 square foot garage and associated site improvements, including the removal of 56 Monterey pine trees and 595 cubic yards of cut and 415 cubic yards of fill.

**Project Location:** 1272 Viscaino Road, Pebble Beach

**Proposed CEQA action:** Find the project qualifies for a Class 3 Categorical Exemption pursuant to CEQA Guidelines section 15303, and there are no exceptions pursuant to Guidelines section 15300.2.

#### RECOMMENDATION:

It is recommended that the Planning Commission adopt a Resolution:

1. Finding the project exempt from CEQA pursuant to section 15303, new structures and there are no exceptions pursuant to Section 15300.2 that can be made; and
2. Approving a Combined Development Permit consisting of:
  - a. Coastal Administrative Permit and Design Approval to allow construction of a 6,396 square foot single family dwelling, inclusive of an attached 984 square foot garage, and associated site improvements; and
  - b. A Coastal Development Permit to allow the removal of approximately 56 protected Monterey pine trees.

Staff has prepared a draft resolution, including findings and evidence, for consideration (**Exhibit A**).

Staff recommends approval of the Combined Development Permit subject to 13 conditions of approval.

#### PROJECT INFORMATION:

**Agent:** Angie Phares

**Property Owner:** Ardua 31 LLC

**APN:** 008-231-003-000

**Parcel Size:** 63,149.37 Square Feet (1.45 Acres)

**Zoning:** Low Density Residential with a density of one unit per 1.5 acres and a Design district overlay in the Coastal Zone (LDR/1.5-D(CZ))

**Plan Area:** Del Monte Forest Land Use Plan

**Flagged and Staked:** Yes

**Project Planner:** Fionna Jensen, Principal Planner

JensenF1@countyofmonterey.gov, 831-796-6407

SUMMARY:

The project is located at 1272 Viscaino Rd, Pebble Beach. The 1.45 acre property is a heavily forested lot containing over 150 trees with no natural clearing. The proposed project includes construction of a 5,412 square foot single family dwelling with an attached 984 square foot garage, associated site improvements including a new driveway and hardscape, and the removal of approximately 56 protected Monterey pine trees. The project was previously scheduled for consideration before the Planning Commission on June 26, 2024. At this hearing, the Applicant/Owner requested approval to allow the removal of 58 Monterey Pine trees, however, staff only supported 41 Monterey Pine trees. After public testimony, the Planning Commission continued the project to August 14, 2024 to allow time for the Applicant/Owner to submit additional justification (e.g. grading/civil plans) supporting the removal of 58 trees. On August 14, 2024, the Planning Commission continued the item to a date uncertain to allow additional time for staff to review the submitted grading plans - information which was not submitted prior to the June 2024 hearing. Staff is now returning with an updated analysis of tree removal and a revised resolution recommending approval of a redesigned project (**Exhibit A**).

Following the June 2024 hearing, civil plans were submitted in July 2024. These civil plans indicated that 66 Monterey Pines would need to be removed to accommodate the project. This increase was partially due to the expansion of exterior patios (Patios 2 and 3), which resulted in the removal of approximately 8 additional trees. To accommodate two disabled residents who will be living with the Owner, exterior walkways were added to connect the outdoor patios to the living area. Due to the gently sloping nature of the property, additional grading was identified as being needed to level portions of the property to facilitate the installation of these exterior walkways. These walkways and associated additional grading required the removal of approximately 13 trees. Other trees proposed for removal included trees identified by the Applicant/Owner as hazardous.

County staff reviewed these plans for conformity with Del Monte Forest Land Use Plan policies and Coastal Implementation Plan (CIP; Part 5) regulations. The Del Monte Forest Land Use Plan protects landmark trees, which are defined as those native trees that are 24 inches or more in diameter when measured at breast height or trees that are visually significant, historically significant, exemplary of their species, and/or more than 1,000 years old. CIP section 20.147.050(C)(4) requires that tree removal be minimized to the extent feasible, retention of trees located near construction areas, and careful siting of driveways. Accordingly, staff's review of the July 2024 civil plans emphasized retention of landmark Monterey Pines (trunk diameter greater than 24 inches) and trees not impacted by the grading necessary for the footprint of the residence. Staff thoroughly reviewed these plans and identified ten of the proposed 66 trees that staff could not support for removal due to their size or location. Trees originally proposed for removal but identified by staff as suitable for retention are outlined in blue circles in **Exhibit B** and discussed below.

Approximately six of these ten trees (Tree ID#s 465, 466, 467, 475, 484, and 485) were proposed for removal by the Applicant/Owner, but not recommended for removal by the Project Arborist. These six trees are all Landmark Monterey pines (greater than 24 inches in diameter at breast height [DBH]). Although in a fair condition, the Applicant/Owner and a neighbor claim that these six trees are hazardous. However, no evidence has been submitted supporting this claim. Should these trees

become hazardous, the property owner may seek separate authorization from the County. Four of these six landmark Pines are outside of grading limits and thus did not meet the criteria to be considered for removal. Two of these six landmark Pines were within the area proposed to be occupied by walkways connecting the garage to the rear patio and the patio to the entry level floor. These walkways were not sited or designed to minimize tree removal; instead, they extended unnecessarily far from the residence's exterior, expanding the project's grading limits. Two additional trees (Tree ID#s 458 [36 inches DBH] and 459 [12 inches DBH]) were proposed for removal due to these walkways' grading limits. Finally, two trees on the south side of the residence (Tree ID#s 425 [30 inches DBH] and 426 [20 inches DBH]) were proposed for removal due to an increase in Patio #3's size.

CIP section 20.147.070(B)(10) requires the "Siting and design of structures shall be such that tree removal and alteration to natural landforms is minimized. New structures shall be designed to harmonize with the natural setting..." The Del Monte Forest LUP also requires that trees be retained to the maximum extent feasible. Reducing the size of the ancillary patio, reconfiguring the walkways to better align with the footprint of the residence, and monitoring and hand trenching around specific trees were identified by staff as feasible measures to reduce tree removal and ground disturbance. After meeting with the Applicant/Owner, the County received revised plans incorporating these recommendations. These design changes resulted in the retention of 10 Monterey Pines, most of which are Landmark trees, and reduced total ground disturbance by approximately 1,800 square feet. Condition No. 7 requires monitoring of excavation to ensure drilling or cutting into or through major roots of trees proposed for retention does not occur.

The remaining 46 trees proposed for removal are either dead, or within the footprint of the residence, reasonably sized exterior patios, or the proposed driveway. Seventeen of these 46 trees are dead and could pose a hazard to the residence and its occupants once constructed. Removal of these trees will help to thin the overcrowded vegetated conditions of the site. The other 33 trees are within the development limits of the proposed project. The proposed 5,412 square foot single-family dwelling with an attached 984 square foot garage is compatible with the scale of residences within this neighborhood. Additionally, the proposed driveway's simple and direct configuration is consistent with the requirements of CIP section 20.147.030(A)(1)(a). Any relocation of the proposed residence and the driveway would result in an equal or greater number of impacted trees. Therefore, as redesigned and conditioned, staff support the removal of the 56 Monterey pines. The recommendations of the arborist report align with staff's recommendations.

As redesigned, the project better meets the goals and policies of the Del Monte Forest Land Use Plan, specifically those policies supporting minimizing tree removal and ground disturbance. As outlined in **Exhibit A**, the project is consistent with applicable regulations and development standards in Title 20 (Zoning Ordinance), the Del Monte Forest Coastal Implementation Plan (DMF CIP), and the Del Monte Forest Land Use Plan (DMF LUP). The property will receive water and sewage services from the Pebble Beach Community Services District.

As a reminder, an Archaeological Resources Report (County of Monterey Library No. LIB23102) was prepared for this project to assess any potential impacts to archaeological or cultural resources. The archaeological report concluded there was no evidence of any significant resources on the parcel

and did not recommend further investigation. Additionally, a Biotic Assessment (County of Monterey Library No. LIB220352) was prepared for this project to address any potential impacts to biological and forest resources. The initial report determined that there are known occurrences of springtime special status species within the proximity of the project site. A springtime survey was completed, and no special status plants were observed. Due to these findings, the biologist was able to rule out the potential for impacts to special status species from the proposed development.

The site is subject to the policies of the Design Control “D” zoning district, which establishes design review requirements to assure protection of the public viewshed and neighborhood character. The development’s design, size and placement are consistent with the goals and policies of the DMF LUP and the surrounding neighborhood character:

- The proposed colors and materials are consistent and compatible with the surrounding neighborhood character. Colors and materials include light beige lap siding and stucco for the exterior walls of the home, brown asphalt shingles and copper-like standing seam metal roofing, black window and door frames, and vertical stained wood accent beams.
- A 6-foot high deer fence is proposed to surround the property. This fence will be comprised of wire and wood and will be consistent with the deer fences on neighboring properties.
- The proposed development is approximately 0.4 miles from 17 Mile Drive and will not be visible due to the intervening development and dense pine forest. Consistent with the DMF LUP, the proposed development will not have adverse impacts on the view from 17 Mile Drive.
- Condition of Approval No. 6 requires an exterior lighting plan be provided and approved by HCD-Planning before the issuance of building permits.

CEQA:

The project is categorically exempt from environmental review pursuant to Section 15303 of the CEQA Guidelines, “New Construction”. This exemption applies to construction of limited new structures that will not result in any adverse impacts to the surrounding environmental resources as defined in the CEQA Guidelines. This project qualifies for a Class 3 exemption because it includes the construction of a single family dwelling and attached garage. There are no exceptions pursuant to Guidelines section 15300.2.

OTHER AGENCY INVOLVEMENT:

The project was reviewed by HCD-Planning, HCD-Engineering Services, HCD-Environmental Services, the Environmental Health Bureau, and Pebble Beach CSD. The respective agencies have recommended conditions, where appropriate, to ensure that the project will not have an adverse effect on the health, safety, and welfare of persons either residing or working in the neighborhood.

LUAC:

The project was referred to the Del Monte Forest Land Use Advisory Committee (LUAC) for review. The LUAC reviewed the project at a duly noticed public meeting on March 16, 2023, and voted unanimously to support the project as proposed. See **Exhibit D**.

Prepared by: Fionna Jensen, Principal Planner x6407

Review and Approved by: Melanie Beretti, AICP, Chief of Planning

The following attachments are on file with the HCD:

Exhibit A - Draft Resolution, including:

- Recommended Conditions of Approval
- Site Plan, Floor Plans, Elevations & Colors and Materials

Exhibit B - Tree Retention

Exhibit C - Tree Assessment

Exhibit D - LUAC Minutes

Exhibit E - Vicinity Map

cc: Front Counter Copy; Planning Commission; Pebble Beach Community Services District; HCD-Environmental Services; HCD-Engineering Services; Environmental Health Bureau; Fionna Jensen, Principal Planner; Ardua 31 LLC Property Owner; Angie Hastings, Agent; The Open Monterey Project (Molly Erickson); LandWatch (Executive Director); Laborers International Union of North America (Lozeau Drury LLP); Christina McGinnis, Keep Big Sur Wild; Project File PLN220251.