

Exhibit D

This page intentionally left blank.

Askar/Zohori
Tree Resource Assessment
2972 Colton Road
Pebble Beach CA

Prepared for:

Kamran F. Ashkar & Floura Taleb Zohori

Prepared by:

Frank Ono
Urban Forester
Member Society of American Foresters #48004
ISA Certified Arborist #536
1213 Miles Avenue
Pacific Grove, CA 93950

April 16, 2025

Owner:

Kamran F. Ashkar & Floura Taleb Zohori
3301 Montecito Dr.
San Jose, CA 95135

Architect/Engineer:

R. I. Engineering
303 Portrero Street
Suite 42-402
Santa Cruz, CA 95060

Forester and Arborist

Frank Ono, Member SAF #48004, ISA Certified Arborist #536
F.O. Consulting
1213 Miles Ave
Pacific Grove, CA 93950

SUMMARY

The development project proposes constructing a new 3,270 square-foot two-story single-family home on a vacant lot, which requires the removal of Coast live oak and Monterey pine trees. The project, as submitted, will require the removal of 12 trees (7 oaks and 5 pines, two pines are landmark size). This tree assessment/arborist report identifies and attempts to address the affected existing tree resources on site. It lists findings and recommendations regarding the trees found on the project. Short-term impacts include site disturbance and potential decline in tree health, while long-term effects on the forest ecosystem are expected to be minimal. The report recommends tree pruning, protective fencing, and monitoring during construction to ensure the health and stability of retained trees.

INTRODUCTION

This tree assessment/arborist report is prepared for Kamran F. Ashkar & Floura Taleb. This is a tree resource assessment report prepared for the construction project at 2972 Colton Road, Pebble Beach, CA. It outlines the impacts of proposed development on existing trees and provides recommendations for tree protection and management due to the proposed construction. 12 trees are proposed for removal, with additional trees identified that also need to be removed due to their proximity to construction activities. The assessment evaluates the health and preservation suitability of trees near the development area, ensuring compliance with local zoning ordinances and land use plans, as the project is subject to the Greater Monterey Area Land Use Plan and Monterey County Zoning Ordinances.

ASSIGNMENT/SCOPE OF PROJECT

To ensure protection of the tree resources on site, the property owners, Kamran F. Ashkar & Floura Taleb Zohori, have requested an assessment of the trees in and near the proposed development areas. The assessment findings are documented in an arborist report to work with other conditions to approve the building permit application. To accomplish this assignment, the following tasks have been completed;

- Evaluate health, structure, and preservation suitability for each tree within or adjacent (15 feet or less) to proposed development of trees greater than or equal to six inches in diameter at 24 inches above grade.
- Review proposed grading site plans, provided by Kamran F. Ashkar & Floura Taleb Zohori.
- Make recommendations for alternative methods and preconstruction treatments to facilitate tree retention.
- Create preservation specifications relating to a Tree Location/Preservation Map.
- Determine the quantity of trees affected by construction that meet “Landmark” criteria, defined by the County of Monterey, Title 20 Monterey County Zoning Ordinance, and mitigation requirements for those affected.
- Document findings in the form of a report as required by the County of Monterey Planning Department.

LIMITATIONS

This assignment is limited to a review of plans submitted by Kamran F. Ashkar & Floura Taleb Zohori to assess potential construction effects on trees within or adjacent to construction activities. The assessment is of these plans specifically; no other plans were reviewed. Only minor grading and erosion details are discussed in this report as they relate to tree health. This report is not a monetary valuation of the trees or provides risk assessment for any tree on this parcel, as any tree can fail at any time. No clinical diagnosis was performed on any pest or pathogen that may or may not be present. In addition, Ono Consulting relied on inspections of property with other information provided to prepare this report (such as surveys, property boundaries, and property ownership) and reasonably rely on the accuracy of the information provided. Ono Consulting shall not be responsible for another's means, methods, techniques, schedules, sequence, or procedures, or for contractor safety or any other related programs; or for another's failure to complete the work following the plans and specifications.

PURPOSE AND GOAL

This Tree Assessment report is prepared for this parcel due to proposed construction activities at 2972 Colton Road, Pebble Beach, CA. The assessment determines what trees will be affected by the proposed project. Oak trees and Monterey pine trees are considered protected trees as defined by the County of Monterey, Greater Monterey Area Land Use Plan, and the Monterey County Zoning Ordinance, Title 21, unless otherwise proven to be an introduced or planted species.

The report's goal is to protect and maintain the Greater Monterey Area Land Use Plan's forested resources through adherence to development standards, which allow the protection and maintenance of its forest resources. Furthermore, the intended goal of this report is to aid in planning to offset any potential effects of proposed development on the property while encouraging forest stability and sustainability, perpetuating the forested character of the property and the immediate vicinity.

SITE DESCRIPTION

- 1) Assessor's Parcel Number: 007-512-028-000.
- 2) Location: 2972 Colton Road, Pebble Beach, CA.
- 3) Parcel size: .33 acre.
- 4) Existing Land Use: 4U/AC zoned for residential use (MDR/B6DRES).
- 5) Slope: The parcel does not have slopes of 25% or over.
- 6) Soils: The parcel is located on soils classified by the Monterey County Soils report as NcC Narlon soil, a gently sloping and moderately sloping soil on dissected marine terraces. Clay subsoil is at a depth of 15 to 20 inches, and slopes are mostly 3 to 6 percent. Runoff is slow to medium, and temporary shallow ponds form in swales in wet winters. The erosion hazard is moderate. The seedling mortality is low, and the wind throw hazard is severe. The soil has moderate productivity for Monterey pine. Equipment limitations range from medium to severe.
- 7) Vegetation: The vegetation is a closed-cone pine forest vegetated sparsely with a few native Monterey pines with an Oak understory.
- 8) Forest Condition and Health: The stand of trees and health are evaluated using the residual trees combined with the surrounding adjacent trees as a complete stand. The site is vacant and undeveloped, and the surrounding forest canopy is fragmented with a few remaining standing pines. The site is experiencing tree mortality (based on the condition of remaining stumps) and recent tree failures.

BACKGROUND

I was requested to provide an assessment report of the trees on the lot to proceed with conditions for approval of the building permit application. The assessment incorporates the preliminary location of site improvements, coupled with consideration for the general goals of site improvement desired by the landowner. The study of individual trees determined the treatments necessary to complete the project and meet the goals of the landowner. Trees within and immediately adjacent proposed development area were located, measured, inspected, flagged, and recorded. The assessment of each tree concluded with an opinion of whether the tree should be removed or preserved, based on the extent and effect of construction activity on the short and long-term health of the tree. All meetings and field reviews were focused on the area immediately surrounding the proposed development.

OBSERVATIONS/DISCUSSION

The following list includes observations made while on site and summarizes details observed or discussed during this stage of the planning process.

- The site is vacant and undeveloped. My understanding is that nine existing trees are proposed to be removed with the plan as presented; however, additional trees were found that will need to be removed. These trees are listed in the tree chart found later in the report.
- Two oaks were found that were not indicated for removal on the site map but are affected by the design:
 - #377 is a 10" diameter oak that is located in the front yard where a concrete walk is to be installed. The tree is in fair or better condition.
 - #392 is a small 6" diameter oak located in the front yard where a series of steps are proposed. This tree appears to be in fair or better condition.
- Surrounding lots have had trees removed over time, either due to disease or safety reasons. This lot has approximately a dozen stumps of various sizes and appears to have been removed, either because they were dead or hazardous.
- There is a 30" diameter Monterey pine (#97) on the property that has been uprooted and will need to be removed. Judging by the tree's trunk, the tree appears to have been in poor condition before its failure.
- The main structure and patio area require that trees #384 (patio area) and # 386-#389 will require removal due to the trees being located within the building footprint.
- The site map submitted shows an elaborate drainage system around the structure. This appears to incorporate several retaining walls and terracing of the soil. Grading will affect trees #377, #390-#392 because the terracing grading will require excavation into the critical root zones of these trees.
- The project will construct the main structure and install a driveway to the rear yard. The driveway travels along the eastern portion of the lot and will affect trees #378, #379, #381 (now a stump), and #382. Oak tree #380 is shown to be retained, however, excavation may encroach into the tree's critical root zone, but it does not appear that many roots will be encountered; therefore, the tree is expected to survive construction, provided work near the tree is monitored and the tree is protected.

CONCLUSION/PROJECT ASSESSMENT

This proposal to build an addition to a single-family residence and expand the driveway and garage requires 12 trees (7 oaks and 5 pines, two pines are landmark size) to be removed due to the construction. The assessment reveals that several trees on the property fall under the protected category defined by local ordinances. Specific attention has been given to the health and structural integrity of the oak and Monterey pine trees, which are deemed crucial for maintaining the ecological balance and aesthetic value of the area. The project does not appear to have visual sensitivity and is not considered to be within the coastal zone. Tree removal should not significantly impact the forest or its understory and include actions to provide long-term protection of the remaining forest area, under Policy 32 in the Del Monte Forest LUP. As designed and conditioned, the proposed project would not affect the health of the surrounding forest. This includes the driveway grading, excavation for drainage, and the main structure. Remaining trees are expected to survive if properly protected and monitored. The property frontage contains tree cover, which will remain undisturbed. No watercourses are near the planned construction.

Environmental factors, such as weather conditions and soil characteristics, have also been considered in this assessment. The findings are based on visual inspection and analysis conducted on-site, considering historical data and environmental influences.

Detailed observations are made regarding potential threats to these trees, including construction impacts, soil compaction, and changes in drainage patterns. Recommendations for tree preservation include fencing off critical root zones, implementing soil aeration techniques, and scheduling construction activities to minimize disturbance to the trees. Mitigation strategies for trees that cannot be retained include planting new specimens and implementing long-term care plans to foster the growth of the replacement trees. The report also emphasizes the importance of ongoing monitoring to ensure compliance with the preservation guidelines and the health of the trees post-construction.

Short-term Affects

Site disturbance will occur during building construction. Short-term site effects are confined to the construction envelope and immediate surroundings, where trees will be removed, some may be pruned, and root systems reduced. The pruning of tree crowns above 30% and the reduction of root area may have a short-term effect on those trees treated, including a reduction of growth and potential limb dieback.

Long-term Affects

No significant long-term effects on the forest ecosystem are anticipated as this vacant lot is surrounded by already developed residential sites. The project, as proposed, is not likely to significantly reduce the availability of wildlife over the long term or affect the movement of air. Whenever construction activities take place near trees, there is the potential for those trees to experience decline in the long term as well. The greatest attempt has been made to identify for removal of trees likely to experience decline.

RECOMMENDATIONS

Tree removal

There are 12 trees to be removed with the design as stated in the previous tree removal chart. The tree removal contractor shall verify the absence of active animal or bird nesting sites before any tree removal. If any active animal or bird nesting sites are found before tree removal, work shall be stopped until a qualified biologist is consulted for further recommendations.

The following trees are to be removed

ID#	Diameter	Species	Condition	Remove	Comments
377	10	Coast oak	Fair	x	Concrete Walk
378	12	Coast oak	Fair	x	Driveway
379	12	Coast oak	Fair	x	Driveway
382	8	Coast oak	Fair	x	Driveway
384	30	M. Pine	Fair	x	Courtyard
386	16	M. Pine	Fair	x	Main Residence
387	24	M. Pine	Fair	x	Main Residence
388	18	M. Pine	Fair	x	Main Residence
389	16	M. Pine	Fair	x	Main Residence
390	12,16	Coast oak	Fair	x	Concrete Walk
391	10	Coast oak	Fair	x	Concrete Walk
392	6	Coast oak	Fair	x	Walkway stair

M. Pine is a Monterey pine (*Pinus radiata*), Coast oak is a Coast live oak (*Quercus agrifolia*)

Tree Pruning

Pruning will include trees with deadwood, minor structural defects, or disease that must be compensated for, and possibly vehicle or pedestrian clearance. Trees should be monitored on occasion for health and vigor after pruning. Should the health and vigor of any tree decline, it will be treated as appropriately recommended by a certified arborist or qualified forester. Remedial pruning should occur before construction. Following construction, any above-ground tree pruning/trimming should be delayed until one year after completion of construction.

Tree Replacement

Replacement of all protected trees (native trees 6 inches in diameter or greater) to be removed is required unless shown to be a hardship or detrimental to the long-term health of the remaining habitat. There is sufficient room to plant replacement trees with the long-term objective of a one-for-one (1:1) replacement. planting with five-gallon or larger-sized Coast live oak. These trees should be planted in areas with the greatest opening in the stand to allow for a minimum of competition, maximum sunlight, and wind protection. The spacing between trees should be at least 8 feet apart.

Tree Care

Regular watering will be employed initially to ensure the optimal growth and resilience of the newly planted trees. Occasional deep watering (more than two weeks apart) during the late spring, summer, and fall is recommended during the first two years after establishment. Mulching around the base of the trees can also aid in retaining moisture, controlling weeds, and providing necessary nutrients. Fertilization, if deemed appropriate by the qualified professional, should be administered to promote healthy growth. The watering schedule, mulching practices, and fertilization treatments will be adjusted as per seasonal and soil conditions.

Replant Success Criteria

To ensure the survivability and proper growth of the replacement or relocation of trees success criteria will be defined to meet a 100% survival rate and implemented as follows.

A qualified professional monitors newly planted trees for a year for the following:

- Tree health and growth rates of new plantings must be assessed by a qualified forester or certified arborist.
- Trees suffering from poor growth rates or declining health are to be identified and documented as to the reason for this.
- Invigoration treatments, if feasible, will be recommended and implemented.
- Dead trees or trees identified in an irreversible state of decline will be replaced after a written recommendation is made by a qualified forester or certified arborist identifying the type and location of the new replacement. Trees that need replacement will be replaced on a 1:1 ratio. Replant material shall be minimum container-grown, five to fifteen-gallon-size, or greater.
- Near the end of the monitoring period, the status of the plantings will be assessed again to make certain that the success criteria have been met and all mitigation trees planted are performing well.

Tree Protection

Before the commencement of construction activities:

- Trees located adjacent to construction areas shall be protected from damage by construction equipment by the use of temporary fencing and through wrapping of trunks with protective materials. Fencing shall consist of chain link, snowdrift, plastic mesh, hay bales, or field fence. Existing fencing may also be used.
- Fencing must not be attached to the tree. It shall be free-standing or self-supporting so as not to damage trees. Fencing shall be rigidly supported and shall stand a minimum height of four feet above grade.
- Soil compaction, parking of vehicles or heavy equipment, stockpiling of construction materials, and/or dumping of materials should not be allowed adjacent to trees on the property, especially within fenced areas.
- Fenced areas and the trunk protection materials must remain in place during the entire construction period.

During grading and excavation activities:

- All trenching, grading, or any other digging or soil removal that is expected to encounter tree roots will be monitored by a qualified arborist or forester to ensure against drilling or cutting into or through major roots.
- The project arborist should be on site during excavation activities to direct any minor field adjustments that may be needed.
- Trenching for the retaining wall and driveway located adjacent to any tree should be done by hand where practical, and any roots greater than 2 inches in diameter should be bridged or pruned appropriately.
- Any roots that must be cut should be cut by manually digging a trench and cutting exposed roots with a saw, vibrating knife, rock saw, narrow trencher with sharp blades, or other approved root pruning equipment.
- Any roots damaged during grading or excavation should be exposed to sound tissue and cut cleanly with a saw.

If at any time, potentially significant roots are discovered:

- The arborist/forester will be authorized to halt excavation until appropriate mitigation measures are formulated and implemented.
- If significant roots are identified that must be removed that will destabilize or negatively affects the target trees, the property owner will be notified immediately and a determination for removal will be assessed and made as required by law for treatment of the area that will not risk death decline or instability of the tree consistent with the implementation of appropriate construction design approaches to minimize affects, such as hand digging, bridging or tunneling under roots, etc..

Best Management Practices to Observe (BMP)

The following best management practices must be adhered to:

- A) Tree service Contractors will verify animal or bird nesting before tree work. If the nesting activity of migratory birds is found, work must stop, and a wildlife biologist consulted before commencing work (the typical bird nesting season ranges from February 22 to August 1).
- B) Do not deposit any fill around trees, which may compact soils and alter water and air relationships. Avoid depositing fill, parking equipment, or staging construction materials near existing trees. Covering and compacting soil around trees can alter water and air relationships with the roots. Fill placed within the drip line may encourage the development of oak root fungus (*Armillaria mellea*). As necessary, trees may be protected by boards, fencing, or other materials to delineate protection zones.
- C) Pruning shall be conducted so as not to unnecessarily injure the tree. General-principles of pruning include placing cuts immediately beyond the branch collar, making clean cuts by scoring the underside of the branch first, and for live oak, avoiding the period from February through May.
- D) Native live trees are not adapted to summer watering and may develop crown or root rot as a result. Do not regularly irrigate within the drip line of oaks. Native, locally adapted, drought-resistant species are the most compatible with this goal.
- E) Root cutting should occur outside of springtime. Late June and July would likely be the best. Pruning of the live crown should not occur from February through May.

- F) Tree material greater than 3 inches in diameter remaining on site more than one month that is not cut and split into firewood must be covered with thick clear plastic that is dug in securely around the pile to discourage infestation and dispersion of bark beetles.
- G) A mulch layer up to approximately 4 inches deep should be applied to the ground under selected trees following construction. Only 1 to 2 inches of mulch should be applied within 1 to 2 feet of the trunk, and under no circumstances should any soil or mulch be placed against the root crown (base) of trees. The best source of mulch would be from chipped material generated on-site.
- H) If trees near the development are visibly declining in vigor, a Professional Forester or Certified Arborist should be contacted to inspect the site to recommend a course of action.

Fire Defensible Space (Amended PRC 4291 Effective January 1, 2019)

In addition to any pruning for construction or aesthetics, California's Department of Forestry and Fire Protection (CalFire) has instituted a set of rules and guidelines for vegetation management and fire safety for homes in the wildland-urban interface (WUI). These rules have been adopted to reduce the fuel around homes and allow firefighters a better chance to combat the increasing wildfires that has been occurring in California. The law (Public Resource Code 4291) is as follows.

(a) A person who owns, leases, controls, operates, or maintains a building or structure in, upon, or adjoining a mountainous area, forest-covered lands, brush-covered lands, grass-covered lands, or land that is covered with flammable material shall at all times do all of the following:

(1) Maintain a defensible space of 100 feet from each side and from the front and rear of the structure, but not beyond the property line except as provided in paragraph (2). The amount of fuel modification necessary shall take into account the flammability of the structure as affected by building material, building standards, location, and type of vegetation. Fuels shall be maintained in a condition so that wildfire burning under average weather conditions would be unlikely to ignite the structure. This paragraph does not apply to single specimens of trees or other vegetation that are well-pruned and maintained to effectively manage fuels and not form a means of rapidly transmitting fire from other nearby vegetation to a structure or from a structure to other nearby vegetation. The intensity of fuel management may vary within the 100-foot perimeter of the structure, the most intense being within the first 30 feet around the structure. Consistent with fuel management objectives, steps should be taken to minimize erosion. For this paragraph, "fuel" means any combustible material, including petroleum-based products and wildland fuels.

(2) A greater distance than that required under paragraph (1) may be required by state law, local ordinance, rule, or regulation. Clearance beyond the property line may only be required if the state law, local ordinance, rule, or regulation includes findings that the clearing is necessary to significantly reduce the risk of transmission of flame or heat sufficient to ignite the structure, and there is no other feasible mitigation measure possible to reduce the risk of ignition or spread of wildfire to the structure. Clearance on adjacent property shall only be conducted following written consent by the adjacent landowner.

(3) An insurance company that insures an occupied dwelling or occupied structure may require a greater distance than that required under paragraph (1) if a fire expert, designated by the director, provides findings that the clearing is necessary to significantly reduce the risk of transmission of flame or heat sufficient to ignite the structure, and there is no other feasible mitigation measure possible to reduce the risk of ignition or spread of wildfire to the structure. The greater distance may not be beyond the property line unless allowed by state law, local ordinance, rule, or regulation.

(4) Remove that portion of a tree that extends within 10 feet of the outlet of a chimney or stovepipe.

(5) Maintain a tree, shrub, or other plant adjacent to or overhanging a building free of dead or dying wood.

(6) Maintain the roof of a structure free of leaves, needles, or other vegetative materials.

(7) Prior to constructing a new building or structure or rebuilding a building or structure damaged by a fire in an area subject to this section, the construction or rebuilding of which requires a building permit, the owner shall obtain a certification from the local building official that the dwelling or structure, as proposed to be built, complies with all applicable state and local building standards, including those described in subdivision (b) of Section 51189 of the Government Code, and shall provide a copy of the certification, upon request, to the insurer providing course of construction insurance coverage for the building or structure. Upon completion of the construction or rebuilding, the owner shall obtain from the local building official, a copy of the final inspection report that demonstrates that the dwelling or structure was constructed in compliance with all applicable state and local building standards, including those described in subdivision (b) of Section 51189 of the Government Code, and shall provide a copy of the report, upon request, to the property insurance carrier that insures the dwelling or structure.

(b) A person is not required under this section to manage fuels on land if that person does not have the legal right to manage fuels, nor is a person required to enter upon or to alter property that is owned by any other person without the consent of the owner of the property.

(c) (1) Except as provided in Section 18930 of the Health and Safety Code, the director may adopt regulations exempting a structure with an exterior constructed entirely of nonflammable materials or conditioned upon the contents and composition of the structure, the director may vary the requirements respecting the removing or clearing away of flammable vegetation or other combustible growth concerning the area surrounding those structures.

(2) An exemption or variance under paragraph (1) shall not apply unless and until the occupant of the structure, or if there is not an occupant, the owner of the structure, files with the department, in a form as the director shall prescribe, a written consent to the inspection of the interior and contents of the structure to ascertain whether this section and the regulations adopted under this section are complied with at all times.

(d) The director may authorize the removal of vegetation that is not consistent with the standards of this section. The director may prescribe a procedure for the removal of that vegetation and make the expense a lien upon the building, structure, or grounds, in the same manner that is applicable to a legislative body under Section 51186 of the Government Code.

(e) The department shall develop, periodically update, and post on its Internet website a guidance document on fuels management pursuant to this chapter. Guidance shall include, but not be limited to, regionally appropriate vegetation management suggestions that preserve and restore native species that are fire resistant or drought tolerant, or both minimize erosion, minimize water consumption, and permit trees near homes for shade, aesthetics, and habitat; and suggestions to minimize or eliminate the risk of flammability of nonvegetative sources of combustion such as wood piles, propane tanks, decks, and outdoor lawn furniture.

(f) As used in this section, “person” means a private individual, organization, partnership, limited liability company, or corporation.

Detailed descriptions of the firebreaks are described in subsections (a)(1) and (a)(2) of Public Resources Code 4291. These spacings are to be used in and around the proposed home site.

Zone 1

Zone 1 extends 30 feet out from buildings, structures, decks, etc.

- Remove all dead plants, grass, and weeds (vegetation).
- Remove dead or dry leaves and pine needles from your yard, roof, and rain gutters.
- Trim trees regularly, keep branches a minimum of 10 feet from other trees.
- Remove branches that hang over your roof and keep dead branches 10 feet away from your chimney.
- Relocate wood piles into Zone 2.
- Remove or prune flammable plants and shrubs near windows.
- Remove vegetation and items that could catch fire from around and under decks.
- Create a separation between trees, shrubs, and items that could catch fire, such as patio furniture, wood piles, swing sets, etc.

Zone 2

Zone 2 extends 100 feet out from buildings, structures, decks, etc.

- Cut or mow annual grass down to a maximum height of 4 inches.
- Create horizontal spacing between shrubs and trees.
- Create vertical spacing between grass, shrubs, and trees.
- Remove all dead trees.
- Remove fallen leaves, needles, twigs, bark, cones, and small branches. However, they may be permitted to a depth of 3 inches.

Report Prepared By:



Frank Ono, SAF Forester #48004 and ISA Certified Arborist #536

April 16, 2025

Date

PHOTOGRAPHS

Tree #97 has uprooted and fallen, tree #377 is in the concrete walk



Trees to be removed , #390, #391, #392, and 377

Pines #384-#389 will need removal



Trees #390, #391, and #392



Five tall pines to be removed #384, #386-#389.



Trees #379 and #378 need removal; they are in the driveway.



Tree #382, #381 is the stump

