

Exhibit D

This page intentionally left blank.

From: [Amir Tadros](#)
To: [Navarro, Janet](#)
Subject: Re: Notices of Pending Administrative permits for March 20, 2024
Date: Wednesday, March 6, 2024 9:26:48 AM

[CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the County. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.]

Good afternoon,

I have the following substantive concerns regarding PLN200208 - GUNSEL SAHIN & GUNSEL UMRAN:

- Given that we are located in a subdivision with 30 lots and more than 30 structures at the moment in a Very High Fire Hazard Severity Zone, identified pursuant to Section 51178 of the Government Code, without a secondary means of egress route that are at significant fire risk. I am concerned about over crowding. We have already had a situation where a tree was down this last storm almost blocking all of us in. This also happens when the runaway concrete truck crashed into our fence and almost into my property back in September of 2022.
- The area where the project in question is requesting to build upon, consists of landfill soil, on a structurally compromised stacked up old adobe bricks. Which directly borders my property. I am concerned that construction taking place without proper inspection of soil, wall in question and the feasibility of construction being able to take place without constituting great risk to my family's life and my property.
- The property owner leases the lower half of his house to a family at the moment. I don't believe the intent is to provide low income housing to assist with housing issues on the peninsula, rather an extra means of investment, which could potentially add another short term rental to our neighborhood.
- We have received numerous notices from the post office regarding crowding from cars and or trash bins and that affected our mail delivery.

Finally, I am a disabled veteran and my disabilities have been greatly affected by the runaway truck accident, the thought of more construction trucks taking place severely triggers my conditions.

I would like to request a hearing to address my concerns and any other neighbors'.

Thank you,
Amir Tadros
24801 Handley Dr

On Mar 5, 2024, at 12:28 PM, Navarro, Janet <NavarroJ1@co.monterey.ca.us> wrote:

Good afternoon,

Please see the attached notices scheduled for review before the County of Monterey Housing and Community Development Chief of Planning on Wednesday, March 20, 2024:

- PLN200208 - GUNSEL SAHIN & GUNSEL UMRAN
- PLN230231 - KIRKPATRICK ERIN ET AL
- PLN230274 - KING PHILIP M & DENA TRS

Best Regards,

<image001.png>

Janet Navarro

Secretary (WOC)

Housing and Community Development

1441 Schilling Place, 2nd Floor, Salinas, CA 93901

Direct: (831) 784-5657

HCD Main Line: (831) 755-5025

NavarroJ1@co.monterey.ca.us

<PHN_PLN200208_032024.pdf>

<PHN_PLN230231_032024.pdf>

<PHN_PLN230274_032024.pdf>

From: [Navarro, Janet](#)
To: [Bowling, McKenna R.](#)
Subject: FW: Gunzel Property - more information and pictures below...
Date: Monday, March 18, 2024 2:28:40 PM
Attachments: [image001.png](#)
[image001.png](#)

Hi McKenna,

Sorry just saw this other comment regarding PLN200208.

Thanks,



Janet Navarro

Secretary (WOC)
Housing and Community Development
1441 Schilling Place, 2nd Floor, Salinas, CA 93901
Direct: (831) 784-5657
HCD Main Line: (831) 755-5025
NavarroJ1@co.monterey.ca.us

From: Rosemary Macaluso <rosemarymacaluso@icloud.com>
Sent: Monday, March 18, 2024 11:34 AM
To: Navarro, Janet <NavarroJ1@co.monterey.ca.us>
Cc: Amir Tadros <amirtadros@outlook.com>; Montano, Ramon <montanor@co.monterey.ca.us>
Subject: Gunzel Property - more information and pictures below...

[CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the County. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.]

Good morning,

Thank you for returning my call. As I mentioned, attached are emails that were sent previously, proving that Mr. Gunzel not only rented to Ala Milani for over five years, but after she was forced to leave the premises due to dangerous mold situation, Mr. Gunzel completely remodeled the unit.

Obviously he was careful to have what was permitted signed off, but after that juncture, he 'changed' the bar sink (per your records) into a full kitchen with three bedrooms, two bath rental unit. He publicly advertised the rental unit on Zillow and it is now inhabited with new tenants full time. I believe there would be mailing items to prove the new tenants residence.

I would like the opportunity to address my concerns and objections to this 'second' rental unit - the proposed ADU unit - when there is a hearing. I am very disappointed and distraught that fraud and deceit are able to contradict reality; especially with the fact that legal documents, permits, etc. are involved and have been signed. This should also be cause for concern for the county.

The former renter Ala Milani relayed she would speak to any of the 'facts' about her time of residence on the lower level or any clarification to the pictures and documents included in this

email.

Thank you for your time with this matter,
Respectfully,
Matteo and Rosemary Macaluso

----- Forwarded message -----

From: **Montano, Ramon** <montanor@co.monterey.ca.us>

Date: Tue, Oct 18, 2022 at 10:05 AM

Subject: RE: Requested Zillow

To: Ala Milani <ala.milani@santacatalina.org>

Thank you Ala, I am just waiting for the Assessor's records before I can issue a Ciation.

Ramon A. Montano, Code Compliance Inspector II
Monterey County Housing and Community Development
1441 Schilling Place, South, second floor Salinas, CA 93901
montanor@co.monterey.ca.us VMX 831-755-5885 FAX 831-757-9516

To view your project online via Accela Citizen Access, please use the following link: <https://aca.accela.com/monterey/Default.aspx>

Note: The Monterey County Housing and Community Development Department is currently operating with limited in-office staff to reduce risk of COVID-19 transfer to and between its workforce and our customers. During this time, responses may be delayed, but staff is checking email and will respond to you. If you have an urgent issue that requires immediate attention, please contact our main line at: [831-755-5025](tel:831-755-5025).

From: Ala Milani <ala.milani@santacatalina.org>

Sent: Thursday, October 13, 2022 3:35 PM

To: Quenga, Anna V. <QuengaAV@co.monterey.ca.us>

Cc: Rosemary Macaluso <rosemary@macalusoelectric.com>; Montano, Ramon <montanor@co.monterey.ca.us>

Subject: Re: Requested Zillow

[CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the County. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.]

It also looks from the photos of the rental listing, that the area that was a larger bathroom with the large jet (non functioning) tub, was converted into a bedroom or office and a smaller bathroom. The bedroom that did not have a window had the window added as well. That was not there to begin with when we moved in and he promised

that the window would be added but was not in the 6 b years that we lived there. This is a full remodel and a full rental advertised as a 1500 square ft home for rent. When I rented it, it was advertised as a lower level of a home separate unit at 1100 squ ft.

Allowing Mr. Gunsel to build yet another unit for rent and letting him get away with a full remodel with no permits and blatantly lying is a crime. I hope you see it that wat. The longterm residents (40 years plus) don't want more traffic in this neighborhood, more construction and more chaos than they have already endured for the past 5 years. Just two weeks ago a cement truck (in the news) ran out of control down the road to this property and could have easily killed people and pets. This senseless unmonitored construction needs to stop.

Anna, you have all the proof here of someone deceiving and taking advantage of the system, and to allow him to continue to do so tells me there is a problem with the system.

Ala

Ala Milani '87

Associate Director of Admission

Office: [831.655.9358](tel:831.655.9358)

Fax: [831.655.7535](tel:831.655.7535)

santacatalina.org



[THE ALL GIRLS SCHOOL DIFFERENCE](#)

[ADMISSION BLOG](#)

On Thu, Oct 13, 2022 at 2:35 PM Ala Milani <ala.milani@santacatalina.org> wrote:

	Front door Milani and front door Gunsel.JPEG Error! Filename not
	IMG_3428.JPG Error! Filename not specified.
	IMG_3430.JPG Error! Filename not specified.
	IMG_3434.JPG Error! Filename not specified.
	IMG_3435.JPG Error! Filename not specified.

[IMG_3436.JPG](#)Error! Filename not specified.

[IMG_3438.JPG](#)Error! Filename not specified.

[IMG_3439.JPG](#)Error! Filename not specified.

[IMG_3440.JPG](#)Error! Filename not specified.

[IMG_5222.JPG](#)Error! Filename not specified.

[IMG_5224.JPG](#)Error! Filename not specified.

[IMG_5225.JPG](#)Error! Filename not specified.

[IMG_5492.JPG](#)Error! Filename not specified.

[IMG_5493.JPG](#)Error! Filename not specified.

[IMG_5494.JPG](#)Error! Filename not specified.

[IMG_5496.JPG](#)Error! Filename not specified.

[IMG_5497.JPG](#)Error! Filename not specified.

Hello Ramon, [IMG_5498.JPG](#)Error! Filename not specified.

Per our conversation, [IMG_5499.JPG](#)Error! Filename not specified.
earlier today here are some photos. I Have tried to annotate them for your reference. I have also tried to sketch out the property quickly so it's not perfect. I may be able to dig up more photos, but here is what I have and wanted to get to you asap.

- Kitchen has been 100% remodeled - The opening that shows here which is to the living room was a solid wall before with a closet in the kitchen. Everything is new from appliances, to stove to hood, to kitchen cabinets, fridge, closet, and floors. All lighting is new as well.
- All lighting in the living room is new as there was NO lighting in the living room or the bedroom 2.
- Entire house has new floors.
- The back deck has also been completely removed. It was all wood rotten boards, and the hot tub was in the center of it. In the photos of the rental as it is now the whole deck has been removed fence is new and pavers have been installed.
- Bathroom #2 has been fully remodeled
- They have added a 3rd bedroom. There were only two when I lived there.

Here is the link to the listing as it shows the kitchen at the very least as a

whole new remodel 100% - no grey area there.

https://www.zillow.com/homedetails/24806-Handley-Dr-Carmel-CA-93923/19332880_zpid/

You can compare this listing which is how the house looks now, to all the photos I have attached.



Feel free to contact me for more information.

My cell is 831-596-9027

Ala

Ala Milani '87

Associate Director of Admission

Office: [831.655.9358](tel:831.655.9358)

Fax: [831.655.7535](tel:831.655.7535)

santacatalina.org



THE ALL GIRLS SCHOOL DIFFERENCE

ADMISSION BLOG

On Thu, Oct 13, 2022 at 10:10 AM Quenga, Anna V.

<QuengaAV@co.monterey.ca.us> wrote:

Good morning again Ms. Macaluso. The staff report for the project located at 24806 Handley Drive (file No. PLN200208 Gunsel) has been sent out for distribution this morning. I've attached an electronic copy for your review.

Please let me know if you have any questions.

Sincerely,

Anna V. Quenga, AICP

Principal Planner - Current Planning

Monterey County Housing and Community Development

1441 Schilling Place ~ South Building Second Floor

Salinas, CA 93901

[\(831\) 755-5175](tel:831.755.5175) Direct [\(831\) 757-9516](tel:831.757.9516) Fax

<https://www.co.monterey.ca.us/government/departments-a-h/housing-community-development/planning-services>

The Monterey County Housing and Community Development Department is currently operating with limited in-office staff to reduce risk of COVID-19 transfer to and between its workforce and our customers. During this time, responses may be delayed, but staff is checking email and will respond to you. If you have an urgent issue that requires immediate attention, please contact our main line at: [831-755-5025](tel:831-755-5025).

From: Quenga, Anna V.

Sent: Thursday, October 13, 2022 9:41 AM

To: Rosemary Macaluso <rosemary@macalusoelectric.com>
Cc: Montano, Ramon <montanor@co.monterey.ca.us>; Ala Milani
<ala.milani@santacatalina.org>
Subject: RE: Requested Zillow

Thank you for your comments Ms. Macaluso.

I will forward your concerns to the Chief of Planning and incorporate your correspondence as part of the record. Pursuant to [Monterey County Code section 20.76.060.A.5](#), you may request that the hearing on this project be referred to the Zoning Administrator. This would allow you to voice your concerns at a public hearing.

Due to the administrative nature of the hearing on the 19th, a request for a public hearing may better meet your needs. Please let me know if you desire to do so and I will forward your request. You will receive another public notice for the Zoning Administrator hearing.

Sincerely,

Anna V. Quenga, AICP

Principal Planner - Current Planning
Monterey County Housing and Community Development
1441 Schilling Place ~ South Building Second Floor
Salinas, CA 93901
(831) 755-5175 Direct (831) 757-9516 Fax
<https://www.co.monterey.ca.us/government/departments-a-h/housing-community-development/planning-services>

The Monterey County Housing and Community Development Department is currently operating with limited in-office staff to reduce risk of COVID-19 transfer to and between its workforce and our customers. During this time, responses may be delayed, but staff is checking email and will respond to you. If you have an urgent issue that requires immediate attention, please contact our main line at: [831-755-5025](tel:831-755-5025).

From: Rosemary Macaluso <rosemary@macalusoelectric.com>
Sent: Wednesday, October 12, 2022 5:59 PM
To: Quenga, Anna V. <QuengaAV@co.monterey.ca.us>
Cc: Montano, Ramon <montanor@co.monterey.ca.us>; Ala Milani
<ala.milani@santacatalina.org>
Subject: Re: Requested Zillow

[CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the County. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.]

Good afternoon,

I had emailed you yesterday about my concerns in response to the notice of pending coastal administrative permit and design approval that came in the mail for the neighbor Mr. Gunzel who resides at 24806 Handley Drive, Carmel. The Project file No: PLN200208.

I believe that Mr. Montano (county inspector) has also spoken to you about my concerns and a call that I put in to him yesterday. The purpose of my call was to clarify if in our single family neighborhood, one property could have three separate residential dwellings, (if he is allowed to proceed with this ADU unit). Mr. Gunzel has constructed a rental on his property on the bottom level of his home and has rented that unit out for many years. (it is highly questionable if this rental was constructed with proper permits as Mr. Montano states that the county shows this as a single family dwelling). It also is factual that he did current remodel work that was not permitted (electrical panel, etc.) and had to in turn get those re-inspected and approved. I assume he cleverly installed the finish of the remodel of the kitchen last, after the other infractions were approved.

The last long standing tenant of Mr. Gunzel was forced to vacate due to issues of dangerous mold (which she had to bring to his attention). Mr. Gunzel demanded the tenant vacate the property without proper notice or offering to house her and her daughter until they could find a place to live. This situation ended up with a legal battle of letters back and forth - so this is on record as well. The previous tenant, Ala Milani is more that willing to speak to anyone about her seven years of residence on Mr. Gunzel's property.

Our other neighbor, Mr. Tadros, whom you have spoken with - also objects to the building of the ADU unit and has several issues he has shared including safety factors. One issue includes that the proposed ADU site is sitting high atop only backfill soil which is held with a brick type retaining wall. Mr. Tadros is worried about this status as well as the safety of emergency vehicles with another unit, etc. I know he enumerated his concerns and shared that conversation he had with you - as he shared with us. He mentioned you had asked him about attending a hearing but I believe he declined as he was not comfortable creating a possible personal battle. He hopes it is resolved otherwise with the objections he has brought forth.

This small neighborhood sadly is becoming a vacation / rental property with the individual dwellings. It does not seem lawful to be allowing one property site, to turn into a triplex for income property on a single residential neighborhood site. This will absolutely lower the value of our property as well, not to mention adding to an already questionable safety factor for fire and any other kind of evacuation or emergency vehicles. We just recently had that situation a couple weeks ago with a cement truck that landed in Mr. Tadros' property.

Please confirm receipt to this email address of my objections. I don't know what happened to the letter I sent yesterday.?? Foremost, I am awaiting the answer to my question as far as the zoning regulations for three separate dwellings (two being rentals) on a single residential property site.

Thank you for your time and consideration with this matter.

Rosemary Macaluso

831 601-6035

(Below is the rental advertisement that Mr. Tadros sent to me. This is the rental unit that Mr. Gunzel currently has tenant occupation on the lower floor (basement garage level) of his home where he resides independently above with his family.)

On Oct 10, 2022, at 4:33 PM, AK Tadros <tadrosfam@gmail.com> wrote:

"3 bedrooms, 2 bathrooms home on 1st level of duplex. Completely remodeled with brand new bathroom and kitchen with new appliances. Walk in closet in the master bedroom. New floor with new interior paint. Brand new tankless water heater and gas heater. Backyard with paver stone and fenced for privacy. Little over 1500 sq ft living space. Electric, gas, and water is shared with upstairs. Garbage and sewer paid by the owner. No garage, two designated parking spots in drive way. Pets okay. No smoking inside the house and on the premises. Close to Carmel High, Carmel Middle, Carmel River schools. Easy access to Highway 1. Rent: \$3750/month First and last months rent and security deposit (\$2000) required. 1 year contract. Available now. Owner pays the garbage and sewer. Electric, gas and water is shared with upstairs(owner)"

<07058fc97557772a057a2b5a37699ae3-p_d.jpg>

[24806 Handley Dr. Carmel. CA 93923](#)
[zillow.com](#)

Regards,

Amir Tadros

From: [Navarro, Janet](#)
To: [Bowling, McKenna R.](#)
Subject: FW: Pending upcoming hearing
Date: Monday, March 18, 2024 9:18:53 AM
Attachments: [image001.png](#)

Hi McKenna,

I received this email while I was out of the office, it's regarding PLN200208 – Gunsel Sahin & Gunsel Umran. I also received a voicemail which I will be forwarding to you.

Thank you,



Janet Navarro
Secretary (WOC)
Housing and Community Development
1441 Schilling Place, 2nd Floor, Salinas, CA 93901
Direct: (831) 784-5657
HCD Main Line: (831) 755-5025
NavarroJ1@co.monterey.ca.us

From: Rosemary Macaluso <rosemariymacaluso@icloud.com>
Sent: Friday, March 15, 2024 5:57 PM
To: Navarro, Janet <NavarroJ1@co.monterey.ca.us>
Subject: Pending upcoming hearing

[CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the County. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.]

Janet Navarro
Secretary (WOC)
Housing and Community Development
1441 Schilling Place, 2nd Floor, Salinas, CA 93901
Direct: (831) 784-5657
HCD Main Line: (831) 755-5025
NavarroJ1@co.monterey.ca.us

Good afternoon,

This complaint challenges and opposes the permit approval for Sahin and Umran Gunzel to build a 'second' and additional rental unit on property - in addition to their residence. This permit for an ADU unit would create three residential dwelling on one property.

This very small residential neighborhood should be respected as such. We did not move here many years ago to live around triplexes and crowded street parking. The Gunzel's personal residence is on

their upper floor. The entire lower level the Gunzel's created as a rental unit when they first moved in. Prior and for decades, it was always a single family residence. Somewhat recently, the Gunzel's remodeled the entire lower floor rental (without proper permits). Once the remodel was completed, they publicly advertised this rental online with pictures. We have pictures from the original tenant to compare to the newly remodeled unit. The permits the Gunzel's purchased from the county for the 'remodel' was for a bedroom remodel when we inquired. If you look into the permits, you will see that deception had already taken place. The county was not aware of the details on the construction - but once there were advised, Mr. Gunzel was turned down for the additional plans for the ADU residence to be built.

Several reasons for opposing the permit for the ADU unit on the site chosen appears to be backfill soil and the integrity of ground which is questionable.

Not sure of the regulations for parking and vehicles, but the four vehicles that are now on property in the driveway for both the Gunzel's and their tenants often flow into the street and take up street parking as they cannot navigate the back and forth stacked parking in the driveway. Where will they park additional tenant parking?? This creates more crowded vehicles in the small culdesac,

Due to the tight navigation in the culdesac, public safety is a foremost reason which challenges emergency vehicles as well as weekly management for the waste and mail delivery. Quite frankly it is a nightmare for them already and our vehicle was recently hit by one of the trucks. When we did have a catastrophic accident a couple years ago, the emergency vehicles could not even fit in the culdesac. I have pictures I will be sending.

Public safety for small children and pets is another very serious issue as this culdesac does not have clear sight with all the cars parked on the street.

The question of public safety and CA State Law requires proper fencing around the Gunzel's residential pool. The Gunzel's have never had fencing around this pool and as of this date, it is open completely to the neighboring house. The pool has never been used for recreation but has always had a small amount of stagnant water (which a neighboring cat was found dead in the pool). This is a definite safety hazard for children and animals.

Lastly, this neighborhood, with the Crest View culdesac above the Handley Drive culdesac are locked into an area without a second exit to Highway One. Safety traffic ruling to create a second exit for safety should be a must if additional rental units continue to be allowed. If rental and ADU units continued to be allowed, this puts all current neighbors at risk in the case of an emergency. The traffic is a risk getting on to Highway One at this juncture. To add more dwellings on a single residential neighborhood - to create personal rental income, causes a higher potential for accidents and puts long time residents at risk, flowing in and out of this small area.

A phone call was made to you and a voice mail requesting a return phone call. I am in hopes that we will be hearing from you soon.

Thank you for your consideration and attention to this matter,

Matteo & Rosemary Macaluso
24794 Handley Drive, Carmel
831 601-6035 // 831 915-2669