



County of Monterey Planning Commission

Item No.4

Board of Supervisors
Chambers
168 W. Alisal St., 1st Floor
Salinas, CA 93901

Agenda Item No. 4

Legistar File Number: PC 23-029

March 29, 2023

Introduced: 3/21/2023

Current Status: Agenda Ready

Version: 1

Matter Type: Planning Item

PLN220043 - WOLOVSKY KATHERINE

Public hearing to consider the construction of a 3,794 square foot one-story single family dwelling with an attached 407 square foot one-car garage; a 753 square foot detached garage with attached 420 square foot workshop; an 819 square foot detached accessory structure; and removal of two landmark Coast Live Oak trees. Grading consists of approximately 512 cubic yards of cut and 530 cubic yards of fill.

Project Location: 2 Wild Boar Run, Carmel, Santa Lucia Preserve Phase E

Proposed CEQA action: Consider an addendum together with the Potero Subdivision Environmental Impact Report (SCH #: 2002051095)

RECOMMENDATIONS:

It is recommended that the Planning Commission adopt a resolution to:

- 1) Certify that an addendum has been considered together with the Potrero Subdivision (State Clearing House No. 2002051095) pursuant to CEQA Guidelines Section 15164; and
- 2) Approve a Combined Development Permit consisting of:
 - a. An Administrative Permit and Design Approval for the construction of an approximately 3,794 square foot one-story single family dwelling with an attached 407 square foot one-car garage, 753 square foot detached garage with attached 420 square foot workshop, 819 square foot detached non-habitable accessory structure, 1,430 square feet of covered porches and associated site improvements. Grading consists of approximately 512 cubic yards of cut and 530 cubic yards of fill; and
 - b. Use Permit to allow removal of 2 landmark Coast Live Oak trees.

The attached draft resolution includes findings and evidence for consideration (**Exhibit A**). Staff recommends approval subject to 12 conditions of approval.

PROJECT INFORMATION

Agent: Brittney Schloss

Property Owner: Katherine Wolovsky

APN: 239-102-004-000

Parcel Size: 22.67-acres or 987,505 square feet

Zoning: Rural Grazing with a maximum gross density of one unit/10 acres with Design Control, Site Plan Review and Residential Allocation Zoning District overlays or "RG/10-D-S-RAZ"

Plan Area: Carmel Valley Master Plan

Flagged and Staked: Yes

SUMMARY:

The subject property is 22.67-acres located at 2 Wild Boar Run, Carmel, within the Santa Lucia Preserve. The project proposes construction of a new 3,794 square foot one-story single family dwelling with an attached 407 square foot one-car garage, 753 square foot detached garage with attached 420 square foot workshop, 819 square foot detached non-habitable accessory structure, 1,430 square feet of covered porches and associated site improvements. Grading consists of approximately 512 cubic yards of cut and 530 cubic yards of fill. The project proposes site improvements including a new driveway, two on-site wastewater treatment systems, 2,000-gallon to serve the main residence and detached garage with attached accessory structure and 1,500-gallon to serve the detached non-habitable accessory structure, as well as a pool, outdoor patios and a meandering walking trail through the property. (**Exhibit A**).

The development does not appear to be situated on slopes greater than 30% grade and the design of the home is consistent with development patterns in the Santa Lucia Preserve. Construction of the home, accessory structures, septic system, related grading and site improvements involves removal of two (2) Oak trees. The Portero Subdivision EIR assumed a certain number of trees would be removed for development within each specific homeland boundary. No tree removal was assigned to lot E1 in the EIR. As such, a Use Permit is required for the removal of two additional trees and an addendum to the previously certified EIR is needed to reflect the change in the number of trees removed for the development of Lot E1. The total number of trees anticipated for removal within the Portero Subdivision will not be exceeded as a result of this project.

The parcel is zoned Rural Grazing with a maximum gross density of one unit/10 acres with Design Control, Site Plan Review and Residential Allocation Zoning District overlays (RG/10-D-S-RAZ) which allows one single family dwelling and accessory structures per legal lot of record. The Design Control zoning overlay requires the granting of a Design Approval for the proposed development and the Planning Commission is the appropriate authority in this case. Therefore, the project is an allowed land use for this site.

Based on staff analysis, the proposed project is consistent with all rules and regulations pertaining to zoning uses and any other applicable provisions of the 2010 Monterey County General Plan, Carmel Valley Master Plan, and Zoning Ordinance (Title 21).

DISCUSSION:

Development Standards

The development standards for the RG zoning district are identified in Title 21 Section 21.32.060. Required setbacks for main dwellings are 30 foot (front), 20 foot (sides), and 20 foot (rear) and the minimum distance between accessory and main structures are 10 feet. The maximum allowed height is 35 feet. As proposed, the one-story single family dwelling with an attached one-car garage meets and exceeds all setbacks. Height of the dwelling is 17 feet 10 inches from average natural grade which is below the maximum allowed.

Required setbacks for non-habitable accessory structures are 50 foot (front), 6 foot (sides), and 6 foot (rear) and the distance between accessory structures is 6 feet. The maximum allowed height is 35 feet. As proposed, the two detached accessory structures meet and exceed all required setbacks.

Height of the detached garage with an attached non-habitable accessory structure is 14 feet 5 inches, and the detached non-habitable accessory structure is 15 feet 4 ½ inches (from average natural grade) which both are below the maximum allowed. The proposed structures are located within the “homeland boundary” or designated building envelope on the property. The applicant has complied with all setback and height requirements pursuant to the Monterey County Code (MCC).

Pursuant to Title 21 Section 21.34.060.D, the maximum allowed site coverage is 5 percent. The property is 22.67-acres or approximately 987,505 square feet, which allows site coverage of 49,375.25 square feet. The proposed project results in site coverage of 7,623 square feet which equals 0.77 percent. Thus, the project coverage is within the maximum thresholds allowed.

Design Review

The exterior colors and materials are consistent with the area’s setting and surrounding residences. The single family dwelling is designed to reflect a contemporary style architecture that matches the surrounding neighborhood. Proposed color and materials of the main structure include a mix of light gray and cream stucco exterior siding, natural Douglas Fir wood trim and eaves, black metal framed windows and doors with accents of light gray limestone veneer. Cedar wood is proposed for the garage doors. Roofing material consists of bronze seam metal with mounted solar photovoltaic systems proposed over flat roof areas. All detached accessory structures will be designed to match the main structure. Landscape lighting fixtures consists of metal nickel plated downlit pillar and round mounted path lights which complies with the Monterey County lighting ordinance. Exterior lighting for the main residence and accessory structures have been made a condition of approval for the project. The project also includes a formal landscape plan and fuel management plan (**Exhibit A**). Site improvements consist of a seeded gravel driveway, concrete retaining walls and patios with stabilized granite pathways. The proposed exterior finishes described above are designed to be fire resistant to ensure building safety, blend with the surrounding environment, are consistent with the surrounding residential neighborhood character, and other dwellings in the neighborhood.

The subject parcel is located in the Santa Lucia Preserve within an area of high visual sensitivity. The site was staked and flagged, and a site visit was conducted to verify the visual integrity of the proposed development. The single family dwelling with accessory structures are situated amongst the existing mature Oak trees on the property and are subordinate to the natural features of the area. Staking and flagging was not visible when driving from either direction along Carmel Valley Road. As proposed, the project assures protection of the public viewshed, is consistent with neighborhood character, and assures visual integrity.

Health and Safety

Necessary public facilities will be provided. The applicant submitted a letter from the Santa Lucia Community Services District (CSD) dated April 6, 2022, indicating sufficient water flow and pressure to serve the subject parcel. The CSD General Manager also reviewed and approved the proposed landscape and outdoor water use design. The parcel will be served by two on-site wastewater treatment systems, 2,000-gallon to serve the main residence and detached garage with attached accessory structure and 1,500-gallon to serve the detached non-habitable accessory structure, which was reviewed and approved by the Environmental Health Bureau on November 1, 2022 (**Exhibit A**). The subject parcel is located within a State Responsibility Area classified as having a very high fire hazard. The construction of the new single family dwelling is designed to be a fire-resistant structure

that meets current fire and building code standard. The project also includes a Fuel Management Plan to ensure fire safety regulations are met for the proposed construction. Additionally, the parcel has a designated building envelope referred to as the homeland boundary that was established when the subdivision was created for the purpose of minimizing oak tree removal and potential impacts from debris flow (Board of Supervisors Resolution No. 05-046). The purpose of this boundary is to ensure future development would not encroach within the conservation easement over sloped areas surrounding the parcel. The project has been reviewed by the HCD-Planning Division and conditions have been recommended, where appropriate, to ensure that the project will not have an adverse effect on the health, safety, and welfare of persons either residing or working in the neighborhood.

Tree Removal

The project proposes the removal of 2 landmark Coast Live Oak trees at 48” (tree #1807) and 84” (tree #1802) in diameter due to poor condition and health. An Arborist Report (LIB220155) was prepared by Ono Consulting for the proposed tree removal. The tree amount indicated for the property does not meet the amount approved for the site, according to the Maximum Tree Removal List. The Maximum Tree Removal List approved 0 trees for removal on Lot E1. Though the tree removal amount proposed exceeds what was approved for the lot, it is consistent with what was analyzed in the Use Permit PLN010001 (Resolution No. 05-046) for the Potrero Subdivision. Tree replacement will be at a ratio of 5:1 for landmark trees. The removal of 2 landmark trees (48” and 84” DBH) will be replaced by 10 Oak trees. Tree protection and maintenance measures found in the Santa Lucia Forest Management Plan have been applied as conditions to the project (**Exhibit A**). The project is consistent with all tree removal conditions pursuant to Use Permit PLN010001 (Resolution No. 05-046) for the Santa Lucia Preserve Potrero Subdivision in that the oak tree removal is the least amount under the circumstance, avoids adverse environmental impacts, and removal does not exceed 25% of all oak trees within the home-land boundary.

Environmental Review

An addendum to the previously certified EIR has been prepared to reflect the removal of two trees on Lot E1 of the Potrero Subdivision. This change does not alter the conclusions within the SEIR and does not trigger substantial revisions to the previously certified SEIR. There have been no substantial changes in the project, no changes in circumstance, and no new information which would require major revisions to the previous SEIR. The SEIR considered the potential for residential development within the homeland boundaries for each of the 29 lots created for the subdivision. The subject project includes residential development within the homeland boundary on one of those lots. The increase in two additional trees does not result in new or substantially more severe impacts. Tree removal counts are still within the total number of trees analyzed in the SEIR (295 trees).

OTHER AGENCY INVOLVEMENT:

The following agencies have reviewed the project, have comments, and/or have recommended conditions:

- HCD-Engineering Services
- HCD-Environmental Services
- Environmental Health Bureau
- Monterey County Regional Fire Protection District

LAND USE ADVISORY COMMITTEE (LUAC):

Based on the Land Use Advisory Committee (LUAC) procedure guidelines adopted by the Monterey County Board of Supervisors per Resolution No. 08-338, this application does not meet any of the criteria in the guidelines requiring LUAC review because the project was reviewed by the Santa Lucia Preserve.

Prepared by: Kayla Nelson, Associate Planner, x6408

Reviewed by: Craig Spencer, HCD Chief of Planning

Approved by: Erik Lundquist, AICP, HCD Director

The following attachments are on file with HCD:

Exhibit A - Draft Resolution, including:

- Recommended Conditions of Approval
- Site Plans, Floor Plans, Elevations
- Colors and Materials

Exhibit B - Addendum to EIR

Exhibit C - Vicinity Map

Exhibit D - Arborist Report

Exhibit E - Lot-Specific Fuel Management Plan (Lot E1)

Exhibit F - Santa Lucia Preserve updated Tree Removal Matrix

Exhibit G - Santa Lucia DRB Letter Approval of Design

cc: Front Counter Copy; Monterey County Regional Fire Protection District; HCD-Environmental Services; HCD-Engineering Services; Environmental Health Bureau; Kayla Nelson, Planner; Anna Quenga, AICP, Principal Planner; Katherine Wolovsky, Property Owner; Brittney Schloss, Agent; The Open Monterey Project; LandWatch (Executive Director); Planning File PLN220043