



County of Monterey Planning Commission

Item No.3

Board of Supervisors
Chambers
168 W. Alisal St., 1st Floor
Salinas, CA 93901

Agenda Item No.3

Legistar File Number: PC 24-119

November 13, 2024

Introduced: 11/7/2024

Current Status: Agenda Ready

Version: 1

Matter Type: Planning Item

PLN190439 - YAN SHI & SUN YING

Public hearing to consider the construction of a 4,601 square foot single-family dwelling inclusive of a basement level three-car garage, a covered front porch and removal of 15 protected trees (6 Coast live oaks and 9 Monterey pines).

Project Location: 1187 Lookout Road, Pebble Beach, Greater Monterey Peninsula Area Plan

Proposed CEQA action: Find the project Categorically Exempt per Section 15303 of the CEQA Guidelines.

RECOMMENDATIONS

Staff Recommends that the Planning Commission adopt a resolution that:

- 1) Finds that the single-family dwelling project qualifies as a Class 3 Categorical Exemption pursuant to Section 15303(a) of the CEQA Guidelines, and there are no exceptions pursuant to Section 15300.2; and
- 2) Approves:
 - a. A Design Approval to allow construction of a 3,665 square foot one-story single family dwelling with an 80 square foot covered porch and an 856 square foot basement level three-car garage. Colors and materials consist of charcoal & tan blend shake cement tile roofing, cream cement plaster with beige, tan and brown stone accents for the exterior walls, dark bronze clad wood casement frame windows, off white wood door and window trim, and brown aluminum with obscure glass garage doors; and
 - b. A Use Permit for the removal of 15 protected trees (6 Coast live oaks and 9 Monterey pines).

The attached draft resolution includes findings and evidence for consideration (**Exhibit B**). Staff recommends approval subject to 13 conditions of approval.

PROJECT INFORMATION

Property Owner: Peter Yan Shi & Sun Ying

Agent: Susan Bailey, Any Habitat

APN: 007-682-013-000

Parcel Size: 15,333 sq. ft.

Zoning: Medium Density Residential, with a Building Site, Design Control, and Parking & Use of Major Recreational Equipment Storage in Seaward zoning overlays or "MDR/B-6-D-RES"

Plan Area: Greater Monterey Peninsula Area Plan

Flagged and Staked: Yes

SUMMARY:

The project site is located approximately 2.5 miles west of Highway 68 and 1.0 mile east of 17 Mile Drive, within the inland portion of Pebble Beach. This lot was created as part of the Lookout Ridge subdivision. The vacant parcel is 0.35 acre in size that sits in and has a mixture of mature Monterey pine trees and Coast live oak trees. A small section of the Lookout Road right-of-way, between the northern property line and edge of road pavement, contains steeper slopes which level out at the property line. This condition was created when the cul-de-sac for Lookout Road was constructed. Slope conditions on the subject property are gradual and ascends from north to south and range from 5% to 20%.

The project consists of the construction of a one-story single family dwelling with a basement level 3-car garage. Site improvements include grading (970 cubic yards of cut and 70 cubic yards of fill); the removal of 15 trees (6 Coast live oaks and 9 Monterey pines ranging from 6 to 36 inches in diameter); and construction of a driveway, stepped entry path into the dwelling, a 6 foot tall rear perimeter fence and a short retaining wall (ranging in height from 2 to 6 feet) to create a flat 600 square foot patio area off the family room.

Although onsite improvements would not occur on steep slopes, offsite improvements to connect to the proposed driveway to existing roadway pavement would require development on slopes in excess of 25%. However, this area of development is below the 500 square foot threshold qualifying for a Use Permit exception pursuant to 2010 General Plan Policy OS-3.5.1.c.

The Greater Monterey Peninsula Land Use map (Figure LU5) illustrates that the subject property has a land use designation of "Residential 4 Units/Acre". Accordingly, the property has a base zone of Medium Density Residential (MDR), which allows development of single-family dwelling as an allowed use. However, the Design Control zoning overlay requires the granting of a Design Approval and a Use Permit is required for the removal of 15 protected trees.

DISCUSSION:

Staff reviewed the proposed siting and design of the dwelling and determined that the colors, materials, and design are consistent with the MDR development standards and the character of the surrounding neighborhood. Staff has evaluated the request for removal of trees and based on the site conditions and evidence from the arborist report (see **Exhibit D**), the required Use Permit findings to allow the proposed tree removal can be made in this case.

Siting and Design Review

Development of the property is subject to the development standards for the MDR zoning district in the Del Monte Forest area (Title 21 Section 21.12.070), setback requirements for the B-6 zoning overlay (Title 21 Section 21.42.030.F.2) and the setbacks delineated on the final map for the Lookout Ridge subdivision. Title 21 Section 21.42.030.F.2 states that setbacks shall not be less than "B-4" regulations unless otherwise indicated on the final or parcel map. The subject property is shown as Lot 31 on the final map for the Lookout Ridge subdivision (recorded in Volume 11 of Cities and Towns, page 36) and as indicated, has a required front setback of 15 feet, a side setback of 10 feet, and a rear setback of 30 feet. The proposed dwelling is setback approximately 25 feet from the front,

approximately 38 feet from the rear, and 12 feet (eastern) and 17 feet (western) from the sides. Maximum allowed structure height is 27 feet and the proposed height for the single-family dwelling is 23 feet from average natural grade. The allowed maximum site coverage and floor area ratio in the MDR district is 35 percent for lots with a density of more than 2 units acre. The property is 15,146 square feet, which allows a site coverage and floor area ratio of up to 5,301 square feet. Consistent with this requirement, the proposed single-family dwelling, attached garage and covered entry would result in site coverage of 4,601 square feet or 30.37 percent. Therefore, as proposed, the project meets all required development standards.

The subject property is located along a cul-de-sac at the end of a residential street. Properties along the roadway slope downward on the northern side of the street while on the southern side, slope upward resulting in residences that appear low profile and tucked into the natural topography on the north side and residences that appear larger on the south side as the natural elevation is higher than the roadway. In this case, the applicant has attempted to control the bulk of the structure by placing the garage below the living area, giving it a single story profile from the street. The craftsman style architectural incorporates natural mixed materials while incorporating features of a modern design. The project includes installation of a 6 foot tall cedar rear perimeter fence and a cement plaster patio wall. Colors and materials comprised of a charcoal and tan blend shake cement tile roofing, cream cement plaster with earth toned accent stone at exterior walls, dark bronze clad wood casement frame windows with off white wood trim and brown aluminum with obscure glass inserts for the garage doors. Nearby residences include similar features such as the use of stucco, wood trim and stone elements. There is a general California ranch style architectural theme throughout the immediate neighborhood with one and two story residences.

The siting and design of proposed structure is consistent with the surrounding medium density residential neighborhood. In addition to the architectural design and colors and materials discussed above, the project includes a preliminary landscape plan illustrating planting of several of the required replacement trees between the structure and the roadway as well as shrubs and groundcover in the understory. Ornamental landscaping is limited to the area adjacent to the entry stairs. As such, the development will blend in with both the manmade and natural environment. Staff has determined that the proposed residence is compatible with the surrounding neighborhood character in terms of size, color, and location.

Tree Removal/Forest Management

The proposed project would include the removal of 15 trees (6 Coast live oaks and 9 Monterey pines), both of which are considered protected trees, as specified in Greater Monterey Peninsula Policy GMP- 3.5. A Tree Assessment/Forest Management Plan report, dated October 1, 2020, (**Exhibit D**) was submitted by Frank Ono, Urban Forester. Of the 15 trees proposed for removal, two are landmark trees (a 28-inch diameter pine located near the driveway/garage and a 48-inch diameter pine located within the building footprint). The remaining trees range in size from 6 to 23 inches in diameter.

Due to the dense forest conditions development without tree removal is not feasible. Pursuant to Title 21 Section 21.64.260, the following findings must be made to grant the tree removal: 1) removal will not involve a risk of significant adverse environmental impacts such as soil erosion, water quality

degradation, ecological impacts upon existing biological or ecological systems, noise pollution, and movement or significant reduction of available wildlife habitat; and 2) removal is the minimum required under the circumstances of the case.

Impacts: Removal of trees will not involve a risk of adverse environmental impacts in this case. The Ono report describes the conditions of the trees at the site and how it relates to the surrounding environment. The site is heavily forested with an understory of Coast live oaks and mature pines in their later stages of life. No significant long-term impacts to the surrounding forest ecosystem are anticipated due to the large number of trees that are senescent and in poor condition, combined with the relatively small amount of area that will be occupied by the proposed residence and driveway. The project as proposed is not likely to significantly reduce the availability of wildlife habitat over the long-term. As recommended, best management practices would be implemented through construction in order to maintain the health of the remaining protected trees. The removal and replacement (see discussion below) of the large over mature trees will have a beneficial effect on the forest as a whole. The report concludes that removal of trees at the site will not result in adverse effects provided best management practices are incorporated. Staff has reviewed the report and agrees with its conclusions.

Minimum Required: In this case, the lot is .35 acres in size and zoned for residential development. The lot supports a dense stand of trees and development anywhere on the parcel would require removal of trees. Siting of the single-family dwelling is located near the center of the lot meeting setback and development standards for the zoning district. The house is of a size and design that fits the lot and is typical for the area. Attempts have been made to preserve trees around the perimeter of the proposed home with focus on trees that are in good to fair condition. For these reasons, staff supports the determination that the project includes removal of the minimum number of trees under the circumstances of this case.

Tree Protection/Replacement

Pursuant to the requirements of the Title 21 Section 21.64.260, all non-landmark oak trees removed as a result of the project shall be replaced at a 1:1 ratio. Although the site is heavily forested, the project arborist found that there is sufficient room to replace 9 Monterey pines and 6 Coast live oak trees. New plantings should be five-gallon stock or larger, if available. Spacing between trees should be at least 8 feet. Occasional deep watering (more than two weeks apart) during the late spring, summer, and fall is recommended during the first two years after establishment. The project has been conditioned accordingly.

In addition, surrounding trees located close to the construction site will be protected from construction equipment by fencing off the canopy driplines and/or critical root zones with protective materials (Condition No. 8).

Fire Prevention

In addition to any pruning for construction or aesthetics, California's Department of Forestry and Fire Protection (CalFire) has instituted a set of rules and guidelines for vegetation management and fire safety for homes in the wildland-urban interface (WUI). These rules have been adopted to reduce the fuels around homes and allow firefighters a better chance to combat the increasing wildfires that have been occurring in California. Pebble Beach Community Service District has reviewed the project

without imposing any additional conditions of approval on top of these state requirements. Fuel Management was addressed within the Ono report (**Exhibit D**).

Public Comment

Staff received a correspondence dated August 3, 2023 (**Exhibit G**) by a neighboring property owner expressing concerns for incorrect staking and flagging as well as “on-site” parking for the construction vehicles and crews. Staff conducted a site inspection on July 18, 2023 and observed the project’s staking and flagging and found the placement consistent with the proposed plans. A non-standard condition requiring submittal and approval of a Construction Management Plan has been incorporated that includes specific measures relative to preventing obstruction of vehicular and pedestrian access.

CEQA

California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Guidelines Section 15303(a) categorically exempts the construction of new, small facilities or structures, including structures accessory to a single-family dwelling or residential use. The project involves the construction of a single-family dwelling and removal of 15 pine and oak trees. Therefore, the proposed development is consistent with the parameters of this Class 3 exemption. There are no exceptions pursuant to Section 15300.2. No evidence of significant adverse environmental effects was identified during staff review of the development application.

OTHER AGENCY INVOLVEMENT

The following agencies have reviewed the project, have comments, and/or have recommended conditions:

- HCD-Planning
- Environmental Health Bureau
- HCD-Engineering Services
- HCD-Environmental Services
- Pebble Beach Community Service District

LAND USE ADVISORY COMMITTEE

The proposed project was reviewed by the Del Monte Land Use Advisory Committee (LUAC) on August 3, 2023 (see **Exhibit F**). The LUAC members recommended denial of the project by a vote of 3-1 with 3 absent members based on the lack of attendance from the applicant, owner or representative. However, the LUAC recommended the public comment received (see discussion above) be addressed and issues be resolved.

Prepared by: Marlene Garcia, Assistant Planner, x5114
Reviewed by: Anna Ginette Quenga, AICP, Principal Planner
Approved by: Melanie Beretti, AICP, HCD Chief of Planning

The following attachments are on file with the HCD:

- Exhibit A - Project Data Sheet
- Exhibit B - Draft Resolution including:
 - Conditions of approval

- Site Plans, Floor Plans & Elevations
- Colors and Materials

Exhibit C - Vicinity Map

Exhibit D - Arborist Report (LIB220243)

Exhibit E - Soils Repot (LIB220244)

Exhibit F - LUAC Minutes August 3, 2023

Exhibit G - Public Comment

cc: Front Counter Copy; Planning Commission; Pebble Beach Community Service District; Environmental Health Bureau; HCD-Engineering Services Works; HCD-Environmental Services; Anna Ginette Quenga, AICP, Principal Planner; Marlene Garcia, Project Planner; Susan Bailey, Agent; Peter Yan Shi & Sun Ying, Owner; Laborers International Union of North America (Lozeau Drury LLP); The Open Monterey Project (Molly Erickson); LandWatch; Planning File PLN190439.