



County of Monterey Planning Commission

Item No.2

Board of Supervisors
Chambers
168 W. Alisal St., 1st Floor
Salinas, CA 93901

Legistar File Number: PC 25-021

March 12, 2025

Introduced: 3/3/2025

Current Status: Agenda Ready

Version: 1

Matter Type: Planning Item

PLN210068-AMD2 - RECTOR WARDENS & VESTRYMEN OF ALL SAINTS PARISH (ALL SAINTS DAY SCHOOL)

Public hearing to consider a second Amendment to a previously approved Combined Development Permit (PLN210068), as amended by PLN210068-AMD1, which allowed modifications to All Saints Day School, including the construction of outdoor athletic facilities, outdoor learning areas, site improvements, and development within 200 feet of the Carmel River. This Amendment would allow the construction of a 4,745 square-foot field house to include two locker rooms, three classroom/multi-purpose rooms, storage, and a kitchenette.

Project Location: 8060 Carmel Valley Road, Carmel

Proposed CEQA action: Find the project Categorically Exempt per Section 15314 of the CEQA Guidelines.

RECOMMENDATION

It is recommended that the Planning Commission adopt a resolution to:

- 1) Find that the project qualifies as a minor addition to a school, which is Categorically Exempt from CEQA per Section 15314 of the CEQA Guidelines, and no exceptions pursuant to Section 15300.2 of the CEQA guidelines can be made; and
- 2) Approve a second Amendment to a previously approved Combined Development Permit (PLN210068), as amended by PLN210068-AMD1, which allowed modifications to All Saints Day School, including the construction of outdoor athletic facilities, outdoor learning areas, site improvements, and development within 200 feet of the Carmel River. This Amendment would allow the construction of a 4,745 square-foot field house to include two locker rooms, three classroom/multi-purpose rooms, storage, and a kitchenette.

The attached draft resolution includes findings and evidence for consideration (**Exhibit A**). Staff recommends approval of this Amendment subject to 6 conditions of approval. All conditions of approval adopted with Planning Commission Resolution No. 22-014 remain effective for Combined Development Permit No. PLN210068 and this Amendment.

PROJECT INFORMATION

Agent: Joel Panzer - Maureen Wruck Planning Consultants

Property Owner: Rector Wardens & Vestrymen of All Saints Parish

APN: 169-181-057-000

Parcel Size: 29.5 ac.

Zoning: PQP-D-S-RAZ | LDR/2.5-D-S-RAZ (Split-zoned parcel)

Plan Area: Carmel Valley Master Plan

Flagged and Staked: Yes

Project Planner: Steve Mason, Associate Planner

831-759-7375 / masons@countyofmonterey.gov

SUMMARY

All Saints Day School is a private coeducational facility that accommodates students from preschool through eighth grade. Founded in Pacific Grove in 1961, followed by three years at temporary facilities in Carmel, the school established its current location in 1964 - under Planning Commission Resolution No. 5374 (**Exhibit D**) - and opened in 1965.

The school site is bordered by Carmel Valley Road to the north and the Carmel River to the south. “Low-density residential” lots lie to the west, east, and south (across the river), with the St. Philips Lutheran Church directly across Carmel Valley Road to the north. The parcel is split-zoned: Public Quasi Public, with a Design Control, Site Plan Review, and Residential Allocated Zoning overlay (“PQP-D-S-RAZ”), and Low Density Residential, 2.5 acres per unit, with a Design Control, Site Plan Review, and Residential Allocated Zoning overlay (“LDR/2.5-D-S-RAZ”).

Necessary public facilities are provided to the site: Cal-Am supplies potable water while landscaping water emanates from an existing irrigation well which has been allocated a water use of 11.98 -acre feet per year. The school is currently utilizing an existing onsite wastewater treatment system (OWTS) which will be phased-out upon the availability of sewer main lines by the Carmel Area Wastewater District (CAWD).

DISCUSSION

A Combined Development Permit (PLN210068; Planning Commission Resolution No. 22-014; **Exhibit E**) was approved on June 29, 2022, for renovation and expansion of the school’s existing outdoor facilities (playground areas, gardens, and outdoor spaces) and the construction of tennis courts, an artificial turf athletic field, an all-weather track, grass practice fields, and associated seating areas including an open-air 695 square foot pavilion and amphitheater. Other site improvements at that time included additional parking areas for pick-up and drop-off of students, driveway improvements, construction of bioretention ponds, and walking paths to improve internal circulation and connectivity.

A first Amendment to the 2022 Combined Development Permit was approved on July 5, 2023, (PLN210068-AMD1; Chief of Planning Resolution No. 23-045; **Exhibit F**), to allow the installation of six shade structures totaling 3,931 square feet, to serve as an outdoor learning area.

This second Amendment would modify the original Combined Development Permit, as revised by PLN210068-AMD1, to allow the construction of a 4,745 square-foot structure (field house) to include two locker rooms, three classroom/multi-purpose rooms, storage, and a kitchenette. This Amendment has been referred to the Planning Commission, due to the potential visibility of the structure from Carmel Valley Road, and its location within a designated area of “Visual Sensitivity” pursuant to Title 21 section 21.44.040E:

Chapter 21.44 - REGULATIONS FOR DESIGN CONTROL ZONING DISTRICTS OR "D" DISTRICTS

21.44.040 - Appropriate Authority.

The Appropriate Authority to consider and decide a Design Approval Application shall be:

E. The Planning Commission shall be the Appropriate Authority to consider Design Approval applications for those structures which have the greatest potential to impact public views, such as structures along scenic highway or road corridors, in areas designated as critical viewshed, or which may have a substantial adverse visual impact from common public viewing areas

The proposed structure will be sited approximately 300 feet from Carmel Valley Road, and in a manner that minimizes disruption of views from existing homes and public viewing areas. The structure will be 22'-6" in height, with four Armstrong Red Maple trees (24" box size) to be planted adjacent to the north-facing side of the building to facilitate natural screening from the nearest public viewing area (Carmel Valley Road). Note that Armstrong Red Maples typically grow to 50'-60' in height with a 15'- 25' spread. Grading will consist of 150 cubic yards of cut and 30 cubic yards of fill.

A visual simulation photo was provided by the applicant (**Exhibit G**) to illustrate the proposed structure within the context of the existing surroundings. Accordingly, the structure appears to be compatible and consistent with the school's existing development and sited in a manner that does not introduce a new prominent structure into the public viewshed. Additionally, Staff has conducted a site visit (February 10, 2025; **Exhibit H**) and determined that visual impacts will be minimal. The project is consistent with Policy CV-1.20 of the Carmel Valley Master Plan requiring that the proposed materials and colors are consistent with the rural character of the valley and are compatible and appropriate for the immediate surrounding area. The proposed fieldhouse incorporates a rustic architectural style and will utilize colors and materials consisting of off-white board and batten siding, charcoal gray barn doors and windows, zinc gray roofing, and cedar wood framing (See Sheet DA-01 of the plan set attached as **Exhibit A**).

The project site is within an area of "Visual Sensitivity," as designated on Figure 14 (Scenic Highway Corridors and Visual Sensitivity Map) of the 2010 Monterey County General Plan. However, Carmel Valley Master Plan Policy CV-1.18 states that "*Facilities classified as either Public/Quasi-Public or Special Use (such as schools, churches, hospitals, convalescent homes, rehabilitation centers, hospice facilities, emergency facilities, and public facilities such as community halls) may be considered in any land use category provided that they meet the following criteria:*"

- i. Low visibility* - The proposed project will not create an adverse visual impact.
- ii. Safe & unobtrusive access away from pedestrian traffic areas* -The proposed structure is located on an existing school campus. Safe and effective pedestrian paths and a carefully engineered student drop-off and pick-up area have been previously established.
- iii. Low noise impact on surrounding uses* -The proposed project does not include an increase to the existing student population (approximately 256 students currently and up to 300 students maximum) and is intended only to supplement previously established and ongoing activities.

- iv. Development should follow a rural architectural theme with design review. As previously noted, materials and colors are consistent with the rural character of the Carmel Valley.*
- v. Conform to all other Plan requirements. The project conforms to all other Carmel Valley Master Plan requirements.*

It is the conclusion of Staff that the project will not result in adverse visual impacts, and that the project is consistent with the applicable scenic resource policies of the 2010 General Plan and the Carmel Valley Master Plan.

Public Comment

One public comment has been received raising concerns regarding the use of portable lighting and “loudspeakers” (**Exhibit I**). A response was provided by the Head of All Saints Day School noting the seasonal portable lighting for sports practices ends at 7:30PM and the limited use of P.A. speakers for mandatory emergency drills. There will be no intensification of the use of either the lighting or P.A. system with implementation of this project. As conditioned, all proposed exterior lighting will be downlit and harmonious with the area.

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Guidelines Section 15314 categorically exempts construction of minor additions to existing schools within existing school grounds, provided the addition does not increase the original student capacity by more than 25% or ten classrooms, whichever is less. The school has a current enrollment maximum of 300 students (Pursuant to Resolution No. 5374, which granted Use Permit #1170 on April 1, 1964), with 256 students currently in attendance. Even if enrollment was to be raised to 300 students, this would constitute an increase of less than 15%. The classroom/multi-purpose rooms will be ancillary to the adjacent athletic fields and will also serve as supplemental educational areas. The proposed structure is not designed, nor intended, to increase enrollment.

Although the property is located adjacent to Carmel Valley Road, the project will not create an adverse visual impact. All proposed development is sited appropriately and is adequately setback from the Carmel River and the adjacent riparian corridor. The subject development is not located within the Carmel River floodway or floodplain and therefore will not impact the watercourse or be affected by flow related erosion or hazards. Therefore, the proposed development is consistent with the parameters of CEQA exemption 15314. There are no exceptions pursuant to Section 15300.2, and no evidence of significant adverse environmental effects were identified during staff review of the development application or during site visits.

OTHER AGENCY INVOLVEMENT

The following agencies have reviewed the project, have comments, and/or have recommended conditions:

- Environmental Services
- County of Monterey Environmental Health Bureau
- Monterey County Regional Fire Protection Department

LUAC

The project was referred to the Carmel Valley Land Use Advisory Committee (LUAC) for review at their January 21, 2025, meeting. The LUAC voted 6 to 0, with two members absent, to support the project as proposed (**Exhibit C**). One citizen in attendance - a teacher - voiced their support of the project as an “enhancement.” Another member of the public expressed concerns that the landscaping trees may “block views.” The LUAC members did not raise any concerns or issues.

Prepared by: Steve Mason, Associate Planner

Reviewed by: Fionna Jensen, Principal Planner (WOC)

Approved by: Melanie Beretti, Chief of Planning

The following attachments are on file with the HCD:

Exhibit A - Draft Resolution including:

- Conditions of approval
- Site Plans

Exhibit B - Vicinity Map

Exhibit C - LUAC Minutes (January 21, 2025)

Exhibit D - 1964 Planning Commission Resolution No. 5374

Exhibit E - Planning Commission Resolution No. 22-014 (PLN210068)

Exhibit F - Chief of Planning Resolution No. 23-045 (PLN210068-AMD1)

Exhibit G - Visual Simulation

Exhibit H - Site Photo (February 10, 2025)

Exhibit I - Public Comment

cc: Front Counter Copy; Planning Commission; Fionna Jensen, Principal Planner (WOC); Steve Mason, Planner; Melanie Beretti, Chief of Planning; Joel Panzer, Agent; All Saints Day School c/o Sara Brown, Applicant; The Open Monterey Project (Molly Erickson); LandWatch (Executive Director); Carmel River Steelhead Association c/o Brian LeNeve, Interested Party; Project File PLN210068