



Historic Resources Review Board

Legistar File Number: 25-392

June 05, 2025

Introduced: 5/28/2025

Current Status: Agenda Ready

Version: 1

Matter Type: General Agenda Item

PLN240293 - SCOTT GALE TRUST

CONTINUED from January 9, 2025, a Public hearing to consider recommending that the Chief of Planning approve an Administrative Design Approval to allow the remodel of a previously altered 2,545 square foot historic single family residence, to allow returning the original 1951 garage space from a previously approved master bedroom and additionally raising the garage roof to meet code, adding a new 506 square foot single story bedroom addition to the side of the house, a 38 square foot kitchen expansion, and a 40 square foot porch addition; remodeling and converting an existing 580 square foot detached art studio/garage located in the rear of the property to an accessory dwelling unit, and adding a new entry redwood trellis in the front setback. Colors and materials to match existing residence where possible, vertical board-and-batten wood siding for the addition. New custom garage wood doors for main house to be beige to match adobe siding.

Project Location: 3360 5th Avenue, Carmel (Assessor's Parcel Number 009-162-029-000), Carmel Land Use Plan, Coastal Zone

RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends that the County of Monterey Historic Resources Review Board (HRRB) adopt a resolution recommending that the Chief of Planning 1) Find the project qualifies for a class 31 exception pursuant to section 15331 of the CEQA guidelines; and 2) approve an Administrative Design Approval to allow the remodel of a previously altered 2,545 square foot historic single family residence to allow returning the original 1951 garage space from a previously approved master bedroom and additionally raising the garage roof to meet code, and additionally raising the garage roof, adding a new 506 square foot single story bedroom addition to the side of the house, a 38 square foot kitchen expansion, and a 40 square foot porch addition; remodeling and converting an existing 580 square foot detached art studio/garage located in the rear of the property to an accessory dwelling unit, and adding a new entry redwood trellis in the front setback. Colors and materials to match existing residence where possible, vertical board-and-batten wood siding for the addition. New custom garage wood doors for main house to be beige to match adobe siding.

DISCUSSION:

The property contains the Donald Teague residence, a one story Post-Adobe residence constructed in 1951. The residence is historically significant under the California Register of Historic Resources (CRHR) criterion 3, architecture, as a very good example of the Post-Adobe method of construction developed by Hugh W. Comstock; and under criterion 2, important persons, for its association with noted American watercolorist Donald Teague. Its character defining features include its Post-Adobe construction, one-story height, irregular plan, low-pitched gable and hip roof form, wood shake roof covering, multi-panel metal casement type fenestration, outdoor patios and terraces, and informal

landscape setting. The historic assessment prepared for the project by Kent L. Seavey (Exhibit E) concludes the property retains a high degree of integrity.

On January 9, 2025, the Gale project went before the HRRB for a recommendation on a remodel to the residence, with a new a second story addition, re-construction of a two-car garage in its original location, conversion of a detached studio/garage into an ADU, and other minor additions. In its discussion the HRRB identified a few concerns with the proposal. The project included a second story addition on the primary façade that would be highly visible from the street. As the residence's one-story height and post-adobe construction are both character defining, there was concern that this would materially alter these historic features and be inconsistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. There were also requests for clarity in how information is communicated on the project plans and description of the project. As an example, the original plan set included the original design elevations, existing elevations, and new elevations, but these were placed on different sheets making comparison difficult. Similarly, they included an increase in the height of the roof that was not called out as part of the discussion.

During the deliberation in January, the applicant's agent requested a continuance to a date uncertain to address the design concerns raised by the HRRB. The Board unanimously concurred, recommending that the addition be single story and proposed towards the back or the side of the existing house. They also requested the applicants address raising the garage roof. On February 18, 2025, the applicant's agent submitted a revised historic report with revised plans with the following changes: 1) removal of the proposed second story above the proposed garage space; 2) addition of a one-story, gable-roofed living space, off the east end of the front elevation. This will be done with vertical board and batten wood siding, to differentiate the new work from the original Post-Adobe building material, consistent with Rehabilitation Standards; 3) return the original 1951 garage space, raising the garage roof slightly, to provide for a code conforming overhead beam for the doors. The raised gable would be faced with vertical board and batten wall-cladding, again the differentiate the original Post-Adobe from the new material; 4) Maintain hip and gale appearance or roof above the kitchen space along the westside elevation; 5) reroof the residence with appropriate code conforming Class A regulations; 6) repair and replace original metal fenestration, matching any proposed new windows in kind; and 7) changeout multi-panel glazing in 1955 east side bay to full-height single panel panels. An addendum to the phase II historical report dated April 12, 2025 is attached as **Exhibit E**. **Exhibit D** includes both the phase I DPR 523 form and the original phase II historical report dated October 15, 2024. Please note that the October 15, 2024 phase II report includes analysis of the previous version of the project, which included a second story addition that is no longer part of the project.

CEQA

The proposed project qualifies for a class 31 exemption pursuant to section 15331 of the CEQA Guidelines with no exceptions to section 15300.2. This exemption applies to projects that are for the **"maintenance, repair, stabilization, rehabilitation, restoration, preservation, conservation or reconstruction of historical resources"** in a manner consistent with the Secretary of Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties" ("the Standards") are exempt from CEQA. Additionally, the project will not have a cumulative impact on the environment, there are no unusual circumstances regarding this project that will cause a significant impact to the environment, the project is not visible from any scenic highways, the project is not located on a hazardous waste site and the

proposed project will not cause a substantial change to any historical resources.

Prepared by: Erika Isidro-Valdovinos, Permit Tech II

Reviewed by: Elizabeth Gonzales, Permit Center Manager

Approved by: Phil Angelo, Senior Planner

The following attachments are on file with Housing and Community Development:

Exhibit A - Draft Resolution

Exhibit B - Project Plans, Colors and Materials

Exhibit C - Design Approval application with Site Photos

Exhibit D - Phase I DPR 523 Historic Report

Exhibit E - Amended Phase II Historic Report prepared by Kent L. Seavey dated April 12, 2025

Cc: Ray Parks (Agent); Project File PLN240293